

PENTECOSTALISM
Pentecostal Churches as an Ecumenical Challenge

One World Theology
(Volume 15)

PENTECOSTALISM

PENTECOSTAL CHURCHES AS AN ECUMENICAL CHALLENGE



Edited by
Klaus Krämer and Klaus Vellguth



PENTECOSTALISM

Pentecostal Churches as an Ecumenical Challenge (One World Theology, Volume 15)

Copyright © 2021 by **Verlag Herder GmbH, Freiburg im Breisgau**

Published by **Claretian Communications Foundation, Inc.**

U.P. P.O. Box 4, Diliman 1101 Quezon City, Philippines

Tel.: (02) 8921-3984 • Fax: (02) 8921-6205

ccfi@claretianpublications.com

www.claretianpublications.ph

Claretian Communications Foundation, Inc. (CCFI) is a pastoral endeavor of the Claretian Missionaries in the Philippines that brings the Word of God to people from all walks of life. It aims to promote integral evangelization and renewed spirituality that is geared towards empowerment and total liberation in response to the needs and challenges of the Church today.

CCFI is a member of **Claret Publishing Group**, a consortium of the publishing houses of the Claretian Missionaries all over the world: Bangalore, Barcelona, Buenos Aires, Chennai, Colombo, Dar es Salaam, Lagos, Macau, Madrid, Manila, Owerri, São Paolo, Warsaw and Yaoundé.

Cover & Layout design by Julius Ceazar Ladublan

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced by any means without written permission from the publisher.

ISBN: 978-621-426-143-7

Contents

Preface.....	ix
Development of Pentecostalism in Africa/Asia/Latin America/Europe	
Pentecostalism in Europe	3
<i>Joachim Schmiedl</i>	
Revisiting Pneumatology from a Feminist Point of View Regarding Pentecostalism in Korea	13
<i>Meehyun Chung</i>	
Pentecostalism in Latin America Today Dissemination and Trends	27
<i>Brenda Carranza and Christina Vital da Cunha</i>	
The Development of African Pentecostalism.....	39
<i>Asogwa Augustine Chikezie</i>	
Basic Alignment of Pentecostal Theology	
Healing and Holy Spirit. Pentecostal Churches and New Ecumenical Challenges in a Universal Church	51
<i>Margit Eckholt</i>	
Essentials of Pentecostal Theology An eternal and unchanging Lord powerfully present and active by the Holy spirit	71
<i>Tony Richie</i>	
Fundamental Aspects of Pentecostal Theology as seen from Latin America	81
<i>Bernardo Campos</i>	

Principal Features of African Pentecostal Theology	93
<i>Paul Gifford</i>	

Fascination of Pentecostalism for Christians in Africa/Asia/Latin America/Europe

Something is not coming our way; it is already here. The fascination of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements for Christians in German-speaking countries	105
<i>Hildegard Wustmans</i>	

Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Mainland China	117
<i>Franz Geng Zhanhe</i>	

Pentecostalism in Brazil and its Appeal to Catholics	127
<i>Alberto da Silva Moreira</i>	

The Fascination of Pentecostal Movements for Christians in Africa	151
<i>Patrick C. Chibuko</i>	

Charismatic Movements within the Catholic Church

Argument over the “ <i>Mission Manifesto</i> ” On Evangelical and Pentecostal Tendencies in the Catholic Church in Germany.....	163
<i>Klaus Vellguth</i>	

The Catholic Charismatic Renewal in the world	185
<i>Claude Nonis</i>	

Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Guatemala Enthusiasm and parish diaconia	199
<i>Jakob Egeris Thorsen</i>	

Charismatic Movements within the Catholic Church	209
<i>Kwadwo Nimfour and Opoku Onyinah</i>	

The Response of the Catholic Church to the Pentecostal Movements

Pentecostal Churches — Question Marks and Challenges 221

*Klaus Krämer*A New “Religious Style” in the Catholic 233
Church in Germany?*Esther Berg-Chan*A Converging Paths — the Catholic Church and
the Pentecostal Movement in Latin America 243*Diego Irrazaval*The Response of the Catholic Church
to the Pentecostal Movements 259*Ignatius Ayan Kaigama***Appendix**

Index of Authors 269

Index of Translators 273

Preface

For a long time the Catholic Church paid little attention to the emergence of Pentecostal churches and failed to recognise the challenge they presented. In the meantime the Pentecostal churches with their numerous denominations are among the fastest growing churches worldwide and it is more than just the sheer numbers of their new adherents which gives the “traditional churches”, including the Catholic Church, food for thought. Pentecostalism is clearly a global movement which is effecting significant changes within Christianity. It is to trace and analyse these changes that the present volume in the One World Theology series has been conceived. The contributors from Africa, Asia, Latin America and Europe first describe the development of Pentecostalism on their respective continents and then conduct an examination of fundamental aspects of Pentecostal theology. The articles in the third chapter explore the fascination the Pentecostal movement exerts on Christians around the world. The fourth chapter is devoted to the Charismatic movement within the Catholic Church which has been growing across the globe since the 1960s and can be seen as a parallel development or response to Pentecostalism. In the fifth chapter the authors look at the answers the Catholic Church has found to the challenges posed by Pentecostalism. The present volume in the One World Theology series thus addresses a key issue for missiologists and theologians within the universal Church and provides a platform for them to contribute their views from a specific, context-related perspective. One of the distinguishing features of the One World Theology series is that issues are approached from differing standpoints, thereby underlining the polyphonic nature of the theological discourse with the universal Church.

In the first chapter the authors review the development of Pentecostalism on the different continents. Joachim Schmiedl begins by stating that precursors of present-day Pentecostalism have existed

since the early days of Christianity. He traces the emergence of Pentecostal revivalist movements in Europe since the second half of the 19th century and notes that the Pentecostal movement on the continent is now greatly affected by migration flows. One of the striking features of the Evangelical and Pentecostal churches in Europe is the number of followers who have immigrated from Latin America, sub-Saharan Africa and Asia. Joachim Schmiedl draws attention to the significance of the Charismatic movement for the Catholic Church and says that “it is precisely these Christian communities which are treading new paths in ecumenical openness, leading to reconciliation and joint prayer”.

In her contribution entitled “Revisiting Pneumatology from a Feminist Point of View Regarding Pentecostalism in Korea” Meehyun Chung examines the historical development of the Protestant Pentecostal movement in Korea, deals briefly with the emergence of Catholic Pentecostalism in the country and highlights the pneumatological characteristics of the Pentecostal movement. She sees “a paradigm shift from an individual oriented mindset so a socially oriented mindset” as one of the major challenges facing the movement there.

Brenda Carranza and Christina Vital da Cunha explore the dissemination of, and tendencies within, Pentecostalism in Latin America, highlighting the dynamic way in which Pentecostalism spread across the continent in three historical phases. Reviewing current developments, the authors distinguish a fourth phase of Pentecostalisation in Latin America, in the wake of which Pentecostal and Charismatic Christians are taking up political offices and using them to enforce their conservative political views, especially in respect of sexual diversity.

Asogwa Augustine Chikezie then looks into the development of the Pentecostal movement in Africa, in which he discerns various phases since the end of the 19th century. He says that Pentecostalisation began with the appearance of foreign missionaries, although some classical Pentecostal churches in Africa were founded by Africans. The magnetic appeal of Pentecostalisation led to the emergence of a Charismatic movement within the “established churches” in Africa. Focussing on the “third wave of Pentecostalisation”, the author describes the development of neo-Pentecostal churches which

preach a gospel of prosperity and in their structure and behaviour are essentially modelled on profit-making businesses. He makes it clear that the triumphant progress of the Pentecostal churches in Africa is attributable in part to the fact that the other churches previously failed to integrate traditional African religiousness into the faith of their own congregations.

In the second chapter the authors elucidate fundamental aspects of Pentecostal theology. In her contribution Margit Eckholt goes back to a conference held in 2017 on “The Revival of the History of Ecumenism in Latin America and the Caribbean”. She draws attention to the significance of conversion and reincarnation and to the fact that Pentecostal Christians attach greater importance to the present power of the Spirit than to an unbroken line of apostolic succession. Looking at Pentecostal pneumatology she says: “A ‘practical’ theology of the Holy Spirit is lived out in Pentecostal churches. The ‘inner’ liberation which arises from the experience of the Spirit and healing in the Spirit is associated with a more comprehensive political, social and cultural liberation”. She points out that Pentecostal religious practices are particularly attractive for women. Margit Eckholt also deals with the dimension of immanence in the concept of the Kingdom of God which finds expression in healings, exorcisms, speaking in tongues and a superficial ethic of success. In view of the significance of the Pentecostal churches she calls for a broad-based ecumenical dialogue going beyond the dialogue that has been established in Germany between Evangelical Lutherans and Catholics.

In his article entitled “Essentials of Pentecostal Theology. An eternal and unchanging Lord powerfully present and active by the Holy Spirit” Tony Richie examines various aspects of Pentecostal theology and focuses, in particular, on speaking in tongues. He explores glossolalia in its communicative function and sees in it a crystallisation point of Christian spirituality: “Higher, heavenly treasures of the Holy Spirit are transported into earthly, human vessels. Christian spirituality in general and glossolalia in particular has this strange and sometimes confusing mix of the divine and sublime with the human and humble.” He notes that it is “important to discern both aspects united in action, and to recognize that God has chosen to bestow the heights of spiritual experience on lowly beings fraught with human frailties”.

In his essay Bernardo Campos presents some “Fundamental Aspects of Pentecostal Theology as Seen from Latin America” and underlines the heterogeneous nature of the Pentecostal movement. He investigates a fivefold structure (soteriology, anthropology, pneumatology, ecclesiology and eschatology) with a Christological axis, identitarian Pentecostality, and the hermeneutics of the Holy Spirit. He makes it clear that the social identity of Pentecostalism has its origins in the worshipping community and that Pentecost is both the crystallisation point and the “key to reading” Pentecostal theology. Campos concedes that Pentecostal theology is a “hand-made” theology in which theological statements are combined in eclectic fashion. Since the Pentecostal movement is the outcome of revival experiences, it has a dynamic character which also influences the lives of Pentecostal Christians. He points out that “the revival leads to the development of a new rationality, a new mentality and hence to new religious modes of behaviour and new theologies”.

Examining the principal features of Pentecostal theology in Africa, Paul Gifford says it perpetuates in large measure the worldview of African Traditional Religion. He sees the “enchanted worldview” realised in these theologies as one of the main factors contributing to the spread of new forms of Christian identity in Africa. A second characteristic, he says, is the faith Gospel which goes hand in hand with a “seed faith” (from the biblical image of sowing and reaping). Gifford looks at the ways in which the prosperity Gospel has developed in individual churches as a result. He considers prophecy to be the third characteristic of African Pentecostalism. Pastors in Pentecostal churches in Africa see themselves not only as preachers, but also as having been “anointed” and “sent” and thus imbued with the power to “effect biblical promises in the lives of followers”. This allocation of prophetic dignity is associated with the assignment of status in society.

In Chapter Three the authors probe the fascination Pentecostal movements have for Christians on the different continents. Hildegard Wustmans begins by relating an encounter she had with a prayer group influenced by Medjugorje. Drawing on her experience of this form of Christian spirituality, she calls attention to the adaptability of Christianity and its inculcation skills, which find expression in Charismatic and Pentecostal movements. She goes on to highlight

the importance of the social dimension for the growth of these groups, which is of particular relevance in the context of migration movements, since here the group becomes “a substitute family, as it were”. She urges a critical and constructive approach to Pentecostal churches and Charismatic movements and formulates a number of wishes for a liturgy which addresses the challenges posed by Pentecostalism.

In his contribution Franz Geng Zhanhe first provides a brief history of Charismatic renewal in the Catholic Church in mainland China and then concentrates on developments since China opened up and modernised in the early 1980s. He locates the first phase of Charismatic renewal in the decade from 1980 to 1990, when the renewal of overseas Chinese Catholics was in its heyday. In his opinion the second phase of Charismatic renewal in China began around 2010, when the Charismatic movement developed on a larger scale in the Chinese Catholic Church. He credits the Charismatic movement with having renewed the faith of Chinese Catholics, encouraged charitable activities, stimulated growing enthusiasm for evangelisation and fostered the composition of a large number of new spiritual songs. Among the problems brought about by the Charismatic renewal he points to the tension between charisma and institution, the abuse of glossolalia and a magic understanding of healing.

Alberto da Silva Moreira examines Pentecostalism and the appeal it has for Catholics in the light of developments in Brazil. He begins by describing the emergence of the Pentecostal movement in Brazil, the reasons for its considerable expansion, various processes of differentiation, and theological, ethical, political and aesthetic mutations, which have transformed the Pentecostal movement into a mass religion in Brazil. He ends by asserting that Pentecostalism in Brazil represents a stage on the road to a greater secularisation of society.

Finally, Patrick Chibuko investigates the fascination Pentecostalism has for Christians in Africa, basing his remarks primarily on observations he made during his pastoral ministry in Nigeria. Pentecostals, he says, “appear to opt for anti-intellectualism by devaluing the development of Biblical thinking and holding suspect the study of theology as a critical element of faithful Christian ministry.” However, he also points to the footprints that Pentecostalism has left in

many fields of Christian witnessing and living: “Their desire to devour the Word of God and apply it in all situations of human challenges, as well as their courageous capacity in public praying and preaching and above all their functional strategy in fund-raising are illustrative.”

The essays in the fourth chapter look at the Charismatic movements within the Catholic Church. In his article on the “Argument Over the *Mission Manifesto*” Klaus Vellguth shows that Evangelical and Pentecostal tendencies have gained a foothold in the Catholic Church in Germany. In view of the universal Church’s experience of Pentecostalism he rejects any attempts to isolate Pentecostal and Evangelical tendencies inside the Catholic Church and calls instead for a dialogue to be conducted on an equal footing. He also asks what it is that Pentecostalism has which the Catholic Church lacks and what the Holy Spirit wishes to tell Catholic Christians about the success of the Pentecostal churches.

Claude Nonis examines the origins of the Catholic Charismatic movement and describes the major developments before and during the Second Vatican Council as well as the events at Duquesne University in Pennsylvania in 1997, which are regarded as constituting the birth of the Charismatic movement. He highlights the role played by Cardinal Léon-Joseph Suenens in the movement’s founding phase and points out that some 20 million Catholics now take part in Charismatic prayer meetings and events.

Jakob Egeris Thorsen then surveys the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Latin America in general and in Guatemala in particular. He discusses the movement’s diaconal profile and explains the differences that exist in comparison with a diaconal ministry geared more to liberation. He emphasises that the Charismatic movements do not fight shy of criticising corruption, the abuse of power, machismo and a lack of justice in Guatemala. However, Charismatic Christians tend to see the solution rather in a “conversion of hearts” in the form of a chain reaction from person to person. The author points out that there are ever closer links in Guatemala between base ecclesial communities and the Charismatic Renewal movement and that this movement has a diaconal profile which finds expression in social ministry.

Opuku Onyinah, who has been head of the Church of Pentecost in Ghana since 2008, traces the development of the Charismatic movement in the Catholic Church and remarks that it is surprising for Pentecostal theologians that veneration of the Virgin Mary is of specific relevance in the formality of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal.

In Chapter Five the contributors address the issue of how the Catholic Church has responded to the Pentecostal movements. In “Pentecostal Churches – Question Marks and Challenges” Klaus Krämer turns his attention to the dialogue between Pentecostals and the Roman Catholic Church, in which the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity is involved. This dialogue revolves around questions such as baptism in the Holy Spirit and proselytism. According to the author it has shown that “a rapprochement is possible in many key areas or at all events that a more appropriate understanding of the respective positions and concerns can be achieved”. He sees in the dialogue a mutual learning process in which Catholics can learn from Pentecostals “how to better recognise the working of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church and in the lives of individual Christians”, while the Pentecostal churches can “benefit from systematic theological reflection on their religious practice”.

In her contribution entitled, A New “Religious Style” in the Catholic Church in Germany?“ Esther Berg-Chan looks at both the Roman Catholic Church and the Pentecostal, Charismatic and Evangelical movements in Germany. She takes up the thesis posited by Margit Eckholt that a new “basic way of living a Christian life” and a new supra-denominational “religious style” can be discerned in these movements. In both the commitment of the Augsburg House of Prayer and the publication of the *Mission Manifesto* she sees the expression of an increasing “internal charismatisation” and “internal evangelicalisation” of the Catholic Church in Germany.

In his contribution Diego Irrazaval focuses on the exchange between the Catholic Church and the Pentecostal movement in Latin America and urges that it should not be limited to a comparison of doctrines and ceremonies. Irrazaval is in favour of clearing spiritually grounded paths leading to an appropriate discussion about the understanding of the Bible, church organisation, ethical responsibility, the socio-political context and inter-human relationships: “Constructive dialogue between Catholics and

Pentecostals illustrates the freedom we have along our human paths, in all their ambivalence. With spiritual and theological help the people of God are addressing the transformation of the world in tandem with the lamentations of the Holy Spirit."

In the final essay Ignatius Kaigama deals with the response of the Catholic Church to Pentecostalism as well as the Catholic Charismatic Renewal. He identifies various factors which Catholics find attractive about the Pentecostal churches and illustrates the effects that Pentecostalism has on the Catholic Church. As regards the response of the Catholic Church to Pentecostalism, Kaigama differentiates between those who reject Pentecostalism outright and those who simply ignore it. In conclusion he draws attention to a group which accepts the "biblically justified Pentecostal practices and traditions". He makes it plain that he regards the Charismatic movements and Pentecostalism as a "real threat to Catholic believers" and makes recommendations for measures to counteract this threat.

We owe a debt of gratitude not only to the authors who have contributed to this volume in the *One World Theology* series, but also to the missio staff members Dr. Miriam Leidinger, Dr. Marco Moerschbacher and Katja Nikles, without whose conceptual advice this volume would not have been possible. Our thanks also go to Martina Dittmer-Flachskampf and Nina Dransfeld for the careful preparation of the manuscripts and to Ina Lurweg and Christine Baur for their attentive proofreading. We hope very much that this latest volume in the *One World Theology* series will generate interest in the theological discourse within the universal Church and provide fresh ideas on how an eye-to-eye dialogue can be conducted with the Pentecostal and Evangelical movements within the Catholic Church as opposed to the exclusion strategies which have been pursued to date.

Klaus Krämer

Klaus Vellguth

Development of Pentecostalism in Africa/Asia/Latin America/Europe

Pentecostalism in Europe

Joachim Schmiedl

Precursors of the Pentecostal movement

The first precursors of today's Pentecostal movement date back to the beginnings of Christianity. If we apply a broad definition, we can include groups such as the Montanists in the Early Church, the Lay Movement of the 11th and 12th centuries and the Spirituals in the Franciscan Movement, who were followers of Joachim of Fiore (1130/35-1202). In particular, a direct relationship can be established between the Radical Reformers and 20th-century Pentecostalism. The first generation included reformers such as Thomas Müntzer (1489-1525) and Kaspar Schwenckfeld (1490-1561), who saw themselves as being inspired by a particular presence of the Holy Spirit (Spiritualists and Fanatics). These Anabaptist groups made conversion an express requirement for membership. After the failure of the Anabaptist Kingdom of Münster (1530s), the most prominent group was that of the Mennonites, most of whom were from northern Germany and the Netherlands.

Pentecostal movements continued well into the 20th century, mainly within Protestantism. In the Church of England it was the Puritans in the second half of the 16th century who emphasised the importance of personal conversion and the renunciation of worldly pleasures. They formed the basis for the development of the Methodists, who were inspired by John Wesley (1703-1791), emphasising personal conversion and the practical, ethically disciplined sanctification of life. Wesley encouraged Christians to meet as small communities (such as chapels and conventicles) and to cultivate a heartfelt piety, deepened by the singing of Christian songs.

One group that had a particularly broad impact was Pietism, with its characteristic focus on free prayer that came from the heart and on the sharing of religious experiences. Another was the Moravian Brethren, inspired by the Bohemian Brethren and founded in 1727

by Nikolaus von Zinzendorf (1700-1760). They saw themselves as a non-denominational Christian faith movement and became well known in Germany for their *Losungen* – focal Bible verses for each day and each year – which greatly influenced the biblical spirituality of churches and individuals alike.

The immediate precursors of modern-day Pentecostalism were the revivalist and holiness movements of the 18th, 19th and 20th centuries.¹ Looking at Europe, it is not possible to define any systematic phases in the way we can for the United States. In Germany such movements arose primarily within regional Protestant churches, starting from specific geographical centres, such as the Siegerland region, the area around Wuppertal, Lüneburg Heath, Baden, Württemberg, the Lower Rhine and Middle Franconia. One Catholic offshoot, the Allgäu Revival, goes back to the 18th century, when it was initiated by Martin Boos (1762-1825). In Britain various revivals led to the rise of Bible societies and organisations such as the Salvation Army. Some missionary societies, too, had their origins in revivals, such as the *Christen-tumsgesellschaft* (Christian Society) in Basel and the St. Chrischona Pilgrim Mission in Switzerland. France also saw a number of *Reveil* (revival) movements, which combined a sincere faith-based life with a concern for social reform and mission. This led, for example, to the foundation of the Inner Mission (or Home Mission) by Pastor Johann Hinrich Wichern (1808-1881) in Hamburg, Germany. The Pietist movement in the Württemberg region combined the idea of revival with millenarian concepts of the impending end of the world.

The last quarter of the 19th century witnessed the widespread impact of the Holiness movement, which was distinct from the Inner Mission: "Impoverished individuals turned into active and independent people, capable of making free and confident decisions about their own destiny. The Inner Mission, by contrast, was a movement that targeted the lower classes, but rested on the shoulders of the nobility, the upper middle classes and the clergy."² Esther Hornung also

¹ Cf. Graf, Friedrich Wilhelm, art. "Erweckung/Erweckungsbewegung", in: Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart 4/2, 1490-1495.

² Hornung, Esther, "Geschichte des Evangelikalismus in Europa", in: Elwert, Frederik/Radermacher, Martin/Schlamelcher, Jens (eds.), Handbuch Evangelikalismus (Religionswissenschaft, No. 5), Bielefeld 2017, 49-72, here: 65.

draws attention to the difference that has continued to characterise the relationship between Pentecostal and established churches to the present day: “Individualistic evangelical voluntarism was felt to be a covert and subversive force which threatened to remove control from the forces that supported the state. This circumstance, I believe, explains the threefold opposition which confronted free churches in the English-speaking world and consisted of the established Protestant churches, liberal-bourgeois academic theology and medicine”.³

The older forms of Pentecostalism display a number of common features, one clear requirement being a conscious personal conversion, often combined with either renewed or adult baptism. This “revival” led to a demand for high ethical standards of behaviour. Organisationally, the individual believers were strengthened through membership of small groups – referred to as *house churches*, *ecclesiolas* or *conventicles*, for example, where each group was structured and led along congregationalist lines, i.e. from the bottom upwards, at the local church level. However, this resulted in tension with the major Protestant denominations, which were led by superintendents or bishops, and the various movements therefore joined together to form free churches.

The rise of the Pentecostal movement in the United States

One influential strand of American Christianity is formed by the Pentecostal churches.⁴ They have their origins in the Holiness movement, which required a genuine conversion and a life free of sin in line with the ethical principles of Christianity. Methodism spoke of a “baptism in the Holy Spirit”, but saw ultimate sanctification as part of the hereafter.

“The first Pentecostal churches included one that eventually became known as the Church of God in Anderson (Indiana). Its founder was Daniel Sidney Warner, whose churches soon included several Methodist Holiness churches, which formed their own group in 1881. In 1895 Phineas F. Bresee founded an independent Nazarene church

³ Ibid., 65.

⁴ Cf. Anderson, Allan H., “The Pentecostal and Charismatic movements”, in: McLeod, Hugh (ed.), *World Christianities c. 1914 - c. 2000* (Cambridge History of Christianity, No. 9), Cambridge 2006, 39–62.

in Los Angeles, which became the precursor of the first Californian Pentecostal churches.”⁵

The emergence of the Pentecostal movement is closely associated with the former Methodist minister Charles F. Parham (1873-1929). He became an independent Holiness preacher after 1895 and believed that the world was approaching its latter days, as evidenced by the work of the Holy Spirit. Of particular significance was an event at the college he had founded, Bethel Bible College in Topeka (Kansas), in 1900:

“In December 1900 Parham asked his students to find the common denominator showing that a person had been baptised in the Holy Spirit. Having been sent out on preaching assignments for three days, the students concluded that the common de-nominator on each occasion was the phenomenon of speaking in tongues. After much meditation Agnes Ozman, a Methodist student, asked Parham to lay hands on her in an apostolic manner [...]. Parham hesitated for a moment but then followed her request, laying hands on her and saying a brief prayer. Agnes Ozman reported in her diary that at that moment ‘the Holy Spirit fell upon me and I began to speak in tongues, glorifying God’ [...]. This report must be seen as one of the first known cases in which a contemporary person sought and experienced the gift of speaking in tongues as a sign of baptism in the Holy Spirit.”⁶

However, when Parham was rejected by his own church, he opened a new school in Houston. One of his students “was W.J. Seymour, a black minister from Los Angeles. Seymour moved his church services to a private house after he was banned from preaching in a church. His entire house church then experienced baptism in the Holy Spirit, accompanied by speaking in tongues. A large number of seekers were subsequently attracted and, since the house no longer had enough space, the meetings were moved to a former Methodist Church lying empty in Azusa Street. The revival continued with three services being held every day for three years, and the events even

⁵ Hochgeschwender, Michael, Amerikanische Religion – Evangelikalismus, Pfingstlertum und Fundamentalismus, Frankfurt am Main 2007, 237.

⁶ O’Malley, J. Steven, art. “Pfingstkirchen/Charismatische Bewegung”, in: Müller, Gerhard (ed.), Theologische Realenzyklopädie 26, Paris/Poland/Berlin 1996, 400. – Translator’s note: Agnes Ozman has been quoted from <https://www.apostolicarchives.com/articles/article/8801925/173171.htm> (14.04.2020).

began to draw international attention, attracting visitors from many countries [...]. This came to be known as the origin of the American Pentecostal movement, which was initially characterised by a whole range of special features. They included its attractiveness to the working classes and eventually also to many among the poorest of the poor. Moreover, it united the races, was open to women in ministry and rejected doctrinal formulas, ecclesiastical structures and a liturgy.”⁷

The term Pentecostalism covers a range of independent churches, including the Church of God (1906), the Church of God in Christ (1907) and the Assemblies of God (1914), which is currently the biggest Pentecostal denomination with over 283,000 local churches in 110 countries and some 60 million members.

“These churches recruited their members primarily among the socially disadvantaged classes, and their structures ultimately followed ethnic criteria. The colourful world of Pentecostal churches was divided into white and black churches. Whereas the Church of God in Christ was originally open to all ethnic groups, it eventually became the most important black Pentecostal denomination in America. The same happened with the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World, which initially comprised both white and black believers, but only accepted blacks from 1914 onwards. The Assemblies of God, on the other hand, became ‘lily white’ – like the U.S. Navy. Once this ethnic division had taken place, a new development emerged in that churches, such as the Ethiopian Overcoming Holy Church of God, became centres of militant black movements. They proclaimed that Christianity was African in origin while asserting that white churches were not genuine. [...] What started off as a movement that might have turned into a broad interdenominational revival movement eventually merely enriched the spectrum of American sects, making it even more colourful. The *many* had clearly defeated the *one*, and what aggravated the matter even further was that religion had apparently become not only a breeding ground of racial separation, but also of racial confrontation.”⁸

⁷ Ibid., 400.

⁸ Ladous, Régis, “Die Vereinigten Staaten von Amerika”, in: Gadille, Jacques/Mayeur, Jean-Marie/Greschat, Martin (eds.), Liberalismus, Industrialisierung, Expansion Europas (1830-1914) (Die Geschichte des Christentums: Religion – Politik – Kultur, No. 11), Freiburg 1997, 907–908.

The Pentecostal movement in Europe

The Pentecostal revival that had started in Azusa Street in Los Angeles quickly spread to European countries, particularly the UK, Ireland and Norway. A major figure in this development was Thomas Ball Barrett (1862-1950). In 1924 the Assemblies of God (founded in the US in 1914) started to plant churches in the UK. By 2009 its worldwide membership was over 63 million, with 350,000 churches and preaching venues. The individual local churches were independent but saw themselves as united by the following principles: "(1) a desire to work together in Spirit-empowered evangelism, (2) a sense of eschatological urgency, (3) the practical need for organisational unity, (4) the need for more effective missions and education, and (5) a suspicion of hierarchical institutions".⁹

In Germany¹⁰ a Pentecostal conference was held by the Community Movement¹¹ in Gnadau near Magdeburg from 22 to 24 May 1888, giving rise to the German Society for the Cultivation of Fellowship and Evangelism (1897), often known as the Gnadau Union. The Union also included the German branch of the YMCA (Young Men's Christian Association), known as CVJM (*Christlicher Verein junger Männer* as a literal translation of YMCA, now: *Christlicher Verein junger Menschen* – Young People's Christian Association), as well as the Blue Cross, a temperance organisation. The two aims – cultivation of fellowship and evangelism – were seen as being in conflict with speaking in tongues, as practised at some gatherings. In 1909, this conflict led to a breach between evangelicals and the Pentecostal movement. According to the Berlin Declaration formulated that year, the Pentecostal movement was described as inspired "from below" and akin to spiritism. As a result, the Pentecostal movement took a separate path in its development, forming denominations

⁹ Molenaar, William, The World Assemblies of God Fellowship – United in the Missionary Spirit, 2011, 6, http://worldagfellowship.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/12/History_of_World_-AG_Fellowship.pdf (14.03.2018).

¹⁰ For more on the history of Pentecostalism in Germany go to <http://www.fcg-giessen.de/themen/gs/gs9.html> (14.03.2018). On the current state of theological research into this topic see Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), *Handbuch pfingstliche und charismatische Theologie*, Göttingen 2014; Zimmerling, Peter, "Die Theologie pfingstlich-charismatischer Bewegungen – Annäherungen", in: *Theologische Literaturzeitung*, No. 140 (2015) 11, 1190–1207.

¹¹ On the Community movement see Geldbach, Erich, art. "Gemeinschaftsbewegung I", in: *Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart* 4, 645–649.

such as *Gemeinde der Christen Ecclesia* (Ecclesia Community of Christians), *Volksmission entschiedener Christen* (People's Mission of Resolute Christians) and the Elim Churches, which grew out of Germany's *Zeltmissionen* (Marquee Missions Movement). In 1947 these denominations united to form a single entity. All of them acknowledge baptism in the Holy Spirit, promote evangelistic mission and fellowship, and engage in social action.

To put an end to this fragmented landscape several denominations formed the *Arbeitsgemeinschaft der Christengemeinden* in Deutschland (Working Group of Christian Churches in Germany) in Stuttgart in August 1948, which became a public corporation in 1974 and since then has been known as *Bund freikirchlicher Pfingstgemeinden* (German Federation of Pentecostal Churches, literally, "Federation of Pentecostal Free Churches"). In 2015 it had a membership of around 146,000 and now has 56,275 baptised members as well as 831 local churches and 1,150 church services per week.¹² Church leaders have been trained at the Beroea Theological Seminary in Erzhausen (Hesse) since 1951.

The Pentecostal movement¹³ in Europe has been experiencing growth through various waves of migration. "The evangelical landscape in target countries is being shaped, in particular, by immigrants from regions such as Latin America, sub-Saharan Africa and Asia, where evangelical (and especially Pentecostal) churches play major roles."¹⁴ Germany's free churches have been particularly impacted by migrants from Russia and Eastern Europe. "According to estimates, 15-25% of all ethnic Germans from Russian-speaking countries are members of free churches, thus forming a large proportion of evangelical churches."¹⁵

¹² Bund Freikirchlicher Pfingstgemeinden, <https://www.bfp.de/#count> (14.03.2018).

¹³ Cf. Frenschkowski, Marco, art. "Pfingstbewegung/Pfingstkirchen", in: Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart 4 6, 1232–1235.

¹⁴ Elwert, Frederick/Radermacher, Stefan, "Evangelikalismus in Europa", in: Elwert, Frederick/Radermacher, Martin/Schlamelcher, Jens (eds.), Handbuch Evangelikalismus (Religionswissenschaft, No. 5), Bielefeld 2017, 178.

¹⁵ Ibid., 180–181.

The Charismatic movement

The second wave of Pentecostalism is the Charismatic movement, which transcended the boundaries between Protestant denominations. It was triggered by a Christian retreat in 1967 when students and lecturers from Duquesne University experienced the Holy Spirit. The event led to a movement across all Christian denominations which currently encompasses over half a billion Christians.

A Pentecostal experience also occurred in the Roman Catholic Church, at the Second Vatican Council, and was subsequently reflected, in particular, in the Dogmatic Constitution on the Church *Lumen Gentium* (LG 12). Theologically, this new perspective on *charismata* (gifts of the Holy Spirit) was underpinned by a major study of the Holy Spirit drawn up by Yves Congar (1904-1955).¹⁶ Charismatic groups were supported by Heribert Mühlen (1927-2006) and Norbert Baumert (b. 1932), ensuring their integration into the wider church scene. In 1973 the Belgian Cardinal Léon-Joseph Suenens (1904-1996) secured the recognition of Pope Paul VI (1897-1978) for the Charismatic movement. Greater dialogue and thus interaction between the various spiritual movements was subsequently fostered by Pope John Paul II (1920-2005). Hans Gasper sums up the fundamental thrust of the Charismatic movement as follows: "The so-called 'baptism in the Holy Spirit', its understanding and the associated spiritual gifts are important to all the different forms of the Charismatic movement: In this time God has given to the churches and Christianity – the 'body of Christ' – a new 'outpouring' of the Spirit, a 'new Pentecost'. This is accompanied by personal renewal and conversion, spiritual gifts (i.e. charismata) similar to those in the early church, and a new ability to give testimony and evangelise."¹⁷

Acceptance of Charismatic spirituality within the Roman Catholic Church also made it more open to Pentecostal movements outside its own sphere. A major signal in this direction was provided by Pope Francis (b. 1936) when he visited the Pentecostal Church of Reconciliation in Caserta on 28 July 2014. He encouraged those present to "walk on in the presence of the Lord" and pleaded for

¹⁶ Congar, Yves, *Der Heilige Geist*, Freiburg 1982.

¹⁷ Gasper, Hans, art. "Charismatische Bewegung", in: Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart 4 2, 117–118.

"diversity 'reconciled' 'by the Holy Spirit'.¹⁸ The Holy Spirit, he said, "creates the diversity of charismata and then makes harmony of the charismata".¹⁹ The Pope considers this harmony to be reflected in the image of a polyhedron. Commenting on the lack of mutual understanding, the Pope asked for forgiveness: "I am the Pastor of Catholics: I ask your forgiveness for this! I ask your forgiveness for those Catholic brothers and sisters who understood and were tempted by the devil and did the same thing as Joseph's brothers. I ask the Lord to give us the grace to recognize and to forgive ... Thank you!"²⁰

For many years the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements were mostly regarded as a danger to unity. Undoubtedly, there have been and still are inherent problems, as might be expected from any profound faith movement. Indeed, the emphasis on unity can prevent openness to the opportunities created by plurality. However, it is precisely these Christian communities which are treading new paths in ecumenical openness, leading to reconciliation, joint prayer and greater global engagement.²¹ This can be seen as a great sign of hope, showing that the Holy Spirit is at work within churches, Christian communities and related groups.

¹⁸ Address of Pope Francis, 28 July 2014, http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/speeches/2014/july/documents/papa-francesco_20140728_caserta-pastore-traettino.html (30.12.2019).

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ See the interdenominational initiative of Christian movements and communities Together for Europe, <https://www.together4europe.org/en/> (30.12.2019).

Revisiting Pneumatology from a Feminist Point of View Regarding Pentecostalism in Korea

Meehyun Chung

Introduction of the Development of Korean Christianity

This article intends to elaborate on the Pentecostal movement in Korea and to revisit pneumatology regarding the Pentecostal movement from a feminist point of view. I would like to define the preliminary range of this article within the Korean Protestant Churches with which I am directly related contextually, while I mention Catholic Pentecostalism in Korea rather briefly.²²

Korean Protestant Churches are very much indebted to Catholic martyrdom because their missional work started after this period.²³ Since the Catholic message was first introduced to Korea as a “science of the Western,” the government imposed severe oppression as it was against the Chosun dynasty’s teaching and the cultural custom of Confucian order. When Korean Protestant missions began in the mid-Nineteenth century, there was no more martyrdom except for oppression by the Japanese colonial government between 1910 and 1945.

This article comprises three major parts: firstly, the historical development of Protestant Pentecostal movements in Korea, secondly, the Korean Catholic Pentecostal movement, thirdly, the characteristics of Pneumatology of the pentecostal movement.

²² To elaborate Asian Pentecostalism in general beyond capacity of this article. About this subject of the development of Pentecostal churches in various Asian countries. Cf. Anderson, Allan/Tang, Edmond (eds.), *Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia*, Eugene, OR 2011.

²³ About Catholic Martyrdom see Jangwoo, Lee (et al.), *(The) history of the catholic church in Korea*, Vol. 2, Seoul 2010. Sangkuen, Bang (et al.), *(The) history of the catholic church in Korea*, Vol. 3, Seoul 2010.

The historical development of Protestant Pentecostal movements in Korea²⁴

The Pentecostal Church, which is a part of the Protestant churches, appeared relatively late compared to other denominations in Korea. There was a pre-Pentecostal movement where preaching was accompanied by healings and by intensive prayer: Kil Sun Joo and Kim Ik Du were Presbyterian pastors well-known for healing revivalism. Also, the Methodist mystic Yi Yong Do and Methodist elder Ra Woon Mong introduced the concept of 'prayer on mountains,' which became major patterns for not only Pentecostal churches, but also for other denominational churches including the Presbyterian church.²⁵ The custom of prayer movement on the mountain is an example of the indigenization of religious piety, and how the Korean culture was adapted to Korean Christianity.²⁶

The Korean Pentecostal movement was introduced in the early twenties. As mentioned above, there was already a very pivotal moment that acted as a cradle of the Pentecostal movement. Additionally, like other protestant churches it systematically started with the support of western missionaries. The most important person who introduced the Pentecostal Church was Mary Rumsey.²⁷ She arrived in 1928 after the Azusa Street Revival in 1907.²⁸ In fact, she belonged to a Methodist Church, and experienced the baptism of the Holy Spirit in the Azusa

²⁴ This part is based on the article and slightly changed. Chung, Meehyun, "Korean Pentecostalism and the Preaching of Prosperity", in: Die Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft, No. 99 (2015), 279–282.

²⁵ Anderson, Allan Heaton, An Introduction to Pentecostalism, Cambridge 2014, 151.

²⁶ Chung, Meehyun, Reis und Wasser: Eine Feministische Theologie in Korea, Berlin 2012, 165–166.

²⁷ She was not sent officially by the Assembly of God of USA. Therefore she didn't get any official support by US Church or mission society. Jeongyoul, Han, "The First Missionary of Pentecostal Church Mary C. Rumsey", in: Research on Missionaries in Korea, Seoul 2011, 177–200; Ma, Wonsuk, "Asian (Classical) Pentecostal Theology in Context", in: Anderson, Allan/Tang, Edmond (eds.), Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia, Eugene, OR 2011, 50; Synan, H. Vinson, "The Yoido Full Gospel Church", in: Cyber Journal for Pentecostal-Charismatic Research, <http://www.pctii.org/cyberj/cyberj2/synan.html> (17.08.2017); Lee, Young-hoon, The Holy Spirit Movement in Korea: Its Historical and Doctrinal Development, Oxford 2009, 66.

²⁸ Lee, Young-hoon, "The Korean Holy Spirit Movement in Relation to Pentecostalism", in: Anderson, Allan/Tang, Edmond (eds.), Asian and Pentecostal: The Charismatic Face of Christianity in Asia, Eugene, OR 2011, 419. Cf. Synan, Vinson, In the Latter Days, trans. by International Institute of Theology, Seoul 1995, 240ff.; Synan, Vinson (ed.), The century of the Holy Spirit: 100 years of Pentecostal and charismatic renewal, 1901–2001, Nashville 2001.

Street revival meeting in 1906 and spoke in tongues.²⁹ Due to her calling as a missionary to Korea, she came to Korea and stayed in contact with Dr. Robert A. Hardie (1865~1949).³⁰ He was a medical doctor and founded a Methodist hospital with William B. Scranton and Jack F. Heron. Additionally he initiated the Holy Spirit movement at Wonsan in 1903. He was a key person in the “Wonsan Revival” on the east coast of North Korea, which was a gathering by outpouring of faith and repentance. This event was a stepping stone for the Great Revival movement in Pyongyang in 1907, which was considered as the *Pyongyang Pentecost*. In addition to Rumsey’s missionary work, a Korean named Lee Youngdo also contributed. Lee Youngdo was very active in the Pentecostal movement in 1928. In the same year he established a place of prayer and was influential in the propagation of the Pentecostal movement.

Mary Rumsey later met Hong Hu the headquarters of the Salvation Army in 1931. She taught him the bible and he supported her missionary work. They established the “Seobingga church” in Seoul in March 1933 which was the first Pentecostal church. She emphasized speaking in tongues and divine healing.³¹ Besides Hong Hu, Sungsan Park and Bookeun Bae contributed as active leaders and became the first ordained ministers in the Korean Pentecostal Church.³² During the Japanese colonial period, when Christians were oppressed and persecuted by the colonial government due to their refusal of the Japanese Shinto-worship, many churches including Pentecostal Churches were closed and missionaries left Korea. After the end of the Second World War they came back, gathered the scattered Pentecostal Christians and formed congregations.

The official Pentecostal church was established after the Japanese colonial period. The official missionary from the US Assembly of God

²⁹ Lee, Young-hoon, “The Korean Holy Spirit Movement in Relation to Pentecostalism”, op.cit., 419.

³⁰ Cf. Richardson, Christopher, “Revolution and Revival. Ideology and Faith in North Korea”, in: Sino-NK, 23.06.2017, <http://sinonk.com/2017/06/23/revolution-and-revival-ideology-and-faith-in-north-korea/> (20.04.2020).

³¹ Lee, Young-hoon, “The Korean Holy Spirit Movement in Relation to Pentecostalism”, op. cit., 419.

³² Jeongyoul, Han, “The First Missionary of Pentecostal Church Mary C. Rumsey”, in: Research on Missionaries in Korea, Seoul 2011, 191, 195~197; 60 years anniversary of the Assembly of God in Korea, Seoul 2015, 40~49.

was Abner Chesnut, who arrived in 1952. In 1953 the Korean Assembly of God was officially organized and in 1954 they opened their own theological seminary.³³ Hong Hu took the first position as the Korean chairperson in the Korean Assembly of God. Since the liberation of the country did not come through the Korean people, even though they played a significant role in the independence movement, the political situation changed rapidly and brought serious conflict between lines of ideologies which finally led to Korean War. In the postwar period, where people suffered under the lack of material needs and faced a spiritually difficult situation, there was a deep longing for hope and faith in God. Since then the Pentecostal churches have expanded rapidly like other denominational churches.

Historically North Korea used to be the cradle of Korean Christianity. Pyongyang was a central place of the 1907 Christian gathering, which is referred to as the “Korean Pentecost”. After the Japan-Korea Treaty of 1905 people were very disappointed with the Korean government. The Korean people yearned for God’s help to escape from their despair. The Pyongyang revival rally was a pivotal event that developed the Pentecostal movement in Korea. Like Solnae Church in North Korea, which was founded by genuine Korean people³⁴, the full gospel Church was developed mostly by Koreans, although there were also American missionaries. However, despite it being a revival movement, there was a certain lack of understanding of sin, because they considered merely wrongdoing as sin. Structural sins and social problems were not mentioned and were rather neglected. This spiritual revival movement was compared to John Wesley’s revival.³⁵ Through bible study and prayer meetings, people collectively experienced spiritual revival which was prepared for by the Canadian medical doctor Robert A. Hardie (1865-1949) in Wonsan 1903. Samuel Hugh Moffett (1916-2015), who was born in Pyongyang as the son of missiologist Samuel Austin Moffet (1864-1939), described this Pentecostal movement, claiming that: “Christians went from house to house confessing their sins to those whom they had wronged. Missionaries and Korean Christians, convicted together of their shortcomings, had never known

³³ Synan, Vinson, *In the Latter Days*, op. cit., 240ff.

³⁴ Even US missionaries recognized this fact. Cf. Underwood, Lillias Horton, *Fifteen years among the top-knots, or life in Korea*, Seoul 21977, 130.

³⁵ Moffett, Samuel Hugh, *The Christians of Korea*, New York 1962, 52.

a closer fellowship.”³⁶ People considered individual wrongdoings and shortcomings as a sin. It shows how they defined sin and they repented their behavior. The Social dimension of sin and structural problems were not mentioned. This is still a problem today, where many Korean Christians are individually oriented rather than pursuing the common goodness of the public community.

The second event took place in 1958 when, under the rubble of a ruinous war, the Korean Pentecostal Church (Assembly of God) was founded. The ideology of the Cold War and yearning for economic growth was incorporated into the rapidly growing populace of Pentecostalism, and found fertile soil among people whose primary concern was material and economic growth. While Western society was facing the problem of proliferate secularization during the 1950s, people in Korea were learning how to live with the aftermath of Japanese colonial rule and the Korean War. In these difficult times Korean believers never lost their zeal and their desire for God. Following significant economic growth the ecclesiastical landscape changed somewhat, but a living relationship with God, even if it is sometimes associated with the fear of punishment, remains a point of emphasis in the Korean Church even today.³⁷

The largest congregation among them was developed under the former leadership of David Yonggi Cho, who is still very active in preaching. The emergence and growth of this congregation has to do with the Pentecostal pioneers Choi Jashil (1915-1989)³⁸ and David Cho Yonggi (born 1936),³⁹ who met at the same Bible school. They began a church ministry together, with their meeting place being Choi's apartment and then a tent in the following year. From the beginning both leaders placed much emphasis on prayer and healing.⁴⁰ After these

³⁶ Ibid., 54.

³⁷ See Lee, Hong-Jung, “Minjung and Pentecostal Movements in Korea”, in: Anderson, Allan H./Hollenweger, Walter J. (eds.), *Pentecostals After a Century: Global Perspectives on a Movement in Transition*, London 1999, 141.

³⁸ Regarding Yonggi Cho's mother-in-law, see Choi, Jashil, *Wunder in Korea: Durch Fasten und Gebet*, Karlsruhe 1981.

³⁹ See “Emeritus Pastor Cho”, online: <http://davidcho.fgtv.com> (15.08.2017).

⁴⁰ Healing ministry is one of the most important components of Yoido Full Gospel Church. Early in his ministry David Cho healed a disabled woman and her son, and this had a significant influence on the growth of the congregation. This story is comparable to C. Blumhardt's healing ministry that began with Gottliebin Dittus.

humble beginnings the community witnessed rapid growth, gaining more than 100,000 members within a few decades. This created a series of logistical challenges with respect to meeting space and the church saw the need to relocate a number of times. In 1973 the community finally moved to its present site, and today Yoido Full Gospel Church has 750,000 registered members.⁴¹ Referring to this megachurch, Harvey Cox legitimately asks whether such a phenomenon ought to be criticized as an expression of mere syncretism or presented as evidence of the positive and transformative power of the Holy Spirit.⁴² This congregation separated from the Korean Assembly of God and joined in December 1984 the international Assemblies of God.⁴³

A specific feature of the Yoido Full Gospel Church (YFGC) is its "Prayer Mountain," a retreat center for prayer and fasting where mystical revelations and other experiences with the Holy Spirit are not uncommon. Walter Hollenweger calls this phenomenon, along with dreams, "a kind of icon for the individual and the community."⁴⁴

Korean Catholic Pentecostal movement

In the early days of Korean Catholicism, after severe martyrdom, the Korean mission was led at first by French priests. In 1908, Bishop Gustave Charles Marie Mutel (1854–1933) from France, who had played a significant role in Korean mission work, visited Europe, seeking colleagues to work with him in Korea.⁴⁵ He found there a German supporter for his mission.⁴⁶ This was how the German Benedictine mission began to flourish in Korea. At the time they

⁴¹ Cf. Lee, Young-Hoon, *The Holy Spirit Movement in Korea*, 91–117.

⁴² Cox, Harvey, *Fire from Heaven: The Rise of Pentecostal Spirituality and the Reshaping of Religion in the Twenty-first Century*, Cambridge 2001, 219ff.

⁴³ See Anderson, Allan Heaton, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism*, 152; <http://yfgc.fgtv.com/y1/040303.asp> (29.09.2017).

⁴⁴ Hollenweger, Walter J., "After Twenty Years' Research on Pentecostalism", in: *International Review of Mission*, No. 75 (1986), 6.

⁴⁵ Mahr, Johannes, *Aufgehobene Häuser: Missionsbenediktiner in Ostasien*, vol. 1: Von Seoul zur Nordmission, Sankt Ottilien 2009, 49ff.

⁴⁶ The diary of Archbishop Mutel shows how long this process takes to find some co-workers and how community of St. Ottilien in Germany is involved in Mission in Korea. He wanted to find some support for her education and support by Europeans. Mutel, Gustave Charles Marie, *Journal de Mgr. Mutel 1906–1910*, vol. 4, translated by Research Institute of Korean Church history, ed. by Choi Sukwoo, Seoul 2008, 233, 282, 308–311. Finally on February 25, 1909 two Benedictine priests, Dominicus Enshoff and Bonifacio Sauer, arrived in Korea. *Ibid.*, 282, 358.

needed a new concept of mission and a geographical mission field for strategic development. The German Benedictine mission in East Africa had not achieved the desired results, partly because of political tension between the British colonial government and Germans in East Africa.⁴⁷ They have been contributing in the production of educational books including audio-video materials and vocational training. All these facts show how Europeans, especially the French and Germans, were involved in the development of the Catholic Church in Korea.

Besides this involvement of Europeans there was also a contribution from the US Catholics: Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers which was founded in 1911 as the Catholic Foreign Mission Society of America, officially started a Korean branch in 1923. They became more active after the Korean War. Based on the Second Vatican Council in 1966 professors and students of De quesne University in USA started the Pentecostal movement through bible studies, prayer meetings and so on. In February 1967 they experienced the baptism of the Holy Spirit collectively.⁴⁸ Since then this movement has expanded broadly in the USA. In 1971 Maryknoll missionary priest Joseph Slaby M.M. introduced this movement to Korea. In January 1974 a seminar about the transformative Holy Spirit movement was held.⁴⁹ This kind of movement restored pneumatology within Catholic churches, and helped highlight the spiritual dimension that was excluded in Christian life.

In this context I want to introduce a Catholic NGO, the Kkottongnae movement, which emerged in 1976⁵⁰, as an example of a Pentecostal movement, because they are well-known for their outreach programs for people in need. They focus on the fourfold goals of love, happiness, welfare and education. It is similar to the Focolare movement which started in Italy.⁵¹ It is not only a charity organization, but also a holistic center run with the help of the Holy Spirit. In 2009 they hosted an

⁴⁷ Mahr, Johannes, "Wie meine Mutter den Sauerteig benutzt hat": Benediktiner als Missionare in Korea und Nordostchina 1909–1954", in: Journal of Research on Church History, No. 33 (2009), 5.

⁴⁸ Cf. Institute of Catholic Church History (ed.), "Charismatic Transformative Movement of Catholic Church", in: Catholic Encyclopedia, 1985, 622.

⁴⁹ Cf. Song, Kwangsub, "Catholic Charismatic Transformative Movement", in: Theological Prospect, No. 67 (1984) 12, 24–26.

⁵⁰ About Kkottongnae see <http://eng.kkot.or.kr> (05.10.2017).

⁵¹ To elaborate two practical examples of focolare in Italy and Kkottongnae movement in Korea see Kim, Shin-Myung, Pneumatology of Catholic Charismatic Movement (The Graduate School of Theology, Presbyterian University 2013), 61–68.

International Catholic Charismatic Renewal Services event. The Kkottongnae welfare facilities have developed on the basis of the charismatic prayer meeting. This institution is not a charity foundation, but a Catholic community focused on human salvation accompanied with welfare services. Their perception of healing includes not only physical recovery, but also spiritual healing. They offer a shelter for the needy and take care of them, providing them with food and a place to rest. However, their main focus is on the true healing of sickness through spiritual service. Faith-based love and prayers are prerequisites for serving others as well as for themselves. Their Charismatic prayer meeting started in 1997 which is a core mandatory activity as a member of the Christian community. Their goal, shown in their mission statement, is to create a world in which no one is forsaken, in which everyone is respected just as God is, and in which everyone loves his neighbor as he loves himself.

Additionally they offer a place to hold retreats for the next generation. The Kkottona-gae Holy Spirit retreat program for youth aims to help youth to receive the Holy Spirit and to realize God's presence. This retreat pursues healing of the body and mind holistically. They want to provide time for self-reflection retrospectively. It helps teens and young adults discover their true being with the Holy Spirit in order to find life-changing benefits. This kind of self-transformation will lead to transformation of society as well.⁵²

Personal relationship with God, which is symbolized as a vertical relationship between God and the human being, is well developed. However, the horizontal relationship between human beings and cocreatures including, nature, is not reinforced.

The Characteristics of Pneumatology of the Pentecostal Movement

No matter what religion, there is always some commonality of interest: Wealth and honor, good health and longevity, and being prosperous in everything. The Pentecostal church became representative of this kind of prosperity, because they underlined this aspect more obviously than other denominations. Essential features of the Pentecostal movement are connected to Pneumatology. In general, the Pentecostal movement underlined the visible gift of the Holy Spirit.

⁵² Charismatic prayer meeting see <http://eng.kkot.or.kr> (05.10.2017).

"The Spirit causes people to 'receive' the Spirit, to prophesy, speak in tongues, heal, exorcize demons, have visions and dreams, live 'holy' lives-and generally the Spirit directs the life and worship of these churches, and is the 'leader' of all its activities."⁵³

In specific the basic tenets of the Yoido Full Gospel Church can be summarized as "threefold blessings" and "fivefold good news," the latter referring to salvation (rebirth), the fullness of the Holy Spirit, healing, blessing, and the second coming of Jesus.⁵⁴ The former refers to "prosperity of the soul", "prosperity in all things", and "a healthy life."⁵⁵ David Cho based his preaching of prosperity on the following verse: "Dear friend, I pray that all may go well with you. I hope that you are as strong in body, as I know you are in spirit" (3 John 1, 2).⁵⁶

David Cho underlined the following dimensions of his prosperity ministry: blessing and prosperity, divine healing, successful home cell groups, and prayer for revival.⁵⁷ Especially organizing cell groups helps to find an organic church. "Prosperity" is one of Cho's favorite terms. He insists that the theology of prosperity is not problematic. In order to receive God's blessing, it is not wrong to pray for that blessing. To receive God's blessing is the natural desire of all human beings.

"Some theologians claim that if a person asks God to bless him in a material sense, he is in a low spiritual state. They call it 'prosperity religion.' Is this wrong? Where can we go to be blessed if not to God? When God created the heavens and the earth and all the things that

⁵³ Anderson, Allan Heaton, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism*, 189.

⁵⁴ To illustrate the strength of this congregation, consider a few simple keywords: good networking system as an organic model, extensive human resources, accessibility to every local area, spontaneity, narrativity, and emotional approach, among others.

⁵⁵ Foursquare gospel and the threefold blessing are interrelated. However, a healthy, long life and material blessings are not exclusive to Pentecostal prosperity. These concepts already existed in ancient Korean religiosity prior to the arrival of Pentecostalism. For instance, the core values of Taoism, which is one of the essential parts of traditional Korean thought, include eating well, living a healthy, long life with abundant material blessings, and attaining eternal life – all of these elements can be seen to have influenced Korean Christianity. However, such thinking reduces the biblical understanding of "blessing" to material blessings for individuals and families. The Taoist idea of eternal life and the idea of a Taoist hermit with supernatural powers are confused with the Christian understanding of resurrection and syncretism.

⁵⁶ Cf. Cho, Yonggi, "The Secret Behind the World's Biggest Church", in: McClung, L. Grant Jr. (ed.), *Azusa Street and Beyond*, Alachua, FL 20012, 135.

⁵⁷ Cf. Lee, Young-hoon, "Life and Ministry of David Yonggi Cho and the Yoido Full Gospel Church", in: *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies*, No. 7 (2004) 1, 15.

are in it, He also blessed man...The message of a pastor is to include God's blessings. Obviously, it is wrong to proclaim only material blessings. Above all, pastors must preach the redemption of Jesus Christ.”⁵⁸

The main aspects of Cho's success may have been his simple testimony to the truth of the Bible and his personal charisma. Cho's early preaching was contextually appropriate, optimistic, and widely accepted by ordinary people. This witness is related to his own healing experiences that are very impressive to the general population. Hearing promises of healing, socially marginalized people were consoled and encouraged. In terms of theological doctrine, fundamental theology is overall much more affected by the theology of David Cho. The influence of intensive prayer and revival each partially account for the rapid growth of Pentecostalism.⁵⁹

Besides these components the geographical situation of the congregation also played a significant role. Those who were situated near the church in the beginning were, on average, marginalized groups. Cho's encouraging witness offered support for many of these people. Additionally the political situation in the 1970s indirectly helped church development because, under the political dictatorship of the time, people were not allowed to gather in large groups except for evangelistic purposes. The desire to be part of a close-knit yet larger community undoubtedly helped promote the expansion of membership.⁶⁰ Within the congregation there are small cells in which uninhibited open talks about faith are possible and where the members strengthen each other's faith.

Currently the Full Gospel Church retains a franchisee-style structure.⁶¹ Though Protestant churches do not generally have any parochial system, within the capital city of Seoul there are several branches, providing easy access to many parts of the city. Their cell-group structure is renowned nationwide. It allows intimate relationships within mega churches. Such governing models were not only adopted by other denominational churches, but even by Buddhist

⁵⁸ Cho, Yonggi, op. cit., 135.

⁵⁹ Bae, Dukman, “Inquiry of the Growth of the Yoido Full Gospel Church”, in: Pentecostal Theology in the 21st Century, Daejon 2009, 271ff.

⁶⁰ Ibid., 286.

⁶¹ Cf. <http://www.newsjoy.or.kr/news/articleView.html?idxno=210335> (15.04.2017.)

temples. Due to its large size the church is able to manage its own university,⁶² newspaper⁶³ and broadcasting company⁶⁴ like a “*chaebol* pastor.”⁶⁵ David Cho’s Church became a big conglomerate, a sort of religious *Chaebol*. After several splits due to theological interpretations and diverse opinions about regulations, they merged together under the umbrella of Gidokyo Daehan Assembly of God in 1991.⁶⁶ Compared to previous decades YFGC is currently more involved with ecumenical movements in general. They initiated ecumenical relationships which lead to various levels of collaboration with other denominations. This opened new horizons towards other Christian traditions. Since they are able to establish and operate universities and newspaper companies, it shows how largely influential they are in society, both as opinion leaders as well as at an academic level.

They founded the Elim foundation and the welfare town for diaconal work in 1986.⁶⁷ Based on Exodus 15:27 they are seeking for 12 water resources in order to accomplish social welfare work focusing on special vocational training of youth and on elderly care. Due to financial opacity and misuse of funds he and his family were connected to some issues of corruption and convicted in 2017.⁶⁸ Cho Yongmok, the brother of David Cho took over the representative position of his brother in the Elim foundation in 2017 after his brother was convicted due to the corruption scandal.

In terms of liturgy Korean Pentecostalism is generally more formal than other Pentecostal types, because their liturgy and hymns are rather adapted by the Presbyterian churches in Korea.⁶⁹ Additionally unlike most Pentecostals in other parts of the globe, Korean Pentecostal

⁶² Cf. <http://www.hansei.ac.kr> (15.04.2017).

⁶³ Cf. <http://www.kmib.co.kr/news/index.asp> (15.04.2017).

⁶⁴ Cf. <http://www.fgtv.com/fgtv> (15.04.2017).

⁶⁵ *Chaebol* refers to the dominant company on which a conglomerate of small companies depend. Regarding Confucianism, Calvinism and economic growth, see Ro, Youngchan, “Korean Worldview and Values: Economic Implications”, in: *The Review of Korean Studies*, No. 2 (1999), 50ff.

⁶⁶ Since 2010 they have tried to have a common law and in 2013 agreed on it. The Law of the Assemblies of God of Korea, Seoul 2013, 8–9; Lee, Younghoon (ed.), 60 years history of Assembly of God with Holy Spirit, Seoul 2015, 112–116.

⁶⁷ Cf. <http://www.elimtown.org> (15.08.2017).

⁶⁸ Cf. http://iilo.co.kr/?ac=article_view&entry_id=248128 (15.04.2017).

⁶⁹ Anderson, Allan Heaton, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism*, 136.

congregations recite even the Apostles' Creed during worship.⁷⁰ The Korean Assembly of God joined the Korean National Council of Churches in 1999 which is an ecumenical umbrella organisation. In 2008 Young Hoon Lee took over the position of senior pastor in YFGC, which changed the name in 1984 into the current form. In the interview with the current Pastor Lee, he is compared to water, while his predecessor was symbolized as fire. Previously, they concentrated on numerical growth, in comparison to their current focus on internal growth.⁷¹

In the triune God, the Holy Spirit shows the dimension of God's femininity. Regarding this divine femininity, we could find three patterns: vitality, diversity and solidarity. The Holy Spirit is the sign of de-masculinization and de-classism.⁷² The Holy Spirit works as the mother and as the origin of life experience for liberation, freedom and justice.⁷³

Elisabeth Johnson, a US feminist theologian pointed out that the phenomena of neglecting pneumatology happened not only in Protestant theology, but also in Catholic theology.⁷⁴ In her words, "Neglect of the Spirit and the marginalizing of women have a symbolic affinity and may well go hand in hand...What is most baffling about forgetfulness of the Spirit is that what is being neglected is nothing less than the mystery of God's personal engagement with the world in its history of love and disaster; nothing less than God's empowering presence dialectically active within the world in the beginning, throughout history and to the end, calling forth the praxis of life and freedom. Forgetting the Spirit is not ignoring a faceless, shadowy third hypostasis but the mystery of God closer to us than we are to ourselves, drawing near and passing by in quickening, liberating compassion."⁷⁵ The Restoring pneumatology in the light of the trinity makes it important to keep a balance in theological reflection.

⁷⁰ Ibid., 137.

⁷¹ Cf. <http://shindonga.donga.com/3/all/13/1088345/1> (15.09.2017).

⁷² Cf. Park, Soonkyung, Women of The Third World and Theology, Journey to Theology of Unification, Seoul 1992, 268–269; Barth, Karl, Church, Edinburgh 1932–1967.

⁷³ The German Theologian Jürgen Moltmann elaborates Holy Spirit with personal metaphors as Lord (dominum), Mother and Judge who is giver of life (vivificantem). Moltmann, Jürgen, The Spirit of Life: A Universal Affirmation, Minneapolis 1992, 270–274.

⁷⁴ Cf. Johnson, Elizabeth A., She who is: the mystery of God in feminist theological discourse, New York 2002, 128–131.

⁷⁵ Ibid., 131.

The Holy Spirit supports the dynamic vitality of such a movement. The Holy Spirit recognizes diversity and supports inclusivism. The Holy Spirit helps to liberate people from the bondage of all kinds of oppression. The value of vitality as movement, diversity and solidarity through compassion with people are three keywords regarding pneumatology.

The Pentecostal Church, which is represented as YFGC and the Kkottonagae as a Holy Spirit movement of the Catholic Church show exemplary compassion with marginalized people. This dimension should be reinforced while the transparency of financial matters should be guaranteed. Additionally we need to expand our horizon to fight against structural sins which cause multi-faceted oppression. Christians shouldn't remain as tamed consumer under the current one dimensional capital system, which causes many kind of destruction on our planet. without thinking of an alternative life style

Closing remarks

The Korean Protestant Pentecostal Church was started by the motivation and action of indigenous Koreans before organized foreign missions were introduced to Korea. They were the leading organ for intensive prayer in the prayer mountain movement which is now widely spread over the whole nation, regardless of denomination.⁷⁶ Despite denominational differences, early morning prayers connect all Christians in a common method of community building. The other contribution of the Pentecostal movement was the healing ministry and diaconal work.

The Protestant church generally underlined work ethics without thinking of a work-life balance. We need to recover these values and can do so by rediscovering contemplative prayer and a life of modesty. We can then have a balance between prayer and action rather than imbalance or tension. I believe that it is an inescapable demand of our age to the churches that they must pursue a practical ecumenical orientation to learn from each other as a learning community, to sustain vitality, diversity and solidarity. Through this kind of cooperation with the

⁷⁶ For instance Jesus Abbey is a meditative prayer center which was founded by a priest of the episcopal church 1965. It is a center for reconciliation and peace. <http://www.jabbey.org/bbs/main.php> (15.09.2017).

help of the Holy Spirit it is necessary to connect people more towards global issues such as ecological justice and economic disparity.

Overall the Pentecostal movement is now facing challenges for internal qualitative growth, like other denominations. It implies a paradigm shift from an individual oriented mind-set to a socially-oriented mind-set. It means that our faith communities should be more involved with social issues and express communal goodness through our lifestyle. Additionally highlighting the personhood of the Holy Spirit and personal experience implies the danger of personal cult. We must overcome personal cults, which involve a very pastor-centered structure in the congregation. This should be reoriented into a democratic system within the church structure. In terms of pastoral caring, the Pentecostal movement has been rather successful in comforting marginalised people in comparison to the Minjung theology, which remains more a theory and hasn't appealed so much to the Minjung themselves. But there is a danger of privatisation of the faith focusing on expected material blessing by any means without critical thoughts about structural sins. The value of the Holy Spirit should not be limited to material blessings and health.

Reflecting on the renewal power of the Holy Spirit will help us correct our egocentric privatisation of faith and remind us of our interconnectedness for life. The Holy Spirit is not our property, although we mistakenly think that we possess it. The Holy Spirit is a Spirit of liberty which leads us to break the bondage of oppression and fear. (Joh 8:31-32) To pray to the Holy Spirit is to correct our attitude of dominance and overpowering against others. Thus, the Pentecostal movement, which is related to the Holy Spirit, should remain as a vital movement against the megachurch syndrome, and pursue qualitative growth. Further theological reflection on the trinity will help us correct our limitations of onesidedness.

Pentecostalism in Latin America Today Dissemination and Trends

Brenda Carranza and Christina Vital da Cunha

The stage of Pentecostalisation in Latin America is shared by an uneasy pair of protagonists: Protestant Pentecostalism and Charismatic Catholicism, united by identical pneumatology and the use of performative elements. The development of Latin American Pentecostalism, Catholic and Protestant alike, is marked by fierce disputes as a result of the fact that followers are fighting over the same field, namely that of Catholicism. Political alliances aimed at consolidating a moral direction to be imposed on society as a whole in the name of the Christian tradition of Latin America also exacerbate the strained evolution of this particular religious current.

Which phases has Pentecostalism witnessed in the course of its 111-year presence on the Latin American continent? Which factors facilitate its infiltration within socio-religious contexts? Which interpretation can be found for its astonishing expansion in an Ibero-American America influenced to such a large extent by baroque Catholicism?

In response to these questions we cite works from the extensive canon of specialist literature which trace the manner in which Pentecostalism took root in Latin America. In our concluding remarks we reflect on a new phase of Latin American Pentecostalism which is marked by radical changes in the relationship between politics and religion. These changes lead to conflicts which, on the one hand, threaten the fragile young democracies and, on the other, challenge certain theologies and their representatives in public life.

Our line of argument refers to the case of Brazil. In one sense this has to do with the internationalisation of a certain Pentecostal style, in another to the manner in which its influence has spread to other countries in the region. We assert that Pentecostalisation constitutes a deep, irreversible transformation of Christianity as well as a place of encounter in Latin America.

Pentecostal fervour

"All nations are represented as they were in Jerusalem. They are here in their thousands, from all nations and from many parts of the earth, sent by God to 'pour out the Holy Spirit' [...] These [missionaries] will carry the fire to all the corners of the earth. The missionary zeal is a white warmth. The revival will undoubtedly hold the whole world in its thrall."⁷⁷ This statement appeared in *The Apostolic Faith*, the first Pentecostal magazine which was published back in 1906, when African-born William Joseph Seymour ushered in a new phase of Christianity in Azusa Street in the industrial neighbourhood of Los Angeles, USA. The theology of the Holy Spirit occupied a place at the very epicentre of this new wave of spiritual revival and the ardent preachers attracted considerable crowds made up of the poor, black people and the inhabitants of the urban fringes, all of whom flocked to hear the promise of gifts and charismata which were said to free the faithful from physical and spiritual evils.

Fifty years later the intense emotionality of physical expression (clapping of hands, shouting out, raising hands to the skies) would blend smoothly into gospel music, subsequently coalescing with the bliss to be found in peace of mind and the allure of spiritual consolation in the face of daily misery, all of which exerted an appeal for Catholic Christians. This time, Pentecostalism was embraced by young middle-class white students at the University of Duquesne in Pennsylvania, USA (1967), spreading through prayer groups in American parishes. This is how the Catholic Charismatic Renewal Movement (CE) was born, which on its website estimates the number of Catholic members in 200 countries at over 120 million.⁷⁸ The Catholic renewal in Latin America was led, among others, by Francis MacNutt, who carried the masses along in the same way as the Pentecostal "televangelists". He exerted his influence predominantly by appearing at large-scale events, the so-called "cenacles".⁷⁹

In a study published in 2014, the Pew Forum declared that approximately half of the Protestants in Latin American countries belong

⁷⁷ Miller, Denzil, From Azusa to Africa to the Nations, Malawi 2005, 37.

⁷⁸ Cf. International Catholic Charismatic Renewal (ICCRS), <http://www.iccrs.org/en/ababout-iccrs/> (10.09.2018).

⁷⁹ Cf. Cleary, Edward L., The Rise of Charismatic Catholicism in Latin America, Florida 2011, 10f.

to a Pentecostal church. In countries including the Dominican Republic, Brazil and Panama around eight out of ten Protestants belong to a Pentecostal church or call themselves Pentecostals, regardless of the denomination to which they belong. In Nicaragua, Guatemala, Argentina, Honduras, Ecuador and Chile two thirds or more are Pentecostals by denomination, personal affiliation or both.⁸⁰ There are statistics to verify this explosive increase. The Pentecostal movement has swelled from initially one million followers in 1940 to 70 million in the first decade of the third millennium, experiencing increasing growth rates from six per cent (1960) to 15 per cent in 2010.⁸¹

Of the 425 million Latin American Catholics, who constitute 40 per cent of all Catholics worldwide, one in five describes him- or herself as a follower of the Charismatic Movement. In almost all places studied by the Pew Forum those who call themselves followers of the Charismatic Renewal represent a not inconsiderable proportion of the Catholic population.⁸² In countries including Panama, Brazil, Honduras, the Dominican Republic and El Salvador half of the Catholics state that they are followers of the Charismatic Renewal Movement. Of the Hispanic Americans living in the United States almost half (46 per cent) consider themselves part of the Charismatic Movement.⁸³

Azusa Street and Pennsylvania, Pentecostalism and the Charismatic Movement have become a global factor within Christianity. The widespread experiences of divine revelation among followers together with the practice of exorcism, the interpretation of prophecies and the gift of speaking in tongues (glossolalia) are changing Christianity irrevocably.⁸⁴ With the exception of a few country-specific nuances

⁸⁰ Cf. Pew Research Center (ed.), *Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region*, Washington DC 2014, 64, <http://assets.pewresearch.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/11/2014/11/Religion-in-Latin-America-11-12-PM-full-PDF.pdf> (10.09.2018).

⁸¹ Cf. Jenkins, Philip, "Evangelicals – Pentecostal Churches – Charismatics: New Religious Movements as a Challenge for the Catholic Church", in: Müller, Johannes/Gabriel, Karl (eds.), *Evangelicals, pentecostal churches, charismatics: new religious movements as a challenge for the Catholic Church*, Quezon City 2015, 285–312, here: 287

⁸² Cf. The Pew Research Center (ed.), <http://www.pewforum.org/2014/11/13/chapter-4-pentecostalism/>, (07.07.2018).

⁸³ Cf. *ibid.*, (07.07.2018).

⁸⁴ Cf. Wilkinson, Michael, *Introduction to Global Pentecostal Movements: Migration, Mission, and Public Religion*, Leiden/Boston 2012, 8.

the historical course of Latin American Pentecostalism can be described on the basis of the three great waves which saw it spread throughout Brazil.⁸⁵

In the first wave (1910-1950) the missionary Pentecostal movement was washed to South America, along with its eschatological urge to save Catholic souls, in particular, before the second coming of Christ, revealing a missionary zeal which unleashed an anti-Catholic and iconoclastic crusade. Thereafter (1950-1970), an avalanche of churches rolled across the country, using electronic media such as radio and TV to spread their proselytising message in the form of sermons on the liberation of society from evil (in both the individual and the community). The third wave (1980) brought with it what was called neo-Pentecostalism, which appealed to broad sections of society and, strengthened by praise performed in specific gospel style, spread its ideas with the help of the established Protestant media.⁸⁶

One specific characteristic of this new phase was the setting up of religious representatives as politicians and their installation in political office. This marked a change of direction from the apolitical attitude of the early days, when party politics was considered "dirty" and "the work of the devil". In order to disseminate a new image, and to legitimise this political participation in the eyes of their followers, leaders and official representatives referred to the necessity to drive the demons out of politics via the presence of *men of God*. Little by little the churches became election campaigners along the lines of "brother stands by brother" and so the Neopentecostals' march on the legislative bodies began.

Mention must also be made of the theology of prosperity, which is one of the main features of Protestant Pentecostalism. In this world view the relationship with God can be compared to a form of bartering, whereby God rewards his believers with economic

⁸⁵ Cf. Freston, Paul, "As duas transições futuras: católicos, protestantes e sociedade na América Latina", in: Ciencias Sociales y Religión/Ciências Sociais e Religião, No. 12 (2010) 12, 13–30.

⁸⁶ In many Latin American countries, such as Brazil, Pentecostals are permitted media franchises. In other countries, such as Mexico, these are not allowed, but adherents may rent on-air advertising time. Cf. Doran, Marie-Christine, "Igreja Universal no México", in: Oro, Ari Pedro et al. (eds.), Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus: Os novos conquistadores da fé, São Paulo 2003, 96.

advancement.⁸⁷ This theology promises visible rewards, combining as it does faith in physical salvation through spiritual salvation with the promise of health, success and prosperity if the believer funds the work of evangelism.⁸⁸

In Spanish-speaking countries this is referred to as the Gospel of Prosperity and it is highly popular, being observed by 56 per cent of believers in Brazil and up to 91 per cent of those in Venezuela.⁸⁹ In Latin America, particular emphasis is placed on healing by God's hand, according to which followers are healed of diseases by divine intervention.⁹⁰ Although this theology is attributed only to Pentecostals, the conviction that God gives wealth and health to firm believers is widespread among Central American Catholics and those in Venezuela, Colombia, the Dominican Republic and Ecuador.⁹¹

At this juncture, we will address the changes in Latin American Pentecostalism in order to allude to a fourth wave. In doing so we will consider just two characteristics of this new phase which have emerged in the past two decades. On the one hand, the broad internationalisation of some neo-Pentecostal churches has come about as the result of the migration flows of churches and congregations in the diaspora.⁹² These are distinguished by the architectural splendour of their temples, which they erect in the midst of metropolises, as they export their own Pentecostal experience from Latin America.⁹³

⁸⁷ Cf. Ricardo, Mariano, "O reino da prosperidade da Igreja Universal", in: Oro, Ari Pedro et al. (eds.), *Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus: Os novos conquistadores da fé*, São Paulo 2003, 237–258.

⁸⁸ Neo-Pentecostal churches in Brazil are embroiled in countless scandals, illustrated by the case of the Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus (IURD) [Universal Church of the Kingdom of God], founded in Rio de Janeiro in 1977, whose leaders are accused in (international) proceedings of the embezzlement of the tithe and of holding millions in private assets.

⁸⁹ Cf. Pew Research Center (ed.), op. cit., 69.

⁹⁰ Ibid., 64.

⁹¹ Ibid., 68.

⁹² Cf. Rocha, Cristina, *Transnational Pentecostal Connections: An Australian Mega-church and a Bra-zilian Church in Australia*, n. p. 2013, see <http://dx.doi.org/10.1558/ptcs.v12i1.62> (07.07.2018).

⁹³ An example of neo-Pentecostal trans-nationalisation is the Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus, which has branches in countries such as Mexico, Argentina, Venezuela, Ivory Coast, Kenya, Mozambique, South Africa, the United Kingdom, Portugal, France – and naturally in the USA and Asia as well.

On the other hand, signs of increasingly conservative behaviour are becoming apparent. A political rise in religious groups has been observed which, among other things, demand the right to impose a certain Christian ethic and sexual morality on society in the name of a majority within Brazil's legislative bodies. A fight has broken out against social movements which seek to defend the sexual rights of minorities and discuss sexual morals in a secular context.⁹⁴ However, it should be added that the diversity of the movement (according to data from the Instituto Brasileiro de Geografia Estatística, almost 1,500 different Protestant denominations existed in Brazil in 2010) does not permit the conclusion that it is exclusively conservative. Nevertheless, it is noteworthy that the majority of key positions in politics, radio and television are occupied by religious leaders advocating extremist and/or conservative attitudes. In the alternative media progressive evangelical groups are growing in Brazil today, including movements such as Reimaginar (New Thinking) and Evangélicos pela Democracia (Evangelicals for Democracy).

Mexican scholars have identified areas of tension between religious stakeholders, political parties and ruling individuals in which the religious stakeholders try to reverse the traditional image of a society governed by lay people. The introduction of religious education in public schools has opened doors to Catholics and Evangelicals in this field.

In contrast, the path of Catholic Pentecostalism, with its impulses from Charismatic Renewal (CE), has resulted in the participation of Catholics in party politics. Here they work to preserve the Church's historical privileges or seek new relations with the state power. Numerous new Catholic congregations (led by lay people) are spreading and conducting evangelisation through social networks.⁹⁵ In this respect the media expansion of the Charismatic Renewal Movement (CE) was greatly inspired by Karol Wojtyla (John Paul II) and his pontificate.⁹⁶

⁹⁴ Cf. Vital da Cunha, Christina/Lopes, Paulo, Religião e Política: Uma análise da atuação de parlamentares evangélicos sobre direitos das mulheres e de LBTs no Brasil, Rio de Janeiro 2012.

⁹⁵ Cf. Carranza, Brenda, "Nova face da Igreja católica", in: da Silva Moreira, Alberto/Trombetta, Pino (eds.), Pentecostalismo Globalizado, Goiânia 2015, 70–93.

⁹⁶ Cf. Carranza, Brenda, Catolicismo midiático, n. p. 2011, 128–134.

In both public thinking and the media the Charismatics, who made use of similar performative spectacles, raised the question of who is a (Pentecostal) believer and who is a (Charismatic) Catholic?⁹⁷ This identity crisis forced the Charismatics to resort to the defence of ecclesiastical doctrine in order to strengthen their catholicity. They then availed themselves of certain types of circumscribing symbolism, such as the rosary, adoration of the Mother of God, regular confession and participation in mass, always with the aim of dispelling doubts about their affiliation with the Catholic Church. On the institutional side, long-standing conflicts between the hierarchy and lay leaders prevailed until Charismatic Renewal was eventually recognised. There were rejections and suspicions, but also arguments in favour of assimilation; the organisation of papal visits such as those by Francis in Mexico⁹⁸ and Brazil played a role too, the latter visit confirming the integration of the Catholic gospel style.⁹⁹

Both the Catholic and Protestant dispositions led to William Seymour's dream becoming reality in Latin America; in *The Apostolic Faith*, he wrote: "[...] this is the revival of the world, the last Pentecostal revival that brings our Jesus [...]. We hope that a wave of salvation will pass through this world."¹⁰⁰

Firm roots

The development of Protestant Pentecostalism has gone hand in hand with modernisation and urbanisation in Latin America in the second half of the 20th century and with migration from the countryside to the outskirts of cities. The Pentecostals have focused their efforts on these areas, which lack urban infrastructure, education options, health care and work. During the phase of industrial expansion and thanks to the disengagement of the state the impoverished sections of the population, consisting predominantly of black and indigenous people and mestizos, found solidarity networks in the churches of the

⁹⁷ Cleary, Edward L., op. cit., 31–54, 188–198.

⁹⁸ Cf. Várguez Pasos, Luis, "El Papa Francisco en México", in: Asociación de Cientistas Sociales de la Religión, newsletter No. 36, October 2016, 14.

⁹⁹ Cf. Carranza, Brenda, "Papa Francisco no Brasil alguns olhares", in: Cadernos de Teologia Pública, No. 7 (2013) 79, 31–37.

¹⁰⁰ Quoted from: Miller, Denzil, op. cit, 49.

Pentecostal movement and, in the empowerment which resulted, the opportunity, particularly for women, to assume a leading role in the community.¹⁰¹

The polycentric nature of Pentecostalism and its various centres, which tend to the socially vulnerable – occupying urban land, in a manner of speaking – is the reason for its widespread presence with small churches which attract thousands of followers. In contrast, the Catholic Church has offered insufficient support in the face of urban growth. The lack of priests and the tendency towards clericalisation have weakened it, as has the rejection of female participation in Church structures. The Pentecostals' hierarchical flexibility has facilitated their accelerated expansion into the Catholic domains.¹⁰²

Other reasons for the expansion of the Pentecostal movement are its creativity in terms of rituals and its sheer liturgical vitality (cult). In its churches followers find emotional and spiritual comfort (divine healing, exorcism), a theologically substantiated incentive to overcome poverty (Gospel of Prosperity), plausible explanations for their suffering (such as the spiritual war waged against evil incarnate in the form of urban violence) and a dense social network. The call to bear witness to God's work in one's personal biography has resulted in the subjectively experienced transformation of many followers, their changed behaviour in a community context (abstinence from alcohol, for instance) leading to a stabilisation of family life. Then there is the gospel style to be found in liturgical celebrations, the performative character and the media propagation of worship services (so-called "preacher shows"), all of which have spurred the process of religious modernisation and drawn young people into the churches. The integration of body and soul in this way has underpinned the success of the Catholic Charismatics, who combine their sermons with religious marketing.

However, Pentecostalism is not only flourishing in a religious context. In recent times it has offered fierce public resistance to

¹⁰¹ Cf. Oro, Ari Pedro/Wynarczyk, Hilario, "O pentecostalismo en América Latina", in: da Silva Moreira, Albert/Trombetta, Pino Lucà (eds.), *Pentecostalismo Globalizado*, Goiânia 2015, 32–46; Vital da Cunha, Cristina, *Oração de traficante: Uma etnografia*, Rio de Janeiro 2015.

¹⁰² Cf. Casanova, José, "New Religious Movements as a Global Phenomenon Between Secularization, Religious Revival and Fundamentalism", in: Müller, Johannes/Gebriel, Karl (eds.), op. cit., 66.

the cultural changes brought about by the secularisation of sexual morality, particularly as regards issues such as abortion, homosexual marriage and reproductive medicine. In an alliance with conservative sections of society, leaders of the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements are making considerable efforts to thwart political and juridical forces which seek to guarantee the right to sexual diversity, in particular. Similar developments can be observed in countries such as Guatemala, Argentina, Chile, Brazil and Mexico.¹⁰³ This development reconfigures the relationship between religion and state and calls the secular systems in Latin America into question by orchestrating a participation in constitutional bodies whose decisions endanger the diversity of social coexistence.¹⁰⁴

The Pentecostals and the Charismatics, who struck forth into the very midst of society, initiated the process of Pentecostalisation. This is a development which may help to explain the influence of Pentecostalism on society as well as on Christian institutions and religious interaction.¹⁰⁵ This Pentecostalisation reinvigorates Christianity and relentlessly transforms the socio-religious landscape of Latin America in the process. The social scenario, which has facilitated the organised, solidarity-based action of Pentecostals in the cities, especially in the outskirts, and the expansion and entrenchment of Pentecostalisation, has been exacerbated by poverty and a lack of protection in the face of an absent Catholic Church and an absent state.

The historical development of Pentecostalism in Latin America, knowledge of the mechanisms of its dissemination and an awareness of its continued changes give rise to the following questions: where is it heading today? What are its internal and external points of friction? What level of resistance to necessary analysis can be observed within its own ranks?

¹⁰³ Cf. Oro, Ari Pedro/Wynarczyk, Hilário, "O pentecostalismo en América Latina", op. cit., 32–46.

¹⁰⁴ Cf. de la Torre, Renée, Religious Diversity and its Challenges for Secularism in Mexico, 2017, 7, https://www.academia.edu/36564048/Religious_Diversity_and_its_Challenges_for_Secularism_in_Mexico (26.03.2019).

¹⁰⁵ Cf. Gooren, Henri, The Pentecostalization of Religion and Society in Latin America: First findings from Chile. Paper to be presented at Session B-1 "Religion in Latin America" at the Annual Meeting of the Society for the Scientific Study of Religion (SSSR) in Milwaukee, Wisconsin, 28 October 2011.

Hardening and Resistance

It has already been noted that we are currently experiencing a renewal of Pentecostalism in Latin America, as illustrated by the developments in Brazil. We will now describe one of the elements which we consider a symptom of this latest phase, namely the shift in emphasis from religious activism to politics. In contrast to the third wave of Pentecostalism, in which participation in election campaigns was justified by the expulsion of the evils of political corruption¹⁰⁶, contemporary religious activism seeks to undermine legal and constitutional instruments or, in other words, the guarantors of a secular state. The wise strategy of political participation, involving the assumption of political office by legal means, allows leaders to conduct discourses with a democratic rhetoric and, on that basis, to demand religious rights. In addition, we are currently observing a strategic approach to the filling of positions in executive bodies at national, state and local level.

Examples include the Frente Parlamentar Evangélica (Protestant Parliamentary Front) with 85 self-confessed Protestant deputies in the National Congress and the Frente Parlamentar Mista Católica, Apostólica Romana (mixed Catholic, Apostolic and Roman Parliamentary Front) with 20 self-proclaimed Catholics. Both groups represent a Christian militancy which has scored significant successes, including the suspension of approval for the Plano Nacional de Educação (PNE - National Education Plan 2014/2024), which also includes gender and sexual diversity issues, and the blocking of draft law 122/2006, which punishes homophobia.

This stance has been met with opposition from progressive parliamentarians (currently in the minority), but has received considerable acclaim from conservative and rural groups, in particular. It goes without saying that political conservatism cannot be reduced to the moral themes of religious actions, even if it includes them. However, in terms of the political game, the representatives of conservatism emphasise this morality, using it as a kind of “bargaining chip” to consolidate political capital at grass-roots level.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁶ Even though many of the religious politicians are involved in corruption scandals and are themselves on trial.

¹⁰⁷ Cf. Almeida, Ronaldo, “Os Deuses do Parlamento”, in: Novos Estudos CEBRAP-São Paulo, Especial Juni, 2017, 71–79; Vital da Cunha, Christina/Lopes, Paulo, Religião e Política: medos sociais, extremismo religioso e as eleições 2014, Rio de Janeiro 2017.

The zealous campaign of religious activists is based on the view that the feminist movement and sexual minorities threaten the stability of the traditional family and call creation theology into question. In the understanding of these religious politicians heteronormativity is a God-given law, so human laws must preserve it.¹⁰⁸ In contrast to current changes in democratic, pluralistic societies, these religious stakeholders are chiefly concerned with thwarting policies and laws which promote gender equality and sexual diversity.¹⁰⁹

We should pay particular attention to authoritarian arguments which, in reference to the sacred books of a religion, are presented as universally valid, thereby denying other social groups the right to public existence and to recognition as citizens. This form of interference poses a challenge to the democratic process of a secular state and its complex regulation of religion in the public sphere.

Although conservative Protestant and Catholic politicians and leaders set the tone in the media and enjoy great political and economic power, progressive politicians and religious groups do offer some resistance, as mentioned earlier. They join in with the social movement and make political appearances on social media promoting the message that the importance of Christianity, family, sexual diversity and womanhood in Brazil should be extended. In addition there are countless initiatives rooted in the Catholic Church or in the churches of the Pentecostal movement which advocate the implementation of this expansion within the religious environment by means of concrete action.¹¹⁰

Albeit in the minority, there are religious organisations and communities encompassing a wide range of different people who share the ideas of thousands of civil society activists and who together form a network of resistance against advancing conservatism. Dissidents

¹⁰⁸ Cf. Vital da Cunha, Christina, A ascensão do pentecostalismo: Da religião à política. Entrevista especial com Christina Vital, Instituto Humanitas – IHU, 19 April 2017, <http://www.ihu.unisinos.br/159-noticias/entrevistas/566735-ascensoao-do-pente-costalismo-da-religiao-a-politica-entrevista-especial-com-christina-vital> (07.07.2018).

¹⁰⁹ Cf. Vaggione, Juan, Desplazamientos estratégicos: reconfiguraciones políticas del activismo religioso conservador. Trabalho apresentado no Seminário Religião e Cultura na América Latina, Rio de Janeiro 2010.

¹¹⁰ Cf. Burity, Joaílido, “Ativismo religioso na esfera pública: quem é contra o quê, mesmo?”, in: ACSRM newsletter, No. 36, October 2017, 13f., here: 14, https://www.academia.edu/34908142/Newsletter_36_Octubre_2017 (07.07.2018).

from Pentecostal churches, such as the integrative churches, and Catholic LGBT (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transsexual) priests strongly oppose the theologies and hegemonic hermeneutics that have their representatives among religious politicians in the public sphere and illustrate the heterogeneity of the religious grass-roots.¹¹¹

These are focal points of resistance which merit attentive, analytical examination. They allow us to perhaps better understand how theological-political models which highlight an alternative approach to that of political self-representation in parliament can be consolidated. These are epicentres which combine religious, Pentecostal faith with socio-political commitment and exert public influence in the midst of civil society. We should consider the political, social and economic consequences of these clashes and the empowerment of these visible and invisible groups who are heirs to the lavish Pentecostal spirituality which is caught up in a process of constant metamorphosis and has been present in Latin America for over a century.

¹¹¹ Cf. Natividade, Marcelo, "Para além da 'intolerância': cristianismos, direitos e diversidade sexual", in: ACSRM newsletter, No. 36, October 2017, 15–20, here: 17, https://www.academia.edu/34908142/Newsletter_36_Octubre_2017 (07.07.2018).

The Development of African Pentecostalism

Asogwa Augustine Chikezie

One of the most fascinating and dramatic pages in the history of Christianity in Africa is that of the development of African Pentecostalism. The power and transforming influence it is welding within Christianity in Africa marvel any careful observer. Christianity in Africa has been radically Pentecostalized. The Pentecostalization of Christianity in Africa has therefore been rightly described as the “African Reformation” of the twentieth century¹¹². Indeed, the development and spread of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements, in its various forms, has permanently reshaped Christianity in Africa turning the continent into one of the movement’s biggest depots. This makes it imperative that any serious studies of African Christianity must take careful account of the development of and within African Pentecostalism.

However, notwithstanding, its spread and influence, defining African Pentecostalism is a herculean task. This is because it is a complex brand of Christianity harbouring an interesting variety and great diversity within it. This diversity is occasioned by the various ways through which pentecostal manifestations play out in diverse cultural, religious and political milieu. For this reason, it may be instructive to talk about African Pentecostalism in plural form. Be that as it may, the term African Pentecostalism(s) in this chapter refers to the many forms of spirit movements that engulfed African Christianity at the wake of the twentieth century, this movement places special emphasis on the replica of the event of the day of the Pentecost and subsequent acquisition and use of the spiritual gifts as listed in I Corinthians 12:7-12. In line with this, there is emphasis on the manifestations of spiritual phenomena like speaking in tongues, prophesies, visions, healing, miracles and signs and wonders¹¹³. African Pentecostals are found almost everywhere that there is Christian gathering. They

¹¹² Cf. Anderson, Allan, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism*, Cambridge 2004, 104.

¹¹³ Cf. Omenyo, Cephas, „African Pentecostalism“, in: Robeck, Cecil/Yong, Amos (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism*, Cambridge 2014, 132.

range from African Initiated Churches like the Aladura churches, the Classical Pentecostals with roots in the famous William Seymour's Azusa Street revival, the transdenominational fellowships like the Full Gospel Business Men's Fellowship, the Charismatic movements in the mainline Churches¹¹⁴, the Prosperity Gospel Neo-Pentecostal Churches to the now popular private ministries by individuals not affiliated to any known Church group. All these and probably more come under the umbrella of African Pentecostalism.

The objective of this chapter is to briefly study the development of African Pentecostalism. In doing this, our intention is to show how the history of African Pentecostalism developed through different epochs in the last one hundred years or so. Our line of thought will demonstrate how African Pentecostalism gradually developed from its earliest precursor in African Initiated Churches through the advent of classical Pentecostalism and the growth of Charismatic movements in mainline churches to the present and now booming Neo-Pentecostals and independent ministries. At each epoch efforts would be made to discuss the different trends that dominate the period.

African initiated Churches: Earliest Forms of Pentecostalism

African Initiated Churches constitute the earliest expressions of Pentecostal movement in Africa. They are a group of Churches founded by Africans during the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century. Although imbued with a great deal of African religious sensibilities and categories, they are also seasoned with some Pentecostal features especially in their appeal to the Holy Spirit or the spirit world¹¹⁵. They constitute the foundational block upon which African Pentecostalism was built and represent Africa's specific and enduring contribution to the dynamics of world Pentecostalism. African Instituted Churches, African Independent Churches, African Indigenous Churches and African Initiated Churches are the various nomenclatural nuances that address this one reality.

¹¹⁴ Ibid., 133.

¹¹⁵ Nnamani, Amuluche, „The Ambivalent Impact of Pentecostalism on Inculturation“, in: id. (ed.), *The New Religious Movements: Pentecostalism in Perspective*, Proceedings of the 21st Conference of the Catholic Theological Association of Nigeria, Edo 2007, VII 235-253.

After the initial evangelization of Africa by the missionaries of the mainline churches, Africans sought to understand and appreciate the message within their own worldview. This contextualization of the gospel by the Africans produced the earliest forms of Pentecostalism called the African Initiated Churches. According to the studies made by Ogbu Kalu. As early as the nineteenth century, some prophetic figures emerged in different places at the heels of the missionaries, these figures tried to engage the indigenous worldview with charismatic elements of the Christian canon and symbols. With this came the first generation of educated Africans who caught the spirit of the prophets, and gave voice to a new brand of Christianity that sought to protect the innards of the indigenous spirituality as a pathway for appropriating the gospel. Many factors midwifed this process of contextualization. For instance, the emerging African elites challenged white monopoly of the cultic and decision-making powers within the Church, there was also serious efforts to counter what was seen as the missionaries' misrepresentation of African values and culture in relation to the Christian faith. A clear example of this found in the movement known as Ethiopianism which countered the denigration of indigenous cultures with a nationalistic antistructure¹¹⁶.

Moreover large sectors of African converts sought to bridge the gap between their old religion and Christianity. They were unsatisfied by the seeming inability of the western mission-founded churches to deal directly with the their daily realities of evil, diseases fear of unseen malevolent forces, witchcraft etc. Some of these issues were not understood or dealt with within the framework of the new religion. Thus there came an attempt by the Africans to view Christianity from a distinctively African background and use it to solve their daily problems. In the words of Cephas Omenyo: "many of these converts desired to bridge the gap by using the newfound faith to achieve old aspirations"¹¹⁷. This situation has been expressed differently by an author who accuse western missionaries of preaching a Christianity that was "alien or superficial"¹¹⁸. For the African, such Christianity was unable to me him in his Africanness. In brief the message was not

¹¹⁶ Cf. Kalu, Ogbu, African Pentecostalism: An Introduction, Oxford 2008, 23–24.

¹¹⁷ Omenyo, Cephas, „African Pentecostalism“, in: Robeck, Cecil/Yong, Amos (eds.), The Cambridge Companion to Pentecostalism, Cambridge 2014, op. cit., 135.

¹¹⁸ Bausia, Kofi, „Has the Christian Faith Been Adequately Represented?“, in: International Review of Mission, No. 50 (1961), 88.

incarnated in Africa. In line with this Amuluche Nnamani argues rather persuasively that: "With their set liturgies, rigid rules and rationalistic Western form of Christianity, the mainline missionary churches found it more difficult to unlock the African/topical temperament, spontaneity and enthusiasm ... For this reason, many Christians after years of worship still felt that they are dealing with a foreign religion, incapable of meeting their basic needs and leading them to an emotional and spiritual self-fulfilment"¹¹⁹.

The situation produced spiritual movements like the Zionists in Southern Africa, Abaroho in eastern Africa and the Aladura prayer groups in west Africa¹²⁰. And other churches known collectively as "prophet-healing", "spirit" or spiritual churches"¹²¹. Some examples of prophetic figures that also arose out of these groups were: William Wadé Harris and Sampson Oppong of the Gold Coast (Ghana), Garrick Sokari Braide and Joseph Babalola of Nigeria, Simon Kimbangu of the Belgian Congo, Alice Leshina of Zambia, John Chilembwe of Central Africa, and Isaiah Shembe of South Africa¹²².

What is typical of African Pentecostalism at this stage of its growth and development is its ambivalence stands with the African Traditional Religion. It's the attempt to contextualize Christianity in Africa, there is on the one hand an attempt to reject some aspects of the African Traditional Religion and surprisingly a resurgence of the same in their method of worship. "In one breath the new Churches call for a break with traditional charms and medicines, and in the other, they seek a rapprochement with traditional worldview"¹²³. For instance, Most members of their members reserve special streams and forests as places of cleansing and prayers. Such attitudes are reminiscent of the practices prevalent in the traditional religion which they have jettisoned and labelled as pagan.

At their early stage, the founders of these groups did not intend to found a new church. They preferred to practice their religion within the

¹¹⁹ Nnamani, Amuluche, "The Ambivalent Impact of Pentecostalism on Inculturation", op. cit., 244.

¹²⁰ Cf. Kalu, Ogbu, op. cit., 24

¹²¹ Anderson, Allan, op. cit., 103.

¹²² Omenyo, Cephas, „African Pentecostalism“, op. cit., 134.

¹²³ Ejizu, Christopher, „Down but not out: contemporary forms of Igbo indigenous religion“, in: Okere, Theophilus (ed.), Religion in a World of Change: African Ancestral Religion, Islam and Christianity, Owerri 2003, 195.

confines of the mission churches. However, "their activities invoked negative attitudes from the leadership of the western mission-founded churches and the mainline churches"¹²⁴. The result was that either because of the conditions they found themselves in the mission Churches they or their successors decided to leave and found a new church or they were expressly expelled. Whichever way it went, their break with the mission-churches signalled the beginning of the long journey of African Pentecostalism. Other forms of Pentecostalism would in time have traces of the trends in African Initiated Churches. In this sense they pointed to the future of African Christianity.

Classical Pentecostalism: Missionary Pentecostals arrive Africa

Following immediately the epoch of African Initiated Churches is the arrival of missionary Pentecostalism. Here we refer to the arrival of Pentecostal missionaries, mostly as a result of the Azusa street revival¹²⁵, to Africa. Cecil Robert, Jr. gives an instructive insight on the arrival of missionary Pentecostalism in Africa when he wrote: "... by far the largest number of the first time missionaries who went out in 1906 from the Azusa Street Mission went to Africa"¹²⁶. These missionaries arrived African countries particularly Liberia, Congo and South Africa. Allen Anderson puts it more precisely when he writes: "Classical Pentecostals have been operating in Africa since 1907, when the first missionaries from Azusa Street arrived in Liberia and Angola"¹²⁷.

Through the efforts of these foreign missionaries, a number of Classical Pentecostal Churches were established in Africa. For instance Omeyo maintains that: "the most enduring fruits of the Azusa Street Revival in Africa is the establishment of the Assemblies of God Church, a major classical pentecostal church"¹²⁸. In Tanzania,

¹²⁴ Omenyo, Cephas, "African Pentecostalism", op. cit., 135.

¹²⁵ "312 Azusa Street Los Angeles" was the venue for the famous Azusa Street revival where North American Pentecostalism started with the help of an African American preacher, William Seymour. It was him that pastured a little church on which the revival fell and the Global Pentecostal Movement started.

¹²⁶ Robeck, Cecil, *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival: The Birth of Global Pentecostal Movement*, Nashville 2006, 226.

¹²⁷ Anderson, Allan, op. cit., 104.

¹²⁸ Omenyo, Cephas, "African Pentecostalism", op. cit., 137.

Pentecostal missionaries arrived from Canada in 1913 but within three months two out of the three missionaries lost their lives. They were succeeded by Scandinavian missionaries in 1930. The result of the work of these missionaries was the founding of one of the largest classical Pentecostal church called Pentecostal Church Association of Tanzania¹²⁹. However, it needs also to be noted that some classical pentecostals in Africa were founded by indigenous Africans who collaborated and corresponded with some classical pentecostals from outside Africa. For instance, in Ghana, the Church of Pentecost, the Apostolic Church of Ghana and the Christ Apostolic Church, originated through the remarkable work of Peter Anim and his Northern Irish contemporary James McKeown also through correspondence, David Odubanjo collaborated with foreign missionaries to found some classical pentecostal churches like the Apostolic Faith and Faith Tabernacle¹³⁰. In some instances, these movements fused with the already existing indigenous churches as Ogbu Kalu illustrates: "Faith Tabernacle and Apostolic Church flowed into Pentecostalism by the late 1930s because, first they linked the indigenous movements to external Pentecostal sources; second, their evolution fused into the contemporary Pentecostal movement in west Africa"¹³¹.

Space may not allow us here to enumerate the work of many Classical Pentecostal missionaries that arrived Africa in the turn of the twentieth century. However suffice it to say that most Anglophone African countries experience the wave of classical during this period. This wave was brought about either through missionary activities or through correspondence between local people and foreign mission. Notice must be taken here that the development of Pentecostalism in the francophone African countries came later. This may be attributed to the fact that Pentecostalism got its impetus the late nineteenth and early twentieth century from an English speaking Azusa Street revival.

Charismatic Movements: The Pentecostalization of the Mainline Churches

In his seminal work, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century*, Vinson Synan wrote:

¹²⁹ Cf. Anderson, Allan, op. cit., 114.

¹³⁰ Cf. ibid., 117.

¹³¹ Kalu, Ogbu, op. cit., 42.

"Perhaps the greatest surprise of the whole Pentecostal tradition was the sudden appearance of the Catholic Pentecostalism in 1967"¹³². Indeed as the wave of Pentecostalism blew in different places, towards the middle of the 1960s, many mainline churches were hit by the pentecostal revival. Thus came the Pentecostalization of the mainline Churches. The pentecostal group in the mainline churches are often referred to as Charismatic movements. The Charismatics in the mainline Churches worked with two assumptions: "that the present Christians were lukewarm and uninspiring, and that the Holy Spirit continues in our days to give the same gifts that propelled the small group of Christ's followers to achieve so much at the beginning of Christianity"¹³³. This group brought the revival into the mainline Churches. Although a significant number of them remain in the mainline churches, they share most things in common with other Pentecostals but stop short in adopting the administrative tool of the Pentecostals. Others among them due to strict conditions of the hierarchy of the mainline Churches, break away and found new pentecostal Churches.

In Africa, this group go by different names depending on the mainline Church to which they are affiliated. In the Catholic Church they are called "Catholic Charismatic Renewal", in the Anglican Church they are known as the "Evangelical Fellowship of the Anglican Communion", their name in the Presbyterian Church is the "Presbyterian Young Peoples Association" etc. These groups were mostly founded as a response to Pentecostalism. As Amuluche Nnamani forcefully maintains: "Their presence in their respective Churches is greeted with mixed feelings: ..., their existence helps to discourage a drift to the Pentecostal Churches"¹³⁴.

A current development within the Charismatic movements in the mainline churches is the now popular private ministries. This is a group of individuals either ordained or lay that still maintain their allegiance to the mainline churches and the charismatic group, but found private ministries that hold prayer meetings either in the church

¹³² Vinson, Synan, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century*, Grand Rapids, Michigan/Cambridge 1997, 234.

¹³³ Oguejiofor, Obi, „Pitfalls in our Pentecostalism“, in: Nnamani, Amuluche (ed.), *The New Religious Movements: Pentecostalism in Perspective*, Proceedings of the 21st Conference of the Catholic Theological Association of Nigeria, Edo 2007, 2.

¹³⁴ Nnamani, Amuluche, „Rising to the Challenge of the New Religious Movements“, op. cit., VII.

or in private homes. They see themselves and are seen as gifted individuals mostly with the rare gift of healing, miracles and prophetic visions. Some of them operate like CEOs of large companies and own large personal investments outside the church.

Neo-Pentecostalism: Prospering the Pentecostals

In his study of Pentecostalism, Allen Anderson opened the chapter on African Pentecostalism and Spirit Churches by declaring the following: "Pentecostalism is big business in Africa"¹³⁵. The youngest child in the development of African Pentecostalism, Neo-Pentecostalism, fits the above description very well. The term Neo-Pentecostalism is used to describe the activities of an avalanche of groups that have not evolved into the organizational state of a denomination¹³⁶. According to Andrew Gabriel: "Neo-Pentecostalism is a transdenominational renewal that include all Pentecostals (as broadly understood) who do not fall under the category of classical Pentecostalism or the Charismatic movement"¹³⁷. This group has been described as the 'third wave' of pentecostals (Classical Pentecostals and Charismatics being the first and second waves respectively). They are also known as Neocharismatics¹³⁸. It is difficult to pin down a set of beliefs and practices that could be attributed to this group. This is because "Often they have been founded by entrepreneurs who are dissatisfied for various reasons with current religious marketplace"¹³⁹. Each founder has a reason and a perceived mission sometimes selfish and different from others. This explains why each Church has a nuance of its own as they multiply each day like business centres. Allen Anderson says they consist of many and often overlapping kinds¹⁴⁰. Because they are more business minded than other

¹³⁵ Anderson, Allan, op. cit., 103.

¹³⁶ Cf. Miller, Donald/Yamamori, Tetsunao, Global Pentecostalism: The New Face of Christian Social Engagement, Berkeley 2007, 27.

¹³⁷ Gabriel, Andrew, „Neo-Pentecostalism“, in: Stewart, Adam (ed.), Handbook of Pentecostal Christianity, DeKalb 2012, 150.

¹³⁸ Burgess, Stanley, „Neocharismatics“, in id./van der Maas, Eduard (eds.), The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements, Revised and expanded Edition, Grand Rapids, Michigan 2003, 928.

¹³⁹ Miller, Donald/Yamamori, Tetsunao, op. cit., 27.

¹⁴⁰ Cf. Anderson, Allan, To the Ends of the Earth: Pentecostalism and the Transformation of world Christianity, New York 2013, 6.

pentecostals, they embody practices and spiritualities found in African Initiated Churches, Classical Pentecostals, Charismatic movements and even mainline Churches. They choose whichever practice that is bestselling and that can get them followers.

In Africa the Neo-Pentecostal Churches emerged in the religious scene in the 1970s. Omenyo argues forcefully that both in Uganda, Nigeria, Kenya, Ghana etc, the Christian students' union contributed immensely to the formation of the Neo-Pentecostals¹⁴¹. Moreover, the socio-economic landscape of the African counties bedevilled by poverty and disease caused by failure of the African States after independence to better the life of the individuals gave a breeding ground for the prosperity message for which Neo-Pentecostals are known. Thus in every part of Africa today, we find these Neo-Pentecostal Churches mushrooming in luxuriant style and gradually turning themselves into the new face of African Pentecostalism. Examples of Neo-Pentecostal churches in Africa include: Winners Chapel founded by Bishop Oyedepo, Chris Oyakhilome's Believers' Loveworld Incorporated

Conclusion

Africa has got its share of the world wide revival movement called Pentecostalism. Like many other continents the development of African Pentecostalism continue to be influenced by both internal and external factors. The internal factors pay off in form of African initiated Churches while the work of Pentecostal missionaries and Charismatic movements in the mainline churches complemented the development. What we have outlined above shows how the development graduated through different moments highlighted by the different types of Pentecostalism. What should be bone in mind is that these epochs and types to not admit of any sharp distinctions. They are better read as a continuum where some features are dominant at some period and others less dominant. A deeper study would reveal how their characteristics overlap. However, what must be seriously considered by researchers on African Christianity is that today in Africa, to be Christian seem to pentecostal in one way or another. The difference may be in the degree.

¹⁴¹ Cf. Omenyo, Cephas, „African Pentecostalism“, op. cit., 137.

Basic Alignments of Pentecostal Theology

Healing and Holy Spirit. Pentecostal Churches and New Ecumenical Challenges in a Universal Church

Margit Eckholt

Pentecostalism and New Ecumenical Challenges

Following the celebrations to mark the 500th anniversary of the Reformation in 2017 the official documents made it clear that commemoration of the Reformation is now only possible on a collective footing and in an international context: “This is the first commemoration of the Reformation to take place in the age of ecumenism” and the “first commemoration in the age of globalisation. Collective commemoration must therefore incorporate the experiences and perspectives of Christians from North, South, East and West.”¹⁴² While the documents point to the significance of the Pentecostal Movement which, from the perspective of religious history and religious studies, constitutes a new, fifth manifestation of the Christian faith, little heed has been paid, especially in Germany, to this new “international discursive network” – the term used by the Pentecostal church researcher, Michael Bergunder, to describe the Pentecostal movement¹⁴³, to which 25% of the world’s Christian believers now belong.¹⁴⁴ This situation is clearly symptomatic of an ecclesial and ecumenical context in which the Reformation is seen as a European event and the global perspective receives little more than passing attention. Viewing this development from a universal Church, ecumenical and missiological standpoint, Konrad Raiser, who for many years was General Secretary of the World Council

¹⁴² Vom Konflikt zur Gemeinschaft: Gemeinsames lutherisch-katholisches Reformationsgedenken im Jahr 2017. Bericht der Lutherisch/Römisch-katholischen Kommission für die Einheit, Leipzig/Paderborn 2013, No. 4.

¹⁴³ Cf. Bergunder, Michael, “Mission und Pfingstbewegung”, in: Dahling-Sander, Christoph (ed.), Leitfaden ökumenische Missionstheologie. Konrad Raiser zum 65. Geburtstag gewidmet, Gütersloh 2003, 199–218, here: 201.

¹⁴⁴ Cf. Biehl, Michael/Dehn, Ulrich (eds.), Reformationen: Momentaufnahmen aus einer globalen Bewegung, Hamburg 2015.

of Churches (WCC), says that the Reformation has assumed an international dimension and become a “global citizen”¹⁴⁵. He discerns new challenges for ecumenism in the light of this vibrant, creative and dynamic missionary movement, which is expanding rapidly in the countries of the South – especially in Latin America, Africa and Asia – and attracts adherents from various denominations, including the Charismatic movement within Catholicism.

The Pentecostal movement is a new Christian player in the world community and in the global religious context. It has its roots in the holiness and revivalist movements which grew out of the Reformation churches in the 18th and 19th centuries and is essentially an experiential, reformational expression of the Christian faith, the hallmarks of which are Evangelicalism, baptism in the Spirit and speaking in tongues. The emergence of Pentecostalism in the narrow sense is associated with several occurrences: revivalist experiences in the Church of God in Cherokee County/North Carolina in the 1890s, in the ministry of the preacher Charles Parham in Topeka/Kansas in 1901 and in the Azusa Street revival led by the black preacher William Seymour in 1906. From the very beginning the new “Pentecostal congregations” engaged in missionary work, which resulted in the formation of new congregations in the countries of the South, in Africa, Asia and Latin America. The various modifications and processes of inculturation they underwent led to the emergence of strong local churches planted in indigenous environments. Since the 1970s there has been talk of neo-Pentecostalism. New congregations and churches have sprung up as the result of splits and new establishments, the boundaries separating the denominations are hard to distinguish and, seen from a sociology of religion perspective, Charismatic Catholic movements can also be subsumed under the heading of neo-Pentecostalism.

An international conference entitled “The Revival of the History of Ecumenism in Latin America and the Caribbean” was held at the Faculty of Catholic Theology in the Pontifical Catholic University of Chile from 24 to 26 April 2017. One of the issues it addressed was the risk posed by the fragmentation of Christianity and by new anti-ecumenical attitudes in all the Christian churches. According to the Chilean Pente-costalist and sociologist of religion, Juan Sepúlveda,

¹⁴⁵ Raiser, Konrad, 500 Jahre Reformation weltweit, Bielefeld 2017, 169.

Pentecostalism has precipitated the “institutional fragmentation of the Church of Christ”. In the opinion of the Catholic theologians, Sandra Arenas and Rodrigo Polanco, the Pentecostal movement itself has not taken a proactive ecumenical stance, given the exclusion it has “experienced at the hands of traditional Protestants”¹⁴⁶ and in view of the “fundamentalist, anti-ecumenical influence” of the USA, which “still prevails in Latin America today”¹⁴⁷. The ecumenical and international perspective on the commemoration of the foundational moments of the Reformation referred to during the celebrations will, therefore, remain of relevance in international ecumenical discussions, in which the Catholic Church is involved, with the Pentecostal churches, which are destined to become the most powerful force within the Reformation churches. The Evangelical-Lutheran and Catholic documents issued in commemoration of the Reformation recalled the 1999 ecumenical consensus on questions of justification, which has been joined by other Reformation churches in the past few years. The search for common ground within the Christian faith is of crucial significance in the pursuit of peace, especially in a global society faced with increasing violence. The message of justification will need to be transferred to the plural contexts of the present, witness borne to the Gospel of mercy and freedom, and people made receptive to the “salutary relationship with God”¹⁴⁸, for which the concept of justice retains its central importance today. Wilfried Härtle, a retired professor of systematic theology at the University of Heidelberg, Germany, sees in the ‘righteousness of God’ “the faithfulness of God, through which God promises and demonstrates his mercy to man, while ‘justice in the sight of God’ is the ensuing trust man has in God, enabling his heart to go out in life and in death to God, who revealed himself

¹⁴⁶ Sepúlveda, Juan, “El movimiento pentecostal chileno ante la búsqueda de unidad Cristiana”, in: Cyberjournal for Pentecostal Charismatic Research 24 (2017), <http://www.pctii.org/cyberj/cyberj24/sepulveda.html> (08.07.2018).

¹⁴⁷ Cf. the unpublished presentation by Sandra Arenas and Rodrigo Polanco at the conference held in Magdeburg, Germany, from 30 June to 2 July 2017 on “The Reformation Period from a Different An-gle: A Latin American Ecumenical Perspective” organised by Margit Eckholt (University of Osnabrück) and Johannes Meier (University of Mainz) in cooperation with ICALA (Intercambio cultural alemán-latinoamericano).

¹⁴⁸ Härtle, Wilfried, “Die Relevanz der Rechtfertigungsbotschaft für den Menschen von heute”, in: Pilneu, Oliver/Rothkegel, Martin (eds.), *Aus Glauben gerecht: Weltweite Wirkung und ökumenische Rezeption der Reformatorischen Rechtfertigungslehre*, Leipzig 2017, 161–176, here: 162.

in Jesus Christ to save the world".¹⁴⁹ This is a "mutual relationship of acknowledgement" which, while asymmetrical¹⁵⁰ in structure, is nonetheless decisive. Härtle thus maps out an open ecumenical concept: active communication between God and man. In the light of the fragmentation and violence to be found in the South, this crucial common ground within the Christian faith will need to be examined in a global perspective. That will inevitably lead to the question of the meaning of justification, redemption and liberation today in a global society stricken by poverty, war and migration and how bridges can be built to connect with the experiential theology and practice of the Spirit, these being the distinguishing features of the Pentecostal churches.

This wide-ranging perspective was examined at a conference on the "Global Impact and Ecumenical Reception of the Reformation Doctrine of Justification" held at the Baptist Seminary in Elstal, Germany, which certainly merits broad attention¹⁵¹. It also forms the background to the following, necessarily fragmentary reflections on fundamental aspects of Pentecostal theology. Articles by North Atlantic Pentecostal theologians of the kind presented in German in the Handbook of Pentecostal and Charismatic Theology published by Jörg Haustein and Giovanni Maltese¹⁵² and elucidated by Michael Welker¹⁵³, tend to be read by Catholic systematic theologians and missiologists in conjunction with challenges arising in the countries of the South. The thoughts set out in this essay have been formulated from the perspective of intercultural systematic theology and ecumenical missiology and are intended to propagate a common and unifying Gospel of mercy, freedom and peace.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid., 175.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid.

¹⁵¹ Cf. the publication: Pilneu, Oliver/Rothkegel, Martin (eds.), *Aus Glauben gerecht: Weltweite Wirkung und ökumenische Rezeption der Reformatoischen Rechtfertigungslehre*, Leipzig 2017.

¹⁵² Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), *Handbuch pfingstliche und charismatische Theologie*, Göttingen 2014; a further introduction to Pentecostal theology can be found in: Burgess, Stanley M./van der Maas, Eduard M. (eds.), *The New International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, Grand Rapids 2002.

¹⁵³ Welker, Michael, *The Work of the Spirit: Pneumatology and Pentecostalism*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge 2006.

Holiness – Justification – Church – Comprehensive Salvation. Fundamental theological aspects of Pentecostalism

The metaphor of baptism in the Spirit – a practical theology of the Holy Spirit

According to the pre-eminent 20th century researcher into Pentecostalism, Walter Hollenweger¹⁵⁴, the exercise of the gifts of the Spirit, healing, exorcism and prophecy have become a firm part of Pentecostal spirituality. Thus, in a movement which was originally associated with the reformational renewal of Christianity, that “which was originally connected with justification”, [...] has developed into an “experiential conversion piety”¹⁵⁵ which is linked with emotional and physical forms of expression and glorifies speaking in tongues as “initial proof of baptism in the Spirit”. Michael Bergunder, who researches into Pentecostalism at the University of Heidelberg, draws attention to this focus on “identification” in Pentecostal piety, but in doing so he points out that “this theologumenon has by no means been accepted by all the Pentecostal churches and so it cannot be taken as the authoritative theological characteristic of Pentecostalism”.¹⁵⁶ In the neo-Pentecostal churches, in particular, the practice of speaking in tongues has diminished in significance, greater importance being attributed to healing services and exorcisms appropriate to the respective indigenous cultural contexts.

The relationship between justification, healing and baptism in the Spirit requires examination from a systematic theological viewpoint. On the one hand, Pentecostalism takes up traditions of thought which, building on the reformed approaches of Johannes Calvin and Karl Barth, highlight the significance of the Holy Spirit for redemption while, on the other hand, it continues to develop Wesley’s Methodism and the holiness movements of the Free Churches. Baptism is important for a life in Jesus Christ, but so are conversion and reincarnation. Conversion is interpreted in different ways, however, as a unique event or as a slow growth process. According to Frank Lüdke, a church historian at Tabor

¹⁵⁴ Hollenweger, Walter, Enthusiastisches Christentum: Die Pfingstbewegung in Geschichte und Gegenwart, Wuppertal 1969, 359–395.

¹⁵⁵ Preface, in: Pilnei, Oliver/Rothkegel, Martin (eds.), Aus Glauben gerecht: Weltweite Wirkung und ökumenische Rezeption der reformatorischen Rechtfertigungslehre, Leipzig 2016, 6.

¹⁵⁶ Bergunder, Michael, op. cit., 206.

Evangelical College in Marburg, Germany, “justification and holiness, which for Luther constituted an inseparable entity, are steadfastly understood by Wesley to be in temporal sequence: justification concerns my past and holiness my future – with the clear-cut objective that at some stage sin will no longer occur”¹⁵⁷. This entails first and foremost “working on one’s own holiness”.¹⁵⁸ In Lüdke’s interpretation, Pentecostalism “to all intents and purposes was constructed seamlessly on the theology of the holiness movement. The ground for it was laid by a gradual eclipsing of the concept of holiness by the notion of baptism in the Spirit, which was now definitively anticipated as a sudden experience”.¹⁵⁹ Baptism in the Spirit – the interpretations here refer primarily to the Pentecostal event in Acts 2 or to the Spirit-induced witness to the Christian faith in Acts 1:8 – is the crucial “empowerment” enabling people to bear witness to God, which is confirmed by speaking in tongues. The Evangelical theologian, Jonathan Paul (1853-1931), who took over leadership of the revivalist and holiness movement in Germany, talked of a three-tier path to faith: conversion, entry into “complete holiness” and then “baptism in the Spirit confirmed by speaking in tongues, the key aspect of which is not so much the fruit of the Spirit, as is the case in the second tier, but rather the gifts and the power of the Spirit, which are regarded as the necessary preparation for ministry”.¹⁶⁰ Emotional and physical experiences such as healings, exorcisms, glossolalia or xenolalia¹⁶¹ and other spiritual gifts, which are an integral part of baptism in the Spirit, are crucial to the “success” of Pentecostalism especially in Africa and Latin America, where a belief in spirits and demons, sorcery and possession are considered to be proof of a special affinity to the transcendental. People blessed with this gift – and anyone can receive it – are recognised as “instruments” and as authentic witnesses to God’s activity in the world, which becomes

¹⁵⁷ Lüdke, Frank, “Freiheit, Erlebnis, Veränderung! Die Rechtfertigungsbotschaft in den Erweckungsbewegungen und im Evangelikalismus”, in: Pilnei, Oliver/Rothkegel, Martin (eds.), *Aus Glauben gerecht: Weltweite Wirkung und ökumenische Rezeption der Reformatorischen Rechtfertigungslehre*, Leipzig 2017, 139–160, here: 149.

¹⁵⁸ Ibid., 148.

¹⁵⁹ Ibid., 156.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid., 157.

¹⁶¹ Cf., for example, Macchia, Frank D., “Zungen als Zeichen: Wege zu einem sakramentalen Verständnis pfingstlicher Erfahrung”, in: Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), *Handbuch pfingstliche und charismatische Theologie*, Göttingen 2014, 249–266.

manifest for members of Pentecostal churches as a “turning point in life” or “change in life”. The “success” of these forms of “incarnate” prayer¹⁶² is beyond dispute. Salvation is experienced as practical healing in the prayer fellowship of the congregation. The task here is certainly not so much to establish a set of criteria for “supernatural” gifts from the perspective of systematic theology as to initiate a debate with psychotherapists and psychoanalysts that takes pastoral psychology into account.

In theological and ecumenical respects, significance attaches to more recent approaches such as those of the Baptist, Uwe Swarat, and the Pentecostalist, Frank D. Macchia. They relate justification and holiness to each other in the context of the continuous path to human conversion. This encompasses the experience of interruptions and new departures, on the one hand, and reflection on Trinitarian theology, on the other, which refuses to countenance any separation of the activity of Jesus Christ and the working of the Spirit. In his attempt to link the doctrine of justification to the healing traditions of the Free Churches Uwe Swarat says that “in our understanding of conversion there must be room for both a unique turning point of the kind experienced in Paul’s congregations and for the daily repentance of which Luther speaks. [...] Baptism stands for the uniqueness of entry into a new life in the faith (and is therefore unrepeatable) as well as for the constant renunciation of evil and devotion to God.”¹⁶³ Inter alia in response to new pneumatological approaches such as those expounded by Michael Welker, Frank D. Macchia presents a stimulating interpretation of baptism in the Spirit in which he connects the soteriological and pneumatic dimension in an eschatological perspective and interprets baptism in the Spirit as a productive ecumenical and inter-religious “metaphor” of the Kingdom of God sermon. “Spirit baptism points to redemption through Christ as substantially pneumatological and eschatological”, which means

¹⁶² Peter Zimmerling focuses on speaking in tongues and other ecstatic phenomena as natural phenomena against the backdrop of access to the “incarnation” of prayer: cf. id., *Beten jenseits des Verstehens? Charismatische Verleiblichung des Betens*, in: Dalferth, Ingolf U./Peng-Keller, Simon (eds.), *Beten als verleiblichtes Verstehen: Neue Zugänge zu einer Hermeneutik des Gebets*, Freiburg/Basel/Vienna 2016, 278–302.

¹⁶³ Swarat, Uwe, “‘Gerecht und Sünder zugleich’: Die Rechtfertigungslehre Martin Luthers in kritischer Diskussion”, in: Pilnei, Oliver/Rothkegel, Martin (eds.), *Aus Glauben gerecht: Weltweite Wirkung und ökumenische Rezeption der Reformatorischen Rechtfertigungslehre*, Leipzig 2017, 9–32, here: 31.

for the Church that it shares in the “final sanctification of creation”.¹⁶⁴ Jesus Christ is the one who redeems and baptises in the Spirit. Hence the Spirit cannot be understood as the “power of God”, separated from the redemptive event, which endows human beings with the gifts of the Spirit and gives them the strength to bear witness – an interpretation often encountered in congregations actively involved in missionary work. Macchia therefore relates Spirit baptism not so much to the Pentecostal event as to the practice of Spirit baptism by Jesus himself. John the Baptist baptises with water, he bears witness to Him who will come and baptise with the Holy Spirit (cf. John 1:33) and in whom the Kingdom of God will be fulfilled from an eschatological perspective. Baptism in the Spirit is thus proof of the “pneumatological substance of God’s redemption through Christ”.¹⁶⁵

For the ecumenical relationship between the Christian churches and the Pentecostal movement these are important perspectives which offer a fresh way of looking at what was referred to in the commemoration of the Reformation as being definitive and unifying for Christians. Baptism is the “entry into the new life in faith” and the “consistent renunciation of evil and devotion to God”¹⁶⁶, bound up with which is “increasing justice”¹⁶⁷. Baptism in the Spirit means that this is embedded in the broad Kingdom of God context. The ground is thus laid for an understanding of justification that is not church-focused, one which in terms of creation theology and eschatology means salvation for the whole of creation. In this sense “baptism in the Spirit” and speaking in tongues, which is associated with it, open up wide-ranging ecumenical and inter-religious prospects.¹⁶⁸

¹⁶⁴ Cf. Macchia, Frank D., “The Kingdom and the Power: Spirit Baptism in Pentecostal and Ecumenical Perspective”, in: Welker, Michael (ed.), *The Work of the Spirit: Pneumatology and Pentecostalism*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge 2006, 109–125, here: 124f.; cf. also the study: Macchia, Frank D., *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology*, Grand Rapids 2006.

¹⁶⁵ Macchia, Frank D., *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology*, 114: “Pentecostalism is a movement that has helped to bring this metaphor back to the center of our understanding of God’s redemptive work in history. Especially in the light of the well-known *Geistvergesessenheit* in the West, Spirit baptism can emerge as a powerful metaphor of the pneumatological substance of God’s redemptive work through Christ [...].”

¹⁶⁶ Swarat, Uwe, op. cit., 31.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., 12.

¹⁶⁸ Cf. Macchia, Frank, “The Kingdom and the Power: Spirit Baptism in Pentecostal and Ecumenical Perspective”, op. cit., 125: “The acceptance of Christ by faith, water baptism, and charismatic, prophetic empowerment in multicontextual experiences will all play a vital role in our experience of this baptism in the Spirit, a metaphor that will continue to shape us as the church in ways unforeseen and unexpected.”

Community of Church and Ministry

In Pentecostal theology, ecclesiology is often paid only marginal attention. Neo-Pentecostal congregations, in particular, set great store by personal holiness and the freedom of the Spirit, which takes hold of the people it has chosen and gives them the task of preaching the Gospel. According to the Pentecostal theologian, Simon Chan, however, this entails the risk of “the door being opened to all manner of secularisation.”¹⁶⁹ He says that crucial importance attaches to the church, especially as regards the evolution of tradition and its preservation in the context of apostolicity. It is not just a “missionary fellowship”¹⁷⁰ and, from a Pentecostal perspective therefore, pneumatology must constitute a key methodological element of ecclesiology.¹⁷¹ “Ecclesial experience is being the body of Christ, the temple of the Spirit, divine mankind or, to use an earlier formulation, the church as *totus Christus*. In other words, because the Church is the body of Christ, it is – in its function as a church which, in its ministry, turns via Jesus Christ in spirit to God – the place where truth enjoys a dynamic existence”.¹⁷² In his outline of a “pneumatological ecclesiology” Chan examines the church service with its focus on the celebration of the Eucharist in which the church is reconstituted as the living body of Christ through the invocation of the Spirit (*epiclesis*)¹⁷³. If church is understood as a spirit-filled church of this kind, the truth of the Christian faith is confirmed by the Spirit of God and, as the Finnish theologian, Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, emphasises, it is this Spirit which authenticates the apostolic service. Apostolic life and the power of promulgation lead to conversion to Jesus Christ, and the holiness of life is a “criterion of qualification” for apostolicity.¹⁷⁴

In the interests of ecumenical dialogue it is important to recall the close connection between the Spirit and the Church. In the Dogmatic

¹⁶⁹ Chan, Simon, “Die Kirche und die Entwicklung der Lehre”, in: Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), op. cit., 414.

¹⁷⁰ Cf. Macchia, Frank, “The Kingdom and the Power: Spirit Baptism in Pentecostal and Ecumenical Perspective”, op. cit., 112, with reference to Grant Wacker.

¹⁷¹ Chan, Simon, “Die Kirche und die Entwicklung der Lehre”, op. cit., 425.

¹⁷² Ibid., 417.

¹⁷³ Ibid., 420.

¹⁷⁴ Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti, “Die Pfingstbewegung und der Anspruch auf Apostolizität: Ein Essay zur ökumenischen Ekklesiologie”, in: Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), Handbuch pfingstliche und charismatische Theologie, Göttingen 2014, 430–448, here: 442.

Constitution on the Church *Lumen Gentium* the Second Vatican Council laid the ground for overcoming *Geistvergessenheit* in the Catholic tradition, for the “via empirica”, the importance of experience and a serious approach to the charisms in the people of God; it also revised its attitude to narrowly defined sacramentalism. As Hermann Josef Pottmeyer says in his thoughts on the question of the true church, “If it is correct that not only the symbolism of its institutions, but also the *life witnesses* of its members form part of the Church as the sign of the Kingdom of God, then the verification of the truth of the Church cannot be ignored by practice”.¹⁷⁵ Right up to the present day this is where unresolved issues in ministerial theology appear. “The event of the Spirit repeatedly renews the justification for the institution. Wherever the freedom of the Spirit is acknowledged in this way within the overall sacramental structure of the Church, it is possible in principle to recognise in a spiritual judgement ministries which may be invalid on the basis of purely institutional criteria, but which prove their worth in spiritual terms and turn out to be spiritually fruitful.”¹⁷⁶ This scope articulated here by Walter Kasper is significant in ecumenical terms and from the point of view of ministerial theology. However, it comes into conflict with other perspectives which contrast the significance of the “representation of the ‘prior’ Christ” with the “relativisation of ministry as a charism recognised by the congregation”.¹⁷⁷

The only way forward in dialogue with the Pentecostal churches, however, is that set out by the ecumenical dialogues of the 1970s and 1980s which were based on pneumatological reflections. The “Lima Text” (1982) of the Faith and Order Commission of the World Council of Churches states that the “Spirit keeps the Church in the apostolic tradition until the fulfilment of history in the Kingdom of God”¹⁷⁸,

¹⁷⁵ Pottmeyer, Hermann Josef, “Die Frage nach der wahren Kirche”, in: Handbuch der Fundamentaltheologie, vol. 3: Traktat Kirche, Freiburg/Basel/Vienna 1986, 212–241, here: 240.

¹⁷⁶ Kasper, Walter, “Die apostolische Sukzession als ökumenisches Problem”, in: Pannenberg, Wolfhart (ed.), Lehrverurteilungen – kirchentrennend?, vol. 3: Materialien zur Lehre von den Sakramenten und vom kirchlichen Amt, Freiburg/Göttingen 1990, 329–349, here: 348.

¹⁷⁷ Menke, Karl-Heinz, “Identifikation von Amt und Charisma?”, in: Theologie und Glaube, No. 92 (2002), 263–276, here: 271.

¹⁷⁸ Faith and Order Commission of the World Council of Churches, “Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry” (“Lima Text”, 1982), in: <https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/commissions/faith-and-order/i-unity-the-church-and-its-mission/baptism-eucharist-and-ministry-faith-and-order-paper-no-111-the-lima-text> (27.04.2020); cf.: Sattler, Dorothea, “Der lebendige Erinnerer an das apostolische Erbe: Pneumatologische Argumentationen in den ökumenischen Gesprächen über die Ämter”, in: id./Wenz, Gunther (eds.), Das kirchliche Amt in apostolischer Nachfolge, vol. 3: Verständigungen und Differenzen, Freiburg/Göttingen 2008, 13–39.

while the report of the Joint Roman Catholic-Evangelical Lutheran Commission on “Spiritual Ministry in the Church” (1981) points to the charismatic foundation of the ministries. This path is pursued further in the Catholic-Pentecostal dialogue on ordination. The dialogue between the Roman Catholic Church and the Pentecostals notes that “the Pentecostals treat ordination as the recognition of spiritual gifts which have already been endowed. For Pentecostals a ministry is always evoked by a divine calling and accompanied by the evident reception of the necessary gifts and graces.”¹⁷⁹ Lived experience is of seminal importance for Pentecostals. “For Pentecostals the actual power of the Spirit is manifested more readily in a valid proof of the apostolic faith and ministry than in an uninterrupted line of episcopal succession. Pentecostals regard apostolic life and the power of the sermon, which leads to conversion to Jesus Christ, as an attestation of the apostolic ministry. They ask Roman Catholic Christians whether they have not occasionally ignored the requirements of apostolic life by their insistence on the episcopal succession.”¹⁸⁰ As regards potential agreement between them it is emphasised that: “Both partners in the dialogue reiterate strongly that the holiness of life is essential for an effective ministry and they recognise that the quality of the minister’s apostolic life has an influence on the quality of his ministry. Both seek by means of their respective doctrine and practice to maintain close scrutiny of the minister’s holiness. Both recognise that the power and sovereignty of God are occasionally effective in the ministry of a weak and sinful minister, although the doctrine of both classical Pentecostals and Roman Catholic Christians foresees the removal from office of anyone completely unworthy of it.”¹⁸¹

A “practical” theology of the Holy Spirit is lived out in Pentecostal churches. The “inner” liberation which arises from the experience of the Spirit and healing in the Spirit is associated with a more comprehensive political, social and cultural liberation. These are practical aspects of the faith which make membership of Pentecostal churches attractive to women, in particular. Moreover, they can frequently assume positions of responsibility in the congregation and thus help to break down the

¹⁷⁹ Schlussbericht des Dialogs zwischen dem Sekretariat für die Einheit der Christen der Römisch-Katholischen Kirche und einigen klassischen Pfingstlern, in: Dokumente wachsender Übereinstimmung 2, 596.

¹⁸⁰ Ibid., No. 90.

¹⁸¹ Ibid., 597.

“machismo” which is still a distinguishing feature of culture and church in Latin America.¹⁸² In recent empirical studies attention has been drawn to the “decentralised structures” and “flat hierarchies” of Pentecostal churches which “develop a tremendous momentum” and give them “advantages over the established religious players”: “They can respond faster to changing conditions. The considerable permeability of the hierarchies gives the churches a constant connection with reality, which in turn has a positive impact on their ability to interact.”¹⁸³ These are challenges rooted in pastoral practice for a new way of being church and they certainly require closer examination from an ecumenical perspective. A further contribution to this end will come from the gradual elaboration of a pneumatology-oriented ministerial doctrine, in which the proclamation of the word of the Lord involves closer interaction with diaconal and missionary tasks. According to the ecumenist Dorothea Sattler, it will then be the case in ecumenical dialogues that the “acknowledged common ground in the doctrine of justification [...] will become so manifest in the words and life of the churches that the convergence which has been achieved will become visible and apparent in the public arena”¹⁸⁴.

Eschatological Perspectives and the “Prosperity Gospel”

Pentecostalism was originally distinguished by very pronounced eschatological concepts – pre-milleniaristic ideas. The global preaching of the Gospel and Christian revivalism revolve around an expectation of the pending return of Jesus Christ, and Christians regard themselves as citizens of the Kingdom of God. As the Pentecostal theologian, Joel J. Shuman, makes clear, this Kingdom offers “a completely different kind of existence, which rests on the claim that, if we make the history of Jesus’ life, death and resurrection our own, we will be taken directly into God’s Kingdom. The presence of his Kingdom explains a substantial reality, and we are called upon

¹⁸² Cf., for example, Brusco, Elizabeth, *The Reformation of Machismo: Evangelical Conversion and Gender in Colombia*, Austin 1995. – The “positions of responsibility” taken up by women applies only to the lower echelons, however, and not to leadership roles in the Pentecostal churches.

¹⁸³ Seifert, Camilo, “Wirtschaftliche Deprivation und Wachstum der Pfingstkirchen in Argentinien”, in: Religion, Staat, Gesellschaft: Zeitschrift für Glaubensformen und Weltanschauungen No. 7 (2006), 63–82, here: 81.

¹⁸⁴ Sattler, Dorothea, op. cit., 37.

to learn how to live in it"¹⁸⁵. In the past this has often been associated with a dualistic view of the world, a retreat from the world, and the subordination of a socio-ethical focus to changing the world and demonstrating a commitment to justice. According to the Pentecostal church researcher, Heinrich Schäfer, in his study on Protestantism in Central America, "the social problems then verify the correctness of the belief in the pending global catastrophe. Active involvement intended to resolve these problems becomes anti-Christian in character, because it runs counter to God's historical plan. In this context, healings and the illusions of healing, such as ecstatic experiences during church services, provide a way of escaping the oppressiveness of everyday life for a while and of forgetting hopelessness in moments of joy."¹⁸⁶

In contrast to the Kingdom of God perspective outlined here, which is not communicated in the form of historical processes and experiences, this concept of the Kingdom of God takes on a dimension of "immanence" in neo-Pentecostal churches. Pentecostal religious practices – healings, exorcisms and speaking in tongues – are used to preach a gospel geared to the practical aspects of life, to success and prosperity. In poverty-stricken areas, in particular, splits lead to the formation of other "congregations", i.e. smaller Pentecostal churches often encompassing the occupants of a single residential block, in which an intensive religious life characterised by strong emotions is linked to support and recognition from the community. The liberation people experience here, primarily in the form of healing, has to do with their personal and family welfare and prosperity. The preaching of the Gospel is bound up with "worldly" values such as economic growth and prosperity, a healthy life and the healing of family relations destroyed by alcoholism. The gospel proclaimed talks of a God who rewards good Christians with prosperity. This has led – particularly in view of developments in Latin America – to the following formulation: The Church has announced an option for the poor, but the poor have

¹⁸⁵ Shuman, Joel J., Pfingsten und das Ende des Patriotismus: Ein Aufruf zur Wiederherstellung des Pazifismus unter pfingstlichen Christen, in: Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), Handbuch pfingst-liche und charismatische Theologie, Göttingen 2014, 354–379, here: 376; cf. also Bergunder, Michael, "Mission und Pfingstbewegung", in: Dahling-Sander, Christoph (ed.), Leitfaden ökumenische Missions-theologie. Konrad Raiser zum 65. Geburtstag gewidmet, Gütersloh 2003, 199–218, here: 203.

¹⁸⁶ Schäfer, Heinrich, Protestantismus in Zentralamerika: Christliches Zeugnis im Spannungsfeld von US-amerikanischem Fundamentalismus, Unterdrückung und Wiederbelegung "indianischer" Kultur, Frankfurt am Main 1992, 254.

opted for the Pentecostal churches instead, because they preach a gospel which helps them to overcome poverty and other de-structive experiences.¹⁸⁷ The “prosperity gospel” referred to in sociology of religion studies into Pentecostal churches in Africa and Latin America finds adherents not just among the socially weak classes; attention is also drawn to the growing significance of Pentecostal churches – especially in the form of mega-churches – in the upper and upper-middle classes.

The term “prosperity gospel” should not be interpreted as meaning that it is restricted to economic categories alone; it is a comprehensive concept which links prosperity with happiness, fulfilment in life and physical and spiritual well-being.¹⁸⁸ According to the theologian, Wilfred Asampambila Agana, in his study on the prosperity gospel in Ghana, it is “[...] a gospel that defines happiness and fulfilment in terms of success in life, suggesting that success means prosperity in the form of material wealth and physical health. Happiness through success is the goal, summit and crown of human life.”¹⁸⁹ The expectation of healing embedded in eschatology, which has distinguished the healing and revivalist movements as well as the original Pentecostal movement, brings with it the risk of a sense of immanence in neo-Pentecostal churches. Similarly, there is a reinterpretation of the Reformation doctrine of grace and the “extra nos” of the justification event. Great store is set by redemption related to “inner worldliness”, a redemption in the here and now which gives people “simple” answers to the complex questions they are confronted with in everyday life. Grace is sacrificed on the altar of human faith and adapted to a world determined by economic criteria, says Wilfred Agana. Financial growth, gifts and donations are interpreted in a spiritual context and are bound up with the “assertion” of rights in respect of God.¹⁹⁰ A certain “Pelagianist” image of man comes into play here. God has given man

¹⁸⁷ Cf. Eckholt, Margit, “Pfingstlich bewegt und befreiungstheologisch geerdet? Die ‘Pentekostalisierung’ des Christentums in Lateinamerika und Herausforderungen für den lateinamerikanischen Katholizismus”, in: Ulin Agan, Polykarp SVD (ed.), Pentekostalismus – Pfingstkirchen, Siegburg 2017, 33–57.

¹⁸⁸ Cf. Bowens, Jeffery B., Prosperity Gospel and Its Effects on the 21st Century Church: A Historical and Theological Perspective on the Prosperity Gospel, Bloomington, IN 2013.

¹⁸⁹ Agana, Wilfred Asampambila, ‘Succeed Here and in Eternity’: The Prosperity Gospel in Ghana, Oxford et al. 2016, 29.

¹⁹⁰ Cf. ibid., 244–267.

the capacity to lead a successful life, to which prayer and a specific alignment of the Spirit, rendered possible by changing one's ways and by baptism in the Spirit, make a contribution. A "practical soteriology" of this kind enables neo-Pentecostal churches to inculcate in the rapidly changing societies of the South in both rural areas and the mega-cities. On the one hand, they are in very close touch with the modernisation processes in society and, on the other hand, they are able to exploit key aspects of the traditional cultures. This puts serious question marks against the inculcation of the Christian faith in the evangelising work of the Catholic Church and will provide occasion for self-criticism. After all, the reform movements which, in the wake of the Second Vatican Council, found new ways of preaching the Gospel in people's diverse life situations and articulated them in liberation theologies and other contextual theologies – for instance, indigenous and feminist theologies – were eventually prohibited, as a consequence of which a religious vacuum emerged that led to the growth of Pentecostalism, for example in Brazil and Central America.

The "prosperity gospel" makes it abundantly clear that there is a need to recall the original impulse of the Reformation and that the liberation theology approaches to the doctrine of justification which have been developed in the countries of the South must be incorporated in the theological dialogue with the Pentecostal churches.¹⁹¹ God became man, he is part of the history of the world, this being reflected in soteriological reflections by the use of such terms as justification, redemption, salvation and liberation. The liberation theologies which have developed a theology of history from the standpoint of the Kingdom of God encompass a political and social theory as a form of criticism of the oppressive political and economic structures which violate human dignity. However, they constitute first and foremost "criticism of idols", given that they recall the core aspects of biblical tradition in the Old and New Testament with God as creator and judge, the Lord of life, the liberator and redeemer at the side of the poor, who proclaims through Jesus Christ a Gospel of liberation and salvation. The poor are accepted by God without any "preconditions" or gifts of a moral or financial kind and, when encountering the poor, it is

¹⁹¹ Cf. in the German-speaking countries the project run by Ulrich Duchrow, "Die Reformation radikalisieren – provoziert durch Bibel und Krise", <http://www.radicalizing-reformation.com/index.php/de/> (08.07.2018).

possible to experience the presence of God. In the light of the growing Charismatic-Pentecostal movements this is of no less importance than at the time when the liberation theologies emerged, which was certainly radically different in political terms. Criticism is needed, given that the “prosperity gospel” runs the risk of idolising the image of God and exploiting it in conjunction with the minor infinities of direct salvation and simple communications. The Pentecostal “prosperity gospel” will therefore put the theological approaches of the South in a new light in the context of ecumenical dialogue – especially from an intercultural theological perspective – since they contribute to the elaboration of a “practical soteriology of life”, which embeds the healing and liberating Gospel of Jesus Christ in the diversity of everyday human practices and takes individual human beings and their often desperate yearning for salvation seriously. Soteriology is a precept for life which has to be understood with God and the Kingdom of God perspective in mind; redemption is not “abstract” but must be spelled out in relation to human individuals and the questions they have. This provides common ecumenical ground on which Pentecostal and liberation theology soteriology in the Catholic and Protestant tradition can merge.

A new Ecumenism in the Service of the Healing and Sanctifying Gospel of Mercy and Liberations

In the future, Pentecostalism as the new, fifth manifestation of Christianity in the world will place ecumenical work in the Catholic Church in a broader setting. Regional ecumenical dialogues – like the established Evangelical-Lutheran and Catholic dialogue in the German context – will remain significant, but they must form part of an international ecumenical dialogue which takes Pentecostalism as seriously as it does the ecclesial and theological developments in the countries of the South.¹⁹² Christianity has expanded over the past few decades. Of the world’s approximately 7.4 billion inhabitants some 32

¹⁹² Attention was drawn to this in the journal *Concilium* in 1996: Moltmann, Jürgen/Kuschel, Karl-Josef (eds.), “Die Pfingstbewegung als ökumenische Herausforderung”, in: *Concilium*, No. 32 (1996), 207–296. – On the Catholic-Pentecostal dialogue cf. Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti, *Ad ultimum terrae: Evangelization, Proselytism and Common Witness in the Roman Catholic Pentecostal Dialogue (1990–1997)*, Frankfurt a. M. 1999; id., “Pentecostal Missiology in Ecumenical Perspective: Contributions, Challenges, Controversies”, in: *International Review of Mission*, No. 88 (1999), 207–225.

percent are Christians. In 2010 there were 285 million Catholics living in Europe (i.e. 23.8 percent), 90 million in North America (7.5 percent), 496 million in Latin America (41.5 percent), 140 million in Asia and Oceania (11.7 percent) and 185 million in Africa (15.5 percent). In other words, Europe and North America now account for less than a third of all believers throughout the world.¹⁹³ Pentecostal churches are the new global players. The mega-churches of the South engage in missionary work in European countries, the largest Pentecostal churches in London and Kiev are led by African pastors and they excel in exerting a new kind of influence on media and politics.¹⁹⁴ The Catholic Church as the longest-standing global player is under an obligation to recall the Gospel of mercy and peace in the course of ecumenical and inter-cultural dialogue. In African and Asian countries, where Christianity continues to flourish, Christians live in a multi-religious setting in which joining others in bearing witness to the faith is of the utmost importance. As was stated in the document entitled "From Conflict to Community" in the wake of the commemoration of the Reformation, "hostility born of denominational contradictions" harms the "credibility of Christians". "The way in which Christians handle differences among each other can convey something about their faith to believers in other religions."¹⁹⁵ In a globalised world that is threatening to turn into a world disorder, "in which religious and cultural differences are exploited for political ends and result in unprecedented outbreaks of violence", to quote Cardinal Walter Kasper in his ecumenical reflections on Martin Luther, Christians must join together in "standing up to the brutal violence which is often camouflaged in religious guise and proclaiming the universal Christian message of love and a non-violent commitment to justice, peace and freedom".¹⁹⁶ The well-established ecumenical dialogues in the North Atlantic countries will be in a position to make a growing contribution to ecumenism with and within the growing Pentecostal Movement in the countries of the South. Without a common witness to

¹⁹³ Cf. Meier, Johannes, "Die Wirkungen des II. Vatikanischen Konzils in Lateinamerika, Asien und Afrika. 1965–2015", in: Salve, No. 4 (2015), 73–85; cf. Raiser, Konrad, op. cit., 156–164.

¹⁹⁴ Anderson, Allan H., "Pfingstliche Geschichtsschreibung in globaler Perspektive: Eine Revision", in: Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), Handbuch pfingstliche und charismatische Theologie, Göttingen 2014, 135–159, here: 140.

¹⁹⁵ Vom Konflikt zur Gemeinschaft, op. cit., No. 15.

¹⁹⁶ Kasper, Walter, Martin Luther: Eine ökumenische Perspektive, Ostfildern 2016, 56.

Christ, Christians will not be able to convincingly proclaim the Gospel of peace and mercy in a global community that is fragmented and tormented by all manner of violence. The Pentecostal theologian, Allan Anderson, highlights the threat posed by the fragmentation of the power of the Christian faith, which also applies to the Pentecostal churches themselves: “We must ‘listen to the fringes’ by enabling those who have hitherto had no voice and often no name to speak out [...]. Together we will then come to an honest assessment of our history and be in a better position to propose solutions to the problems of disunity, ecclesial provincialism, racism and ethnocentrism which currently plague the Pentecostal movement; and we will attempt to do so in the power of the Spirit, but even more in the humility of the cross.”¹⁹⁷ In the ecumenical debate with the Pentecostal churches it is useful to recall the tense struggle for unity and the history of the ecumenical movement. The founding of the World Council of Churches in 1948, which drew on the momentum established by the 1910 World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh, and the ecumenical path taken by the Second Vatican Council illustrate the fact that the denominational age “is irrevocably gone and past and any attempt to revive it on the ruins of the past is destined to fail.”¹⁹⁸

For the Catholic Church the pontificate of Pope Francis is a propitious moment for this new global ecumenism in a universal Church dimension in which the voices of people in the countries of the South, in particular, are being heard and taken seriously. Fifty years after the Second Vatican Council the Argentine pope from the “other end of the world” stands for a process of recollection which gathers together the central aspects of the commemoration of the Reformation – joint recollection and the international perspective. The “ecclesiogenesis” he calls for applies to many of the elements that characterised the Reformation: the recourse to biblical texts, the popular church liturgy, joint priesthood and hence the emergence of believers as individual subjects. These are all aspects which have taken on fresh life in the various concepts developed in liberation theology and the new Pentecostal forms of being church. Since the beginning of his pontificate Pope Francis has placed the reform movement, which the Second Vatican Council constitutes for the

¹⁹⁷ Anderson, Allan H., op. cit., 159.

¹⁹⁸ Walter Kasper, op. cit., 38.

Catholic Church, at the very heart of his addresses and sermons. This is a church that “goes forth”¹⁹⁹, “semper reformanda”²⁰⁰, a “field hospital”²⁰¹, a church with a focus on “confessio” – not as a means of dissociation from others, but in the sense of a vibrant faith and common witness to Christ “in the service of unity and peace in the world”.²⁰² This, then, is a Church which is missionary in character and in precisely the sense that it “converts” itself again and again to Jesus Christ in its “discovery of the others” and, above all, ministers to the poor and excluded, thereby recalling the healing and liberating Gospel of Jesus Christ in the Sermon on the Mount. These are the central foundations of the global ecumenical dialogue today, in which the Pentecostal movement must be heard and taken seriously as a new force for Christianity.

¹⁹⁹ Apostolic Exhortation of the Holy Father Francis on the Proclamation of the Gospel in Today's World, 24 November 2013, http://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_exhortations/documents/papa-francesco_esortazione-ap_20131124_evangelii-gaudium.html (27.04.2020), No. 20–23.

²⁰⁰ The Argentine theologian, Carlos Galli, has pointed to the multiple usage of this term by Pope Francis: Galli, Carlos, “Pablo VI y Francisco: La alegría de Cristo”, in: Istituto Paolo VI Notiziario, No. 72 (2016), 43–71, here: 70.

²⁰¹ Papst Franziskus, Frühmesse: Die Kirche ist ein Feldlazarett, Radio Vatikan http://de.radiovaticana.va/news/2015/02/05/fr%C3%BCChmesse_die_kirche_ist_ein_feldlazarett/1121657 (08.07.2018).

²⁰² Kasper, Walter, op. cit., 51.

Essentials of Pentecostal Theology.

An eternal and unchanging Lord powerfully present and active by the Holy Spirit

Tony Richie

Pentecostals Christians believe in the possibility of receiving the same experience of the Holy Spirit today as the disciples on the Day of Pentecost (Acts 2:1-4). However, Pentecostalism is dramatically diverse. There is no monolithic definition of Pentecostal identity broad enough to encompass all adherents.²⁰³ Yet for all its diversity there exists an underlying, and unifying, spiritual theology. This chapter focuses on these shared essentials. Admittedly, I speak as a North American Classical Pentecostal. Nevertheless, deep appreciation for the broad diversity of Pentecostalism affirms its more inclusive aspects. Further, for all their distinctiveness, contemporary Pentecostal/Charismatic movements are part of a stream of spiritual tradition existing more or less consistently throughout Christian history.²⁰⁴

Various Accents and Conflicts

One can compare Pentecostal theology to the phenomenon of pronunciation in which the same language exhibits different accents. Walter Hollenweger stressed the orality of Pentecostal worship and thought expressed primarily in songs, testimonies, preaching, worship, and prayer.²⁰⁵ French Arrington presents a Classical Pentecostal theology similar to typical Evangelical theologies – with more pronounced pneumatological emphases.²⁰⁶ Hollis Gause explicates

²⁰³ Hunter, Harold D., *Spirit Baptism: A Pentecostal Alternative*, Eugene, OR 2009, 15.

²⁰⁴ Cartledge, Mark J., *Encountering the Spirit: The Charismatic Tradition*, Maryknoll, NY 2007, 33–50. Cf. Chan, Simon, *Pentecostal Theology and the Christian Spiritual Tradition* (JPT Sup, No. 21), Sheffield 2000/2003, 73–77.

²⁰⁵ Hollenweger, Walter J., “After Twenty Years Research on Pentecostalism”, in: *International Review of Mission*, No. 75 (1986), 3–12.

²⁰⁶ Arrington, French L., *Christian Doctrine: A Pentecostal Perspective*, vol. 3, Cleveland, TN 1993.

Pentecostal theology within a Wesleyan-Holiness framework.²⁰⁷ Steve Land offers an integrative dispositional framework with an emphasis on eschatological missiology via Trinitarian revisioning.²⁰⁸ Frank Macchia outlines parameters of contemporary developing Pentecostal theology via a more encompassing conversation.²⁰⁹

Keith Warrington and Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen highlight divine encounter and dynamic charismatic spirituality overflowing in worship and in witness as the essential, distinctive thrust of Pentecostal theology.²¹⁰ Via pneumatological imagination Amos Yong explores hermeneutics, epistemology, philosophical presuppositions, Trinitarian theology, theology of religions, ecumenical and interfaith relations, theology of disability, engagement with contemporary culture, and the religion and science conversation.²¹¹ For Wolfgang Vonney Pentecostal theology addresses the renewal of the Christian life identified by the transforming work of the Holy Spirit and directed toward the kingdom of God.²¹²

The preceding emphases are not incompatible. Each has its own accent. Each expresses Pentecostalism in continuity and, usually, in community with the others. But Pentecostals have their share of internal debates.

Pentecostals debate the nature and role of sanctification in the Christian life. Wesleyan-Pentecostals, harking back to Holiness roots, view sanctification as definitive crisis experience within a growth process. Baptistic Pentecostals emphasize sanctification as an ongoing growth process definitively unattainable in this life.

²⁰⁷ Gause, R. Hollis, *Living in the Spirit: The Way of Salvation*, Cleveland 2007. Pentecostals are almost universally Wesleyan-Arminian rather than Calvinist/Reformed, with rare exceptions among denominational Charismatics.

²⁰⁸ Land, Steven J., *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom*, Sheffield, UK 1993.

²⁰⁹ Macchia, Frank D., "Theology, Pentecostal", in: Burgess, Stanley M./Van Der Maas, Eduard M. (eds.), *New International Dictionary of Pentecostal Charismatic Movements*, Grand Rapids 2002/2003, 1120–1141.

²¹⁰ Warrington, Keith, *Pentecostal Theology: A Theology of Encounter*, New York 2008; Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti, *Pneumatology: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*, Grand Rapids 2002, 89–92.

²¹¹ Vonney, Wolfgang/Mittelstadt, Martin William (eds.), *The Theology of Amos Yong and The New Face of Pentecostal Scholarship*, Boston 2013.

²¹² Vonney, Wolfgang, *Pentecostal Theology: Living the Full Gospel (Doing Theology)*, New York 2017.

Ecclesial polity and practice often reflects the specific branch of Christianity out of which a particular Pentecostal group originated. A prominent wing of Pentecostalism (Independents) stresses non-denominationalism. Certainly Pentecostals are far from unanimous regarding the role of women in ministry, political activism, social responsibilities, environmentalism, ecumenical relations, or dialogue with non-Christian faiths.²¹³

Pentecostals stridently debate the nature of the Divine Being. A large majority of Pentecostals is Trinitarian, while a strong minority is Unitarian. Many North American Pentecostals and their affiliates affirm the doctrine of initial evidence – speaking in tongues as the first observable sign of Spirit baptism. Denominational Charismatics and global Pentecostals are less likely to emphasize initial evidence. Pentecostals are becoming increasingly diverse regarding eschatology. Many traditional Pentecostals are classical dispensationalists while others argue that dispensationalism is inherently adverse to Pentecostalism due to its embrace of cessationism.²¹⁴ The latter tend to adopt an inaugurated, already/not yet eschatology in conjunction with more conventional approaches to Christ's second coming and the consummation of history.

A Description not a Definition

At the heart of Pentecostal experience and testimony is affirmation of the ongoing applicability of Hebrews 13:8, “Jesus Christ is the same yesterday and today and forever” (NASB; cp. Malachi 3.6). This text describes Christ's participation in God's unchangeableness and exhorts believers to unchangeable faith in Christ's unchangeableness.²¹⁵ The Christ portrayed in the New

²¹³ Melissa L. Archer well remarks that “despite theological differences that emerge, the spirituality of early Pentecostals remained remarkably consistent”, in: id., ‘I Was in the Spirit on the Lord’s Day’: A Pentecostal Engagement with Worship in the Apocalypse, Cleveland, TN 2015, 333.

²¹⁴ Cessationism claims spiritual gifts (charismata) esp. speaking in tongues, divine healing, and miraculous signs and wonders ceased after the Early Church age, rejecting the authenticity and credibility of Pentecostalism, Horton, Stanley M., “Spirit Baptism: A Pentecostal Perspective”, in: Brand, Chad Owen (ed.), Perspectives on Spirit Baptism: Five Views, Nashville 2004, 47–104, here: 82–83.

²¹⁵ Cf. Adams, J. Wesley, “Hebrews”, in: Arrington, French L./Stronstad, Roger (eds.), Full Life Bible Commentary to the New Testament: An International Commentary for Spirit-Filled Christians, Grand Rapids 1999, 1295–1399, here: 1392.

Testament (NT) is precisely the Christ Pentecostals expect to encounter today. Arguments that Christ no longer dramatically and miraculously saves, heals, and delivers are rejected out of hand as inconsistent with this guiding hermeneutical principle.²¹⁶ Cessationists emphasize changing times but Pentecostals emphasize an unchanging Lord.

Many Pentecostals embrace a Christocentric paradigm known as the fivefold gospel.²¹⁷ The fivefold gospel stresses the role of Jesus as Savior, Sanctifier, Holy Spirit Baptizer, Healer, and Soon Coming King. There is a restorationist ring to this paradigm thus it is often called the “full gospel”.²¹⁸ It facilitates a vibrant Trinitarian and Incarnational integration of Logos/Spirit Christology.²¹⁹ Pentecostals confess faith in Jesus Christ as the eternal and unchanging Lord who is powerfully present and active by the Holy Spirit in all of one’s personal life today and forever.

Pentecostals experience the coming God as now present. Along this line, Peter Neumann articulates the critical role of spiritual experience in Pentecostal faith and life.²²⁰ I first learned key aspects of this emphasis from my grandmother. My grandparents were swept up in the early Pentecostal revival in the mountains of southeast Appalachia. Unable to read for herself, Grandma Richie memorized Scripture verses she heard read in church services. She became so adept at this practice that if anyone misquoted a passage she would correct them. One of her favorites, frequently quoted during testimony time, was Psalm 16:11: “Thou wilt shew me the path of life: In thy presence *is* fulness of joy; At thy right hand *there are* pleasures for evermore.” (KJV)

²¹⁶ Pentecostals accept a wide range of gifts enumerated throughout the NT (e.g. Rom 12:6–8; Eph 4:7–13) but are best known for those in 1 Corinthians 12:1–11. Pentecostals do embrace the miraculous, Richie, Tony, “An Affirmative Pentecostal Theology of the Miraculous”, in: The Pneuma Review (Spring 2015): <http://pneumareview.com/an-affirmative-pentecostal-theology-of-the-miraculous/> (09.05.2020).

²¹⁷ Thomas, John Christopher, Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel, Cleveland, TN 2010, 4. Baptist Pentecostals utilize a fourfold version collapsing salvation and sanctification into one.

²¹⁸ Bryant, Herschel Odell, Spirit Christology in the Christian Tradition: From the Patristic Period to the Rise of Pentecostalism in the Twentieth Century, Cleveland, TN 2014, 412, 432.

²¹⁹ Ibid., 519–520.

²²⁰ Neumann, Peter, Pentecostal Experience: An Ecumenical Encounter, Eugene, OR 2012; Hollen-weger, Walter J., The Pentecostals, Peabody 1972/1988, argued that Pentecostal “dogmatic theology” is an expression of Pentecostal “experience of life” (483–486). Unsatisfactory as an exhaustive description, Hollenweger rightly lifted up a distinctive characteristic of Pentecostal theologizing. Stephenson, Christopher A., Types of Pentecostal Theology: Method, System, Spirit, New York 2013), esp. 111–130.

Psalm 16:11 is part of a group of prayers/songs which grew “from the soil of confessing the living God of revelation” “supported by it as by its *ground of faith and life*” and taking the “form of *didactic testimonies*.²²¹ These testimonies simultaneously edify and comfort along with prophetical discourse originating in personal experience from intimate communion with God. Therefore, Psalm 16:11 as a prophetic testimony of the praying believer is both a confession of present faith and a prophecy awaiting ultimate fulfillment.

Pentecostals testify of a present experience, not of a vague emotional thrill, but of a vital encounter with God’s transforming and uplifting presence in vivid foretaste of joyful abiding eternally in God’s presence.²²² Like the Psalms, Pentecostals relate experiencing God’s presence to the Holy Spirit’s agency (51:11) and render unto the Lord appropriately exuberant worship in response (95:2; 100:2) with firm assurance that the Spirit’s presence reverberates throughout all their life (139:7). Here and hereafter God’s own presence is the reward of righteousness (140:13). Pentecostals experience God through liturgy and sacraments; yet, experiencing God’s presence through Spirit baptism is particularly direct and dramatic (Matt 3:11; Mk 1:8; Lu 3:16; Jn. 1:33).²²³ True to the instincts of early Pentecostals, contemporary Pentecostal theology explicates an experience of God’s presence as a simultaneously pneumatological and eschatological mode of being.

Crucial Commitments

The doctrine of subsequence is crucial to Pentecostal theology. Pentecostals affirm that the “*baptism, or filling, with the Spirit is a distinct spiritual experience subsequent to conversion*.²²⁴ Spirit baptism is a gift

²²¹ Lange, John Peter/Schaff, Philip et al., A Commentary on the Holy Scriptures: Psalms, Bellingham, WA 2008, 126–127.

²²² Cross, Terry L., Answering the Call in the Spirit: Pentecostal Reflections on a Theology of Vocation, Work and Life, Cleveland, TN 2007, 14–16, 107.

²²³ Tomberlin, Daniel, Pentecostal Sacraments: Encountering God at the Altar, CreateSpace, 2015.

²²⁴ Arrington, French L., op. cit., 51. Catholic Charismatics view Spirit baptism as an experiential realization of an earlier sacramental impartation, Del Colle, Ralph, “Spirit Baptism: A Catholic Perspective”, in: Brand, Chad Owen (ed.), Perspectives on Spirit Baptism: Five Views, Nashville 2004, 241–289, here: 270, 276–279. Protestant Charismatics argue for Spirit baptism as a broader, multi-dimensional metaphor, Hart, Larry, “Spirit Baptism: A Dimensional Charismatic Perspective”, 105–180; Brand, Chad Owen (ed.), Perspectives on Spirit Baptism: Five Views, Nashville 2004, 108, 167–168. For Pentecostals the crucial point remains essentially the same, Hunter, Harold D., op. cit., 228–230.

of God the Father through his Son Jesus Christ to believers enabling them to “walk in the truth of the gospel and in the power of the Spirit, giving loving service to Christ and to His church.”²²⁵ Pentecostals fully affirm the indwelling presence of the Holy Spirit in every convert due to regeneration (Rom 8:9; John 3:5, 6; Titus 3:5). Thus Harold Hunter rightly warns that Pentecostals “can never demean as inferior one who is not in the same circle.”²²⁶ As the Spirit was present in Jesus’ life prior to the Spirit coming upon him at his baptism in Jordan as an empowerment for service (Luke 4:14), so it is with his disciples at Pentecost (Acts 1:8; 2:1-4). Pentecostals perceive a pattern of subsequence in the Book of Acts at (8:12, 15, 17; 9:9, 17; 10:44-48; 11:15, 17; 19:1-7).²²⁷ From a pastoral perspective, the doctrine of subsequence incentivizes confessing Christians toward deeper spirituality and bolder ministry.²²⁸ As Stanley Horton well says, being Spirit-filled is primarily about “a life wholly dedicated to God”.²²⁹

The purpose of Spirit baptism is empowerment for service and guidance into truth.²³⁰ Pentecostal power is not for self-aggrandizement or self-exaltation. Jesus’ pre-Ascension words, “But you will receive power when the Holy Spirit comes on you; and you will be my witnesses” (Acts 1:8 NIV), suggest empowerment for service. Pentecost

²²⁵ Arrington, French L., op. cit., 57. Pentecostals stress the gift nature of Spirit baptism – it is graciously endowed by God, not earned or merited. Faith, prayer, obedience, yielding, and confident expectation are conditions leading to its reception, 85–95.

²²⁶ Hunter, Harold D., op. cit., 231.

²²⁷ Didactic references in the Pauline corpus are marshaled to support these historical accounts (e.g. Gal 3:2; Eph 1:13–14); but, Pentecostals agree with the weight of scholarship identifying Luke as both historian and theologian, Horton, Stanley M., “Spirit Baptism: A Pentecostal Perspective”, in: Brand, Chad Owen (ed.), *Perspectives on Spirit Baptism: Five Views*, Nashville 2004, 47–104, here: 55–56.

²²⁸ Even those who do not accept the doctrine of subsequence per se admit that it has been crucial to the movement, Del Colle, Ralph, “Spirit Baptism: A Catholic Perspective”, in: Brand, Chad Owen (ed.), *Perspectives on Spirit Baptism: Five Views*, Nashville 2004, 241–289, here: 244.

²²⁹ Horton, Stanley M., *What the Bible Says about the Holy Spirit*, Springfield, MO 1976, 256–258. Nevertheless, Myer Pearlman, *Knowing the Doctrines of the Bible*, Springfield, MO 51992, notes that “the Baptism with the Holy Spirit, which is a baptism of power, is charismatic in character, judging from the descriptions of the results of the impartation”, 312–313.

²³⁰ Arrington, French L., op. cit., 69. Arrington adds, with appropriate scriptural support, that Spirit baptism results in greater: awareness of the presence of the Triune God; spiritual sensitivity; love of the Scriptures, openness to the gifts of the Spirit, consecration to God, measure of joy, and boldness in witnessing, 78–84. However, “these blessings in no way diminish what God does for us in regeneration and sanctification, before we receive the Pentecostal experience of being baptized in the Holy Spirit” (84).

empowerment enables witnessing for Christ, doing mighty works for Christ, and withstanding hostility and persecution for Christ's sake.²³¹ Jesus also said that when, "the Spirit of truth, comes, he will guide you into all the truth" (John 16:13 NIV). The Spirit's truth is not esoteric, Gnostic-like elitism. Spirit baptism guides believers into the knowledge of Jesus Christ (14:6; 15:26; 16:13-15). The Spirit teaches believers, imparting divine knowledge and wisdom for effective, faithful service to Christ (Acts 6:3; 1 John 2:27).²³² Thus, Pentecostal preachers have been heard to say, "Salvation is God's gift to the world. Spirit baptism is God's gift to the Church."

Pentecostals build on the close association in Acts between Spirit baptism/infilling and glossolalia (speaking in tongues).²³³ The context of this exegesis is an associative pattern between spiritual experience, inspired speech, and practical service deeply rooted in Scripture (Num 11:16-17, 24-26; 1 Sam 10:6-7).²³⁴ At the paradigmatic Pentecost event the Holy Spirit's coming was accompanied by speaking in tongues (2:1-4). This pattern was repeated in Peter's mission to the Gentiles (10:44-46) and Paul's ministry to disciples of the Baptist at Ephesus (19:1-7). When tongues are not specifically mentioned (Samaria) the presence of an observable sign is indicated, which Pentecostals argue is likely tongues (8:18, 19). Pentecostals admit there is no indication of tongues when Paul received his Spirit baptism (9:17-19); however, he later confessed to speaking in tongues (1 Co 14:18). Significantly, speaking in tongues does not comprise Spirit baptism. Rather, this manifestation of Spirit-inspired speech shows "the relationship between the spiritual experience and practical service."²³⁵

²³¹ Cf. ibid., 70-75.

²³² Stronstad, Roger, *The Charismatic Theology of St. Luke: Trajectories from the Old Testament to Luke-Acts*, Grand Rapids 1984/2012, argues that the NT emphasizes three dimensions of the Christian life – salvation, sanctification, service – and that the charismatic understanding of Spirit baptism applies to the third, 14, 98.

²³³ Arrington, French L., op. cit., 62–63. Pentecostals note the significatory nature of Acts as consistent with evidential tongues, Richie, Tony, "From Suspicion to Synthesis: Toward a Shared Wesleyan and Pentecostal Theology of Spirituality", in: Crawford, Nathan (ed.), *The Continuing Relevance of Wes-leyan Theology: Essays in Honor of Larry Wood*, Eugene, OR 2011, 252–268, here: 262–263.

²³⁴ Stronstad, Roger, op. cit., 25.

²³⁵ Arrington, French L., op. cit., 65. Also, glossolalia is a form of praising God and of prayer, a sign to unbelievers, and a sign of the last days, 65–68. Further, it functions as one of the gifts of the Spirit bestowed for the edification of the church (1 Co 12–14), 113–119; 150–162.

Simon Chan doubtless is correct that initial evidence is the one Pentecostal doctrine that “the larger spiritual tradition” of Christianity finds most problematic and that requires further theological development.²³⁶ However, note an ancient and ongoing ecclesial tradition contrasting the theological significance of Pentecost tongues with those of Babel.²³⁷ That being said, Pentecostal theologians are plumbing the depths of glossolalia.²³⁸ Land describes glossolalia as the language of the Kingdom. The ability to form and utilize complex systems of communication is a most intriguing characteristic of human beings. The role of the brain in language is a subject of ongoing scientific research. Yet language is much more than a means of communication involving cerebral activity. Language has many social and cultural uses. It can signify group identity, social stratification, social grooming, and more. Arguably, tongues function as Kingdom language in just such a multifaceted manner.

Macchia describes glossolalia in terms of sacramental function and value in settings of Pentecostal worship. Most Pentecostals affirm that a sacrament or ordinance is an outward sign of an inward and spiritual grace that has been ordained by Christ and is experienced by believers through the agency of the Holy Spirit. These ordinances or sacraments involve physical or material (water; bread, wine) representations of spiritual participation in experiencing Christ’s gracious presence by the Holy Spirit. Sacraments bear witness to Christ in continuity with his Incarnation – itself the ultimate exemplification of humanity and divinity. Thus liturgical tongues are an outward, physical sign of God’s presence.

I utilize the concept of tongues as transposition. Speaking in tongues exemplifies the way much of Christian spirituality functions. Higher, heavenly treasures of the Holy Spirit are transposed into earthly, human vessels. Christian spirituality in general and glossolalia

²³⁶ Chan, Simon, op. cit., 40–41. Hunter admits that theological immaturity resulted in “inferior formulations” that are “not difficult to criticize” but in essence stand up well under more careful investigation, (see Hunter, Harold D., op. cit., 221–222, 226).

²³⁷ E.g. Origen, Cyril of Jerusalem, Gregory of Nazianzen, Chrysostom, Augustine, Gregory the Great, and Calvin, Oden, Thomas C., *Life in the Spirit: Systematic Theology*, vol. 3, Peabody, MA 1992/2001, 64–65.

²³⁸ Richie, Tony, “Review of Robert W. Graves (ed.), *Strangers to Fire: When Tradition Trumps Scripture*”, Woodstock, GA 2014, The Pneuma Review (Dec 2014): <http://pneumareview.com/strangers-to-fire-when-tradition-trumps-scripture-reviewed-by-tony-richie/> (09.05.2020).

in particular has this strange and sometimes confusing mix of the divine and sublime with the human and humble. It is important to discern both aspects united in action, and to recognize that God has chosen to bestow the heights of spiritual experience on lowly beings fraught with human frailties. Pentecost is divine-human connection and expression with profound consequences.

Fundamental Aspects of Pentecostal Theology as seen from Latin America

Bernardo Campos

This brief article deals with the defining aspects of Pentecostal theology in their diversity and complexity. Three key features are seminal to the identity of the Pentecostal movements. We refer to the original event of Pentecost and offer biblical, historical and cultural references to explain the particular nature of Pentecostal theology that has evolved as a part of Christian religion and theology.

In any description of the fundamental aspects of a denominational theology such as that of Pentecostalism account must be taken of various factors associated with its theological work and the socio-cultural structures in which it takes shape.²³⁹

First of all, recognition is required of the fact that the *object* of the theological work conducted is made complex by its very diversity and cultural roots. The Pentecostal movement is not homogeneous. On the contrary, it is very heterogeneous.

Thematic and dogmatic debate as such is preceded by a *taxonomy*²⁴⁰ which is required in order to establish what current

²³⁹ On the formation of the symbols of the Pentecostal experience see Campos, Bernardo, "Lo Testimonial: un caso de teología oral y narrativa. La producción simbólica de lo pentecostal", in: Álvarez, Carmelo (ed.), Pentecostalismo y Liberación: Una experiencia latinoamericana, San José 1992, 135–141.

²⁴⁰ The classification scheme of the Pentecostal movement distinguishes four dominant currents and two variants: 1) historical Pentecostalism, 2) classical Pentecostalism, 3) Oneness Pentecostalism (Jesus Only movement), 4) Charismatic or neo-Pentecostalism, 5) the Apostolic-Prophetic Movement and 6) the so-called "divine healing agencies" (agencias de cura divina). Cf. Campos, Bernardo, "El cristianismo pentecostal y su variedad", in: id., El Principio Pentecostalidad: La Unidad del Espíritu, Fundamento de la Paz, Oregon 2016, 149–157. A similar classification for Africa can be found in Anderson, Allan/Bergunder, Michael/Droogers, André/van der Laan, Cornelis (eds.), Varieties, Taxonomies, and Definitions in Studying Global Pentecostalism: Theories and Methods, Berkeley/Los Angeles/London 2010, 18–29. For Brazil see Freire De Alencar, Gedeón, Matriz Pentecostal Brasileira: Assembleias de Deus 1911–2011, Río de Janeiro 2013; cf. Campos, Bernardo, "Neopentecostal Paradigms in Latin America Mission", in: Synan, Vinson/Yong, Amos/Álvarez, Miguel (eds.), Global Renewal Christianity: Spirit-Empowered Movements Past, Present, and Future, vol. 2: Latin America, Lake Mary 2016.

within the Pentecostal movement is under discussion in any particular instance. My points of reference in this article are historical Pentecostalism, classical Pentecostalism and – to a much lesser extent – Oneness Pentecostalism (Jesus Only movement).

Secondly, it should be borne in mind that the *discipline itself* (the theology) comprises four key aspects: biblical theology, historical theology, dogmatic theology and practical theology in their consistent inter-relationship with reality. For that reason we talk of a Pentecostality based on the *Actus Apostolorum* (Acts of the Apostles according to Luke) and their ongoing effect in early and recent history.²⁴¹

Thirdly, there is a need to focus on the *context* in which the theology develops, which in our case is the reality of life in Latin America. To arrive at a full understanding and to facilitate practical application theology must be seen in *relation* to the whole of reality (social, cultural, economic, political, religious and other specific aspects).²⁴²

The process in its entirety rests on a hermeneutic theology²⁴³. This includes a cognitive process which is needed to give life a meaning that is rooted in the constitutive elements of the religion: the faith of Abraham and a pragmatic process linked to a religious experience within a cultural dynamic of the have-nots.

As a part of Christianity, Pentecostalism has a system of *items of religious faith*, a system of *rites* and *organisational forms* which arise from these rites and items of religious faith, and a *set of ethical rules* which sheds light on *social practices* in dialogue with the respective culture.

²⁴¹ Cf. Robeck, Cecil M. Jr., "Calle Azusa. 100 Años Después", in: Revista de Enriquecimiento, The General Council of the Assemblies of God, Springfield 2006, http://enrichmentjournal.ag.org/enrichmentjournal_sp/200602/200602_026_Azusa.cfm (25.09.2018).

²⁴² This aspect is dealt with in detail in: Luvís Núñez, Agustina, "Vientos de libertad: Un Acercamiento a la Teología Caribeña desde una Perspectiva Pentecostal", in: Campos, Bernardo/Uribe Villegas, Eleuterio (eds.), Encuentro de Culiacán RELEP-IAFCJ (presentations made at the meeting in Culiacán, Sinaloa, Mexico, 6 to 8 April 2016. RELEP stands for Red Latinoamericana De Estudios Pente-costales and IAFCJ for Iglesia Apostólica De La Fe En Cristo Jesús.

²⁴³ For a more detailed explanation of the hermeneutics of the Spirit see Campos, Bernardo, Hermenéutica del Espíritu: Cómo Interpretar los Sucesos del Espíritu a la Luz de la Palabra de Dios, Oregon 2016; Yong, Amos, "Reading Scripture and Nature: Pentecostal Hermeneutics and Their Implications for the Contemporary Evangelical Theology and Science Conversation", in: Perspectives on Science and Christian Faith, No. 63 (2011) 1, 3–15; id., The Spirit of Creation: Modern Science and Divine Action in Pentecostal Charismatic Imagination, Grand Rapids 2011; Archer, Kenneth J. A., Pentecos-tal Hermeneutic: Spirit, Scripture and Community, Cleveland 2009.

I am well aware that any synthesis of a religion harbours the risk of a constricted view, but let me single out three aspects which typify Pentecostal theology²⁴⁴ in Latin America: a fivefold structure with a Christological axis in its theology; identitarian Pentecostality; and the hermeneutics of the Holy Spirit which initiates its development.

Fivefold Structure and Christological Axis

At the core of Pentecostal theology is the *Christological axis* as the basic structure around which five of its most important dogmas revolve. In accordance with a formula introduced by Pentecostal missionaries from North America and the Caribbean, Pentecostals believe that Jesus Christ “redeems, heals, baptises, sanctifies and returns”. The point here is not to explain this formula but to note that it is a fivefold structure in which the fundamental dogmas of Pentecostal theology are summarised in their religious form, as it were.²⁴⁵ It is a Christological formula in which soteriology, anthropology, ecclesiology and eschatology are interrelated and which at the same time signifies a process or programme that facilitates the long-term (and sanctifying) work of the Holy Spirit.

Christ (Christology)	redeems (soteriology)... from this...	World
	heals (anthropology)... in this...	
	baptises with power (pneumatology) ... in this...	
	sanctifies (ecclesiology) ... from this ...	
	returns (eschatology) ... to this ...	

²⁴⁴ A study conducted by the University of Pretoria in South Africa makes it clear that the distinguishing feature of Pentecostal theology is its “experience of the presence and power of God”. Cf. Lederle, Henry I., “An Ecumenical Investigation into the Proprium or Distinctive Elements of Pentecostal Theology”, in: id./Clark, Mathew S. et al., What is Distinctive about Pentecostal Theology?, Pretoria 1989, 158–171.

²⁴⁵ Originally a fivefold structure (five dogmas) applied. However, this was transformed into a fourfold structure (four dogmas), because the concept of baptism in the Spirit is merged with the notion of sanctification. The formula, which was in keeping with the Wesleyan tradition, said that: “Christ justifies by the faith, sanctifies, baptises, heals and returns”. On the assimilation of the dogma of sanctification by the dogma of baptism in the Spirit see Dayton, Donald W., Theological Roots of Pentecostalism, Grand Rapids 1987, 87–113; see also Matos, Paulo Ayres, “Reflexões sobre o uso da linguagem poder na teologia de John Wesley”, in: Barbosa, Carneiro/Antonio, Carlos (eds.), Teologia Pentecostal I: O que nos resta a fazer, São Paulo 2017, 37–54.

God manifested himself in Christ and is present in his Spirit; he redeems sinners from all the powers of this evil world and heals them bodily as a sign of their liberation from evil (in Pentecostals' view of the world, illness is a sign of affliction with sin, although not in every case); human beings must therefore seek to be sanctified and baptised in the Holy Spirit, to be empowered to evangelise and to remain faithful until Jesus Christ returns to reign for a thousand years (Rev 20).

Soteriology: (Christ redeems.) Redemption consists in liberation from sin, the law and death. Jesus' redeeming grace takes effect in non-believers through the Gospel as the Word of God. Redemption is the gift of God's grace, but believers must work hard to receive it because it can be lost.

Anthropology: (Christ heals). Healing refers to body and soul. Human beings are restored to full health, including by miracles. The health of the soul is also described as *inner health*. Charismata – including the charism of healing – are often practised in the course or outside the confines of a church service in order to heal the sick and to perform miracles, this being an important part of the ethos or lifestyle of Pentecostals.²⁴⁶ Manifestations of the Holy Spirit and possession by demons are always physical phenomena. Pentecostals express a great deal in church services through their body.

Ecclesiology: (Christ sanctifies.) Sanctification is an act as well as a necessary process that begins with conversion and is consolidated by the sacraments of baptism in water and the body of Christ. The assumption is that sanctification is the work of the Spirit which introduces the accusation of sin and points to justice and judgment; however, believers who are sanctified in Christ must be sanctified permanently – every day, if necessary – and nurture their sanctification as if they might lose it. In this respect most Pentecostals are Arminians²⁴⁷ and reject the doctrine of predestination.

²⁴⁶ This is the case in Brazil, for instance: cf. Câmara, Ana Lúcia/Câmara, Jonatas (eds.), *Histórias Entrelacadas: 100 anos de Milagres na Assembleia de Deus No Amazonas*, Manaus 2017; and also in the Pentecostal movement in Puerto Rico: cf. Santiago, Helen, *El Pentecostalismo de Puerto Rico: Al compás de una fe Autóctona 1916–1956*, Puerto Rico 2015.

²⁴⁷ *Arminianism*, which arose in the 16th century, assumes that redemption is the result of interaction between human beings and God's mercy brought about by faith. After the death of Jacobus Arminius (1609) his principles were published in 1610 in a five-point proclamation of faith entitled *Remonstrance* (which is why his followers are also called Remonstrants). Remonstrance is an "expression of opposition or protest", which in this case means an indictment of the Calvinist doctrine of predestination, which forms part of the denomination in Belgium.

Pneumatology: (Christ baptises.) If we are baptised in Christ, baptism in the Holy Spirit takes effect as an intermediary element for the persistence of the saints. The term used for this is being filled with the Spirit in order to undertake the mission to the peoples, although in some cases proof of speaking in tongues is required for recognition of baptism in the Holy Spirit. Pneumatology is crucial for Pentecostals because of the relationship that exists with the gifts, services and workings of the Holy Spirit. That is not quite correct, however, since in reality we are talking about a *Christological pneumatology*²⁴⁸ or a *pneumatological Christology*. Moreover, in Pentecostal ecclesiology preference is given to a form of ecclesia as the people of God or a community with the saints as a *Sanctorum Communio*²⁴⁹.

Eschatology: (Christ returns.) A key element in the eschatology of Pentecostals is the return of the resurrected Christ as a source of hope for the world²⁵⁰ and the final building of his Kingdom. While many Pentecostal movements have taken up and assimilated the Jesuit doctrine of rapture, there is no consensus on this matter. Some Pentecostals who are more versed in biblical science question the interpretation of secret rapture or the rapture of the church. Those who agree with this interpretation assert that rapture takes place before the Great Tribulation so that the church will not suffer.²⁵¹ Pentecostal eschatology is almost always *premillenarian*, importance being attached to resurrection, return, the Millennium, Judgment Day

²⁴⁸ Cf. Congar, Yves, *A palavra e o Espírito*, São Paulo 1989, 137ff.; Brandt, Hermann, *O Risco do Espírito*, São Leopoldo 1977, quoted by Mesquati de Oliveira, David, "Lutero, O Espírito Santo e os pentecostais", in: Zwetsch, Roberto E. (ed.), *Lutero e a Teologia Pentecostal*, São Leopoldo 2017, 32–56; see also Yong, Amos, "Poured Out on all Flesh: The Spirit, World Pentecostalism, and the Renewal of Theology and Praxis in the 21st Century", in: *PentecostStudies*, No. 6 (2006) 1, 16–46.

²⁴⁹ Bonhoeffer, Dietrich, "Sanctorum Communio: Eine dogmatische Untersuchung zur Soziologie der Kirche", in: id., *Complete Edition*, edited by Joachim von Soosten, vol. 1, Munich 2005; cf. Frère François de Taizé, *Die Aktualität Dietrich Bonhoeffers (1906–1945): Ein Porträt*, http://www.taize.fr/de_article4904.html (25.09.2018).

²⁵⁰ Cf. Martins, Aílton, "A esperança no pentecostalismo clássico: uma proposta para escatologia do Espírito a partir da experiência da praxis da fé pentecostal", in: Mesquati de Oliveira, David/de Vasconcelos Ferreira, Ismael/Fajardo, Maxwell Pinheiro (eds.), *Pentecostalismos em Perspectiva*, São Paulo, Brasil 2017, 341–355.

²⁵¹ Cf. Duffield, Guy P./Van Cleave, Nathaniel M., *Foundations of Pentecostal Theology*, no place of publication indicated, 2002; see also Farrow, Douglas, *Ascension and Ecclesia: On the Significance of the Doctrine of the Ascension for Ecclesiology and Christian Cosmology*, Grand Rapids 1999; Bousset, William, *La leyenda del Anticristo*, London 1896; Anderson, Andrew R., *Puerta De Alexander, Gog y Magog y las Naciones incluidas: Monografías de la medieval Academy of America*, Cambridge 1932.

and the Kingdom of God. This does not mean that other doctrines are refuted, but that certain ones are emphasised, as the Methodist and theologian José Míguez Bonino²⁵² has noted.

Identitarian Pentecostality

Social/Pentecostal identity evolves in the worshipping community

From beginning to end the church service is marked by a gradual, ascending process which is aimed throughout at achieving “contact with heaven” through ecstasy. For that reason a typical Pentecostal service in which *mystical ecstasy*²⁵³ occurs comprises the following elements: a) hymns, b) opening prayer, c) termination of secular time, d) stages of increasing mystical ecstasy, e) closing prayer, f) mission or extension of holy time to secular time.²⁵⁴

In a Pentecostal service, confirmation of transcendence, of the holy, of the unspeakable is manifested by means of the contrast with human transience. The profoundly sinful nature of society is stressed. The service with *glossolalia* is an emulation of archetypal sign language. Although attempts are made to achieve mystical ecstasy, it does not end in a flight from earthly reality (escapism or alienation) or a reproduction of Gnostic dualism in which there is an antithesis between good and evil. At all events, it is a modern emulation and embodiment of archaic forms of the experience of the holy as well as a cultural form of replicating the cosmic order, in which rite has priority over concept, dance over thesis and gesture over word, although this need not necessarily run counter to a theoretical discussion. Glossolalia is a form of speaking which the persons praying need not understand themselves but which has a symbolic meaning. It does not have to be a language, although that can be the case. The most important aspect of glossolalia is not translation

²⁵² Bonino, José Míguez, *Rostros del protestantismo Latinoamericano*, Buenos Aires/Grand Rapids 1995, 65.

²⁵³ The term *mystical* as a category signifies that the divine is manifest in every religious experience: “God himself is present here”. The mystical phenomenon is the “attempt to transcend every sphere of finite being in order to reunite the finite with the infinite” (Tillich, Paul, *Systematische Theologie*, vol. 2: *Die Existenz und der Christus*, Berlin/New York 1987, 93).

²⁵⁴ Cf. Campos, Bernardo, *Estructura y Morfología del Culto Pentecostal*, Lima 22016, <https://www.academia.edu/25378386/estructura-y-morfologia-del-culto-pentecostal> (25.09.2018).

but its *significance* as constituting meaning in the midst of a church service, meaning which is on a different plane to everyday, direct and simple human language when the service proceeds in a *different sphere* of reality: *the reality* of the holy.

Pentecost as a universal point of reference and a key to reading in Pentecostal theology

For Pentecostalism the Pentecostal event (and thus the Acts of the Apostles) is an archetypal, universal point of reference as well as a key to reading the Bible.

Pentecostals believe that deep within every church professing to be Christian there is a *latent or patent Pentecostality*, which exists for the following reasons.

Firstly, the Pentecostal event is a primordial phenomenon of Christianity in its historical manifestation. a) *As a promise* it is a prerequisite in the sense that it substantiates and permeates that which is of fundamental importance: being a witness and bearing witness to the presence of the resurrected Jesus, Lord and Christ. b) It is a Christological event which gives the church an *eschatological beginning* as regards a *promised kingdom*. c) Pentecostality is, therefore, not an *epiphenomenon* of Christianity, as the current existence of the Pentecostal movements and the Pentecostal experiences following the Christ event after Easter or after Pentecost might imply.

Secondly, the event of the Pentecost – to the extent that it is fundamental and of crucial significance – is the “symbolic location” of the reference to what is reported of the historical mediation of the universal Church of Jesus Christ, in other words the entire Christian church.

For Pentecostals, Pentecost is a historical, fundamental “reference point” (*locus theologicus*) – not in any normative sense, though, as if the life of the first Christians (the early church) should be taken as a “model” for those who came after, but in the sense of an example for the common endeavour to seek mutual understanding and self-creation in the light of the Pentecostal event and the Christ event, in other words because of *Pentecostality*.

Thirdly, the reference to the early church as a founding experience maintains its validity for us today in its property as an *archetype*. Seen from this perspective it is permissible to seek and find a patent or latent *Pentecostality* in “Catholicity”. In other words, wherever there is a religious community founded on “Catholicity” there is a latent or patent *Pentecostality*.

Now, it might be objected that the “early Pentecostal movement” may not have coincided with “early Catholicism”.²⁵⁵ This would take account of only one aspect of the matter, however. As can be inferred from the Synoptic Gospels, there is an early Catholicism in the experience of Jesus Christ and his disciples in which *Pentecostality* is not readily discernible.

Pentecostality as an important sign of the church

Pentecostality is an *important sign of the church*²⁵⁶, since it is the pillar on which the other signs and attributes rest. Apostolicity, holiness, oneness and the Catholicity of the church are only possible thanks to *Pentecostality*, because it reflects the working of Christ, who is present in the Holy Spirit, and marks the beginning of the ecclesial era up to the parousia. Catholicity, oneness and holiness would not be possible without *Pentecostality*. *Pentecostality* gives apostolicity motivation and meaning.

²⁵⁵ Cf. Theisen, Gerd, *La Religión de los primeros cristianos: Una teoría del cristianismo primitivo*, Salamanca 2002

²⁵⁶ This hypothesis is dealt with in: Campos, Bernardo, “El pentecostalismo en el contexto indígena: La ansiedad por la hominización”, a presentation given at the symposium on “Pentecostal Churches in Guatemala/Central America as a challenge for the Catholic Church” held by the German Bishops’ Conference in cooperation with the German Bishops’ Conference Research Group on the Tasks of the Universal Church in Guatemala City (Casa Marista de formación) from 6 to 9 August 2018.

Although the theory of the *notae ecclesiae* was not fully developed until after the reform, earlier signs can be found in St. Augustine. He assumes there are five signs which distinguish the church: genuine wisdom, the denomination “Catholic”, acceptance on the part of the vast majority, the miracles, the chair of St. Peter and the Episcopal succession. The four key attributes of the Church – oneness, holi-ness, Catholicity and apostolicity –, which were also named as positive signs by Thomas Aquinas, can be found in the Nicene Creed, however. Pope Boniface VIII mentions the same four properties in his papal bull *Unam sanctam* (1302). However, Johannes von Ragusa was the first to draw up what later came to be known as the theology of signs in his manuscript *De Ecclesia* (1433–1435). The signs proposed by St. Augustine were adapted for a definition of the position of the Catholic Church. Cf. <http://mercaba.org/DicEC/N/notasdelaiglesia.htm> (25.09.2018).

Hermeneutics of the Spirit and Pentecostal theology

The theological work of the Pentecostal movement

The theological work of the Pentecostal movement is essentially *pragmatic*. If necessary, it makes use of whatever is appropriate: elements of different theologies are combined, depending on what seems best. This method of proceeding clearly harbours risks and the consequences are often fatal, if not heretical. For the most part the hermeneutics involved is context related. Essentially it could be said that the Bible is interpreted in an intuitive, scholarly and context-related (procedural) manner and the events are read in the light of the Holy Spirit (inspirational) and against the background of the biblical prophecies. Fulfilment is sought in world history (prophetic, historical). The meaning of the text is updated in keeping with modern-day experience and placed in context (experience related). Experience is emphasised so that the biblical text can be experienced in a way that matches the hagiography (fitting). Efforts are consistently made to recognise what is exceptional in the narrative (transcendental) and to put it into practice (pragmatic).

From the very beginning Pentecostal theology was Christological ("Christ: redeems, heals, [baptises,] sanctifies and returns"). At the same time it was pneumatological (spiritualising) and apocalyptic (millenarian), but not messianic. It is eschatological (i.e. it relates everything with the parousia). Its hermeneutics is almost always related to a group or community (multicultural).

In summary, it can be said that it is a *handmade* theology, because theological essentials are combined with whatever happens to be available, just like somebody who makes a mosaic from coloured stones or ceramic parts or a patchwork blanket from pieces of cloth (interculturality and cross-fertilisation).

The hermeneutics of the Spirit

The hermeneutics of the Spirit is not just an "understanding of the faith" (*intellectus fidei*) in the sense of a rational grasp. It is also, and above all, an important and specific updating, a practical application and extension of the event triggered by the message of the biblical text, which becomes flesh in the daily religious experience

resulting from the *actual* encounter with the Risen Jesus.²⁵⁷ Drawing on Jon Sobrino, Daniel Chiquete thinks that in hermeneutical terms Pentecostal theology is conveyed not as *intellectus fidei* but rather as *intellectus amoris et misericordiae* (an understanding born of love and charity) in the sense of a knowledge of God.²⁵⁸

Seen from this angle, the old and the new Pentecostal experience are genuine experiences of the Holy Spirit within a community of believers who define themselves as Pentecostals, i.e. as successors of the Pentecostal experience. The Apostle Peter interpreted the experience of the Jews and the proselytes as having been instigated by the Spirit. Peter, who might be described as the first Pentecostal theologian, connected the Pentecostal experience with the prophecy made by Joel for the final days and thus updated – *in actu* – the message of the old biblical text.

Peter's experience, which has been replicated by Christians down the centuries, founded what I call “Pentecostality”. This is a theological construction which serves as an epistemological criterion to describe the vocation of the universality of the Church and can be employed to overcome the aporias of the recent problematical historicisation and institutionalisation of the Pentecostal movements. At the same time Pentecostality belongs to the *notae*²⁵⁹ of the Church. *Pentecostality* is, therefore, a universal experience which finds expression in the Pentecostal event as a regulating principle for those who identify with the experience of the Pentecostal revival and thus develop a *Pentecostal identity*²⁶⁰.

²⁵⁷ Cf. Campos, Bernardo, *Hermenéutica del Espíritu: Cómo Interpretar los Sucesos del Espíritu a la Luz de la Palabra de Dios*, Oregon 2016, 60.

²⁵⁸ Cf. Chiquete, Daniel, *Haciendo Camino al andar: Siete ensayos de Teología Pentecostal*, Costa Rica 2007, 30–32.

²⁵⁹ On the meaning, ecumenical function, eschatological dimension and current impact of the *notae* of the Church see the interesting commentary by Duquoc, Christian, *Iglesias Provisionales: Ensayo de eclesiología Ecuménica*, Madrid 1986, 101–137. In Latin, the term *notae* describes the brand concept, attributes or hallmarks which constitute the essence of the Church. The *notae* of the Church are: oneness, holiness, Catholicity and apostolicity. To that I would now add Pentecostality, which links these attributes.

²⁶⁰ Cf. Vaccaro, Gabriel O., *Identidad Pentecostal*, Quito 1999. He provides a very good description of the attributes of this identification. See also Campos, Bernardo, “La Madurez del Hermano Menor: Apuntes sobre el Sujeto de la Producción Teológica Pentecostal”, 2011, [https://issuu.com/pentecostalidad/docs/apuntes_sobre_la_identidad_pentecostal_\(25.09.2018\)](https://issuu.com/pentecostalidad/docs/apuntes_sobre_la_identidad_pentecostal_(25.09.2018)). A study of new trends and emerging models can be found in Barrozo, Farias/Breno, Victor, “Faces do pentecostalismo brasileiro: Esboço de uma cartografia do campo

Summing up, Pentecostality can be described as a principle and fundamental religious practice which has its origins in the Pentecostal event; a universal experience that raises Pentecostal and post-Pentecostal practices, which claim to be of central importance as the historical counterparts of this *experience*, to the level of a “principle” (organising archetype); of seminal importance because it explains current experience and provides new experiences with meaning and identity.²⁶¹

In the light of recent experiences within the Ibero-American church (in Spanish and Portuguese-speaking countries) concerning the working of the Holy Spirit we are now witnessing a more universal expression of Pentecostality. This *Pentecostality* permeates denominational forms of all kinds and consequently brings forth innovative and alarming religious variations. Most (perhaps not all) of the neo-Pentecostal churches illustrate the changes which characterise the Christian upsurge all around the world. For that reason they no longer appear to be Pentecostal churches. Their new guise makes them look different. While they may retain aspects of the earlier religiousness, they display new forms in the content of their faith, in their rituals, organisational forms, ethical norms and public practices. Farias Barrozo and Victor Breno²⁶² classify them as *hybrid*.

The Pentecostal movement is the outcome of revival experiences or, more precisely, the continuation of various prior revival experiences. No revival is static or comparable with any other. Every revival is unique. In general a revival experience brings forth new experiences which can lead to a revolution among people and their environment. A wave of revival lasts for a certain time (20, 50 or 100 years?) and then subsides. As long as it lasts, it transports friend and foe alike. When it abates, it leaves behind a great void. But *something new* has arisen and those who remain must compete to adapt to the new situation. Some come to a mutual arrangement while others resist. The dilemma means *adapt or die*. It is true that not every major movement in the churches is of necessity a revival

pentecostal no Brasil”, in: Mesquati de Oliveira, David/de Vasconcelos Ferreira, Ismael/Fajardo, Maxwell Pinheiro (eds.), op. cit., 97–106.

²⁶¹ Cf. Campos, Bernardo, De la Reforma Protestante a la Pentecostalidad de la Iglesia, Quito 1997, 90.

²⁶² Barrozo, Farias/Breno, Victor, op. cit., 102.

movement. If the revival is authentic, it brushes resistance aside and wraps those who are prepared (to open up to the Holy Spirit) in a mantle of peace and serenity of the Spirit. This leads to repentance and penitence, to confession of sins, to sanctifying zeal, to a return to the Word of God, to a thirst for God and his presence as well as to joy and delight which flow in streams²⁶³, and to a host of extraordinary manifestations.

The revival leads to the development of a new rationality, a new mentality and hence to new religious modes of behaviour and new theologies. New debates take place to explain the new practices. The changing rites that reflect the new religious content are a source of surprise and scandal.²⁶⁴ The previous organisation dissolves itself because it is no longer viable for the new era that is dawning. The charisma leads to the breakdown of the religious institution.²⁶⁵ A new set of ethical rules and a new morality emerge.²⁶⁶ New forms of association lead to the formation of new modes of social coexistence which exert a varying influence on society at large. A new hermeneutics would clearly be needed to interpret the new situation. Such is the development of Pentecostal theology.

²⁶³ Cf. Ropero, Alfonso/Hughes, Philip E., *Teología Bíblica del Avivamiento: Avívanos de nuevo*, Bar-celona 1999, 86–90.

²⁶⁴ Cf. Moulian Tesmer, Rodrigo, *Metamorfosis Ritual: Desde el Ngillatun al Culto Pentecostal. Teoría, historia y etnografía del cambio ritual en comunidades mapuche willische*, Valdivia 2012, 517–529.

²⁶⁵ On the routinisation of the charisma see Weber, Max, *Wirtschaft und Gesellschaft: Grundriss der verstehenden Soziologie*, Tübingen 2002.

²⁶⁶ Fernandes de Souza, Elton, "Conflitos entre pentecostais: repreentações da igreja universal do Reino de Deus no âmbito da Igreja Evangélica Assembleia de Deus do Brasil (1990-2009)", in: Oliva, Alfredo Dos Santos/Benatte, Antonio Paulo (eds.), *Cem Anos de Pentecostes: Capítulos da História do pentecostalismo No Brasil*, São Paulo 2010, 249–284.

Principal Features of African Pentecostal Theology

Paul Gifford

In recent years churches have proliferated across sub-Saharan Africa. These are not the mainline or mission churches (to which the majority of African Christians still belong) nor the conventional African Independent Churches which probably were strongest around the 1960s. There is enormous variety within these new churches. Some are megachurches, with state of the art facilities and branches in other countries. Others are small, almost family concerns, meeting in makeshift premises. Some conduct services in English; others local languages. Some cater for the middle classes, others for the poor, some for both. Some are well established, others disappear rapidly. Some have links to Western (mainly North American) churches, many more would like them. Some have pastors travelling the world to international conventions and are media stars; others are much more modest. Although services tend to follow the same basic structure (praise and worship, testimonies, offering, sermon), some are more sacramental, with communion (even if rather infrequent) and a higher understanding of baptism.

This variety makes categorizing them difficult. Labeling them 'Pentecostal' can distort, if one assumes that Pentecostalism automatically connotes the gifts of the first Pentecost – tongues, prophecy, healing, other gifts. (Most attending these churches, for example, do not speak in tongues.) Nor can one simply apply the word evangelical, if one assumes the four characteristics usually ascribed to Anglo-Saxon evangelicalism: biblicism, personal conversion, mission and the cross. (As will become evident, their stress on the cross can be minimal.) However, we cannot avoid using labels, and I will follow convention and call all these new churches Pentecostal, but I will leave aside the question of their relation to Pentecostalism in the West. I will not proceed from some presumed 'essence', but give a personal assessment of their major theological ideas, based on 35 years of attending such churches.

Enchanted Imagination

Their theology perpetuates in large measure the worldview of African Traditional Religion (let that stand, despite problems surrounding the word ‘traditional’). In ATR there is no such thing as pure matter; spirits pervade everything – trees, lakes, rivers, mountains, animals. These spirits, and spirits of the ancestors, can affect us, and religion is in large measure ensuring proper relations with them. A successful human life, assessed in terms of abundance (of crops, flocks, wives, children, and long life) depends on them. Causality is sought largely (though not exclusively) in these spiritual forces.

This worldview (which we can call ‘enchanted’ in deference to Max Weber) has been brought sharply to Western attention in recent years through the publicity given to issues like albino killings in Tanzania, where body parts of albinos are sought for their supposed mystical power to bring riches. Spates of such ritual murder were reported in Liberia in November 2015, Uganda in March 2016, in Zambia in April 2016, and as I write, July 2017, the police in Mozambique are reported to be increasing their protection for bald men after an outbreak of ritual murders; the police are blaming traffickers from neighbouring countries of Tanzania, Malawi and the Great Lakes. This worldview underpins the phenomenon of child witches in the Democratic Republic of Congo. It is pervasive in African football; among recent examples, in 2014 Emmanuel Adébator of Togo and Tottenham to great publicity accused his mother and sisters of using *juju* to end his career, and in 2017 a former Zimbabwe captain’s autobiography revealed the rituals, charms and spells that spiritual advisers enforced on them, often undermining technical strategy and performance.

This enchanted worldview is hard to deal with appropriately and sensitively, because in the West it is often associated with superstition and backwardness. Drawing attention to it seems to portray those operating with such a worldview as primitive. But I would argue that this enchanted religious imagination is the biggest single reason for the spread of this new Christianity: finally a form of Christianity has become acceptable that takes this enchanted worldview seriously, in a way that the mission churches never did. No longer, for example, does a Catholic, after attending Mass on Sunday, have to slip away quietly on a weeknight to a healer-diviner to deal with the spiritual

cause of her predicament. She can have her problem addressed publicly on a Sunday through official church ministry.

Many African Pentecostal churches exclusively focus on this worldview. A prominent and influential church of this kind is the Mountain of Fire and Miracles Ministry, founded by Daniel Olukoya in Lagos in 1989.²⁶⁷ It has spread throughout Africa and Europe (in 2012 it claimed 83 branches in Britain alone). Olukoya puts all his stress on combating the spiritual forces determined to thwart our glorious destiny. These include witches, who are people in league with the devil and whose evil manipulation can be detected wherever we fall short of the greatness which God intended for us. Even more powerful than witches are marine spirits, found widely in Africa's coastal and riverine areas, and particularly associated with sex and female beauty; they control commerce, trade and the economy, and the world of fashion. Again, their presence can be detected anywhere there is failure. Spirit spouses, or wives and husbands in the spirit realm, also thwart our destiny; according to Olukoya 90% of African women are 'trapped spiritually' by spirit husbands. We are also prey of the curses and covenants that even remote ancestors incurred or entered into in the past. Ancestral curses, lasting up to 500 years, are ubiquitous in Africa where (he claims) 95% of problems stem from ancestors. Places can be cursed, too. Curses can cover things like poverty, infertility, stagnation, backwardness, defeat and general failure. Such spiritual forces are so powerful and pervasive that often a powerfully gifted pastor is needed to identify and neutralize them. Churches like Olukoya's are geared to achieving exactly this.

Not all churches are as relentlessly focused on this worldview as is Olukoya's. I have even found churches which repudiate this worldview entirely – Mensa Otabil of the Central Gospel Church of Accra, Ghana, actually preaches against it, claiming that there is no future for Africa until this worldview is discarded. In other churches, too, it may not be the standard Sunday fare, but most often it can be discerned not far below the surface, and virtually all Pentecostal conventions can easily accommodate pastors like Olukoya.

²⁶⁷ I have discussed this church in Gifford, Paul, Christianity, Development and Modernity in Africa, London 2015, 13–27.

Faith Gospel

The Faith Gospel originated in the USA in the 1950s, and is associated with such names as Kenneth Hagin Jr. and Kenneth and Gloria Copeland. The faith gospel holds God has met all the needs of human beings in the suffering and death of Christ, and that every Christian should now share in Christ's victory over sin, sickness and poverty (hence the label 'health-wealth gospel'). These blessings are obtained by a confession of faith (hence the dismissive name: the 'name-it-and-claim-it gospel'). For this reason, negative speech is outlawed. Thus some of these churches refuse to use the traditional marriage formula 'for better or worse'; even to mention the word 'worse' makes it a possibility.

This faith gospel quickly became associated with the idea of 'seed faith' (from the biblical image of sowing and reaping). To receive one's due, one must first sow. Thus tithes and offerings are essential. The aggressive, theologically driven, quest for funds is the salient characteristic of many of these churches. Some of this is as unsubtle as similar efforts in North America, and there are just as many abuses. But to focus on abuses would be to miss the dynamism of the entire movement, which is fueled precisely by this focus on material wellbeing.

This faith gospel is pervasive in Africa's new churches. I would argue that in some form it characterizes virtually all, because the theology of seed faith is the motor which has powered the proliferation of these churches. All these buildings, sound systems, musical instruments, vehicles, programmes, all these new religious entrepreneurs, have had to be paid for. This theology has made it all possible. If the precise expression can be traced back to American televangelists, it fits very well with Africa's traditional worldview that religion is concerned with well-being and abundance.

I have written extensively on one church that perfectly embodies this theology. This is Living Faith Church Worldwide, founded in Lagos by David Oyedepo in 1983.²⁶⁸ (Its popular name of 'Winners' Chapel' says it all. This is in no way unique; names denoting success are common among these churches: Victory Bible Church, Jesus

²⁶⁸ Ibid., 29–45.

Breakthrough Assembly, Triumphant Christian Centre. This is also the explanation for the addition of ‘International’ to so many church names; that is another indication of success.) Oyedepo’s church has over 400 branches in Nigeria, and is in 40 African countries. Winners’ headquarters outside Lagos boasts the world’s biggest church, seating 50,400 people. In Nairobi, Kenya, it has opened what it claims is the biggest church in East Africa. (In this matter, size is important; it is another indication of success). Though the success promised at Winners’ covers all areas of life, material success is paramount – to be expected from Oyedepo’s account of his calling by God, obviously modeled on God’s call to Moses. But whereas Moses was commanded ‘Set my people free’, Oyedepo was told ‘Make my people rich’. Testimonies at this church almost invariably tell of God’s favour in providing wealth, jobs, scholarships, cars, houses, visas for overseas travel.

Oyedepo preaches the whole package (and, named by Forbes as Africa’s richest pastor, with four private jets, he personally witnesses to the abundance God lavishes on true followers). He freely acknowledges his debt to Hagin and Copeland, claiming that he learnt ‘the secrets of kingdom prosperity’ from books by Copeland and even from sleeping in a bed in which Copeland had once slept. He does encourage work and effort, and his churches invariably run entrepreneurs’ workshops and businessmen’s clubs where the successful and established can help beginners, but this in no way obscures the fact that the motor of success is divine favour, obtained principally by sowing into his ministry.

Prosperity thinking of some sort (its precise formulation can vary, and mutations are ongoing) has even become retroactive, in the sense that churches not previously associated with this teaching have since embraced it. One of Africa’s biggest Pentecostal churches, The Redeemed Christian Church of God (RCCG), another Nigerian multinational that claims to be the fastest growing church in the world (although in Africa at least it has been surpassed by Winners’), was founded by Josiah Akindayomi in 1952. His successor and current leader, Enoch Adeboye, transformed it in the early 1980s from a struggling holiness, even world-denying tribal church, into the flourishing prosperity multinational it is today.

Prophecy

Africa's Pentecostal pastors are often not simply preachers. Increasingly they present themselves as anointed to effect biblical promises in the lives of followers. The Bible is considered not a record of God's revelation or saving acts in history, but as a record of covenants, promises, pledges and commitments between God and his chosen. These are not realities of the past. The Bible is a contemporary document. The Bible offers God's covenant and commitment to me now.

The pastor thus exercises a performative function; in the same way as a judge can declare a defendant guilty or not guilty, or as one properly accredited can declare a man and woman husband and wife, so the pastor declares the promises of the Bible fulfilled in my life: the blessings of Abraham, the power of Joseph, the authority of Moses, the sovereignty of David, the wealth of Solomon, the anointing of Elijah. Thus certain texts become privileged – the exilic and post-exilic prophecies of restoration (like Isaiah 60, for example) are standard fare.

This prophetic development has even led to Pentecostal rituals (sometimes considered a contradiction in terms). At Winners', for example, at special services everyone brings a white handkerchief called a mantle, which the Man of God blesses and imbues with a double portion (II Kings 2,9). Several times a year Winners' conducts a washing of the feet, not so much on the example of Jesus at the Last Supper ((Jn 13), but referring to Joshua 14,9: 'Whosoever your feet tread upon shall be given unto you for a possession' – thus assuring the recipient of new acquisitions. Winners' most characteristic ritual involves oil (Oyedepo claims to have introduced this to Africa, and it is now widely imitated). Winners' anointing ritual, built upon texts like the anointing of Aaron's family (Ex 30,30-31), Samuel's anointing of Saul (I Sam 10,1-7) and the miraculous exploits of Elijah and Elisha (II Kings 2-8), imparts the power of these men.

These developments have brought enhanced status to the pastor, with considerable effect on these churches' 'ecclesiology'. Many of these churches (even some making claims to promote 'cell groups') are not really communities or fellowships at all. Some began that way but have become associations of clients of a particular 'Man

of God'. Leaders who were originally called 'Brother (more rarely 'Sister') became 'Bishop' or 'Archbishop'. Prophets with their special anointing have become persons of a totally different order from their congregations. To quote Wilfred Lai of Mombasa, Kenya: 'I am your Moses. God has sent me to deliver you from everything that has been binding you'.

Specific prophecies, of course, become eminently falsifiable. Pastors can insist that particular breakthroughs will occur 'now', 'during this service', 'this week', 'this month' or 'this year'. I have even heard a pastor in Ghana proclaim: 'No man has yet asked you to marry him. At the end of this service, thirty men will come to ask you.' This falsifiability is probably part of the reason for the traffic between these churches, the large numbers leaving one and joining another. Failure of prophecies seems less to discredit the mindset than to highlight the inadequacy of a particular pastor.

Conclusion

I have focused on what I consider three principal theological emphases in contemporary African Pentecostalism. They are not found in every case, and their balance varies, but they are pervasive. The huge investment of the likes of Olukoya and Oyedepo on the ever-increasing Christian broadcast media serves to diffuse them further. It will be clear that these characteristics do not flow from any 'essence' of Pentecostalism. I have not presumed that because Pentecostalism refers directly to the first Pentecost, therefore the Holy Spirit must be the first referent in African Pentecostalism. (I would argue Abraham is more prominent than the Holy Spirit.) By contrast, I have argued from personal observation.

It has often been said that Christianity in Africa focused the attention of Africans on the next life at the expense of this world. If so, this emphasis has been totally reversed. It is obvious that this Christianity is focused on the here and now. Achieving one's glorious destiny *here* is paramount – either through spiritual warfare against the forces that would diminish it, or through claiming biblical blessings in faith, or submitting to the prophetic anointing of the Man of God. Yes, this Christianity offers salvation, but one is 'saved' primarily from poverty or sickness or obscurity and insignificance here. I

have suggested that the this-worldly focus fits very closely with the traditional African understanding of religion.

This stress on this-worldly wellbeing means (rather paradoxically) that addressing suffering (in a continent marked by considerable suffering) is notably absent. This Christianity is geared to eliminate suffering rather than address it. Suffering is viewed as an aberration in a Christian life, rather than part of any redemptive plan. The cross is not frequently cited, and where it is, it is often invoked to convey the message that Christ suffered on the cross so that we don't have to.

The Bible is quoted widely; these churches often claim that they are 'biblical' to distinguish themselves from the mission churches. The sermon is central – much more so than anything sacramental (which in most cases is a dimension totally lacking). In many cases the biblical usage is characterized by remarkable ingenuity and rhetorical skill, but the quoting is usually atomistic – texts are chosen to illustrate or clinch the point to be made, with little attention to context or to authorial intent, or even parameters of common-sense interpretation. An enchanted theology or the faith gospel can indeed be buttressed from scriptural verses, but only with difficulty can one claim it to be the obvious or central, much less the *only* reading of the Bible. The absence of a 'critical' or 'historical' perspective does not make these churches 'fundamentalist' (a term best avoided because of its very different provenance) but it gives their use of the Bible a particular character, one very different from that characteristic of the mainline churches of the West.²⁶⁹

The person of Jesus is not particularly prominent. It is probable that in most Pentecostal churches Old Testament figures like the patriarchs and Judges, and Moses, David and Solomon are cited more often; they illustrate the blessings we could and should replicate. The miracles of Jesus are sometimes used, but reference to his teaching is far less common. Reference to his incarnation and resurrection are not common; the restoration of Israel is a more common image for rising from poverty, sickness and mediocrity than the resurrection. Paul is not prominent; Hebrews (with its verses on faith) is probably cited

²⁶⁹ Gifford, Paul, "A Nigerian Reading of the Bible and its Interpretational Power", in Hock, Klaus (ed.), *The Power of Interpretation: Imagined Authenticity, Appropriated Identity: Conflicting Discourses on New Forms of African Christianity*, Wiesbaden 2016, 25–37.

more often. There is little use of the apocalyptic literature, perhaps surprisingly, given the apocalyptic conditions in parts of Africa.

Christian morality is of course essential. Repentance and righteousness are frequently demanded. Corruption is often denounced; honesty and integrity are insisted on. Drink and immodest clothing may be decried, but it is not usually a particularly puritan morality – marriage and the family are highly valued, and husbands and wives are exhorted to fulfill their duties selflessly, but abandoned or divorced women have no stigma attached to them. These churches are not world-denying. Where they have been, the trajectory is towards world-affirming (as noted above in the case of the RCCG); the faith gospel brings all blessings in their fullness.

The social dimension is not prominent. The stress is on personal destiny, though it is understood that with more Africans achieving the personal destiny decreed by God, Africa's circumstances will change. This Christianity pays little attention to the structures or systems that prevail in Africa. In fact, it is rather prone to support politicians upholding and benefiting from present structures, as long as they claim to be 'born-again' and show favour to these churches. Chiluba in Zambia, Doe in Liberia, Momoh in Sierra Leone and Moi in Kenya are among those who have encouraged this sector (even attending crusades) and thus benefited from Pentecostal support, without notable change in the country's governance.

The dynamics of these churches are predominantly African. But they are not isolated, and Africa's Pentecostal pastors are increasingly significant in international networks, not least those of African Americans. As Africa changes, and as the influence of these networks increases, this Pentecostal sector can be expected to change also.

Fascination of Pentecostalism for Christians in Africa/Asia/Latin America/Europe

Something is not coming our way; it is already here. The fascination of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements for Christians in German-speaking countries

Hildegard Wustmans

A Personal Snapshot

After listening to one of my lectures a student invited me to come to his prayer group and give a talk. After a quick look in my diary I immediately accepted, although I had to convince him that I would prefer to engage in a dialogue with the participants rather than deliver a monologue. After some reflection and mutual discussion he took up my offer and so it was clear from the start that we would embark on the experiment together. Thus it was that I made my way to the prayer group on the appointed evening. Every Wednesday a group of around thirty young adults met in a chapel in Upper Austria with speakers sometimes being invited along. The participants (most of whom had biographical ties to Croatia) were all greatly influenced by the pilgrimage town of Medjugorje. Consequently, the Mother of God was at the centre of their prayers. The rosary was recited in German and Croatian and the songs' catchy melodies reminded me of Balkan pop music. The testimonies and intercessions were spoken in German. In this atmosphere of concentration everything was enveloped in a soft, warm light. The street noise penetrating the periods of silence sounded as if it came from a distant world. Looking around me I saw deeply moved young men and women engaged in devout prayer. In the midst of it all I felt like a participating observer. No spark ignited my own religious ardour. Instead, I occasionally felt rather perturbed, ill at ease even. Mary was invoked as a woman of peace and the Prayer to Saint Michael was also spoken in the old version.²⁷⁰

²⁷⁰ Saint Michael the Archangel, defend us in battle, be our protection against the malice and snares of the devil. May God rebuke him we humbly pray; and do thou, O Prince of the Heavenly host, by the power of God, thrust into hell Satan and all evil spirits who wander through the world for the ruin of souls. Amen.

With the strong feeling, on the one hand, that this liturgical celebration placed unreasonable demands on me, in the ensuing exchange I, in turn, believed myself to be an imposition on the others, someone who asked questions and made uncomfortable observations. Nevertheless, the encounter was a friendly one marked by mutual respect and interest in the views of the other. It was this constellation that created an "accessible" space in between. A space which permitted critical questions, provoked irritation and even encouraged the discovery of some similarities. After about two hours of prayer and exchange we filed over to the rectory for some refreshments. A relaxed and joyful atmosphere prevailed. A young man sought a conversation with me. He wanted to talk in a quiet place. We went outside and he told me about his conversion in Medjugorje. He had taken this experience as an occasion to change his life completely, giving it a new direction. Everything had been going well for him. He had completed his studies (in economics) quickly and successfully and already had a job. He was due to begin in October. He only enjoyed alcohol in moderation nowadays and sex was no longer an issue. But all this had a painful side, he confessed. He had been feeling increasingly alien towards his friends. He was no longer able to share in their world and asked me what he should do or how he could assist in their own conversion. I suddenly found myself in the midst of all the unreasonableness and seeming irrationality that faith can hold and I knew immediately that I would probably not be able to respond to all aspects in a manner pleasing to my interlocutor. But there was no other way. First of all, I thanked him for the trust and confidence he had placed in me by requesting a conversation. I thought it courageous. Afterwards, we discussed conversions and I told him that I did not believe that conversions could be "made". These, like faith, are a gift. As he reflected on his own conversion, I sensed that he secretly agreed with this way of thinking. I also shared with him my opinion that the Christian faith is marked by respect for others, even if I cannot share in, or specifically advocate, their various ways of living. The prayer meeting in the church had, for me, been marked by something of this understanding. Finally I questioned, in my discussion with him, a faith that divides and does not unite. How salutary is a faith that builds walls and fails to tear them down? Is this consistent with the philanthropy of God, who became incarnate in Jesus Christ so that all may have life and have it in abundance

(Jn 10:10)? The young man and I left each other in pensive mood, the conversation still lingering in my mind. Did his questions not show that the direction offered, the certainties expressed through prayer, only appeared to quell questions and uncertainties, which sometimes became only the greater as a result of contact with other environments? Always knowing what God wants is a mere fallacy in the context of such Charismatic movements (which are partly also fundamentalist movements).²⁷¹ This is why they are so dangerous for both individuals and social systems. Their statements are also theologically misleading, because they ignore the inaccessibility and thus, ultimately, the greatness and mystery of God.

That evening I received an insight into a Christian spirituality which I have, to date, encountered in its nascent form in my experiences of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements in Brazil, Tanzania and the USA. As we know, they have been gaining ground in these regions for quite some time, but have now also penetrated as far as the German-speaking countries. The evening of shared prayer and discussion not only fuelled my theological doubts, but also prompted me to reflect more deeply on the attractiveness of these and similar spiritual forms and groups. For they constitute a religious phenomenon that is growing rapidly worldwide. According to Willibald Sandler, "approximately 120 million Catholics all over the world sympathise with Charismatic Renewal, many of them in Latin and Central America, Africa and Asia, but with [as yet, H. W.] disproportionately modest dissemination in German-speaking countries. [...] Overall, these forms of non-denominational, Charismatically-oriented Christianity are the most rapidly growing elements within the Pentecostal-Charismatic currents worldwide, which are already experiencing rapid expansion. We live in an age in which Christianity is increasingly beginning to structure itself in a non-denominational way, and there is some evidence that this is only the beginning of a spectacular volte-face."²⁷²

However, it should be mentioned at this juncture that a defining classification is almost impossible to achieve, given that

²⁷¹ Cf. Hoff, Gregor Maria, *Religionsgespenster: Versuch über den religiösen Schock*, Paderborn 2017, 21.

²⁷² Sandler, Willibald, *Erfahrungen des Heiligen Geistes in charismatischen Strömungen*, <https://www.uibk.ac.at/theol/leseraum/texte/970.html> (20.09.2017).

the movements are extremely multi-faceted.²⁷³ Nonetheless, it can be said that, although members of Charismatic groups frequently organise themselves outside the ambit of the major churches, they nevertheless remain a part of them. They often regard themselves as a complement. This applies to Renewal movements and spiritual communities such as the Loretto community, the Emmanuel community (to name two from the Catholic spectrum which also value recognition by local bishops) as well as to Protestant communities such as Vineyard. The website of Vineyard Linz states: "By this, we do not mean that existing churches aren't brilliant in their own ways! On the contrary, we think that there can't be enough of them! Linz needs even more of them! In other words, we want to add something to the great things that already exist in Linz. And why aren't there enough churches? It's quite easy. We believe that the global church is God's plan to bring his love, his peace, his forgiveness, his acceptance – his dominion – into the world. Linz is a fantastic city, but is it a city without problems? Is it a city where God's love reigns supreme? A city in which every person lives in this incredibly wonderful loving relationship with God and places his or her life in the care of Jesus' reign of peace? We think the answer is "no"! So Linz needs a new church. And hopefully many more new churches will be founded in Linz after this one so that more and more people can learn to love Jesus."²⁷⁴ This statement brims with (religious) self-confidence and makes it clear that longer-term developments are anticipated.

²⁷³ Among the books to provide an insight into the situation in Austria are: Hinkelmann, Frank, Kirchen, Freikirchen und christliche Gemeinschaften in Österreich: Handbuch der Konfessionskunde, Wien-na/Cologne/Weimar 2016; cf. <http://www.remid.de/blog/2015/10/ambivalentes-verhaeltnis-zur-moderne-was-ist-eigentlich-die-pfingstbewegung-und-warum-ist-sie-global-so-erfolgreich/> (20.09.2017) and Bergunder, Michael, "Der 'Cultural Turn' und die Erforschung der weltweiten Pfingstbewegung", in: Evangelische Theologie, No. 69 (2009), 245–269. An insight into Pentecostal / Charismatic theology is offered by Haustein, Jörg/Maltese, Giovanni (eds.), Handbuch pfingstliche und charismatische Theologie, Göttingen 2014.

²⁷⁴ Vineyard Linz, "Warum braucht Linz eine neue Kirche", <https://vineyard-linz.church/warum-braucht-linz-eine-neue-kirche> (20.09.2017). The Vineyard movement has its origins in California, where it was founded by John Wimber in 1978 and now has branches all over the world. Vineyard belongs to the "so-called third wave of the Holy Spirit". Schäfer, Klaus, "Mission im Kontext charismatischer und pentekostaler Bewegungen", in: Sekretariat der Deutschen Bischofskonferenz (ed.), Weltmission Mission – Internationaler Kongress der Katholischen Kirche: Dokumentation, 2–4 May 2006, Freising, Arbeitshilfen, No. 202, Bonn 2006, 203–240, here: 207. Central to this movement is the understanding of the Kingdom of God, worship, healing services and social commitment. Cf. Hinkelmann, Frank, op. cit., 197–200.

More than just a temporary phenomenon

There are several reasons for the rapid spread of Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity. The most important of all is probably the absolutely essential feature of Christianity – its adaptability.²⁷⁵ The skill of inculturation consists predominantly in accepting local conditions and ideas and interpreting them in a manner commensurate with Christian values.²⁷⁶ This explains why the movements in Latin America, Asia and Africa are so successful. Upon closer examination different, culturally conditioned emphases are revealed. In the case of African societies, for instance, rituals of healing and protection have always influenced religious rites and customs. Thus “healing in the Pentecostal churches [...] absorbs the alphabet of form of African rites.”²⁷⁷

In any case, these groups and movements invariably constitute an alternative to existing forms of religious expression and that, indeed, is how they seem themselves. The personal experience of faith or conversion, the reference to Holy Scripture and the emphasis on the salvific action of Jesus Christ are all of outstanding significance.²⁷⁸ Furthermore, prayer, witness and missionary commitment are of extraordinary importance.²⁷⁹ The social dimension should not be forgotten either. These aspects are particularly important in the context of migratory movements. Charismatic movements respond to these movements and accept them. “Pentecostal piety is thus a versatile means of expressing the interests, concerns and needs of people in a wide variety of positions and situations, be it poverty, loneliness, hope for social and economic advancement or fear of the deterioration of

²⁷⁵ Gregor M. Hoff discusses the skills of inculturation present within Christianity, thus highlighting Christianity's adaptability, which has developed over time. Cf. Hoff, Gregor Maria, “Religion in Europa und ihre Bedeutung für den Kontinent”, in: Theologische Revue, No. 112 (2016), 356–376, here: 366. Religious scholars also attribute this skill to Christianity.

²⁷⁶ Cf. Wagenseil, Christoph, “Ambivalentes Verhältnis zur Moderne: Was ist eigentlich die Pfingstbewegung und warum ist sie global so erfolgreich?”, in: REMID, 04.10.2015, <http://www.remid.de/blog/2015/10/ambivalentes-verhaeltnis-zur-moderne-was-ist-eigentlich-die-pfingstbewegung-und-warum-ist-sie-global-so-erfolgreich/> (20.09.2017).

²⁷⁷ Heuser, Andreas, “Die Zähmung des Satans: Erscheinungsformen der afrikanischen Pfingstbewe-gung”, in: Gemeinhardt, Alexander F. (ed.), Die Pfingstbewegung als ökumenische Herausforderung, Göttingen 2005, 58–92, here: 70.

²⁷⁸ Cf. Hempelmann, Reinhard, “Evangelikale und die Reformation: Charismatische Bewegungen im 21. Jahrhundert”, in: Herder Korrespondenz Spezial (2016) 2, 21–24, here: 23.

²⁷⁹ Cf. ibid.

status, values and familiar structures.”²⁸⁰ In addition, a clear contrast to the established Christian churches exists (this being particularly evident in migration communities) in that the challenges posed by migration are not primarily perceived and addressed as social and political problems, but as individual and spiritually challenging situations in life. In some migration communities migration is also intertwined with a missionary mandate. “Let God send foreigners to Germany so that German Christians may lead them to Christ.”²⁸¹

Personal contact is central to the stance taken by Pentecostal groups and Charismatic movements. This is frequently accompanied by a reinforcement of people’s own self-confidence which facilitates access to their own emotionalism.²⁸² Faith is not about overly intellectualised theology; it gets under the skin. Liturgical celebrations are usually suffused with a warm light, the melodies are catchy, the prayers personal and the atmosphere often intense and charged. God is experienced personally, physically, vividly and instantaneously.²⁸³ The event becomes the framework for these experiences.

The interplay of the aforementioned aspects should be seen as influencing the appeal of this form of Christian faith. In these communities people find “not only a knowledge that is supposedly secure and not subject to any challenge, but also (!) a concrete gift of know-how and experience.”²⁸⁴ In addition they offer individuals a transparent form of reassurance and security, which appears increasingly attractive in an era of diversity, ever increasing complexity and increasing uncertainties. At the same time they respond to emotions with emotion. “They protest against an understanding of reality and faith that has become devoid of mystery.”²⁸⁵ They offer all this in a network of like-minded people. The group becomes a kind of

²⁸⁰ Suarsana, Yan, *Christentum 2.0? Pfingstbewegung und Globalisierung*, Zell am Main/Würzburg 2010, 117.

²⁸¹ Ibid., 109.

²⁸² Cf. Hempelmann, Reinhard, “Pentekostale Bewegungen im deutschsprachigen Raum”, in: *Catholica*, No. 70 (2016), 187–197, here: 187.

²⁸³ Cf. Hochholzer, Michael, *Pfingstbewegung und Charismatik: Herausforderungen für die Kirche*, http://www.kamp-er-furt.de/level9_cms/download_user/Weltanschauung/Eigene%20Texte/Pfingstbewegung%20und%20Charismatik.pdf (20.9.2017).

²⁸⁴ Hempelmann, Reinhard, “Pentekostale Bewegungen im deutschsprachigen Raum”, in: *Catholica*, No. 70 (2016), 187–197, here: 195.

²⁸⁵ Ibid.

substitute family.²⁸⁶ The fact that they offer space for self-expression and personal fulfilment also seems to boost the movements' appeal. "This is confirmed by the high regard for social and missionary commitment and the idea of contributing one's own gifts to the community. Of course, there are limits to personal fulfilment [...]; in principle, however, the neo-Pentecostal congregation seems to offer many opportunities for such self-realisation. More than other Christian organisations at least."²⁸⁷ This constitutes a clear strength of these communities when compared with the established churches.

In the face of Competition

Pentecostal churches and Charismatic movements can no longer be discounted in view of their sheer growth alone (a phenomenon which is also being observed increasingly in the German-speaking countries). Instead, they should be viewed as what they really are in the context of institutionalised churches – competition and a challenge. They lay bare aspects that the churches appear to have lost sight of and neglected. This perspective thwarts the temptation to focus solely on their weaknesses. Indeed, there is a need to undertake a more general analysis of their strengths and weaknesses (and of one's own).²⁸⁸ These movements and groups establish coercive bonds as well as practising rigorous exclusion; they operate on the basis of certainties and rules, in the context of which encouragement can quickly become overbearing. Nevertheless, their growth rates and appeal (particularly to young people and migrants) indicate the existence of neglect within the established churches.²⁸⁹ Therefore, an approach is required which does not simply dismiss these movements as something that will ultimately dissolve into thin air. Not only is that a fallacy; such an attitude is both arrogant and shows an ignorance of the past. After all, Charismatic forms of expression have always been a part of Christianity. Paul, for instance, had to deal with Charismatics and Pneumatics in the church of Corinth (cf. 1 Cor 12:1-11).

²⁸⁶ Cf. Peter, Isgard S., *Der unsichtbaren Religion auf der Spur: Eine soziologische Studie zur Pfingstbewegung in Deutschland*, Saarbrücken 2007, 89.

²⁸⁷ Ibid., 90.

²⁸⁸ Cf. Sander, Hans-Joachim, "Identität mit prekärem Plural: Eine Ortsbestimmung für die Christen in nachmoderner Zeit", in: *Kirche und Israel*, No. 20 (2005), 4–8.

²⁸⁹ Cf. Hempelmann, Reinhard, "Evangelikale und die Reformation", in: *Herder Korrespondenz Spezial* (2016) 2, 21–24, here: 24.

It is dishonest to reproach the movements for their failure to embrace pluralism and yet react in the same way towards them. Indeed, such a stance is marked by resentment, which offers no way out. Instead, it nourishes personal complacencies and leads to a zero-sum game that ultimately knows only losers. After all, in the final analysis resentment is nothing more than “self-constitution by the denunciation of others”²⁹⁰ and presumably an expression of the fact that people no longer have the strength to “react creatively, self-confidently and innovatively”²⁹¹.

Self-critical confrontation with the strengths of others offers an escape from the cul-de-sacs of resentment and zero-sum games, however.²⁹² An analysis of the strengths of others allows you to familiarise oneself with your own weaknesses, consolidating your own strength as a result. Yet this perspective is by no means a matter of course, because people habitually exploit the weaknesses of others in order to feel better about themselves.

On the necessary critical and constructive approach to Pentecostal Churches and Charismatic Movements

It is remarkable that both Pentecostal churches and Charismatic movements often present themselves in what is an externally modern mould, “without opening up to modernity. They [appropriate] modernisation yet [refuse] to accept the values of modernity”²⁹³. Thus modern means of communication, the use of professional sound technology, etc., ultimately function as mere aids to delimit and narrow down the Christian faith, not only establishing norms and rules, but also demanding that they be consistently adhered to. These aspects must be evaluated critically, because they give people a security that does not exist. Moreover, the fact that fundamental statements

²⁹⁰ Bucher, Rainer, “Entmonopolisierung und Machtverlust: Wie kam die Kirche in die Krise?”, in: id. (ed.), *Die Provokation der Krise: Zwölf Fragen und Antworten zur Lage der Kirche*, Würzburg 2004, 11–29, here: 21.

²⁹¹ Ibid.

²⁹² Cf. Sander, Hans-Joachim, “Dialoge führen – Heteropien des Glaubens: Über die Kunst und Fähigkeiten, führen zu können”, http://www.wir-sind-kirche.at/sites/default/files/2008_10_26_sander_dialoge_fhrenheteropien_des_galubens.pdf (20.9.2017).

²⁹³ Carranza, Brenda, “Der katholische Pentekostalismus Brasiliens im Wandel”, in: Keßler, Tobias/Rethmann, Albert-Peter (eds.), *Pentekostalismus: Die Pfingstbewegung als Anfrage an Theologie und Kirche*, Regensburg 2012, 34–56, here: 53.

issued by the Second Vatican Council (specifically those contained in the Vatican Council document *Gaudium et Spes*) are completely ignored is critical in theological terms and highly questionable. Yet it is important to emphasise once again that a decidedly self-critical perception within the established churches is required, as these groups seem to have an ability the others have lost – to present the Gospel in word and deed among people as something that gives sense and meaning to their lives.²⁹⁴

Many contrasts exist between the elements characteristic of these movements and conventional community pastoral ministry.²⁹⁵ For example, personal conversion and/or the experience of the Holy Spirit encourage a testimony of faith. Prayers and ceremonies are holistic and everyone can and is empowered to contribute. The language is easy to understand and there is room for spontaneous expression(s of faith). Not only do these ceremonies follow a routine, but they also contain space for individuals, for their encounter with transcendence and for the relating of this encounter or yearning for the same. All this makes these ceremonies so immediate, intense and “real”. This, then, also establishes the intensive connection within the celebrating community and the community at prayer. People gather together who view themselves as a community of life and faith. In doing so (and this is certainly a further point of criticism), the emphasis is placed on similarities, while differences are not celebrated for their possible creativity, but perceived as threatening. Despite the presence of a range of personalities, there is no room for diversity and ultimately individuality.

Finally, the ability of established churches to accept the competition, gleaning positive things from it as opposed to shunning it, will be considered by reference to liturgical celebrations.²⁹⁶

²⁹⁴ Cf. Wustmans, Hildegard, “Charisma und Kirche oder Die Frage nach der Pastoral des Geistes”, in: Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft, No. 97 (2013) 3/4, 253–262.

²⁹⁵ Cf. Widl, Maria, “Movimenti – ein postmoderner Beitrag der Kirchenentwicklung”, in: Theologisch-praktische Quartalschrift, No. 159 (2011), 248–256, here: 250f.

²⁹⁶ Cf. Wustmans, Hildegard, “Lebens-Mittel: Wie Liturgie feiern?”, in: Bucher, Rainer (ed.), Die Provokation der Krise: Zwölf Fragen und Antworten zur Lage der Kirche, Würzburg 2004, 238–254, here: 247–252.

Liturgy depends on physicality. Every liturgical celebration is full of physical movements.²⁹⁷ During a divine service the celebrants stand, sit and kneel. They turn to one another to exchange the sign of peace, reaching out their hands to one another in friendliness and appreciation. To receive Holy Communion they leave their seats and approach the altar, where spirituality and religiosity are also connected to the physical body. It is worthwhile devoting increased attention to physicality, because it speaks of life – of life in its vitality and fragility.

Liturgy consists of community. It is a place of encounter between human beings and God, but also among individuals. This community finds its expression in praying together, singing together and moving together. It is true that the individual is a part of the community, but he or she also always stands before God.

Liturgy consists of signs and symbols and needs these. They support the expression of human hope and what people desire and request, both for themselves and for others, thus serving as a source of strength in their everyday lives. In this respect symbols and symbolic actions are not decorations or empty vessels which serve merely to make a ceremony more varied and entertaining. Instead, they express something for which there are sometimes no words. For this reason symbolic language and a mindful approach to it are not only important, but also beneficial. It is a language that should be practised and used.

Liturgy needs a language that people understand.²⁹⁸ The liturgical language is often incomprehensible to listeners, something which also applies to many sermons. Yet, in a special way, the language of prayer offers an opportunity to lend expression to the lives of people, with their peaks and troughs, joy and pain. Prayers and sermons should be delivered in such a way that everyone can understand them. Martin Nicol once said that preachers should learn to “talk into” a topic.²⁹⁹ In essence, this means nothing more than to talk about sadness and joy in such a way that the words spoken can actually console and

²⁹⁷ Cf. Guardini, Romano, Von heiligen Zeichen, Kevelaer 2008.

²⁹⁸ Cf. Flügge, Erik, Der Jargon der Betroffenheit. Wie die Kirche an ihrer Sprache verreckt, Munich 2016.

²⁹⁹ Cf. Nicol, Martin, “Dramaturgische Homiletik: Predigtarbeit zwischen Künsten, Kult und Konfessionen”, in: Garhammer, Erich et al. (eds.), Kontrapunkte: Katholische und protestantische Predigtkultur, Munich 2006, 274–287.

encourage people and gladden their hearts. The issue at stake here is not just what is said, but also how it is said. The challenge is to find words that build trust, encourage, comfort and reassure in the specific situation and place.

Every liturgical celebration is about something special. In consequence, value should always be attached to the ceremonies' specific form. These should be prepared and led well and conscientiously. They also reveal what is truly important.

Liturgy needs a special celebration for the simple reason that it transcends the everyday order of things. Such interruptions of everyday routine are capable of giving worshippers the strength and trust to cope with daily life and its challenges. In liturgical celebrations life is celebrated, confidence is given and encouragement is experienced. Liturgies are celebrations before and with God.

Where these aspects are taken into account, there is no need to shun competition with other groups. In these places a way of being Christian exists that is friendly, self-confident, sensitive, beneficial to life and appealing.

Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Mainland China

Franz Geng Zhanhe

A Brief History of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Mainland China

From the end of the nineteenth century to the beginning of the twentieth century, a spiritual renewal movement emerged within Protestant Christianity in the United States, known as the Pentecostal movement. Soon it attracted a large number of Christians and enthusiastic participants. The Catholic Charismatic Movement began in February 1967 at Duquesne University in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania.³⁰⁰ Since then, the renewal movement has spread widely among Christian believers from the United States to Europe, Asia, Latin America, Africa and other places.

While the influence of the Charismatic Renewal is expanding in the whole world, a great number of Chinese priests, nuns and lay people who live outside the Chinese mainland, such as in the United States, Taiwan, Hong Kong and the Philippines, came into contact with and participate in this massive movement. Small prayer groups were established respectively. At the same time, these overseas Chinese began to introduce the teachings and practices of the Charismatic Movement in the Chinese language, thereby laying the foundation for the future spreading of the Movement among the overseas Chinese and in the Catholic Church in Mainland China.

During this period, not only were a number of books about the Movement in foreign languages translated into Chinese, but also many books and articles written in Chinese were composed. An overview of the major Chinese Catholic academic journal *Fujen Daxue Shenxue Lunji* (Collectanea Theologica Universitatis Fujen) shows that more than twenty articles exploring the phenomenon of

³⁰⁰ Wang, Jinghong, "Catholic Charismatic Renewal Movement" (Tianzhujiao nei de Shenen Fuxing Yundong), in: Collectanea Theologica Universitatis Fujen, No. 117 (1998), 501.

the Charismatic Movement have been published since 1973. The Chinese theological journal *Shen Si* (A Review for Theology and Spirituality) even dedicated one entire issue (the 15th in 1992) to the Charismatic Renewal Movement.

The greatest contribution to the spreading of the Charismatic Renewal among Chinese Catholics, and the theological reflection upon it, came from the Jesuit Fr. Wang Jinghong and Dr. Shu Xiaoping. Fr. Wang was born in Hankou, Hubei Province, China, and entered the Society of Jesus in 1958. He had already come into contact with the Charismatic Movement before his ordination in 1971, and actively participated in its various activities because of his own life experience. After ordination, he engaged energetically in the Charismatic Movement. In addition to his teaching responsibilities, he shared his own charismatic experience with others, held charismatic prayer meetings, and wrote books about his own healing experiences. These included "Shenen yu Jiaohui" (Charisma and the Church), "Xinling de Zhiyu" (Healing of the Soul), "Shengming de Xinchuangzao" (A new Creation of Life), "Tongku yu Chaoyue" (Agony and Transcendence), "Tan Guishi, Hua Lingxiu" (About Ghosts and Spirituality) and "Hefeng Chuisong. Jiuwei Siduo de Jianzheng" (The Wind Blows Where it Will: The Witness of Nine Priests), etc.

Dr. Shu was born in Taiwan in 1954 and was baptized in 1960. On June 29, 1991, he was baptized in the Holy Spirit and began to give lectures and retreats to Chinese Christians all over the world (such as the United States, Canada, Taiwan, Malaysia, Singapore, Europe, Hong Kong, Mainland China and other places). He introduced and promoted the Charismatic Movement to a great number of Chinese. Among his writings are "Shengshen yu Ning" (The Holy Spirit and You), "Hefeng Xiyu su Xinsheng" (Revelations in the Wind and Whispers in the Heart), "Chang Yu Tianzhu Wanglai" (Contact with God), "Xingzhu de Ren biyou Qiji Zhuisui zhe Tamen" (Believers Definitely Experience Miracles), "Shushen de Zhishi yu Zhihui" (Divine Knowledge and Wisdom), etc.

In addition to the above mentioned Chinese original works, quite a lot of well-known international theological works have been translated into Chinese, such as the works of Fr. Serafino Falvo, "Ora dello Spirito Santo", "Il risveglio dei carismi", "Lo Spirito Ci Rivela Gesù".

These books are very helpful for the Chinese Catholics to understand the Charismatic Renewal.

Outside mainland China, especially in the Catholic Church of Taiwan and Hong Kong, the Charismatic Movement began in the early 1970s. It reached its peak in the 1980s and 1990s, and then proceeded at a slower pace. As China opened its doors, and began to modernize in the early 1980s, Catholics in Mainland China finally had the opportunity to come into contact with the universal Church and get to know the new teachings and practices, which had developed over the past few decades. In this process, the Charismatic Renewal gained access to the Chinese Catholic Church, and went through two stages.

The first stage occurred mainly in the 80s and 90s of last century, when the Charismatic Renewal of the overseas Chinese Catholics was in its heyday. During this period, the Renewal was mainly carried out in the underground Church, whose representative figure was Father Zhao Muhua from the Zhengding Diocese in Hebei Province. While studying abroad, he came to know about the Charismatic Renewal and brought its teaching and practices back to China. From then on, the Charismatic Renewal continued to grow in the underground Church, and has pervasive influence, especially in Hebei Province.

The second stage of the Charismatic Renewal in Mainland China began around 2010, and has continued to grow since. In this stage, the Charismatic Movement has developed on a larger scale in the Chinese Catholic Church. It mainly takes the form of a “disciples training course”. Fr. Fei Jisheng founded this course form in 2007 in the Liaoning Diocese. The idea is to learn from Jesus Christ and his disciples, to train catechists to be acquainted with the faith and to enable them to share their faith by means of the catechism, Bible sharing and prayer meetings. The catechists are then to carry out evangelization throughout China. In order for the catechists to have not only a rich knowledge of the faith and an ability to share it, but also to have tremendous enthusiasm, the “disciples training course” introduces elements of the Charismatic Movement. Similar to the first disciples, the trainees should have spiritual gifts, such as the ability to speak in various tongues, to heal sick persons, perform exorcisms, etc., in order to enhance the credibility of their preaching.

Such “disciples training courses” soon spread from Jilin Province to other provinces, especially the course pattern created in Weixian in the Handan Diocese. This one became the most influential. It provides courses for hundreds, or even thousands, of trainees throughout the whole year. People from different dioceses come to attend these courses, and then bring this pattern of evangelization back to their own dioceses and parishes to be carried out there. As a consequence, the Charismatic Renewal extends to the whole country. While the Charismatic Movement brought by the over-seas Chinese experienced its golden age in the 1980s and 1990s, it has now become more stable. Meanwhile, its counterpart in Mainland China is in full swing, sweeping through the whole Chinese Church.

It must be observed, that this second wave of the Charismatic Movement in Mainland China is also influenced by the Charismatic Renewal of the Protestant Church. In the “disciples training course,” not only do Catholic priests and lay people give lecturers and lay hands on the candidates to pass on the spiritual gifts, but Protestant Christians are also invited to do this. Some Catholic priests even lead their parishioners to participate directly in the prayer meetings and other activities of the Protestant Church.

The Reasons for the popularity of the Charismatic Renewal

Why has the Charismatic Movement become popular among the faithful in such a short time? What is its unique fascination? Some theologians have reflected on these questions and have ascribed it to two factors: first, the Charismatic Renewal offers every believer the possibility of having a treasured spiritual experience; second, its way of praying meets the needs of modern people.

Religious experience

In today’s rationalistic and positivistic world, people seek for things that can be verified in person, and they only believe in knowledge which is verifiable and true. This is also true in the case of religious issues.³⁰¹ A religious teaching without practical effect as evidence,

³⁰¹ Cf. Huang, Kebiao, “Baptism in the Holy Spirit and the Christian Life” (*Shengshen Xili yu Jidu Shenghuo*), in: *Spirit*, No. 15 (1992), 1–6.

but only asking people to rely on trust alone, is just too demanding for most modern people.

After the Enlightenment, Christian faith was rationalized to a great extent, and it turned into an abstract theoretical system. However, it is difficult for ordinary believers to identify themselves with such a system. The distance between the sacred realm and the world of believers is growing wider and wider. People have a hard time experiencing the presence of God.³⁰² For many Christians, the life of faith has only an external form and lacks a spiritual dimension. So faith is dull for them.³⁰³ Yet it is not right to say that the sacred realm does not fascinate modern people. Modern literature and media are filled with supernatural experiences. People are “longing for a kind of personal experience, which can be implemented, is fascinating, is a kind of selfless religious experience”.³⁰⁴ The same is true with contemporary Christians. They “are thirsty for encountering what they believe in their lives”.³⁰⁵ The conviction and practice of the Charismatic Movement meet the desire of today’s Christians. Many people believe that they have come to the experience of God’s presence and His work, and have received the gifts of language, healing, prophecy and so on.³⁰⁶ At the same time, they experience divine comfort, such as peace and joy, and are impressed and fascinated.³⁰⁷ In the Charismatic Renewal Movement, the God of faith becomes a personal God, whom they can experience. This is undoubtedly appealing to modern humans.

³⁰² Cf. Liang, Jialin, “Charismatic Movement and the traditional Evangelical Christianity” (*Fanlun Fanlingen Yundong yu Chuantong Fuyinpai Jiaohui*), in: Liao, Bingtang (ed.), *Reflection on Charismatic Renewal*, Hong Kong 2007, 237–238.

³⁰³ Cf. Xiao, Shouhua, “The Meanings of speaking in Tongues and Charismatic Renewal”, in: Liao, Bingtang (ed.), *Reflection on Charismatic Renewal*, Hong Kong 2007, 53.

³⁰⁴ Yang, Mugu, “A Preliminary Study on Charismatic Renewal” (*Lingen Yundong Chutan*), in: *Spirit*, No. 15 (1992), 17–25.

³⁰⁵ Zhang, Chunshen, “The Holy Spirit and the Religious Experience” (*Tianzhu Shengshen yu Zongjiao Jingyan*), in: *Collectanea Theologica Universitatis Fujen*, No. 46 (1980), 599.

³⁰⁶ Walsh, Vincent M., *A Key to charismatic renewal in the Catholic Church II*, translated by Tian Yuying, Taipei 1996, 35.

³⁰⁷ Lun, Ruose, “The Charismatic Renewal” (*Shenren Fuxing Yundong*), in: *Spirit*, No. 15 (1992), 40–47.

The form of prayer

Another attraction of the Charismatic Movement for Chinese Catholics is its completely new form of prayer. The Church in Mainland China could not keep pace with the universal Church after the Second Vatican Council to reform the Church in all its aspects. When Church life was restored in the early 1980s, Chinese Catholics lived their belief still in accordance with the traditions they knew before the Second Vatican Council. Until the early 1990s, Chinese priests had still been celebrating the Eucharist in Latin, while the faithful were reciting different prayers. Whether in public, or in private, Chinese Catholics basically followed the prayer pattern from before the Vatican Council. Formatted prayer forms often could not express the inner feelings of believers in their daily lives. The Charismatic Renewal introduced a totally different prayer form. Christians who practice charismatic worship gather regularly for prayer meetings. In addition to listening to the Word of God through Bible reading, they try to experience directly the presence and the works of God in the community. The unique feature of charismatic worship is to encourage the faithful to dedicate themselves entirely, including mind, affection and the whole body, to the worship of God. With the assistance of emotional, short, rhythmic songs of praise and gratitude, together with the appropriate body language, such as raising their hands, standing or kneeling and other actions, the praying person is led by the Holy Spirit to express his faith and his feelings.³⁰⁸

The contributions of the Charismatic Renewal to the Chinese Church

The experience which the Charismatic Renewal brought to Chinese Catholics is unprecedented. It influences, at least in the short term, the lives of many Christians in an obvious positive way. These positive contributions can be summarized as follows:

First of all, the greatest contribution of the Charismatic Movement is the renewal of faith for Chinese Catholics. Many of the believers who had been away from their faith became fervent again, and many of baptized, who had left the Church, returned. Through participation

³⁰⁸ Emmanuel Community, "The Charismatic Renewal and the Local Church in Hong Kong" (Shenren Fuxing Yundong yu Xianggang Difang Jiaohui), in: *Spirit*, No. 15 (1992), 68–81.

charismatic prayer meetings, they have some personal experiences, and they understand and affirm their faith anew.

Secondly, the Charismatic Renewal stimulates charitable activities, and these have increased rapidly in the Chinese Church in recent years. Charismatic Christians form groups, donate to charities, mutually support one another, share with one another, and visit vulnerable groups to share God's love with them.

Thirdly, the Charismatic Renewal greatly improves the enthusiasm for evangelization among Chinese Catholics. The members study the Bible and the catechism together, share their faith, and then walk out of the Church to proclaim the Gospel and to bear witness to others.

Fourth, the Charismatic Renewal produces a large number of "lively songs which express the spirit of the movement. These songs soon become popular and are brought into other liturgical celebrations of the Church".³⁰⁹ Chinese Catholics can thus participate in the Liturgy of the Church more actively.

Problems the Chinese Charismatic Renewal faces

The Charismatic Renewal is still making progress in Mainland China. It has changed the life of the Church, and has positive significance for the development of Christianity in China. However, noteworthy problems present themselves.

The first problem is the conflict between Charism and Institution. Some charismatic Christians think that their own religious experience comes directly from the Holy Spirit, and that this is more important than the doctrines of the Church. In case their own charisms come into conflict with the leadership of the Church, some charismatic Christians choose to obey the "Holy Spirit," not the Church.³¹⁰ Such phenomena occur frequently.

The second problem concerns "speaking in tongues," which is considered as the most extensive and obvious gift, and a unique symbol of the Charismatic Renewal. However, a serious review of

³⁰⁹ Wang, Jinghong, op. cit., 512.

³¹⁰ Weng, Yuting, "The Importance of Discernment of the Spirits in the Charismatic Renewal" (Fenbian Shenlei zai Shenren Yundong zhong de Zhongyaoxing), in: Collectanea Theologica Universitatis Fujen, No. 178 (2013), 523–524.

the development of the Charismatic Renewal in the Chinese Catholic Church shows that both the teaching and the practice of “the gift of tongues” are still immature. There are abuses, and therefore latent dangers. For instance, there is a tendency to regard the language of the tongues as magic words, and that the effect of prayer is more attributed to the manner of prayer than to the love of God.³¹¹ The overemphasis on the gift of language makes some believers pursue this gift excessively. And it is possible, that some people pretend that they have received the gift.³¹²

The third problem involves gifts of “healing.” In addition to the gift of tongues, the gift of healing is the most notable supernatural ability, and is another characteristic of the Charismatic Renewal. It is believed that the Holy Spirit gives some people the gift of healing to cure spiritual and physical illness.³¹³ However, the teaching and practice of the “inner healing” are not derived from the Bible and Church tradition. Rather they derive from a kind of psychological counseling and methods of treatment from modern psychology with Christian elements.³¹⁴ Then how can one be sure, that the effect of “inner healing” is the work of the Holy Spirit, and not of psychology? Moreover, some outstanding issues have arisen already, because once the causes of illness are exposed, sick persons may get out of control. After releasing the long depressed emotion, the person concerned could fall into abnormal mental state, and this might cause serious mental harm. An external healing has the tendency to be seen as a magic. The power of the Holy Spirit seems to be in human hands, and to be controllable, just as if the Holy Spirit answers every call at any time according to one’s wish. This leads to a desire to perform magic.³¹⁵ Although quite a few believers affirm that they have been cured, the high recurrence rate of their illnesses cannot be ignored either. This phenomenon is open to the suspicion that the cure may have only been a psychological suggestion.

³¹¹ Liang, Jialin, op. cit., 239.

³¹² Xiao, Shouhua, op. cit., 59.

³¹³ Cf. Wang, Zhiyuan, “Inner Healing and Discernment of the Spirits” (*Neizai Yizhi yu Fenbian Shenlei*), in: *Collectanea Theologica Universitatis Fujen*, No. 178 (2013), 530.

³¹⁴ Cf. Peiyi, Yu, “Charismatic Renewal and Theological Crisis” (*Lingen Yundong yu Shenxue Weiji*), in: Liao, Bingtang (ed.), *Reflection on Charismatic Renewal*, Hong Kong 2007, 224.

³¹⁵ Cf. Liang, Jialin, op. cit., 238–239.

Conclusion

The Charismatic Movement is rapidly developing and spreading in the Chinese Catholic Church. There is no doubt that it has brought new vitality, renewed the way of prayer and inspired the enthusiasm for evangelization among the Christians. However, it is undeniable that quite a lot burning issues remain. In fact, all these issues stem from one problem, the exaggeration of the spiritual gifts, which are also the cause of the popularity of Charismatic Renewal. Yet a theology of the Charisma has still not been fully developed, this makes its practice too hasty. Christians who carry out the Charismatic Renewal in their daily lives need to have proper attitude towards the spiritual gifts, and need to have the ability to discern spirits. Discernment of the spirits does not mean to extinguish the gifts. The purpose is rather to make the real Gifts of the Spirit stand out, and not to be tainted. Instead of complaining that the bishops and priests are not supportive, charismatic Christians should purify their teaching and practice first. This is the most effective way to gain recognition. At the same time, bishops and priests cannot just be indifferent to the development of the Movement. They should take responsibility for the supervision and guidance of the Movement in order to avoid deviation from Church doctrine. Otherwise it would not only be a loss to the Charismatic Renewal Movement, but also a loss to the whole Chinese Catholic Church.

Pentecostalism in Brazil and its Appeal to Catholics

Alberto da Silva Moreira

Seen in global terms, it is in Latin America that the intensive missionary outreach of the Pentecostal movement has produced the largest growth.³¹⁶ Brazil, where this religious movement had existed for an entire century by 2010 and where it now has over 35 million members, has been one of the most fruitful soils for the Pentecostal movement in the southern hemisphere. Over the past three decades the extraordinary growth of the Pentecostal movement has changed the religious landscape in Brazil, and its increasing impact on both the mass media and political activists has led to a transformation of public awareness. How did all this happen?

In the past, Brazil's religious scene was dominated almost completely by the Roman Catholic Church. For 389 years during Portuguese colonialism and the Kingdom of Brazil the country was ruled by a system of royal patronage, and the formal separation of church and state did not take place until 1891, when Brazil received its first constitution as a republic. This political and legal milestone paved the way for relatively balanced competition between the various religions, which was intensified by a process of socio-economic and cultural modernisation from the 1930s onwards. During the second half of the 20th century this process promoted religious freedom and an increase in religious diversity. As a result, the country witnessed a wider variety of religious options as well as increasing competition between the different religious groups. This also led to conflict between religious groups and the state.³¹⁷

The purpose of this article is to present an academic perspective, investigating the rise of Brazilian Pentecostalism, the reasons for its expansion, its processes of differentiation, its impact on public

³¹⁶ Cf. Stoll, David, *Is Latin America Turning Protestant? The Politics of Evangelical Growth*, Berkeley 1990; Martin, David, *Tongues of Fire: the Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America*, Oxford 1990.

³¹⁷ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, "Mudanças no campo religioso brasileiro no Censo 2010", in: Debates do NER, No. 2 (2013) 24, 119–137.

awareness and the theological, ethical, political and aesthetic transformations which have turned the Pentecostal movement into a major religion. We will also look at the question why Pentecostalism is so attractive to Catholics.

The rise and development of Pentecostalism in Brazil

The Brazilian Pentecostal movement has never been homogeneous.³¹⁸ Right from the beginning both denominations, the *Congregação Cristã no Brasil* (founded in 1910) and the *Assembleia de Deus* (founded in 1911) have displayed differences in dogma, church structure, evangelistic strategies and liturgical preferences. Moreover, they have their origins in different cultural milieus: the *Congregação* among Italian immigrants in rural areas and small towns in the south, and the *Assembleia* among ordinary public employees in the capitals of the federal states along the north and north-east coasts down to the south-west. Nevertheless, the *Assembleia* and the *Congregação* both succeeded in reaching the lower social classes with their message of radical conversion.

Both churches formed sect-like communities with a strong sense of cohesion in the midst of a Catholic population that was distinctly hostile towards them. At the time, converting to a Pentecostal church meant undergoing a profound transformation. This involved accepting the ethos of a religious minority and distancing oneself from the customs, traditions and values of Brazilian culture and popular piety, which were denounced by Pentecostals as worldly, sinful and diabolical. To preserve their ethical and religious virtues and to stay firmly on the narrow path of salvation, the *Crentes* (believers) publicly distanced themselves from the Carnival, fleshly cultural practices, drinking, football, sports, celebrations and games as well as from the pilgrimages and devotional meetings of popular Catholicism. For a long time Pentecostal identity was associated with this stance as well as with asceticism, sectarianism, anti-Catholicism, renunciation of the world, indifference towards politics, a strict moral code, the belief in an impending divine intervention, apocalyptic expectations and the practice of glossolalia (speaking in tongues). In a society that was still largely rural, provincial,

³¹⁸ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, Neopentecostais: sociologia do novo pentecostalismo no Brasil, São Paulo 1999.

predominantly Catholic and sparsely populated, Pentecostalism, which was discriminated against by traditional Protestants, only progressed very slowly during the first half of the 20th century.³¹⁹

After the Second World War, the Brazilian Pentecostal movement experienced a *second wave*, as Paul Freston³²⁰ called it, which soon led to denominational splits within the Pentecostal churches (with the *Igreja do Evangelho Quadrangular, Brasil para Cristo, Deus é Amor and Casa da Bênção*). The centre of this development was the south-west, an area of rapid industrial development (including São Paulo, Rio and Belo Horizonte), as the expansion of Pentecostalism followed internal migration paths. The churches that formed during this period maintained the same basic doctrinal principles as the earlier churches, particularly a strong rejection of Catholicism and worldly customs. However, they also practised healings, which they saw as highly important, along with church meetings at football stadiums and other open-air events. At the same time they took their first steps into the media, producing their own programmes and occasionally supporting political candidates.

The *third wave* of Brazilian Pentecostalism³²¹ – called neo-Pentecostalism³²² by Ricardo Mariano – refers to Pentecostal churches founded in the 1970s. They arose in the country's major urban conglomerations, were all founded by Brazilians, and from the very beginning their members were socialised by television, urban life and the media.³²³ Neo-Pentecostal churches differ from those in previous waves of Pentecostalism in a number of ways:

- A strictly sectarian ethos
- No millennial expectations
- Preaching of prosperity theology

³¹⁹ Cf. Mendoça, Antonio G., "Um panorama do protestantismo brasileiro atual", in: Landin, Leilah (ed.), *Sinais dos tempos: tradições religiosas no Brasil*, Rio de Janeiro 1989, 37–86.

³²⁰ Cf. Freston, Paul, "Breve história do pentecostalismo brasileiro", in: Antoniazzi, Alberto et al. (ed.), *Nem anjos, nem demônios: interpretações sociológicas do pentecostalismo*, Petrópolis 1994, 67–159.

³²¹ Cf. *ibid.*

³²² Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, *Neopentecostais: sociologia do novo pentecostalismo no Brasil*, op. cit.

³²³ Cf. de Souza, Beatriz Muniz, *A experiência da salvação: pentecostais em São Paulo*, São Paulo 1969.

- Preaching of a theology of spiritual warfare
- Introduction of a modern capitalist leadership style in the church
- High level of investment in the media
- A highly sophisticated strategy in the political arena.

The prototype of this far-reaching change in Brazilian Pentecostalism was the *Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus (IURD)*, a church formed in Rio de Janeiro in 1977, whose formula for success was subsequently adopted by many other Pentecostal churches. Over the past three decades most Pentecostal churches in Brazil, particularly a number of *Assembleias de Deus* churches, have experienced a kind of “neo-Pentecostalisation” or process of aggiornamento marked by varying degrees of intensity.³²⁴ Dozens of new Pentecostal churches have arisen during that period, some of them even leading the way in international expansion and now represented in several other countries. They include *Reborn in Christ*, *Videira*, *Fonte da Vida*, the *Inter-national Church of God's Power (ICGP)* and the *Igreja Universal do Reino de Deus (IURD)*.

In both theological and organisational terms neo-Pentecostals have had a major impact on the Pentecostal movement in Brazil. They have taken on board and remodelled the teachings and practices of prosperity theology, according to which Christians are destined by God to be prosperous, healthy, happy and successful in their earthly endeavours through their unwavering belief, faithful tithing and generous donations to the church. They have left behind the ancient customs of “holiness”, adopted elements of domination theology³²⁵, emphasised spiritual warfare against the devil, whom they see as particularly associated with Afro-Brazilian cults,³²⁶ created a professional management structure for church enterprises and invested massively in televangelism, marketing techniques and the spectacular performance of rituals and gospel music.³²⁷ Like the *Assembleias de Deus* they have become

³²⁴ Cf. ibid.

³²⁵ Teologia do domínio in Portuguese: the term refers to a socio-political domination of state institutions which Christians should aim for, lead and eventually control by getting involved in party politics. This religious and ideological orientation was devised by American fundamentalist Protestants.

³²⁶ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, Neopentecostais; Oro, Ari Pedro, Avanço pentecostal e reação católica, Petrópolis 1996.

³²⁷ Cf. Campos, Leonildo, Teatro, templo e mercado: organização e marketing de um empreendimento neopentecostal, Petrópolis/São Paulo/São Bernardo 1999.

involved in party politics, beginning with the constitutive National Assembly of 1986.³²⁸

Pentecostalism in Brazil today has become so complex, diverse and dynamic that it can no longer really be studied under the heading of neo-Pentecostalism alone. It may well be too early to map out a new period, but some scholars are already speaking of a *fourth wave* of “bronto-Pentecostalism”³²⁹ or “post-Pentecostalism”³³⁰ in order to describe the latest developments. The new Pentecostal churches have undoubtedly introduced many new symbolic, structural, behavioural and doctrinal changes. The latest developments have been combined with earlier patterns within the traditional Pentecostal movement. The second oldest and largest Pentecostal church in Brazil, the *Assembleia de Deus*, provides a good example of the current diversity and complexity. Assembleia is not an entity so much as a brand that gathers together hundreds of highly diverse churches and institutions, both large and small, which are often in no way connected with each other. Like in marketing, the successful brand serves as a model which is then copied in many different versions and reused in modified forms. *The Igreja Universal (IURD)*, on the other hand, sells an “all-inclusive franchising package”. The third process of differentiation has led to a multitude of Pentecostalisms within the same religious tradition.

In the course of this historical development Pentecostal churches have become a major force in society at a time which has been marked by profound changes in all other areas³³¹, e.g. the weakening of Catholicism, the rapid process of urbanisation³³² and industrialisation,

³²⁸ Cf. Pierucci, Antonio Flávio, “Representantes de Deus em Brasília: a bancada evangélica na Constituinte”, in: Ciências Sociais Hoje (1989), 104–132; Preston, Paul, Evangélicos na política brasileira: história ambígua e desafio ético, Curitiba 1994; Machado, Maria das D. C., Os votos de Deus: evangélicos, política e eleições no Brasil, Recife 2006; Baptista, Saulo, Pentecostais e neopentecostais na política brasileira: um estudo sobre cultura política, cultura, estado e atores coletivos religiosos no Brasil, São Paulo 2009.

³²⁹ Cf. Flores Filho, Honório, “Brontopentecostalismo: o pentecostalismo popular de periferia e sua diversidade na região metropolitana de João Pessoa”, in: Rivera, Dario P. B. (ed.), Diversidade religiosa e laicidade no mundo urbano latino-americano, Curitiba 2016.

³³⁰ Cf. Siepierski, Paulo, “Pós-Pentecostalismo e política no Brasil”, in: Estudos Teológicos, No. 37 (1997) 1, 47–61.

³³¹ Cf. Montero, Paula, “Religiões e dilemas da sociedade brasileira”, in: Miceli, Sérgio (ed.), O que ler na ciência social brasileira (1970–1995), São Paulo/Brasília 1999.

³³² Cf. de Almeida, Ronaldo, “Religião na metrópole paulista”, in: Revista Brasileira de Ciências Sociais, No. 56 (2004) 19.

massive waves of internal migration as well as the urbanisation of culture and the increasing impact of the media on the country's culture.

Pentecostal expansion in figures

For most of the 20th century Brazil continued to be greatly influenced by Catholicism, and its demographic composition was characterised by relatively low religious diversity. Up to 1970, 91.8% of residents described themselves as Catholic (see Table 1). Thirty years later that figure had dropped to 73.8%. Yet despite this substantial decline Catholics accounted for 125.5 million out of 170 million Brazilians – still nearly 100 million more than Protestants and Pentecostals. Nevertheless, during the second half of the 20th century, particularly from the 1980s onwards, Pentecostals gained considerable ground in a culture of rapid, highly urban cultural pluralisation and redemocratisation, which then triggered further growth. Between 1980 and 2000 their numbers doubled in each decade, from 3.9 million in 1980 to 8.8 million in 1991 and then to 17.7 million in the year 2000. During the decade of its greatest expansion, from 1991 to 2000, it reached 10.4% of the population, growing four times faster, on average, than the population as a whole. By 2010 Pentecostalism had reached 13.3% of Brazil's population, i.e. 25.4 million³³³, and at the end of 2016 unofficial research estimated its growth at 22%, which was tantamount to at least 44 million members.³³⁴

Table 1: Religions and growth of Pentecostalism in Brazil

Year	1940	1950	1960	1970	1980	1990	2000	2010
Population (in millions)	41.2	51.9	70.9	94.5	121.2	146.9	169.6	190.8
Roman catholics (in %)	95.0	93.5	93.1	91.8	89.2	83.8	73.8	64.6
Protestants and Pentecostals (in %)	2.6	3.4	4.0	5.2	6.6	9.6	15.4	22.2

³³³ Cf. Pierucci, Antonio Flávio, op. cit.

³³⁴ Cf. Institut DataFolha, 28.12.2016, <http://datafolha.folha.uol.com.br/opiniaopublica/2016/12/1845231-44-dos-evangelicos-sao-ex-catolicos.shtml> (13.07.2018).

Pentecostals only (in %)					5.6	10.4	13.3
No religion (in %)	0.2	0.5	0.5	0.7	1.6	4.8	7.3

Source: IBGE censuses of 1940 to 2010

The *Assembleias de Deus* (i.e. all the churches under this name) remained the largest Pentecostal denomination in Brazil encompassing no less than 48% of all Brazilian Pentecostals, in other words 12.3 million in 2010.

The rapid growth of Pentecostalism has been accompanied by ownership of TV channels (Rede Record is the second biggest TV network in the country), cable TV, a range of websites and web channels, radio stations, newspapers, magazines, publishing houses and some of the music industry. The increased use of electronic and print media and the incorporation of gospel music have enabled Pentecostals to heighten their visibility, gain a firm foothold in society and the media, acquire greater social and religious legitimacy and accelerate their expansion into new socio-cultural areas.³³⁵ They have thus been able to grow their customer base and establish a billion-dollar market for religious products and services. In addition, they have gained massive party-political power and changed the landscape of Brazil's towns and cities with their countless churches and other buildings. Brazil, the world's biggest Roman Catholic and spiritualist country, has now also become the largest Pentecostal country.³³⁶

Main features and changes within Brazilian Pentecostalism

According to Ricardo Mariano³³⁷, a high level of religious mobilisation can be expected in a society characterised by religious freedom, profound, magical and thaumaturgical religiousness, and cultural and religious diversity. This explains the success of highly active evangelistic groups, a substantial decline in traditional worship,

³³⁵ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, "Expansão pentecostal no Brasil: o caso da Igreja Universal", in: Estudos Avançados, No. 18 (2004) 52, 121–138.

³³⁶ Cf. Freiston, Paul, "Latin America: the 'other Christendom', pluralism and globalization", in: Beyer, Peter/Beaman, Lori (eds.), Globalization, religion and culture, Leiden 2007, 577–599.

³³⁷ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, "Mudanças no campo religioso brasileiro no Censo 2010", op. cit., 119–137.

an increase in religious conversions, intensive religious individualism, religious innovation, bricolage and syncretism. Brazil has also seen heterodox, reflexive and privatising experiments with religion, a rise in disillusionment, disputes and polemics as well as increased cultural, religious and political conflicts. All these elements can be found (to a greater or lesser degree) when we attempt to establish the direction in which Pentecostal churches are moving and the transformation they are undergoing. As mentioned earlier, there are currently numerous divergent, convergent and conflicting tendencies; in this article we will focus on the most relevant among them. The main features of contemporary Brazilian Pentecostalism can be described as follows.

Roots in popular culture

In past decades Pentecostals could easily be distinguished from "ordinary" Brazilians by their strict customs, values, choice of language, outer appearance and the ubiquitous presence of the Bible. However, this scenario has changed substantially. Pentecostals are becoming increasingly rooted in elements of Brazilian (Catholic) folk traditions and have taken over various folk festivals and given them new names, sometimes with slightly different interpretations (St John's, harvest and country festivals, Christmas, Carnival and football events). These are areas in which Pentecostals have identified with popular culture, aligned their lives with those of average Brazilians and adopted a range of traditional "Catholic" features. Pentecostalism has become popular, has long started to produce a popular culture and has abandoned its earlier anti-cultural attitude. At the same time it has been appropriated by the creative industry and now sells the full range of religious products.³³⁸

Recent surveys among young Pentecostals³³⁹ have shown that even abstinence from alcohol – one of the most defining features of evangelicals that once distinguished them from Catholics in

³³⁸ Cf. Flores Filho, Honório, "Brontopentecostalismo: o pentecostalismo popular de periferia e sua diversidade na região metropolitana de João Pessoa", op. cit.

³³⁹ Four out of ten young Pentecostals (up to age 25) admitted that they were not following their churches' restrictions on alcohol. See de Sousa Pinto, Ana Estela, "Nova geração de evangélicos ocupa metade dos bancos das igrejas", in: Folha de S. Paulo, 25.12.2016, <http://www1.folha.uol.com.br/poder/2016/12/1844387-nova-geracao-de-evangelicos-ocupa-metade-dos-bancos-das-igrejas.shtml> (13.07.2018).

public places – can now no longer be regarded as reliable. Popular Pentecostalism follows the internal logic of “fitting in and negotiating to win people for Christ”. This attitude can be found in many Pentecostal mindsets, especially in pastors and churches, who are even introducing funk parties, mixed martial arts, night clubs and all kinds of other events and facilities into the church. The approach has deep cultural roots and largely works along the same lines as the country's traditional *jeitinho brasileiro* – the Brazilian way of getting things done, a cultural approach to finding a way out of any difficult or complex situation, even if it occasionally means turning a blind eye to matters of morality and the law.

Intolerant and fundamentalist tendencies

Traditionally, Pentecostals have always been rigorously anti-Catholic and anti-ecumenical in their outlook. Until recently it was part of their self-image to belong to a persecuted religious minority. They saw themselves as chosen by God to live among a semi-pagan Catholic majority who were ignorant of Scripture. As a small, active Christian minority they considered it their duty to evangelise and convert others. They, therefore, had no interest in ecumenical dialogue or joint projects with other churches, even with traditional Protestants who, in the past, had joined forces with dominant Catholicism in treating them with contempt. For these reasons Pentecostals have continued to distance themselves from other religions – an attitude which has not changed to the present day. In fact, intolerance has been spreading among Pentecostals, occasionally even leading to active violence towards other groups – all based on a new self-image of pride and power as a result of their growing significance and visibility in Brazilian society. This has been coupled with an aggressive and irresponsible campaign, initiated by the IURD, aimed at demonising Afro-Brazilian religions. Places of ritual worship, Orishá figures and other sacred items from Afro-religions have been destroyed in Brazil and their members have suffered threats and attacks. Fundamentalists have also been attacking other religions, but their violence has mainly been directed at Afro-Brazilian religions and images of saints from popular Catholicism. In a number of slums in Rio and São Paulo there have been instances of priests and priestesses of the *Candomblé* and *Umbanda* cults being threatened at gunpoint by Pentecostal drug dealing gangs, who wanted them to close down their

places of worship and leave the district. Numerous places of worship used by Afro-Brazilian religions, especially in poor and peripheral areas, have been burned down or destroyed. There are documented instances of drug-dealing gangs working closely with leaders of local Pentecostal churches.³⁴⁰

Pentecostal churches are growing as a result of personal initiatives

Dario Rivera has identified a consistent and accelerated fragmentation of institutionalised Pentecostal churches, particularly in the sprawling peripheries of urban conglomerations.³⁴¹ In 2010 Maxwell Fajardo looked at Perús, a large suburb on the outskirts of São Paulo with a population of 70,000, and found that it had 174 Pentecostal churches which belonged to 60 different denominations.³⁴² Such small denominations, classified as “other Pentecostal churches” by the census, are spreading in urban peripheries and are taking over the names, reputations, teachings, management techniques and members of Brazil’s major older Pentecostal churches. According to Fajardo, this up-and-coming Pentecostal category boasts around five million followers.³⁴³ This pulverised, decentralised and individualistic Pentecostal movement owes its existence to a young generation of religious leaders who, unlike in the past, have not emerged from the Catholic Church but from the older and bigger Pentecostal churches.³⁴⁴ Their evangelism also targets young believers and they are highly active, creative, mobile and swift in setting up small venues for their church services – often known as “garage churches” – in order to meet the existential religious needs of their audience. “Opening” a new denomination or a new Pentecostal church presents major challenges in terms of personal dedication and is therefore held in high esteem. Moreover, it requires close interaction between evangelism and entrepreneurship.

³⁴⁰ Cf. Medrado, Lucas, “A adesão de bandidos ao pentecostalismo no contexto da favela Jardim São Jorge em Cidade Ademar-SP”, in: Rivera, Dario P. B. (ed.), *Diversidade religiosa e laicidade no mundo urbano latino-americano*, Curitiba 2016, 365–390; Vital de Cunha, Christina, *Oração de traficante: uma etnografia*, Rio de Janeiro 2015.

³⁴¹ Cf. *ibid.*

³⁴² Cf. Fajardo, Maxwell, “Laicidade, presença partidária e variedade pentecostal no Brasil”, in: Rivera, Dario P. B. (ed.), *Diversidade religiosa e laicidade no mundo urbano latino-americano*, Curitiba 2016, 271–290.

³⁴³ Cf. *ibid.*

³⁴⁴ Cf. Institut DataFolha 28.12.2016, <http://datafolha.folha.uol.com.br/opiniao-publica/2016/12/1845231-44-dos-evangelicos-sao-ex-catolicos.shtml> (13.07.2018).

Pentecostal churches are oriented towards the needs of the faithful

Pentecostal churches are generally highly efficient at both addressing and responding to believers' religious needs. Some well established middle-class churches such as *Videira*, *Source of Life*, *Heal our Country* and others offer not only church meetings and services, but also professional training courses as well as assistance with mental health, financial counselling, conflict resolution workshops, waste recycling initiatives, seminars on management techniques, job centres and incubation centres. They also develop and sell church management materials and even computer programmes. These churches practise a "friendly" Pentecostalism – Pentecostalism *light*, as it were – which involves expressly seeing and treating their members as partners. The *Igreja Universal (IURD)* and its clone, the *Igreja Mundial do Poder de Deus*, concentrate more on the poorer sections of society, offering various in-depth services, exorcisms, the provision of partnership and family therapies and vocational and religious counselling. What most Pentecostal churches have in common – together with Catholics and other religious groups – is a strong internet presence and online stores offering a variety of religious products. The IURD continues to apply aggressive fundraising methods, particularly among the poor. There are many instances of victims reporting cases of manipulation, blackmail, piracy and deliberate deceit. Several cases have even been brought before consumer protection courts.

The inherent need to meet the expectations of believers is of course present in all religions but it is particularly prevalent in the latest forms of neo-Pentecostalism with their individualism and focus on entrepreneurship. This is a domain in which religious expectations act as an ongoing covert impetus that influences the religious products and services on offer. We are currently witnessing a move towards the aestheticisation of religion³⁴⁵, and Pentecostalism has been especially responsive in picking up this trend. Religious services have become transformed into performances that are planned down to the smallest detail. People are turning to Pentecostal religious services which are beautiful, cheerful, vibrant, good fun and sensational in every sense of the word – particularly in outlying suburbs which are unlikely to boast

³⁴⁵ Cf. Moreira, Alberto, "A religião sob o domínio da estética", in: Horizontes, No. 13 (2015) 37, 379–405, <http://periodicos.pucminas.br/index.php/horizonte/article/view/P.2175-5841.2015v13n37p379/7708> (14.07.2018).

pleasant green parks or other state-sponsored forms of beautification. Such Pentecostal services address a need among the younger generation for joyful, highly emotional and uplifting experiences.

Pentecostals in politics

Right from the beginning the Pentecostal movement in Brazil has established itself in close contact and in close proximity to people's everyday milieus and to the working classes.³⁴⁶ However, it has never developed any sensitivity to social issues or a critical attitude towards social phenomena – a deficit that may well be due to its North American origins (and lack of any contact with revolutions in Europe). But the main reason for this historical right-wing tendency may be a different one. It is worth noting that the most important traditional Pentecostal churches – the *Congregação Crista no Brasil* and the *Assembleia di Deus*, together with the most widespread third-wave neo-Pentecostal churches such as the *Igreja Universal* and, together with them, nearly all the other churches – simply took over the old authoritarian concept of the *caudillo*³⁴⁷ and hence an oligarchic and patriarchal political culture.

"Pastors and bishops are more *caudillos* than clergy [...]. They use authoritarian structures to ensure that the relationship between church leaders and church members is marked by control and subordination. Organisationally, Pentecostalism has definitely assimilated the despotic patterns of Brazilian political leaders. [...] It is an authoritarian organisation which excludes the individual believer from any participation in the decision-making process."³⁴⁸

According to Saulo Baptista, authoritarian regimes have a certain affinity to church structures and are therefore particularly attractive to Pentecostals. When the *Assembleia de Deus* and the IURD entered the political arena in 1986, they leveraged corporatist principles as they manipulated Christians in order to win elections. In this way they reproduced and applied a traditional Brazilian authoritarian pattern of

³⁴⁶ Cf. Rolim, Francisco C., *Religião e classes populares*, Petrópolis 1980; ibid., *Pentecostais no Brasil: uma interpretação sócio-religiosa*, Rio de Janeiro 1985.

³⁴⁷ A populist, authoritarian leader (editor's note).

³⁴⁸ Baptista, Saulo, op. cit., 383.

political action, the so-called *curral eleitoral* ("electoral threshold").³⁴⁹ Such manipulative practices towards evangelical voters are the foundation stone of Pentecostal power in politics, particularly in the Brazilian parliament, where they have a representative, well organised, although not always coherent lobby (*bancada evangélica*). On the other hand, candidates also act as representatives of their churches.

Pentecostal politicians are no worse than other Brazilian politicians³⁵⁰, yet once they have been voted into the Brazilian Congress or Senate they do not defend a political agenda based on the republican values of autonomy, democracy and respect. They generally align themselves with the lobby of big landowners and with political conservatism, so they have major problems when it comes to supporting social movements, demonstrations or the right to strike. Fortunately, however, there are also clear indications that the rank and file of Brazil's Pentecostal churches are moving towards greater independence in matters of political representation.

Pentecostalism is growing and transforming Brazil's urban hubs

As in many other Latin American countries, Brazil's Pentecostal movement is growing and becoming more diverse within its specific socio-economic, cultural and geographical space: the peripheries of the country's major urban hubs.³⁵¹ Over the past ten years thousands of new small Pentecostal churches have been springing up in such suburbs. Operating as religious start-ups, they are highly individualistic in their focus. They appear and disappear, often closing down, relocating and reopening under a new name. It is a precarious, yet dynamic "take-away" form of Pentecostalism. On the urban peripheries, where certain rights are denied, people increasingly value the right to make religious decisions – decisions which can be regarded as an expression of citizenship among the marginalised.³⁵² Although material deprivation and social fragility provide fertile soil for Pentecostalism, no direct or indirect link can be established between

³⁴⁹ Cf. ibid.

³⁵⁰ Cf. ibid.

³⁵¹ Cf. Rivera, Dario P. B. (ed.), *Diversidade religiosa e laicidade no mundo urbano latino-americano*, Curitiba 2016.

³⁵² Cf. ibid.

poverty and the Pentecostal movement. It is therefore incorrect to say: "The poorer people are, the more likely they are to be Pentecostals".³⁵³

Pentecostal churches mainly target young people

Internal differentiation also means specialisation. There are now Pentecostal churches and evangelical meetings for every age, preference, social class, cultural background and gender orientation (e.g. churches for gays, lesbians, athletes, beach enthusiasts, the elderly, young people, business people, the unemployed, ordinary public employees and big landowners). Some churches specialise in modern gospel music, traditional country music, new country music, funk, Axé (Afro-Brazilian rhythm) and Samba, while others play hard rock, light rock or thrash rock. Many Pentecostal churches specialise in meeting the expectations and needs of extremely different social niches. In particular, they focus on two major population groups: the poor (by addressing the immediate, urgent practical needs of individuals among the working classes) and the younger generation (by creating a language and method that appeals to this group and encourages them to get involved in church). Young new pastors are taking the initiative, replacing the old Pentecostal *caciques* and opening new temples and Pentecostal start-ups on the sprawling peripheries of Brazil's urban hubs.

Pentecostals in public positions and the media

The consolidation of cultural pluralism and the rapid spread of Pentecostalism have enabled lay and religious communities to question the state practice of maintaining Catholic privileges, citing Brazil's legal principles of secularity and freedom of religion. It is true to say that increasing competition between Pentecostals and Catholics and also among Pentecostals themselves has recently led to religious conflict in the struggle for public positions. Several religious leaders are therefore aiming to occupy party positions with members of their own ranks and seeking to increase investments in evangelism through the media, opening mega-temples and staging spectacular worship shows and open-air services.

³⁵³ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo/Moreira, Alberto da Silva, "Expansão, diversificação e transformação do pentecostalismo no Brasil", in: Moreira, Alberto da Silva/Lucá Trombetta, Pino (eds.), O pentecostalismo globalizado, Goiânia 2015, 47–69.

Evangelism with the help of electronic media has been increasing in importance within the Pentecostal movement. Between the 1950s and 1970s Pentecostals concentrated exclusively on radio evangelism. In the 1980s some churches, particularly neo-Pentecostals such as the *Igreja Universal, International Grace of God and Reborn in Christ*, began to replace channels featuring American televangelists with national religious channels.³⁵⁴ Then they started to buy radio stations and set up TV stations. However, it is only during the past few decades that Brazil's Pentecostal churches have stepped up their use of television. This has been done partly by purchasing TV stations and partly by renting or leasing programme slots on other TV channels, so that there are currently only two TV stations that do not have any religious programme slots available for outsiders to broadcast. The competition for broadcasting slots on TV channels costs a lot of money and has recently led to conflict between various televangelists with accusations being exchanged between Edir Macedo, Valdemiro Santiago, R. R. Soares and Silas Malafaia. Several Pentecostal churches are now owners of TV stations and studios in Brazil.

Pentecostal activism in politics started in the late 1970s, when Pentecostals finally abandoned their position of quietism and sectarianism in which party politics had been seen as worldly and diabolical, an attitude that automatically excluded them from the political arena.³⁵⁵ Members of Pentecostal churches were now expected to vote for the official candidates of those churches, supporting God and his faithful servants in the cosmic and earthly battles against the devil and worldliness.³⁵⁶ The Pentecostal churches tried to mobilise their members to vote, arguing that participation in the country's constitutive assembly was necessary to prevent the Catholic Church from securing state privileges for itself. Their aim was to oppose religious adversaries as well as homosexuals, feminists, secularists and left-wing politicians, while at the same time defending religious freedom and fighting for Christian morals, the nuclear family, good behaviour and their own institutional interests. Pentecostal churches thus became involved in opposing the decriminalisation

³⁵⁴ Cf. Fonseca, Alexandre, Brasil: evangélicos e mídia no Brasil, Bragança 1999.

³⁵⁵ Cf. Pierucci, Antonio Flávio, op. cit.

³⁵⁶ Cf. Machado, Maria das D.C., op. cit.

of abortion³⁵⁷, the liberalisation of marijuana and homosexual civil partnerships (including the right of homosexual couples to adopt children) as well as other gender issues.³⁵⁸

Since then various Pentecostal churches have been supporting candidates for the executive and endeavouring to vote their fellow-Christians – including pastors and bishops – into parliament. Whenever there is an election, the different Pentecostal churches present their official candidates for city councils, state parliaments, the federal parliament and the senate. The *Igreja Universal* set up its own party in 2005, called *Partido Republicano Brasileiro* (PRB, Brazilian Republican Party), and in 2017 the *Assembleia de Deus* tried to do the same. In the 2014 elections Brazil's Pentecostal churches increased the number of their MPs to 76. Elected with the institutional support of their churches and the votes of their brothers and sisters in Christ, many evangelical politicians do not make any clear distinction between religious and political activities.

Pentecostal leaders have actively campaigned for or against the main candidates in all recent presidential elections. Today's Pentecostals are fervently courted by political parties and candidates from almost the entire political and ideological spectrum. All parties and candidates endeavour to win and keep the votes of Pentecostals. Increasing religious pluralism, evangelical growth, the decline of Catholicism and the growing political activism of Pentecostals have prompted political leaders and party-political candidates to pay increasing attention to the religious interests and material and political demands of evangelical groups who are involved in politics and elections. The religious instrumentalisation of politics has thus been supplemented by the political instrumentalisation of religion.

Factors explaining the fascination of Catholics for Pentecostalism

Up to 1970 Brazilian Protestants – both so-called historical or traditional Protestant churches and Pentecostals – accounted for just

³⁵⁷ Secret abortions are the fifth most frequent cause of death among mothers – “a situation which presents a problem of considerable significance for the public health system”, says the Brazilian government. See <https://oglobo.globo.com/sociedade/governo-afirma-onu-que-aborto-clandestino-no-pais-problema-de-saude-publica-15550664#ixzz56eSyi5pl> (14.07.2018).

³⁵⁸ Cf. Pierucci, Antonio Flávio, op. cit.

under 5% of the Brazilian population. At that time the Pentecostal movement had not yet turned into a major religion and so we need to ask ourselves what has happened in Brazilian society, in the other religions and in the Pentecostal movement itself to explain the enormous success of Pentecostalism and how we should interpret the transformation that has occurred since the 1970s.³⁵⁹ We already mentioned the internal transformation processes within Pentecostalism and various external factors, such as the social vulnerability of the poor, rapid urbanisation and situations of inherent violence. We will now look at what I believe to be the most important factors, as they will help to explain the attractiveness of the Pentecostal movement to Brazilian Catholics and therefore some of its missionary success.

Intensive missionary outreach

Protestants, particularly Pentecostals, have always conducted systematic militant missionary outreach in Brazil. There are several missionary organisations which are maintained by the major churches, by interdenominational groups, by the odd denominations and even by small local churches; some of them even send missionaries to other countries and support them there. At the same time, Pentecostals themselves tend to get involved. In the past they were an isolated marginalised minority and therefore often sought to introduce their own families, friends and acquaintances to their churches and, if possible, to convert them. Catholics, on the other hand, were born as Catholics. There are reports of mothers who, once they had converted to the Pentecostal movement, gradually integrated all their children into it. The same is true of young people. The intense militancy in promoting conversion has produced lasting fruit for the future.

A very warm welcome, a personal approach and attentiveness

One point that features in all the testimonies of individuals who have converted to Pentecostal churches is that they received a warm welcome from the members of the new church and that they were well cared for. This personal approach, being called by their name and given

³⁵⁹ Cf. Mariano, Ricardo, "Crescimento pentecostal no Brasil: fatores internos", in: Revista de Estudos da Religião 2008, 68–95.

friendly hugs and affection, turns occasional visitors into frequent ones and frequent visitors into church members. Being treated well helps people to overcome the feeling of anonymity, raises their self-esteem and shows them that they are important to someone. As well as giving newcomers a warm welcome, Pentecostals visit the sick, regularly pray for individuals and ask God to remove everything from their lives that causes anxiety or suffering. It need hardly be emphasised how important it can be for someone to feel actively integrated into a warm, friendly community, especially if they otherwise feel uprooted.

A religion of results as opposed to pious religiousness

Pentecostalism is a religion that responds immediately and pragmatically to urgent and distressing needs such as sickness, unemployment, alcoholism, drug addiction, violence and family conflict. Church workers, pastors or church members visit people's houses, pray with those who are desperate, offer material, moral and spiritual help and drive out demons that have invaded their lives. In this way they restore people's self-respect, and if someone has lost their bearings, they show them a clear way which they must follow in order to overcome evil and start a new life. These are clear signs in the here and now. Popular Catholicism, on the other hand, presents itself as a religion of piety. It is associated with the figures of saints and with the major life cycles of a culture or lifestyle that has its roots in an agricultural context. Although Catholicism does have a clear ethos of caring support, joy and working together, it puts far less emphasis on taking the initiative, on actively deciding to intervene creatively in people's difficult personal lives.

Inherited versus adopted religion

Traditional Brazilian popular Catholicism is part of the matrix of Brazilian religiousness and has influenced it profoundly so that, in the past, it was even confused with the Brazilian mentality. In the 1920s Cardinal D. Leme from Rio de Janeiro took it for granted that being Brazilian was synonymous with being Catholic. However, this popular Catholicism into which people were born was imparted to them by the surrounding culture, by its institutions and through

Catholic socialisation. It was not a religion they had chosen freely and independently but something they had automatically inherited. Nowadays, in an individualistic society, people want to make their own religious decisions rather than simply take over those of others. The first and most obvious religious choice outside Catholicism is the Pentecostal movement.

Globalised capitalism as reflected in the Pentecostal ethos

The Pentecostal movement fosters an attitude that favours an individualistic capitalist culture of entrepreneurship, initiative, flexibility and the unquestioned productivity of the worker. With this in mind, the debate that was once initiated by Max Weber is still highly relevant.³⁶⁰ The theology of spiritual warfare between God and demonic forces works as a theological matrix, spreading a religious ethos of a non-conformist, proactive or even aggressive subjective disposition. This makes it both possible and necessary to help those in need and to overcome challenges of all kinds. It enables Christians to combat and defeat the (always very specific) activities of the devil in people's lives. From a religious point of view this mainly concerns life changes, such as the conversion of crisis-ridden people – often marginal groups (for instance prisoners) – to Pentecostalism. By ignoring faults in society and, instead, transferring responsibility for evil to the devil, Pentecostalism reduces the guilt felt by individuals. The Pentecostal theology of spiritual warfare also favours a competitive business mentality, producing and leading to prosperity theology and a theology of the winner. This then justifies the private, individual possession of finance, commodities, jobs, money and salaries, which are considered as rewards.³⁶¹ A philosophy of life of this kind is sought and cultivated very avidly by lower-middle to middle-middle classes.

Religion and spectacle – a strong appeal to young people

Many Pentecostal churches have integrated aesthetic resources, drama, gospel music, the use of modern IT, sound and video

³⁶⁰ Cf. Weber, Max, *Die protestantische Ethik und der Geist des Kapitalismus*, Munich 2006.

³⁶¹ Cf. Oro, Ari Pedro, "Podem passar a sacolinha": um estudo sobre as representações do dinheiro no neopentecostalismo brasileiro", in: *Cadernos de Antropologia*, No. 9 (1992), 7–44.

technology, the systematic triggering of strong emotions and ecstatic states and the subjectivity of religious experiences into their standard practice. The main criterion to authenticate and guarantee the “truth” of a religious experience is no longer a religious institution but the subjective feelings of the individual. This experience can only gain significance if it creates strong emotions, brings about sensations involving tears and ecstasy and produces a sense of community. This spectacular form of religion is highly attractive to young people who already owe their socialisation to the media and are looking for major emotional experiences, fast rhythms and radical, live experiences.

Affirmation of (non-Catholic) identity

Although Pentecostalism is increasingly becoming rooted in strongly Catholic-influenced popular culture, the expansion strategy of Pentecostal churches – especially in Catholic regions – continues to cultivate an apologetic approach to the Catholic Church. Many Pentecostal preachers and missionaries portray it as the great enemy, the incarnation of all errors and the betrayal of Christianity. So what are the errors with which the Catholic Church is charged? Catholics are accused of (1) praying to images, (2) obeying the Pope and not Jesus, and (3) not knowing and ignoring the Word of God. Such simple and clearly Bible-based statements do not leave Catholics any scope for argument. It even still happens from time to time that the Pope is associated with the apocalyptic beast in Revelation. In the past this reductionist discourse evidently proved fruitful in terms of proselytism and is still quite common. On the other hand, due to their past marginalisation, Pentecostals still complain that judges grant the Catholic Church certain public privileges, such as Catholic holidays and crucifixes in public buildings. Wherever possible, Pentecostals place a Bible next to or instead of a Catholic symbol and many evangelical leaders cultivate the image of a persecuted minority. At the same time the idea of having a “powerful enemy” helps them to create a clear positive identity for themselves – a fact which has played a major role in the history of Brazil’s Pentecostal churches. On the other hand, as there is increasingly marked and aggressive competition between the various Pentecostal churches, this argument will tend to weaken in the future.

Certainty – systematic reference to the authority of the Bible

Brazilians are profoundly religious. They believe in the overriding authority of the Bible, even if they don't know it very well. However, a cultural aspect is also involved: the admiration of the illiterate for the literate (we might call it the cult of the graduate). Many Catholics thus have great respect for those who have mastered the written code, which is only accessible to the educated. The Bible becomes a powerfully persuasive resource in the hands of Pentecostals as they put forward their arguments and cite passages of Scripture which clearly describe all the "inconsistencies" of the Catholic Church.

Reduction of complexity through synthetic (aesthetic) experience

Pentecostal church services are highly charged with emotions, and the Pentecostal message of spiritual warfare explains complex economic, emotional and cultural problems – such as family breakups, unemployment and drug addiction and abuse – in terms of the devil's activities in people's lives. This cognitive-emotional constellation, which leads to exorcism, clearly has a therapeutic mass impact, as it reduces the enormous complexities of social life and re-establishes order, a clear yardstick and peace into the fragmented experience of the individual, produces stability and relief (albeit only temporarily and through political demobilisation) and counteracts the humiliating effects of peripherally capitalist modernism in the subconscious.

More opportunities and empowerment for women

Pentecostal churches provide women with greater opportunities to participate, to take the initiative, to receive empowerment and to be protagonists. Several studies in Brazil have shown that, although Pentecostal churches do not overcome sexist and authoritarian structures, they nevertheless strengthen a feeling of self-worth and self-respect among poor women who are exposed to domestic violence and are socially vulnerable.³⁶² Many Pentecostal churches

³⁶² Cf. Machado, Maria das Dores C./Mariz, Cecília L., *Mulheres e prática religiosa nas classes popu-lares: uma comparação entre as igrejas pentecostais, as Comunidades Eclesiais de Base e os grupos carismáticos*, http://www.anpocs.org.br/portal/publicacoes/rbcs_00_34/rbcs34_05.html (14.07.2018). For India: Shah, Rebecca S., "Pentecostalismo

actually offer women opportunities for self-realisation, even enabling them to rise within the hierarchy, perhaps as deacons, pastors or bishops. Some women, such as Bishop Sonia Hernandez, have become media figures who symbolise successful Pentecostal women.

Obviously, to understand the enormous missionary success of Pentecostal churches account needs to be taken of the deficits and failures of the other religions and churches that compete with them, especially the Catholic Church. Although it is not the purpose of this article, mention should nonetheless be made of the fact that the Catholic Church is clearly unable to offer much that might counteract the increasing competition and insecurity to be found in a culture of (post-)modern individualism which requires everyone to show initiative, productivity and creativity. In sociological terms, Catholicism has numerous disadvantages compared with Brazil's Pentecostal churches: its outmoded clerical system, its centralised management structure in the form of the priest, on whom all activities and initiatives depend but who lives at a distance from people's daily lives, the superhuman, patriarchal expectations of a priest, relative passivity among the Catholic laity and a major shortage of clergy. The clerical tradition has helped to create a chronic sense of non-responsibility for the destiny of their church among ordinary Catholics in Brazil. In areas of the Catholic Church where it is possible to take responsibility and be actively involved in the church and society, e.g. in basic ecclesial communities and in social movements, Catholics have often found no support within the church's clerical system. One positive factor has been the culture of religious tolerance propagated by the Second Vatican Council in Brazilian society. Coupled with liberation theology, it has helped to reduce religious prejudices among Catholics and has thus indirectly also benefited the Pentecostal churches.

Final reflections

The dynamics of assimilation, being rooted in Brazil's traditional culture and ethos while at the same time being open to globalisation,³⁶³

e desenvolvimento econômico entre empreendedores pobres em Bangalore, na Índia', in: Moreira, Alberto da Silva/Lucá Trombetta, Pino (eds.), *O pentecostalismo globalizado*, Goiânia 2015, 147–159.

³⁶³ Cf. Moreira, Alberto da Silva, "A expansão global do pentecostalismo brasileiro: the global expansion of Brazilian pentecostalism", in: 34º – Encontro Anual da Anpocs,

and an ability to respond directly to individual needs are all elements that have helped Pentecostalism to remodel itself and acquire an important role in society. Today's Pentecostal movement in Brazil covers a wide spectrum of styles, theologies, liturgies and services that suit the country's highly diverse socio-economic, cultural, gender-specific and ethnic groups.

During the past few decades, in which Catholicism has experienced a major decline as the traditional majority religion, there has been an increase not only in Pentecostal churches, but also in those without any religion as well as in other religious minorities – so much so, in fact, that the long-standing connection between Catholicism and national identity has disappeared.³⁶⁴ There is now a fairly stable level of religious diversity and Brazil's religious market has become highly competitive. All this has led to substantial changes in the interaction between religious groups, on the one hand, and with representatives of the state and secular organisations, on the other.

Religious pluralism, the expansion of Pentecostal churches and the intensification of inter-denominational competition have stimulated the community and led to a revival within Catholicism³⁶⁵, particularly through its Charismatic Renewal.³⁶⁶ This, in turn, has strengthened Catholic evangelisation through the use of electronic media, prompted greater involvement in party politics and increased investment in publishing and the music industry. Nevertheless, this Catholic response has only succeeded to a marginal extent in reducing the social and religious influence of Pentecostals and the intensity and speed of their growth. The Pentecostal movement continues to spread, particularly among the poorer echelons of society who have an interest in overcoming the precariousness and social vulnerability they experience both in religious terms and on a collective scale.³⁶⁷

Caxambu 2010, <http://www.anpocs.org/index.php/papers-34-encontro/st-8/st29-2/1635-amoreira-a-expansao/file> (19.09.2018).

³⁶⁴ Cf. Pierucci, Antonio Flávio/Prandi, Reginaldo, *A realidade social das religiões no Brasil: religião, sociedade e política*, São Paulo 1996.

³⁶⁵ Oro, Ari Pedro, Avanço pentecostal e reação católica, op. cit.

³⁶⁶ Cf. Carranza, Brenda, "Cristianismo pentecostal: nova face da Igreja Católica", in: Moreira, Alberto da Silva/Lucá Trombetta, Pino (eds.), *O pentecostalismo globalizado*, Goiânia 2015, 70–93.

³⁶⁷ Cf. Mariz, Cecilia L., *Coping with poverty: Pentecostals and Christian base communities in Brazil*, Philadelphia 1994.

It is a sobering thought that the peripheries of Latin America's major urban conglomerations (Mexico City, São Paulo and Buenos Aires) are currently the places with the greatest increase in Pentecostals and people without any religion.³⁶⁸ It is likely that there is a correlation between the two processes and that the Pentecostal option is an intermediate stopping point on the path towards the further secularisation of Brazilian society.

³⁶⁸ Cf. Rivera, Dario P. B. (ed.), op.cit.

The Fascination of Pentecostal Movements for Christians in Africa

Patrick C. Chibuko

It was 1906 when people in Topeka and Los Angeles were looking for something. What they found at the Apostolic Faith Gospel Mission on Azusa Street in Los Angeles were tongue-speaking, ecstatic experiences, alleged prophesying and divine healing. These gave birth to the modern Pentecostal movement.³⁶⁹ In dealing with Pentecostal Movements today, it must be borne in mind of the several groups enveloped in this nomenclature such that it would be unfair to paint all Pentecostals with one brush. In other words, one-size-fits-all approach will be quite inappropriate in dealing objectively with the religious phenomenon. One can only speak of some and not all in any given situation or speak merely in general terms in view of the discussion at hand. With close interactions as a chaplain for a couple of years where Pentecostals operated, this write up originates from the background of an objective participant's observer.

The theoretical frame work of this conversation rests on the premise that Pentecostal Movements flourish optimally in any battered environment where people are seeking for practical and quick panacea to their spiritual, socio-economic and political challenges. In the unbridled quest for quick and practical results the physical overrules the spiritual, the material defines the spiritual values and above all, there is a huge drain in human capacity that results in the poverty and under-development of the peoples. Pentecostal Movements hold a fascination for Christians in Africa because they appear captivating and enchanting in three distinct areas of operation: praying in tongues, prophesying and healing. For them the main-line Churches are very boring especially in these areas mentioned above. Pentecostal Movements or simply Pentecostals represent the emergent ecclesial bodies from the outburst of the Holy Spirit on the

³⁶⁹ Hetrick, Lon, Why I Left Pentecostalism, [www.https://avaregeus.com/2012/10/23/why-i-left-pentecostalism](https://avaregeus.com/2012/10/23/why-i-left-pentecostalism) (28.05.2018). See also Höfer, Josef/Rahner, Karl (eds.), Lexikon für Theologie u. Kirche, Freiburg 1963, vol. 8., 418–423.

Pentecost day in Acts 2:1-13. Indeed, what started like a spark by a bible prayer group among Baptists and Methodists in Los Angeles, USA in the early twentieth century later spread like wild fire in the harmattan weather to all parts of the world.

Some Essentials of Pentecostal Movements

Essentially, Pentecostal movement is spirit-driven, whereas the initial Protestant reform movement was 'Word (Bible) driven'. Pentecostals have tended towards growth around individuals and the creation of breakaway or new movements, rather than strong associations or institutional forms. An important extension of the Pentecostal movement has been neo-Pentecostalism, or charismatic renewal, which has seen a new emphasis on the Holy Spirit's power and work in the believer. Most Christian churches incorporate a charismatic renewal movement dynamics which is Holy Spirit oriented.

Pentecostal movements are congregational in governance, although several movements have coordinating national and international bodies. There is a World Pentecostal Council to provide a global network of fellowship although it does not arbitrate on matters of doctrine or church administration. With their emphasis on the gifts of the Holy Spirit and the power for all believers, Pentecostal churches are led by pastors who are seen as teachers, motivators and coordinators.

Pentecostal movement is very diverse but in addition to the key beliefs common to all Christians, they believe: that Individuals need to make a personal commitment to faith and through this the presence of the Holy Spirit will become manifest in them. The Holy Spirit will most often be present through speaking in tongues, but other supernatural phenomena are also possible. The experience of adult baptism is the central rite. Scripture is interpreted literally; the style of worship is emotional, marked by clapping, chorusing, contemporary music and dynamic preaching.

Pentecostals espouse specific beliefs that mark them out among other groups of Christians. They believe they constitute a special people of God who alone are saved and the rest of humanity is doomed to perdition. Theologically, a person is saved who is "born

again" and is regenerated or sanctified by an inward feeling of holiness. Sanctification purifies a believer from sin and all forms of pollution. Of special importance is the teaching on the baptism of the Holy Spirit and external manifestations of speaking in tongues. This is both a spiritual and social marker, setting members apart as God's elected people

This new message promises individuals a comprehensive solution to all their worries on condition that they become born again and give generously to the religious leader in exchange for material and spiritual blessings in the form of healing, wealth, abundant life, success and earthly promotion. The members relate freely and familiarly with one another. Their brotherhood ties are very strong and often stronger than blood ties. They care for each other, ask of each other, visit each other and pray for each other. Anonymity is hardly experienced among themselves.

Their art of raising funds is actually very inspiring and strategic. A good part of their lively celebration is experienced during offertory with the cliché, *offering time, blessing time*. During offertory practically everyone dances to the intoxicating rhythm of music supplied by the singing ministry with various musical instruments and vocalists. They sing and dance to the offering boxes in front of the assembly with their offerings in cash and or in kind. Moved by the powerful celebration of the Word, the offertory is usually bountiful. Their method of offertory has replaced the traditional secret bag collection method.

Tithing is one of the major sources of income. One tenth of one's income is destined and offered to God. The preachers make it mandatory for all to pay their tithes regularly, dutifully and generously with occasional threats that if one is very tight³⁷⁰ in *paying one's tithes*, things will be tight for the person. This is the strategy to motivate the members not only to be dutiful and regular but also to be generous.

Pentecostals have tremendous capacity for spontaneity in public praying. These prayers are often punctuated profusely with biblical quotations from Genesis to Revelation. They have popularised the use of choruses, praises, worship-adoration songs. These songs are usually short and easy to learn and can be repeated as often as one

³⁷⁰ Tight in this context means miserly.

wishes. They have taught most Churches in Africa that quality and functional public address system should not be compromised so that faith which comes from hearing must be heard clearly and distinctly. They promote extensively the wide use of the Bible both in private and public prayers. Their worship has elaborate celebration of the Word of God with the captivating preaching that goes along with it. No matter the length of time they spend during worship, it is considered a quality time spent for and with God. The sense of collaborative ministry is evident in their administrative structures giving rise to so many ministries such as prayer warriors, stewards, singing ministries, preachers, finance ministries etc. In general, Pentecostals follow the principal dates of the mainline Church Calendar.

Some Fascinating Features of Pentecostal Movements for African Christians

Any battered society like the African Continent would fall easy prey to the allurement of the Pentecostal Movements because of what they preach and do. The continent, once well-endowed with enviable human and natural resources was crippled by the indiscriminate scramble for Africa that led to the irrational partitioning of Africa on a drawing table in Berlin,³⁷¹ and not on the fields of Africa simply to suit the new conquerors.³⁷² Until this day, the entire continent still suffers under the psychological trauma, sad effects and confusion, laden injustice and error, which this blunder has caused a continent rightly described by history as the cradle of civilisation and the origin of the scientific human development.³⁷³ On account of widespread underdevelopment in several spheres resulting from this blunder on the continent with the steady deteriorating economy Pentecostal Movements would continue to fascinate African Christians.

³⁷¹ In 1884 Otto von Bismarck convened in Berlin the 1884-1885 conference that partitioned African Continent among European powers.

³⁷² Cf. Obiora, Ike, "The Social, Political and Economic Situation of Nigeria: A Critical Survey", in: Hoffmann, Johannes (ed.), *Wer befreit ist, kann befreien* (Theologisch-ethische Werkstatt: Kontext Frankfurt, No. 5), Frankfurt a. M. 1997, 77.

³⁷³ Cf. ibid.

In Nigeria for instance, what originated around 1990s by an Anglican deacon as Christ Army Church became the genesis of Pentecostal movement. After the Nigerian civil war, many more Pentecostal Movements were founded by individuals under different names in the 1970s and 1980s to cushion the harsh effects of the war. They consolidated in the turbulent 1990s being the beginning of economic crises and recession in the country. They are now witnessing a steady expansion as they are opening branches in different parts of the country and beyond.

The most striking fascinating factor of Pentecostal Movements lies in their concept and manner of presentation of the Christian religion as *Christianity Made Simple* within a distressed continent. The attraction to Pentecostals in Africa emanates also from the variety of names by which they are designated as nomenclatures such as Prosperity Christianity, Health and Wealth Gospel; The Faith Movement; Miracle Church, Name-it-and Claim-it-Instantly Church etc. These names portend over dependence on Miracles even to the detriment of squarely dealing with those things human capacity can achieve scientifically.

Over simplification of Christianity is further seen in their un-exegetical approach to the Word of God especially in preaching, prayer and application in living; the obvious absence of dogma or specific doctrines among Pentecostals, free and improvised structure of worshipping format, lack of central administration, and so no one has universal headship, no censorship for orthodoxy in teaching and preaching, every fellowship is administered by the pastor and the members of the core-group.

Africans are usually practical oriented people. They want something and they want it instantly with tangible results to show for it. Given the above factors, African Christians and even non-Christians are easily attracted to the Pentecostals and when the expected result is delayed or not forth coming, disappointment and disillusionment set in resulting in their mass exodus to form their own sects or return to their former membership.

Critical Review of the Fascinating Features of Pentecostal Movements in Africa

According to recent scholarship and individual experiences with their various groups, Pentecostals appear to opt for anti-intellectualism, by devaluing the development of Biblical thinking, and holding suspect the study of theology as a critical element of faithful Christian ministry. Pentecostals end up distorting the bible. As a result, they perpetually fall victim to the fad-doctrines and false teachings. The average Pentecostal will believe anything delivered with sizzle and style because biblical and theological training and catechism were never part of their spiritual growth plan.

Pentecostal understanding of the Baptism with the Holy Spirit and speaking in tongue need a thorough review in the light of their ecclesiological insight. *Glossolalia*, the Greek word for speaking in tongues has nothing to do with incomprehensible utterances. Rather it has everything to do with authentic and proper interpretation of language in the light of ecclesiological edification.

Speaking in tongues when properly interpreted and understood deals with the universal ecclesiological mission of the gospel of Christ that will expand to all corners of the earth and speaking the various languages of the people. This has to be central. Theologically, the Church was born on Good Friday while Jesus hung upon the Cross of Calvary as the innocent victim for the sins of the world. There he instituted the sacraments of Christian initiation by the blood and water that flowed from his pierced side (symbolic of the Holy Eucharist, and Baptism respectively; John 19:31-34).³⁷⁴ On the Pentecost day, the Church became manifest as the universal means of salvation. In Christ therefore, all nations speak and understand the language of the same faith and love.

An unedifying impression is created by the manner of praying by the Pentecostals that the Holy Spirit can be manipulated by mere mortals and directed according to the whims and caprices of the pastors and members of the praying ministry. One experiences these in the utterances such as *Holy Ghost fire* that is understood as a means of destruction instead of being a means of heart-warming unto dynamic love and edification of the Church and members.

³⁷⁴ Cf. Pope Pius XII, Encyclical *Mystici Corporis Christi*, 29 June 1943, No. 28.

Prayer demands faith in God and allowing God to be God as he says he is in his word. Prayer means, striving to be fully human or being perfect as a human being just as the heavenly Father is perfect as God. It means accepting the limitations of human frailty and total reliance on God's grace and will. Misplacement of emphasis in this regard creates confusion. In effect, spiritual challenges demand spiritual approach and medical challenges demand medical solutions from those God has given the capacity to exercise the skill of curing while he heals. The tendency of facing all human challenges with a mono panacea is not only dangerous but also retards human reasoning, development and progress of the continent. Prayer fulfils the very essence of religion by binding the adherents much stronger with the God they worship (from the Latin word, *religare* to bind again).

Pentecostals have turned Christianity into a clapping and noisy religion. They have compromised the virtue of faith with their gospel of *claim it and prosperity*. Worship for them is no longer devotion to God in Christ through the Holy Spirit. True worship is much more than singing, dancing, shouting and feeling good. Pentecostals have turned Christianity into a rowdy Church where the virtue of humility in worship is relegated to the backgrounds. Humility in worship is evident in wooden-kneeling-pews. Wooden-kneeling-pews promote true worship and collective assembly in worship. Pentecostals' single-plastic-seats emphasize otherwise.

One refers to wooden-pews because of the salvific importance of the wood in the economy of salvation. Kneeling therefore, is an integral part of worship which is a symbolic gesture for penitence and adoration. While kneeling in worship the members are renewed, humbled to obtain God's mercy and blessings. Kneeling empowers Christians to stand up against the storms of life. Kneeling has an enormous spiritual strength.

Prophesying and Healing must be seen in their proper Christocentric perspective. To prophesy means to announce the wonderful works of God as directed by God. It is a gift to those whom he has chosen. Gifts are meant to bear quality fruits. Gifts and fruits complement one another.

The conspicuous absence of the Eucharistic celebration among Pentecostals classifies them as merely congregational ecclesial

bodies and not a Eucharistic Church. Eucharistic liturgy makes the Church what it is as a worship of God the Father through Christ as the priest and victim with the assembly in the unity of the Holy Spirit. Perhaps that is the reason why some Christians in Africa are given to paying double allegiance: first to Pentecostal assembly where the Word is widely and elaborately celebrated and hereafter come to the Church for the Eucharistic celebration where the Word and Sacrament are celebrated as two acts in one scene or vice versa.

Roger E. Olson in his work, *The Dark Side of Pentecostalism*³⁷⁵ observed some grey areas the leaders have to re-address. These include the tendency to emphasise uncritical loyalty over even constructive criticisms that are growth oriented. Among Pentecostals, one observes a rampant *anti-intellectualism*. Yes, there are and have been excellent Pentecostal scholars, but most of them have been driven by Pentecostal leaders out of the movement. An obvious consequence of anti-intellectualism is their *vulnerability to heresies and fanaticism* within the ranks.³⁷⁶

According to him, Pentecostals have the tendency to place “Spirit filled” and “powerfully anointed” preachers, evangelists, “faith healers,” on *pedestals above accountability*. Eventually most of them fall off their pedestals, but that might have been prevented had they never been put up on them in the first place. Their sense of *spiritual superiority* over other Christians, including fellow evangelicals leads to better than attitude.³⁷⁷

One hardly hears of any treatise on the Cross, Suffering and Patience within the activities of the Pentecostals because of their *Gospel of Prosperity, Claiming it or Rejecting it and Instant Miracle*. Christianity is a religion of grace and remembrance whose symbol is the Cross with all its theological implications. A crossless Christianity is rather an absurdity.

The glaring absence of Mariology among Pentecostals needs to be readdressed. The theology of the Incarnation is impaired by their deliberate omission of Mariology in their activities. Christianity

³⁷⁵ Olson, Roger E., *The Dark Side of Pentecostalism*, October 31, 2016, www.pathos.com/blogs/rogerolsen/2016/10/the-dark-side-of-pentecostalism/ (28.05.2018).

³⁷⁶ Cf. *ibid.*

³⁷⁷ Cf. *ibid.*

maintains the totality of the economy of salvation which Pentecostals diminish by their exclusion of Mariology.

Conclusion

Just as every coin has two sides, so have the Pentecostal Movements in Africa. The Movements have indeed left some indelible footprints in the sands of time in so many areas of Christian living and witnessing. Their desire to devour the Word of God and apply it in all situations of human challenges, as well as their courageous capacity in public praying and preaching and above all their functional strategy in fundraising are illustrative.

In Nigeria for instance, even among the mainline Churches, it is a common feature that the ministers of the gospel depend on the offerings by the people for their livelihood. In other words, the survival of the ministers of the gospel and their ministries depend largely on how vibrant the ministers conduct the prayer sessions within which is located the offering time plus the meticulous payment of tithes.

On the other hand, their endless proliferation creates confusion with the wrong impression of a divided Christianity. This makes true Christian witnessing very difficult especially among non-Christians. Apart from the blunders of the scramble for Africa, the Movements on account of their unexegetical approach to the Word of God through anti-intellectualism have impoverished the continent through massive braindrain that is a necessary recipe for authentic biblical spirituality and unrivalled scientific development of the continent.

Charismatic Movements within the Catholic Church

Argument over the “*Mission Manifesto*”. On Evangelical and Pentecostal Tendencies in the Catholic Church in Germany

Klaus Vellguth

Anyone following developments within the Church around the world will not fail to have noticed the rapid spread of Pentecostal-Charismatic movements, which have become something of a “Christian trend religion”.³⁷⁸ While it is a phenomenon encountered mostly outside Europe, it is nonetheless highly relevant for the Church in Europe, too. Reinhard Hempelmann pointed out recently that the Pentecostal-Charismatic movements in Europe are helping to put an end to “the historical monopolies of the Latin-Catholic South and the Protestant North”³⁷⁹.

There can be no denying that Charismatic, Pentecostal and Evangelical influences are changing the face of the Catholic Church in Germany. This is readily apparent from the book lists issued by the denominational publishing houses. If you leaf through the list issued by the Verlag Katholisches Bibelwerk for spring 2019, for instance, you will come across a four-page advertising spread to promote the songbook *Xpraise*, in which songs of worship are published that would be more fitting in an Evangelical, Free Church context. The following

³⁷⁸ Cf. Feneberg, Valentin/Müller, Johannes, *Evangelikale – Pfingstkirchen – Charismatiker: Neue religiöse Bewegungen als Herausforderung für die katholische Kirche. Systematische Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse der internationalen Konferenz Rom 09. – 01.04.2013 (Forschungsergebnisse, No. 6)*, edited by the Academic Working Group of the German Bishops' Conference, Bonn 2014. Westerlund, David (ed.), *Global Pentecostalism: Encounters with Other Religious Traditions*, London/New York 2009. Dickow, Helga, “Zulauf für Charismatiker: Pfingstkirchen wachsen weltweit – auch in Südafrika”, in: Afrika süd, No. 43 (2014) 6, 17–19, here: 17; cf. Ojo, Matthews, *Pentecostal Movements, Islam and the Contest for Public Space in Northern Nigeria: Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, Abuja 2007; cf. Chung, Meehyun, “Korean Pentecostals and the Preaching of Prosperity”, in: *Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft*, No. 99 (2015), 276–296; cf. Fer-nandez, Constantine B., “Catholic Charismatic Renewal”, in: *Asian Horizons*, No. 4 (2010), 250–253; cf. Nonis, Claude, “Living the Experience of Baptism in the Holy Spirit in the Apostolate of Charismatic Renewal in Sri Lanka”, in: *Vidyajyoti Journal of Theological Reflection*, No. 77 (2013), 64–79.

³⁷⁹ Hempelmann, Reinhard, “Geistbewegungen – Pfingstkirchen – charismatische Bewegungen”, in: *Lebendiges Zeugnis*, No. 73 (2018) 4, 282–287, here: 287.

four pages, which are reserved for a prayer journal, give a general idea of Charismatic, Pentecostal and Free Church influences. In 2018, the Verlag Herder publishing house issued the *Mission Manifesto*, which was presented during a MEHR (More) Conference attended by 11,000 participants, many of them from an Evangelical, Pentecostal or Free Church background. A year previously, in January 2017, a MEHR Conference of this kind had attracted an impressive 8,000 participants. There was primetime television news coverage of the conference under the heading "Holy Fascination in Augsburg: Church as a Pop Event".³⁸⁰ Irrespective of the substance of the conference, it was evident that it focused on a way of presenting the Church that is different from the style to which we are largely accustomed. Theresa Mertes and Chris Cuhls wrote in retrospect: "Ninety-minute lectures and nobody nods off: the keynotes [...] last for up to two (!) hours. The presentations are eloquent, entertaining, rhetorically well thought-out and very skilfully arranged. Thousands more were able to follow them thanks to live stream coverage and afterwards on YouTube."³⁸¹

The *Mission Manifesto*, in particular, triggered a passionate and occasionally heated debate in which traditional Catholic theologians discussed with Christians whose faith involves a more Evangelical, Charismatic or Free Church form of piety. I will now examine this debate and begin by presenting the core content of the *Mission Manifesto* before going on to review the reactions to it. I will conclude by looking at the consequences of the debate for missionary work between the two opposite poles of simplification and academicism.

Mission Manifesto

The *Mission Manifesto* is a private initiative launched by Christians who, to quote its instigators, "wish to put new evangelisation at the very heart of Church life and call for a missionary awakening in the Catholic Church". Among the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* are Johannes Hartl, head of the House of Prayer in Augsburg; Father

³⁸⁰ Reichart, Johannes, Holy Fascination in Augsburg: Kirche als Pop-Ereignis, <https://www.tagesschau.de/multimedia/sendung/tt-4963.html>; cf. Werner, Gunda, "Vorwort", in: id. (ed.), *Gerettet durch Begeisterung: Reform der katholischen Kirche durch pfingstlich-charismatische Religiosität?*, Freiburg 2018, 7–15, here: 7.

³⁸¹ Mertes, Theresa/Cuhls, Chris, "Die MEHR-Konferenz: Mehr als eine Konferenz", in: *Lebendige Seelsorge*, No. 69 (2018) 4, 278–282, here: 281.

Karl Wallner, National Director of missio in Austria; Bernhard Meuser, co-author of YouCat; Paul Metzlaff, expert advisor to the Youth Pastoral Centre of the German Bishops' Conference; Martin Iten, head of Radio Fisherman.fm; and Benedikt Michal, managing director of the coordination unit JAKOB, a youth work institution run by the Austrian Bishops' Conference. The inaugurators met in July 2017 in the House of Prayer in Augsburg and six months later, on 5 January 2018, the *Mission Manifesto* was presented at the MEHR Conference in Augsburg.

The *Mission Manifesto* formulates ten theses for new evangelisation. It starts from the premise that a missionary awakening in the Catholic Church cannot be ordained from above by the hierarchy but must have the support of the Church members themselves. The *Mission Manifesto* thus endorses the common priesthood of all the faithful. It does not regard itself as a new institution in its own right, its intention being rather to merge and coordinate existing initiatives. The initial response from large parts of the Church to this fresh initiative, in which a new style of Church is practised, was muted, however. Theologians were critical of the positions set out in the *Mission Manifesto*, which prompted its initiators to first reject any discussion of the criticisms voiced. In answering the critics Johannes Hartl said: "The fervent criticism of the *Mission Manifesto* [...] appears to have been hastily cobbled together. It vigorously refutes statements which as such are not even to be found in the manifesto. Or are we witnessing the emergence of more deep-rooted differences in the use of terms such as mission, truth and decision which require closer examination?"³⁸² There would appear to be far-reaching theological differences between the instigators of the *Mission Manifesto* and their critics. For that reason I will now take a look at the preamble of the *Mission Manifesto* in order to establish how far the statements it contains are theologically controversial.

The preamble begins by noting that "As far as anyone can see, the Church in Germany, Austria and Switzerland is about to cease to play any significant role in our societies in the years to come. The problem with that is not so much that it's bad for the Church as an organisation; rather it is a grievous loss for the people who will forfeit

³⁸² Hartl, Johannes, "Wir wollen missionieren! Zur Diskussion um das 'Mission Manifest'", in: Herder Korrespondenz, No. 72 (2018) 10, 50–51, here: 50.

God or never get to know Jesus in the first place.”³⁸³ This statement in the *Mission Manifesto* strikes me as banal and is likely to be accepted by virtually every theologian in Germany. After all, the publication of the Sinus milieu study in 2005 made it clear that the milieu of the Catholic Church in Germany has been shrinking for years and only has a solid foundation in a few milieus.³⁸⁴ Moreover, the study found that most milieus are sceptical towards, if not opposed to, the Church and that the Church has lost contact with “young” milieus in particular.

At that time Michael Ebers, a sociologist of religion from Freiburg, said: “What is serious is that the Church has lost contact with the three milieus of the established post-materialists and the modern performers. These are the leading milieus in society and they give the whole of society a sense of direction. The study can be seen as a challenge to the Church to seek ways of establishing relations with members of these milieus and engaging in an appropriate dialogue with them.” With this in mind, the preamble of the *Mission Manifesto* states: “As far as anyone can see, the Church in Germany, Austria and Switzerland is about to cease to play any significant role in our societies in the years to come. The problem with that is not so much that it’s bad for the Church as an organisation; rather it is a grievous loss for the people who will forfeit God or never get to know Jesus in the first place.”

The fact that the Church as a crucial vehicle for the communication of the Christian faith in our society is not propelled by any missionary momentum but, on the contrary, is steadily declining in influence is not under dispute. Joachim Wanke, a bishop from eastern Germany, wrote the following in an Episcopal letter dealing with the missionary task of the Church, which he published in conjunction with *Time to Sow. Being a Missionary Church*, a statement issued in 2000 by the German bishops, for which he was largely responsible: “There is something missing in our Catholic Church in Germany. It’s not money. It’s not the faithful. What our Catholic Church in Germany lacks is the conviction that it can attract new Christians.”³⁸⁵

³⁸³ Hartl, Johannes, “Wir wollen missionieren! Zur Diskussion um das ‘Mission Manifest’”, in: Herder Korrespondenz 72 (2018) 20, 50f., here: 50.

³⁸⁴ Cf. Vellguth, Klaus, “Sag mir, wo die Christen sind: Studie zum Milieuhandbuch ‘Religiöse und kirchliche Orientierungen in den Sinus®-Milieus 2005’”, in: AnzSS, No. 115 (2006) 10, 29–41.

³⁸⁵ Wanke, Joachim, “Brief eines Bischofs aus den neuen Bundesländern über den Missionsauftrag der Kirche für Deutschland”, in: Die deutschen Bischöfe, Zeit zur Aussaat: Missionarisch Kirche sein, edited by the Secretariat of the German Bishops’ Conference, Bonn 2000, 35.

Stephan Ackermann hit the nail on the head and, in doing so, rubbed salt into the wound when pointing out in his brief Saturday evening television sermon: “Germany is a mission country, but regrettably we are not a missionary Church.”³⁸⁶

In the third section of the preamble the *Mission Manifesto* refers explicitly to Pope Francis and says: “We invite everybody who seriously wishes to engage with us in a wave of prayer. We wish to bring together those who are bold enough to take unusual steps. As Pope Francis himself says, ‘The current imperative is pastoral conversion, in other words ‘The renewal of [the Church’s] structures demanded by pastoral conversion can only be understood in this light: as part of an effort to make them more mission-oriented, to make ordinary pastoral activity on every level more inclusive and open, to inspire in pastoral workers a constant desire to go forth and in this way to elicit a positive response from all those whom Jesus summons to friendship with himself’. (*Evangelii Gaudium*, no. 27)”. The preamble thus takes up a major concern formulated in the Apostolic Exhortation *Evangelii Gaudium*, which is seen as programmatic for Pope Francis’ pontificate.³⁸⁷ The main purpose of *Evangelii Gaudium* is to recall the missionary spirit of the Church. Drawing on the Final Document of the Fifth General Assembly of the Episcopal Conference of Latin America (CELAM) in Aparecida, the final editing of which was undertaken by Jorge Bergoglio, Pope Francis returns to the concept of a “misión permanente”³⁸⁸ that was formulated in *Evangelii Gaudium*: “Throughout the world, let us be ‘permanently in a state of mission’.”³⁸⁹ This is an unmistakable reference to the words spoken by Cardinal Suenens at the beginning

³⁸⁶ Stefan Ackermann in Wort zum Sonntag on 26 October 2008.

³⁸⁷ The initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* also expressly refer to the concept of missionary discipleship, one of the key terms used by Pope Francis. Hence they write: “We are convinced that two terms which have hitherto played no more than a subordinate role will become increasingly important for the Church in future. These are ‘disciples’ and ‘mission’. A Church without followers of Jesus (i.e. disciples) is absurd. It is equally absurd if the Church has lost sight of its ‘mission’ or, to put it more bluntly, has forfeited its *raison d'être*”; (cf. Hartl, Johannes/Meuser, Bernhard/Wallner, Karl, Mission Manifest: Die Thesen für das Comeback der Kirche, Freiburg 2018, 18).

³⁸⁸ Cf. von Fürstenberg, Gregor, “Zustand permanenter Evangelisierung: Die Missionstheologie von Papst Franziskus”, in: Herder Korrespondenz, No. 69 (2015) 11, 582–586, here: 582.

³⁸⁹ Pope Francis, Apostolical Exhortation *Evangelii Gaudium* on the proclamation of the Gospel in today's world, 24 November 2013, referred to below as EG, here: No. 25

of the Second Vatican Council: “We need [...] to put the whole Church in a state of mission [Ecclesia in statu missionis or Église en état de mission]. This means operating with a mission-oriented pastoral ministry in mind.”³⁹⁰ Pope Francis wants a Church that ventures to go forth: “I dream of a “missionary option”, that is, a missionary impulse capable of transforming everything, so that the Church’s customs, ways of doing things, times and schedules, language and structures can be suitably channelled for the evangelisation of today’s world rather than for her self-preservation.”³⁹¹ Comparing the preamble of the *Mission Manifesto* with the Apostolic Exhortation *Evangelii Gaudium*, it seems to me that the manifesto adds little that is substantially new and goes beyond the theological mainstream. Essentially it moves in the same missionary and pastoral direction as that embarked upon by Pope Francis.

A similar picture emerges with regard to the ten theses set out in the manifesto. The first thesis reads: “We are driven by the desire that people may convert themselves to Jesus Christ.” This thesis emphasises that it is not enough to have been socialised as a Catholic. On the contrary, what is needed is a conscious decision to become a disciple of Jesus Christ.

The second thesis is: “We want to make mission the top priority.” Here the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* refer explicitly to the Second Vatican Council and quote perhaps the most important statement in *Ad Gentes*, the decree on the mission activity of the Church: “The pilgrim Church is missionary by her very nature.”³⁹² This ontological statement about the Church is not the exclusive theological property of the Catholic Church but is now endorsed by the world’s major churches across the ecumenical board. The churches affiliated in the World Council of Churches made this abundantly clear in their mission statement called “Together Towards Life”³⁹³. The same is true of the Evangelical churches affiliated in the World Evangelical

³⁹⁰ Suenens, Léon-Joseph, *Souvenirs et Espérances*, Paris 1991, 74.

³⁹¹ EG 27

³⁹² Decree *Ad Gentes* on the mission activity of the Church, 7 December 1965, here: No. 2.

³⁹³ Ökumenischer Rat der Kirchen, “Gemeinsam für das Leben: Mission und Evangelisation in sich wandelnden Kontexten. Die neue Missionserklärung des ÖRK”, in: EMW (ed.), *Christus heute bezeugen. Mission auf dem Weg von Edinburgh 2010 nach Busan 2013*, Hamburg 2013, 458-494. <https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/commissions/mission-and-evangelism/together-towards-life-mission-and-evangelism-in-changing-landscapes> (26.05.2020).

Alliance which have professed their belief in the missionary nature of the church in the ecumenical mission document they co-signed entitled “Christian Witness in a Multi-Religious World”³⁹⁴,³⁹⁵

The third thesis states: “We believe that chances have never been better than they are now.” Instead of lapsing into a state of shock or pessimistic paralysis in view of the religious developments in Germany the authors of the *Mission Manifesto* deliberately adopt an attitude of calculated optimism.

The fourth thesis is: “We wish to address all people in our countries without making distinctions.” A statement of this kind has a fine ring to it, given that the activities of the Church often revolve around some imaginary centre or internal Church space rather than reflecting a Church which operates “from the outside in”. Such a thesis also keeps the authors of the manifesto at arm’s length from those who think they can rent our society asunder by dividing people up according to their nationality and attempting to foment hatred, envy and discord. The overcoming of national differences associated with this thesis strikes me as crucial in view of the developments in the Catholic Church in Germany at a time when a third of all Catholics in many dioceses come from an immigrant background.

The fifth thesis states: “We believe that our missionary activities will only be as powerful as our prayers are.” The instigators of the *Mission Manifesto* expressly cite Charles de Foucauld in this context and are convinced that missionary spirituality is a source of nourishment for Church and missionary activities.³⁹⁶ I regard this reference as distinctly valuable, given that we are faced with a Church in which we have perhaps forgotten to speak openly about our personal spirituality.

³⁹⁴ Ökumensicher Rat der Kirchen/Päpstlicher Rat für den Interreligiösen Dialog/Weltweite Allianz, Das christliche Zeugnis in einer multireligiösen Welt. Empfehlungen für einen Verhaltenskodex, <https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/wcc-programmes/interreligious-dialogue-and-cooperation/christian-identity-in-pluralistic-societies/christian-witness-in-a-multi-religious-world> (26.05.2020).

³⁹⁵ Cf. Veilguth, Klaus, “Gemeinsam missionarisch unterwegs: Eine vergleichende Einführung in die Missionsdokumente”, in: Biehl, Michael/Veilguth, Klaus (eds.), *MissionRespekt: Christliches Zeugnis in ökumenischer Weite: Konvergenzen und Divergenzen als Bereicherung des Missionsverständnisses*, Aachen/Hamburg 2016, 20–59.

³⁹⁶ Cf. Veilguth, Klaus, “Missionarische Spiritualität in Orthodoxie und Orthopraxie der Kapstadt-Verpflichtung: Zwölf Schritte einer missionarischen Spiritualität in ökumenischer Perspektive betrachtet”, in: Ley, Stefan/Proft, Ingo/Schulze, Markus (eds.), *Welt vor Gott (FS George Augustin)*, 190–207.

The sixth thesis reads: "We are grateful to all the Christians outside the Catholic Church who are already devoted to mission, baptising and leading people to Jesus." This statement shows that the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* have an open mind when it comes to ecumenism. The formulations indicate that there is a closeness in particular to the Free Churches and Evangelical movements within the Protestant church.³⁹⁷

The seventh thesis says: "We must rediscover the contents of our faith." This also echoes mainstream theology in Germany, since it goes without saying that faith is a hermeneutical process in which Christians as subjects of the faith experience change on a daily basis and thus face the day-to-day challenge of rediscovering their personal faith.

The eighth thesis of the *Mission Manifesto* is: "We want to evangelise, not indoctrinate." The fathers of the Second Vatican Council made it clear long ago that missionary work must never be accompanied by coercion or violence. In 2011 the Catholic Church, the World Council of Churches and the World Evangelical Alliance left not the slightest doubt in the aforementioned document "Christian Witness in a Multi-Religious World" that they endorse this position as a fundamental axiom of Christian evangelisation.³⁹⁸

The ninth thesis says: "We need a 'democratisation' of mission." Here the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* are at pains to point out that, in view of the common priest-hood of all the faithful, evangelisation is the duty of all Christians and so cannot be made the exclusive task of a certain group of specialists, be they priests, deacons, theologians, religious or whatever.

Finally, the tenth thesis states: "We have to convert ourselves to the joy of the Gospel in order to be able to lead others to Jesus." Here the authors of the *Mission Manifesto* come back to the concept of joy, which is one of the key terms in the pontificate of Pope Francis,

³⁹⁷ Cf. Vellguth, Klaus, "Ökumenische Facetten als Reichtum und Ressource: Übereinstimmungen und Eigenarten der Kapstadt-Verpflichtung, der Missionserklärung 'Gemeinsam für das Leben' und der Exhortatio 'Evangelii gaudium'", in: Brennpunkt Gemeinde (2016) 4, 122–126.

³⁹⁸ Cf. Vellguth, Klaus, "MissionRespekt: Der ökumenische Verhaltenskodex zum christlichen Zeugnis in einer multireligiösen Welt und seine Rezeption in Deutschland", in: Verbum SVD, No. 55 (2015) 1–2, 160–179; cf. Vellguth, Klaus, "MissionRespekt: Ökumenischer Kongress zum christlichen Zeugnis in einer multireligiösen Welt", in: Pastoralblatt, No. 66 (2014) 12, 367–371.

as is evident from the titles of the documents he has published, e.g. *Evangelii Gaudium*, *Amoris Laetitia*, *Veritatis Gaudium*, etc. Again and again he focuses on joy, which becomes a pivotal concept of the Christian faith with a radiating effect.

Reactions to the *Mission Manifesto*

Having dealt with the preamble and the ten theses in the *Mission Manifesto*, I will now look at reactions to it. First of all, the publication of the manifesto met with a positive and, in some cases, euphoric response. Writing in the journal *Kirche Heute* a few weeks after the publication of the manifesto, Erich Maria Fink and Thomas Maria Rimmel said: "The authors do not shrink from using the word mission; they see it as the key to the future of the Church in our countries. The fact that very different people who subscribe to a new evangelisation can identify with the ten theses of the manifesto and have been brought together as a result is a Pentecostal event in itself."³⁹⁹ At the time of writing, a total of 4,083 persons have signed the *Mission Manifesto*, among the first of whom were Archbishop Rainer Maria Cardinal Woelki (Cologne) and the Youth Bishops from Germany, Austria and West Switzerland: Bishop Stefan Oster SDB (Youth Bishop Germany), Suffragan Bishop Stephan Turnovszky (Youth Bishop Austria) and Suffragan Bishop Alain de Raemy (Youth Bishop West Switzer-land). Suffragan Bishop Florian Wörner (Diocese of Augsburg) is also among the document's signatories.⁴⁰⁰

The publication of the *Mission Manifesto* found not only supporters, but also numerous critics. Ursula Nothelle-Wildfeuer, for instance, wrote a few weeks after the manifesto was issued: "Why am I so sceptical about the *Mission Manifesto*? It feels strange to read about what may be the last chance for Christianity. Is God at an end just because people cannot see the way forward?"⁴⁰¹ And she adds: "It sounds strange, too, to read about a Church comeback. Is not evangelisation all about preaching the

³⁹⁹ Fink, Erich Maria/Rimmel, Thomas Maria, "Editorial", in: *Kirche Heute: Monatszeitschrift für die katholische Kirche im deutschen Sprachraum mit katholischen Radio- und Fernsehprogrammen*, February/March 2018, 3.

⁴⁰⁰ <https://www.missionManifest.online/#unterzeichnen> (26.05.2020).

⁴⁰¹ Nothelle-Wildfeuer, Ursula, "Mission und Mission Manifest", in: <https://www.feinschwarz.net/mission-und-mission-Manifest/> (11.03.2019).

hope offered by the Gospel and thus bearing witness to the advent of God's Kingdom, which the Church renders unmistakably visible while not being identical with it?"⁴⁰² Along with other theologians she also points out that the diaconal care aspect of the Church's activities hardly plays a role in the *Mission Manifesto*: "But where is the dimension of diaconal ministry in the *Mission Manifesto*? Even understood in a broad sense as a charitable-social diaconal ministry or socio-political diaconal work, it is hardly mentioned at all throughout the document. In the manifesto, at least, it is not seen as being crucial to evangelisation and the comeback of the Church."⁴⁰³ Claudia Keller agrees with her: "There is a lot of talk in the manifesto about prayer, revival and miracles but little about the social and political involvement of Christians."⁴⁰⁴ Ursula Nothelle-Wildfeuer goes further in saying: "The *Mission Manifesto* formulates clear-cut demands, but can mission be first and foremost a question of one's own achievements in prayer, fasting, in the profession of one's faith, given that God loves human beings unconditionally without specifying any minimum standards of conviction?"⁴⁰⁵

Esther Berg-Chan offers a classification which is indispensable for an appropriate reading of the *Mission Manifesto*, especially in order to grasp that the manifesto has its origins in the sociology of religion. She wrote the following at the time the *Mission Manifesto* was handed over to Pope Francis: "The rapid growth of Evangelical, Pentecostal and Charismatic movements is nothing new for the Catholic Church. [...] The apparent success of the manifesto and the initiatory House of Prayer, whose annual *MEHR Conference* was attended by a record 10,000 participants this year, make it clear that evangelisation and charismatisation are far from being an unknown quantity any more in Europe."⁴⁰⁶ Esther Berg-Chan sees the *Mission Manifesto* as fitting into an Evangelical or Charismatic milieu which has found a firm footing not only in Pentecostal and Evangelical movements outside the Catholic Church, but has also made inroads into the Catholic Church in Germany. Indeed, in their

⁴⁰² Ibid.

⁴⁰³ Ibid.

⁴⁰⁴ Keller, Claudia, "Viel Furor, kaum Aufbruch: Das 'Mission Manifest' gibt sich radikal und entspricht dem Zeitgeist", in: Herder Korrespondenz, No. 72 (2018) 3, 7.

⁴⁰⁵ Nothelle-Wildfeuer, Ursula, op. cit.

⁴⁰⁶ Berg-Chan, Esther, Papst nimmt Mission Manifest entgegen, <https://iwm.sankt-georgen.de/papst-nimmt-mission-Manifesto-entgegen/> (11.03.2019).

introduction to the *Mission Manifesto* the initiators deliberately point to the “experiences of the Free Churches”⁴⁰⁷ and to the “experiences of the renewal movements, communities and, not least, the reform congregations within the Catholic Church”⁴⁰⁸.

It strikes me as significant that the *Mission Manifesto* has prepared the way for the entry into the Catholic Church of Pentecostal, Free Church and Evangelical tendencies, the hallmarks of which are not primarily unorthodox or “unwieldy” theological concepts but, above all, a different theological style and way of believing. These tendencies are seen by many theologians as constituting a “break in style”, which is rejected. However, this apparent “break in style” is in fact the manifestation of a development which is transforming the Catholic Church the world over. Theologians like Margit Eckholt see in the Pentecostal forms of communitarisation a new “basic form”⁴⁰⁹ of being a Christian which has come to the fore around the world in recent years. Theologians researching into Pentecostalism warn that a lack of interest in both its religiousness and its theology could have fatal consequences for the Catholic Church in future. Instead of rejecting the break in style which is characteristic of Charismatic, Pentecostal and Evangelical tendencies in the Catholic Church, its emergence should be seen rather as a challenge to conduct a critical review of the everyday reality of the Church in Germany. For, as Gunda Werner, for example, has said: “The underlying issue, so the argument runs, is the failure of the Roman Catholic Church to date to come to terms with the modern world. Put in dogmatic terms, even now we still do not have a theoretical framework for a Roman Catholic ecclesiology which takes due account of modern developments.”⁴¹⁰ Sociologists of religion like Detlef Pollak take a look further afield which is beneficial for the Church because they point out that in many countries around the world the Catholic Church has long since turned into what might be called a “supply line” for Charismatic groups.⁴¹¹

⁴⁰⁷ Hartl, Johannes/Meuser, Bernhard/Wallner, Karl, *Mission Manifest*, op. cit., 16.

⁴⁰⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁰⁹ Eckholt, Margit, “Pentekostalismus: Eine neue Grundform des Christseins”, in: Keßler, Tobias/Rethmann, Albert-Peter (eds.), *Pentekostalismus: Die Pfingstbewegung als Anfrage an Theologie und Kirche*, Regensburg 2012, 202–225, here: 203.

⁴¹⁰ Werner, Gunda, “Vorwort”, in: id. (ed.), *Gerettet durch Begeisterung: Reform der katholischen Kirche durch pfingstlich-charismatische Religiosität?*, Freiburg 2018, 7–15, here: 10.

⁴¹¹ Cf. Pollack, Detlef/Rosta, Gergely, *Religion in der Moderne: Ein internationaler Vergleich*, Frankfurt/New York 2015.

In getting to grips with the substance of the *Mission Manifesto* it is important not to overlook the fact that the manifesto itself is deliberately not intended to be a systematic guideline statement and that it wishes to provoke its readers to a certain extent. That may well be necessary from time to time if organisations such as the Church have developed in a way that turns their members into captives in their own comfort zones. It can come as no surprise that we representatives of the Church – and I mean all of us together – regard the *Mission Manifesto* as disconcerting, because we all too often see the Church from our own vantage point. This has meant that the Catholic Church in Germany is far too often viewed and shaped from the standpoint of “full-time officials”. The *Mission Manifesto* pulls no punches in criticising such a standpoint. The authors say, for example: “We have no need to be afraid of the new. At worst we should feel uneasy at the prospect of everything having to stay exactly the way it is in the Church with all the old treaties, official regulations, pastoral plans and employment contracts.”⁴¹²

The *Mission Manifesto* has a conception of the Church which does not assume that full-time officials have a prominent part to play. It goes without saying that the initiators of the manifesto do not expect their approach to go down well with such officials. Nevertheless, they write: “There was general agreement that in addressing the issue of a missionary revival it makes no sense to point the finger at others, such as bishops, priests, religious education teachers and full-time officials in the parishes. The famous assertion that ‘It’s about time they got cracking!’ is an unacceptable delegation.”⁴¹³ Of course it is theologically correct that responsibility for the missions cannot be assigned to a single group of specialists, irrespective of how they are chosen, and that evangelisation ultimately poses a challenge to all Christians. So what is the reason for the vehement reactions? By attempting to “democratise” mission the authors of the *Mission Manifesto* set about gently upsetting the Church’s power structures. The same applies to the assignment of functions, which is closely associated with the identity of bishops, priests, religious education teachers and full-time officials in the parishes. No wonder such “chipping away at identities” triggers criticism. The fact of the matter is, however, that

⁴¹² Hartl, Johannes/Meuser, Bernhard/Wallner, Karl, *Mission Manifest*, op. cit., 18.

⁴¹³ Ibid., 15.

there will be a fundamental change in hierarchies and functions within the Catholic Church in the years to come. This has nothing to do with abstract ecclesiological reflections but with fundamental changes in communication in society at large. Communication specialists say that the era of digitisation is accompanied by the “removal of hierarchies and gatekeepers”⁴¹⁴. Wolfgang Beck, a pastoral theologian from Frankfurt, likewise draws attention to the connection between digitality and changes in roles and hierarchies within the Church. He says that: “There is an emergent culture of digitality in which hierarchies are being largely levelled out, public relations is taking on an additional control function and the lack of professionalism within the Church is being ruthlessly exposed.”⁴¹⁵

The provocative statements made by the authors of the *Mission Manifesto* have inevitably triggered protests from full-time Church staff. However, it seems that the initiators of the manifesto not only “wish to pick a quarrel” with the officially organised Church and its full-time employees, but also have a bone to pick with academic theologians. They assert, for instance, that: “The Church can function without concordats, faculties and cathedrals. In fact it can do without almost everything it is associated with in the eyes of contemporaries.”⁴¹⁶ It was inevitable that a statement of this kind would not go down well with the holders of chairs in faculties of Catholic theology in Germany. It is equally obvious that they have little sympathy for such formulations and have rejected the initiative and its missionary intentions. It is to the credit of the authors of the *Mission Manifesto* that they have in the meantime made concessions with regard to the debate they have unleashed and are at pains to point out that evangelisation also requires theological reflection. Johannes Hartl, for example, has said: “No, of course mission needs theological reflection. There can be no evangeli-sation without theology.”⁴¹⁷ However, he goes on to make a remark that is crucial for an understanding of the *Mission Manifesto*:

⁴¹⁴ Cf. Büsch, Andreas, “Christus, der Meister der Kommunikation – auch digital? Herausforderungen der Digitalisierung für die Pastoral”, in: Anzeiger für die Seelsorge, No. 128 (2019) 2, 9–12, here: 10.

⁴¹⁵ Beck, Wolfgang, “Pastorale Herausforderungen in einer ‘Kultur der Digitalität’: Eine Chance zum Aufbruch!”, in: Anzeiger für die Seelsorge, No. 128 (2019) 2, 5–9, here: 7.

⁴¹⁶ Hartl, Johannes/Meuser, Bernhard/Wallner, Karl, *Mission Manifest*, op. cit., 18.

⁴¹⁷ Hartl, Johannes, “Wir wollen missionieren! Zur Diskussion um das ‘Mission Manifest’”, in: Herder Korrespondenz, No. 72 (2018) 10, 50–51, here: 50.

"It will be obvious to every reader that the *Mission Manifesto* is not a theological textbook."⁴¹⁸ And he adds: "It is an open matter whether a book designed for a grassroots initiative consisting largely of new movements which has been written by practitioners for practitioners ought to satisfy academic standards or whether it will become a bestseller nevertheless."⁴¹⁹

At this point at the very latest it becomes obvious what has also contributed to a lack of understanding or outright rejection amongst academics. The *Mission Manifesto* avoids academic language and instead uses spiritualising terms and other forms of advertising language that are alien to academic theologians. The use of such language is far from surprising in view of the professional background of the initiators and authors of the manifesto.

Bernhard Meuser, who was awarded the Catholic Journalists' Prize by the German Bishops' Conference over 25 years ago, is a journalist and writer as well the co-initiator and head of the YouCat Foundation. Martin Iten is in charge of Radio Fisherman.fm. Michael Prüller runs the Public Relations and Communications Office of the Archdiocese of Vienna. Katharina Fassler is an author and co-founder of *Nightfever*. Maria-Sophie Maasburg writes books. In other words, the inaugurators of the *Mission Manifesto* are all people with a background in journalism or have at least something to do with journalism. It would certainly be true to say that Johannes Hartl, the founder and head of the House of Prayer in Augsburg, has a certain affinity with journalism. It would be wrong to voice criticism from an academic perspective of the unusual style of the *Mission Manifesto*, which has its origins not least in the journalistic provenance of the authors. On the other hand, if you take the focus on charisms seriously, it would certainly be possible to regard the journalistic background of the authors as a charism which enriches the Catholic Church in its commitment to evangelisation.

Another probable reason for the "unwieldy" impression the manifesto has formed in the minds of many Christians is that the language it uses is not gender-sensitive. By that I do not only mean that the texts in the *Mission Manifesto* are not linguistically "gendered". What is striking, in addition, is that one of the hallmarks of the *Mission*

⁴¹⁸ Ibid.

⁴¹⁹ Ibid.

Manifesto is the predominantly male style of the discourse it conducts, which tends to exclude rather than invite and to assert rather than to argue. At a conference on the *Mission Manifesto* held at the Study Centre for Faith and Society of the University of Fribourg in December 2018, Gunda Werner criticised the construction of dichotomies and the mixing of description and assessment as well as the assertion of the right to determine who needs evangelisation and for what reason. It would appear to be no accident that the *Mission Manifesto*, which was initiated by three men, reveals distinctly masculine traits in the expressions it uses and in the manner of its presentation. It seems to me that, if the initiative is to meet with approval in broad circles of the Church and among theologians, it will need to discard this distinctly masculine style of discussion. Let me make a comment at this point. Just how important greater sensitivity to gender issues and to the role of women in the Church is has been made all too clear by the Munich reform groups here in Fürstenried Palace who from eleven o'clock to five minutes to twelve have made clear their advocacy of a diaconate for women.

The vehement debate about the *Mission Manifesto* shows that its initiators have put their fingers into some sensitive wounds afflicting the Church and academic theology. There can be no doubt that the *Mission Manifesto* and its ten theses have raised issues which are beyond dispute. Both the preamble and the manifesto's ten theses contain little that is new or at odds with the understanding of a missionary church of the kind that Pope Francis has unceasingly called for in the last few years of his pontificate. So if the *Mission Manifesto* itself is not at issue, then what is? In terms of substance, the argument over the *Mission Manifesto* is not about the manifesto itself at all but about the contributions that have been published by individual authors in the book *Mission Manifesto. The Theses for A Comeback of the Church* which was issued in January of last year by the Verlag Herder publishing house. These contributions certainly contain statements which occasionally run counter to mainstream academic theology. However, it would be wrong to assume that the articles published in the book are concerned with academic theology. It is helpful here to take a look at the blurb, in which there is a frank admission that: "This book is deliberately intended to provide food for thought and to encourage people to join in. It is, therefore, a must for all those who really care about the Church." The authors are keen to

provoke and thus shake up a Church apparatus which they consider to be lethargic. Those who confuse provocation with academic reflection fail to do justice to the character of the work. The main concern of Johannes Hartl and the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* is not to explain mission but to invite people to engage in evangelisation. Thus in response to the objections voiced by theologians Hartl writes: "While many of the objections might seem right at first glance, the question is: 'What would a theologically 'slimmer' version of missionary activity look like?"⁴²⁰

The decision people face is whether they wish to be provoked by the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* or not. I think it is helpful first of all to see that the manifesto is a provocation and to accept it as such. It is about introducing a new style of inner-Church discourse which is largely alien to both traditional Church and traditional academic circles. It is about a style of being Church that is more at home amongst Charismatics, Pentecostals and Evangelicals. In essence it is also a question of style that is under dispute. At the very latest after having read the arguments over the Sinus milieu study, which concluded that the Church with its all but dogmatic concentration on a few lifestyles has excommunicated itself from large parts of society, I would take the debate over style which has developed around the *Mission Manifesto* as an occasion to recall the Catholicity of the Church. My feeling is that the deliberate provocation aspired to by the initiators of the manifesto should be countered by a degree of sangfroid with a view to integrating styles rather than separating or excluding them.

Mission between the poles of Simplification and Academicism

In conclusion, perhaps I can express a few wishes concerning the way in which the discussion of missionary work should be conducted between the two poles of simplification and academicism. Let me begin with the inaugurators of the *Mission Manifesto*. From my point of view it is important that they should not seek a separate role for themselves within the Church but do more to win over the many Christians who feel at home in the Catholic Church and are active in associations, initiatives, parishes, etc. Should they fail to do so,

⁴²⁰ Ibid.

they will certainly foster division if they are all too confident about “who is friend and who is foe” whilst conjuring up the prospect of the “complete demise of the Church”, loudly denouncing the institution and presenting themselves as taboo breakers and martyrs.⁴²¹

My second wish is that the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* should not ignore theology but seek a theological debate. It is not conducive to a constructive discussion if their reaction to theological criticism of their initiative is to engage in “verbal abuse” and to discredit the criticism as “booing from the sidelines”⁴²² or as “theological muddling through, but with an attitude of composure”⁴²³.

My third wish is that when it comes to missionary commitment the other religions or the so-called “world” should not be ignored but accorded the esteem due to them. For example, the “normative interpretation of salvation based on an explicitness in matters of religious affiliation”⁴²⁴, which has been rightly criticised by Gunda Werner, is far from helpful. None other than Karl Rahner pointed out in his work *Selbsterfahrung und Gotteserfahrung* that a divine experience is not an inner-Church occurrence and that it takes place in the midst of life or in the midst of the world. Rahner said: “A divine experience of this kind can always happen in an everyday setting even if the person concerned is busy with all manner of things but certainly not with God.”⁴²⁵ There should also be no pretending that the *Mission Manifesto* is not part of this world. It should be treated instead as an initiative in the midst of the world to which God has promised salvation. After all, *extra mundus nulla salus*.

My fourth wish is that the representatives of the *Mission Manifesto*, while accepting the journalistic need for reduction, should not indulge in over-simplistic formulations but take due note of the complexity

⁴²¹ Keller, Claudia, op. cit., 7.

⁴²² Hartl, Johannes, “Rezension ‘Einfach nur Jesus? Eine Kritik am Mission Manifest’”, <https://johanneshartl.org/rezension-einfach-nur-jesus-eine-kritik-am-mission-Manifest/> (11.03.2019).

⁴²³ Ibid.

⁴²⁴ Werner, Gunda, “Überall schlägt uns Angst entgegen: Das Mission Manifest zwischen Untergangs-szenario und Errettung als Ausdruck fortschreitender Binnencharismatisierung der römisch-katholischen Kirche”, in: Nothelle-Wildfeuer, Ursula/Striet, Magnus, *Einfach nur Jesus? Eine Kritik am Mission Manifest*, Freiburg 2018, 11–33, here: 31.

⁴²⁵ Rahner, Karl, “Selbsterfahrung und Gotteserfahrung”, in: *Schriften zur Theologie*, vol. 10, Zu-rich/Einsiedeln/Cologne 1972, 134.

of human reality. It seems to me that there is a need for a different manner of discussion within the Church especially in times like the present, when right-wing populists are offering simple solutions to the numerous people in our society who feel perplexed by the complex changes going on around them in the age of globalisation. If we fail to bring about such a manner of discussion, we will merely see a replication within the Church of what is already being observed with concern in society at large.

My final wish is that the instigators of the *Mission Manifesto* should consciously be different and remain that way. It would be good if, while deliberately remaining different, they were to display a little more humility in their approach to discussions with others.

In response to the ten theses put forward by the initiators of the *Mission Manifesto* I have formulated five wishes that I have of them. I should now like to address five further wishes to the readers of the *Mission Manifesto*. My first wish is that others should ascertain what is different in the *Mission Manifesto* that puts a positive question mark against us as the Catholic Church. In this respect I find interesting what Theresa Mertes and Chris Cuhls wrote and published last year. Reflecting on the MEHR Conference, at which the manifesto was presented, they said: "The combination of music, presentations and prayers is in itself nothing fundamentally new, although the aesthetic and professional setting may well act as decisive factors."⁴²⁶ They refer here to the new style which can be observed. They also stress that this new style is rooted in a deeply felt spirituality. "Moreover, there would appear to be confirmation in the cautious resort to the Doctor of the Church, Augustine, and his teachings that you can only ignite in others what already burns within yourself. For there can be no mistaking the organisers' exceptional personal commitment to the event."⁴²⁷ The protagonists associated with the *Mission Manifesto* seemingly radiate a spirituality that strikes a chord with others. We should therefore allow ourselves to be provoked by the spirituality of those who wish to establish a new style of faith in the Church. The language they use, its attractive character and the sense of guidance it gives are markedly different from the linguistic styles

⁴²⁶ Mertes, Theresa/Cuhls, Chris, op. cit., 282.

⁴²⁷ Ibid.

normally encountered in Church discussions. Perhaps this different linguistic style can help to breathe new life into the customary style of communication within the Catholic Church.

My second wish is that the readers of the *Mission Manifesto* should ignore the half-baked theological notions to be found in some formulations in the book, which was published, after all, within the space of just a few months. If the remarks made by the initiators about how the book came into being are correct, the idea for it came about in the summer of 2017. The book was subsequently presented to the general public in January 2018. Anyone with an inkling of publication processes will know that the manuscript must have been produced in great haste. It is obvious that some of the formulations should be taken with a pinch of salt. Apart from which, the authors of the contributions are concerned not so much with offering an analysis as with urging other people to act.

My third wish is that there should be recognition of the challenges to our Christian spirituality that are formulated in the *Mission Manifesto*. Its instigators are not concerned primarily with theological reflection but with religious experience. We theologians certainly need to ask ourselves how personal theological reflection relates to personal religious experiences. Even if the professionalism of us theologians, with which our personal identity, our self-image and not least our social capital is largely intertwined, has a good deal to do with the professionalism of our theological reflection, this must never be allowed to obscure the more fundamental significance of religious experience as opposed to theological reflection.

Karl Rahner, a master of theological reflection, pointed again and again to the primacy of religious experience over an abstract knowledge of faith. This was something he stressed in 1969 during a lecture in Koblenz: "While it may be the case that experience as such and conceptually objectivising reflection on such experience may never be completely separable, the dimensions of experience and of objectivising reflection on that experience are never identical. Reflection never quite catches up with the original experience."⁴²⁸

⁴²⁸ Rahner, Karl, lecture given at the Catholic Academy in Koblenz on 22 October 1969, published in: *Schriften zur Theologie*, vol. IX, Einsiedeln 1970, 161–176.

My fourth wish is that the readers of the *Mission Manifesto* should think about and take up the challenges involved in a drive to evangelise. Because there can be no doubt that the *Mission Manifesto* is a book which is intended by the initiators, like Pope Francis in his missionary Apostolic Exhortation *Evangelii Gaudium*, to shake up the Church and put it “permanently in a state of mission”^{429,430}

My final wish is that the readers of the *Mission Manifesto* should not be over-confident in their approach to the manifesto but rather enter discussions with a little more humility. The *Mission Manifesto* initiative exhibits a style which is alien to many of us and which some also find repulsive. However, given the experience that churches worldwide have gathered with Pentecostal, Evangelical and Free Church movements, it makes little sense to hastily dismiss or exclude them. The experience of other local churches, especially in Latin America and Africa, with Pentecostal, Evangelical and Free Church movements has shown again and again that: “Only an open and honest dialogue can help to find the right way to deal with this movement and to adopt a constructive approach to a coexistence that is inevitable.”⁴³¹ A debate involving polemics or exclusion is considered an ineffectual means of fostering Christian unity.

Ecumenical Challenge and Opportunity

The *Mission Manifesto* initiative can be classified as part of a movement in which Pentecostal and Evangelical religious styles are making inroads into the Catholic Church in Germany. Germany is now witnessing on a very “modest scale” a development which has been

⁴²⁹ EG 25

⁴³⁰ In his first major interview, which he granted to Antonio Spadaro, Pope Francis made clear his un-understanding of a pastoral ministry or mission that is in keeping with the times: “Instead of being just a church that welcomes and receives by keeping the doors open, let us try also to be a church that finds new roads, that is able to step outside itself and go to those who do not attend Mass, to those who have quit or are indifferent.”; (cf. Spadaro, Antonio, “Interview with Pope Francis”, ed. by Andreas R. BAtlogg SJ., Freiburg i.Br. 2013, 49).

⁴³¹ Feneberg, Valentin/Müller, Johannes, Evangelikale – Pfingstkirchen – Charismatiker: Neue religiöse Bewegungen als Herausforderung für die katholische Kirche. Systematische Zusammenfassung der Ergebnisse der internationalen Konferenz Rom 09. – 11.04.2013 (Forschungsergebnisse, No. 6), op. cit., 26; cf. Vellguth, Klaus, “Pentekostalismus als ökumenische Herausforderung: Kontext: Afrika”, in: Ulin Agan, Polycarp, Pentekostalismus – Pfingstkirchen: Vortragsreihe Akademie Völker und Kulturen St. Augustin, vol. 38, Siegburg 2017, 139–159.

under way on other continents for many years now. In the age of post-modern pluralism there is not only the phenomenon of multi-religiousness, but also an increasing fragmentation of Christianity, of which Cardinal Koch has written that it must be “seen as a trend running counter to the original efforts to achieve greater unity among the Christian churches and church communities”⁴³². For a long time the increasing fragmentation of Christianity caused by the emergence of Pentecostal and Evangelical churches was seen merely as a hostile threat. In the Catholic Church and in Catholic theology this led initially to a debate dominated by apologetics in which there was talk of Pentecostal developments as an object of personal observation. This discussion was marked by reservations and insinuations, and it is perfectly understandable that the Pentecostal side responded to the way it was conducted by the Catholic side by adopting a tit-for-tat approach. It took a while for both sides to realise that mutual demonization is not useful and that Pentecostal Christians and the Pentecostal movement are not objects of personal observation but subjects engaged in discussion on an equal footing. “Only an open and honest dialogue can help to find the right way to deal with this movement and to adopt a constructive approach to a coexistence that is inevitable”⁴³³ was the consensus arrived at during an international conference on the phenomenon of Pentecostalism organised by the German Bishops’ Conference. “A debate involving polemics or exclusion was considered an ineffectual means of fostering Christian unity. Instead, a plea was issued for acceptance and mutual respect, which is ultimately rooted in the recognition of religious freedom, and a call made for a ‘pluralism of dialogues’.”⁴³⁴

The fact that Pentecostal tendencies have now found their way into the Catholic Church in the form of the *Mission Manifesto* may strike many people as out of place and some as distressing. The point, however, is to read the signs of the time and, if at all possible, to understand them. Let me, therefore, end with the question: What does Pentecostalism have that is perhaps lacking in the Catholic Church? And what does the Holy Spirit wish to tell us about the Pentecostal churches and the success they enjoy?

⁴³² Koch, Kurt, “Vorwort”, in: Feneberg, Valentin/Müller, Johannes, op. cit., 5.

⁴³³ Feneberg, Valentin/Müller, Johannes, op. cit., 26.

⁴³⁴ In view of the 35,000 churches calling themselves Christian which exist around the world, ecumenism has no other choice but to pursue a pluralism of dialogues.

The Catholic Charismatic Renewal in the world

Claude Nonis

The emergence of this Charismatic Renewal goes back to the 1960's. The Ecumenical Council of Vatican II from 1962-1965 and the manifestations of the Spirit at a retreat in 1967 at Duquesne University in Pennsylvania have primarily paved the way for the Charismatic Movement in the Catholic Church.

In this article, we briefly look at three areas that seem important in the understanding of the Charismatic Movement in the Catholic Church. Firstly, historical background will show how the development and realisation of renewal thought patterns have taken place among academic writers, ecclesial leaders and movements in the Church. Secondly, we concentrate on the background that was influential in guiding the nucleus of charismatic expressions in the Catholic Church. Thirdly, we shall study the slow but steady process of formal recognition of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal by the Catholic Church. The historical setting shows the long process involved in the preparation and creation of the Catholic Charismatic Movement.

Historical Antecedents: doctrinal and theological roots

Historical investigations reveal that there have been various attempts towards the renewal of the Church at the ecclesiastical, pastoral and theological levels. Certain encyclicals, theological writings, pastoral and ecclesial initiatives contributed to the convening of Vatican II.

The publication of Pope Leo XIII's encyclical letter (1897) on the Holy Spirit, *Divinum Illud Munus*,⁴³⁵ is of prime importance in the history of the Catholic Church, as this encyclical is said to have

⁴³⁵ Acta Sanctae Sedis, No. 29 (1896–97), 644–658 (The encyclical, 'On the Holy Spirit' was issued on 9th May 1897).

laid the foundation for the Catholic Charismatic Renewal.⁴³⁶ In this document, the Pope directed the Church to a new appreciation of the Holy Spirit and the gifts of the Spirit. He expressed his desire for an intimate rapport with and experience of the Holy Spirit on the part of the faithful.⁴³⁷

These enduring endeavours of the Pope were in fact a result of an idea expressed by an Italian village lady, the foundress of the Oblate Sisters of the Holy Spirit in Lucca, Italy, the Blessed Elena Guerra (1835–1914). She wrote to Pope Leo XIII suggesting that Catholics should say a special novena to the Holy Spirit.⁴³⁸ The Pope not only read her letter but also, to many people's surprise, he formally proclaimed the novena an approved practice of the Church.⁴³⁹ In Elena's second letter, she urged that this devotion to the Holy Spirit become a universal observance of the Church every year. Six months later, this suggestion became a reality with the encyclical letter on the Holy Spirit.⁴⁴⁰ Consequently, a good many Catholics from all backgrounds concentrated their attention on the Holy Spirit.⁴⁴¹

On 1st January 1901, Pope Leo XIII "[...] dedicated the twentieth century to the Holy Spirit intoning the *Veni Creator Spiritus* in the name of the whole Church [...]."⁴⁴² The Pope exhorted the faithful to return to the Pentecostal experience of the first Christian community as a result of his receptivity to the Holy Spirit.

At the same time, we find some synchronisation at the level of theological research on the Holy Spirit especially in Germany in the writings of Johann Adam Moehler (1796–1838)⁴⁴³ and Matthias Scheeben (1835–88). Both authors became the focus of attention of

⁴³⁶ O'Connor, Edward, "The Hidden Roots of the Charismatic Renewal in the Catholic Church", in: Synon, Vinson (ed.), *Aspects of Pentecostal-Charismatic Origins*, New Jersey 1975, 171.

⁴³⁷ Martinez, Salvatore, "Renewal in the Spirit: Testimonies by the Movements and Communities", in: *The Ecclesial Movements in the Pastoral Concern of the Bishops*, Vatican City 2000, 175.

⁴³⁸ A nine-day cycle of special prayer in between the feasts of Ascension and Pentecost.

⁴³⁹ Cf. *Acta Sanctae Sedis*, No. 27 (1894–95), 645–647.

⁴⁴⁰ Cf. Gaudet, Val, "A Woman and the Pope", in: *New Covenant*, No. 3 (1973) 4, 4–6.

⁴⁴¹ Cf. Synan, Vinson, "Pentecostal Roots", in: id. (ed.), *The Century of the Holy Spirit 1901–2001*, Nashville 2001, 36.

⁴⁴² Martinez, Salvatore, op. cit., 175.

⁴⁴³ Cf. in particular, the book, 'Unity in the Church', issued in 1825.

the theologians of the time regarding the function of the third person of the Divine in the personal lives of Christians. Catholic tradition and theology have always maintained the belief in the miraculous aspects of life in spite of pessimistic reactions by reformers like Luther and Calvin. Yet the investigations by Augustus Neander (1789-1850), a researcher of Church history in the Lutheran Church, and also Humbert Clérissac (1864-1914), a French Dominican, have had a great impact upon subsequent optimistic explorations in theology concerning the role of the Holy Spirit and charism in the life of the Church.⁴⁴⁴

Further, the encyclical, *Mystici Corporis*, by Pius XII in 1943⁴⁴⁵ called the Holy Spirit the soul of the mystical body of Christ, who is the life-giver and source of communion. The academic writings of Yves Congar and Karl Rahner on the role of the Holy Spirit in the body of Christ prior to Vatican II contributed to establishing a conducive setting for the acceptance of the Holy Spirit in the right perspective.⁴⁴⁶ Thereby, the Catholic hierarchy attached due importance to this facet of belief.⁴⁴⁷

These theological explorations with regard to the Holy Spirit and charisms have been undertaken by a limited number of theologians during the above-mentioned periods, especially from the late eighteenth century up to the period of Vatican II.⁴⁴⁸ Moreover, the movements of liturgy, Bible, ecumenism and laity were at the forefront in showing the dire need for renewal in the first half of the twentieth century. Even though these currents did not explicitly speak of the Holy Spirit and charism, the contributions, investigations and implications of these movements stood them in good stead towards the ultimate realisation of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal.⁴⁴⁹

The above explanations illustrate the historical development of renewal thought patterns in the Catholic Church. The faithful and the

⁴⁴⁴ O'Connor, Edward, op. cit., 173-174.

⁴⁴⁵ Cf. Acta Sanctae Sedis, No. 35 (1943), 193-248 (The encyclical 'The Mystical Body of Christ' was issued on 29th June 1943).

⁴⁴⁶ Cf. Gelpi, Donald L., "Discerning the Spirit among Catholic Charismatics", in: Dialog: A Journal of Theology, No. 41 (2002) 1, 27. The important consideration of the underpinnings of the Holy Spirit before, during and after Vatican II will be treated in the second chapter of our project.

⁴⁴⁷ Cf. O'Connor, Edward, op. cit., 171.

⁴⁴⁸ Cf. ibid., 175.

⁴⁴⁹ Ibid., 176-180; Synan, Vinson, In the Latter Days: The Outpouring of the Holy Spirit in the Twentieth Century, Fairfax, Virginia 1984, 101-106.

hierarchy sensed the need for some transformation in the Catholic Church, but it had not yet become a reality. Thus, Vatican II became the place where the groundwork was prepared doctrinally for a renewal of the Church. Pope John XXIII, who started on this wide-ranging expedition, is esteemed for his bold step.

The Role of Vatican II: Search for a New Pentecost

Pope John XXIII was considered a transitional Pope because of his age. It was as if he was not expected to embark on massive undertakings. When he first conceived this idea of an ecumenical Council, he consulted Mgr. Tardini, whose reply was positive. Yet when Pope John XXIII saw a negative reaction to this idea in the face of his personal secretary, Mgr. Loris Capovilla, he said to him: "I can see what you are thinking. You are saying to yourself: the Pope is too old for this sort of adventure. But, Don Loris, you are too cautious! When we believe that an inspiration comes to us from the Holy Spirit, we must follow it: what happens after that is not our responsibility."⁴⁵⁰ Here, Pope John XXIII insisted on the necessity of listening to the promptings of the Holy Spirit and setting them in motion. Another remarkable element was prevalent in his life. Cardinal Leon Joseph Suenens has explained that on one occasion, Pope John XXIII took a guest to his personal library, showed him some of his work written during his tenure as the patriarch of Venice, and asked: "Do you know what I feel when I look at these volumes?" The Pope hesitated a moment and then said, "I feel sincere."⁴⁵¹ In fact, sincerity was a hallmark of his life, and he had a genuine love and need for the renewal of the mission of the Church.

Accordingly, on 25th January 1959, while announcing his plan to convene Vatican II, Pope John XXIII prayed that the windows of the Church be opened to God's breath. In pronouncing that the Church indeed needed a breath of fresh air, symbolically he threw wide open the closed doors of the Vatican.⁴⁵² It was a shocking revelation to

⁴⁵⁰ Suenens, Léon-Joseph, *Memories and Hopes*, Dublin 1992, 65. Cardinal Suenens heard these words from Pope John XXIII himself.

⁴⁵¹ Suenens, Léon-Joseph, *A Man Sent from God: A Homily Delivered at the Opening of the Second Session of Vatican Council II*, in *Memory of Pope John XXIII*, Dublin 1992, 12.

⁴⁵² Cf. John, Cyril, *Spurred by the Spirit, Reflections on the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in the New Millennium*, New Delhi 2007, 4.

many, but he was aware of the need for such a move.⁴⁵³ In preparing for the Council, the Pope asked all the faithful to pray fervently for a new manifestation of the Holy Spirit.

Renew Thy wonders in this our day, as by a new Pentecost. Grant to Thy Church that, being of one mind and steadfast in prayer with Mary, the Mother of Jesus, and following the lead of blessed Peter, it may advance the reign of our Divine Savior, the reign of truth and justice, the reign of love and peace. Amen.⁴⁵⁴

For Pope John XXIII, the dream of a Church increasingly filled with the Holy Spirit must have been so compelling that he suggested, prior to the Council, the reading of the Acts of the Apostles and a new embodiment of that same preparation as when the disciples were together in the Upper Room preparing to receive the Spirit (Ac 1,14). This was a bold step taken by Pope John XXIII. Though he was elected to be a transitional Pope, no one would have predicted that he would convene a Council of this nature.⁴⁵⁵

Pope Paul VI in his turn took up the prayer of John XXIII and asked the Lord to grant us a new Pentecost. As Cardinal Suenens observed: "He has expressed this wish insistently and frequently, saying that the Church today needs first and foremost the miracle of Pentecost: the wind and fire and spiritual power which is the Holy Spirit."⁴⁵⁶ The Pope's passionate prayer and wish could create among people a longing for a sanctified wind to drive away dryness,⁴⁵⁷ lethargy, ritualism,⁴⁵⁸ clericalism,⁴⁵⁹ authority,⁴⁶⁰ and formalism,⁴⁶¹

⁴⁵³ Cf. Lamberigts, Mathijs, "Vatican II: A Short History", in: Eastern Journal of Dialogue and Culture, No. 2 (2009) 1, 9.

⁴⁵⁴ Abbott, Walter M. (ed.), *The Documents of Vatican II*, London 1966, 793.

⁴⁵⁵ O'Connor, Edward, op. cit., 183.

⁴⁵⁶ Suenens, Léon-Joseph, *A New Pentecost?*, London 1975, x–xi.

⁴⁵⁷ Cf. Bruner, Frederick Dale, *The Theology of the Holy Spirit: The Pentecostal Experience and the New Testament Witness*, Michigan 1970, 54.

⁴⁵⁸ Cf. Eilers, Franz-Josef (ed.), "The Spirit at Work in Asia Today: Office of Theological Concerns (OTC)", in: *For All the Peoples of Asia*, vol. 3, Quezon 2002, 317.

⁴⁵⁹ Cf. Gutzler, Antoinette, "Journeying to the Other Side: Beyond Previously Accepted Boundaries", *East Asian Pastoral Review*, No. 42 (2005) 1/2, 15; Ker, Ian, *The New Movements: a Theological Introduction, New Movements and Communities in the Life of the Church*, London 2001, 10.

⁴⁶⁰ Cf. Koodapuzha, Xavier, "Crisis in the Renewal", in: *Jeevadharma*, No. 9 (1979) 52, 269.

⁴⁶¹ Cf. Suenens, Léon-Joseph, *A New Pentecost?*, 103.

and to produce an overall renewal in the Church.⁴⁶² This much anticipated and opportune Council was, according to Aloysis Pieris, "the first ever renewalist council," "the first ever Ecumenical Council of the World-Church," and "the first pastoral synod."⁴⁶³ This Council was indeed a new start and not at all an extension of Vatican I.⁴⁶⁴ It was a new beginning, and its sole intention was to lead the Church to newness of life in all its aspects. "The purpose of the council [...] was a Pentecostal renewal of the Church in all its dimensions."⁴⁶⁵

No one would have expected such a turning point in the history of the Church. It was indeed a shocking disclosure to every Christian that the revitalisation of Catholic life would take place with the exercise of the gifts of the Holy Spirit mentioned in I Cor 12. Likewise, the judicious intervention of Cardinal Suenens in Vatican II's proceedings and later the ratification of a chapter (GS 12) in the Constitution of the Church regarding charisms were momentous in the history of the Catholic Church. What Cardinal Suenens had in mind doctrinally became a reality in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, becoming manifest among the laity in the United States of America after three years.⁴⁶⁶ Perspectives connected to the formation of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal reveal correlations to Pentecostalism.

Manifestations of Catholic Renewal Experience

Saturday 18th February 1967 was another day of Pentecost. The power of the Holy Spirit fell upon a group of Roman Catholics

⁴⁶² During the discussion of the document 'Dogmatic Constitution on the Church,' in an exciting intervention, Bishop de Smedt of Bruges declared the urgent need for a change from 'triumphalism', 'juridicalism' and 'clericalism' in the Church. Some transformation in the affairs of the Church was deeply felt at that time. See Philips, Gerard, "Dogmatic Constitution on the Church: History of the Constitution", in: Vorgrimler, Herbert (ed.), *Commentary on the Documents of Vatican II*, New York 1966, 109; "Editorial: Discernment, Direction and Harmony", in: *Renewal*, No. 46 (August/ September 1973), 3.

⁴⁶³ Pieris, Aloysis, *Give Vatican II a Chance: Yes to Incessant Renewal, No to Reform of Reforms: An Appeal to the Lay, Religious and Clerical Leaders of the Asian Churches*, Ragama, Sri Lanka 2010, 1. Pieris presents three reasons for calling Vatican II the first pastoral council. 1. For not devoting time to defending the teachings and position of the Church. 2. For opening her vistas towards other Christian communities, other religions and the everyday world. 3. For minimising the distance between the Church and Jesus the Lord.

⁴⁶⁴ Cf. *ibid.*, 4.

⁴⁶⁵ Cf. *ibid.*, 6.

⁴⁶⁶ Cf. Hocken, Peter, *The Glory and the Shame: Reflections on the 20th Century Outpouring of the Holy Spirit*, Surrey 1994, 19.

at a retreat house north of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Most of them were students from Duquesne University.⁴⁶⁷ It was the conviction of some of these young people that human solutions will not be effective for the social and religious issues facing the country. So they went for a weekend of prayer and fasting.⁴⁶⁸ They were members of the university who were taking an active part in associations concerned with liturgy, ecumenism, human rights and world peace. Dorothy and Kevin Ranaghans wrote:

In spite of all this they felt there was something lacking in their individual lives. They couldn't quite put their finger on it but somehow there was emptiness, a lack of dynamism, a sapping of strength in their lives of prayer and action. It was as if their lives as Christians were too much their own creation, as if they were moving forward under their own power and of their own will. It seemed to them that the Christian life wasn't meant to be a purely human achievement.⁴⁶⁹

Among those who attended, many had read David Wilkerson's 'The Cross and the Switchblade'.⁴⁷⁰ The professors did delve into the inner self of the pastor in chapter 21 of the book, where he said, from experience, "The Holy Spirit is what you need."⁴⁷¹ They had also read St. Paul and the Acts of the Apostles. Some had recited the Sequence from the Octave of Pentecost, "Come, Holy Spirit." In these ways they had prepared, prior to the weekend, for a fresh outpouring of the Spirit. At that particular moment, there was not a plan for a prayer service as such, but a birthday party for one of the colleagues on the weekend retreat.⁴⁷² One of the students, Patty Gallagher Mansfield, shared the experience as follows:

I wandered into the upstairs chapel, not to pray but to tell any students there to come down to the party. Yet, when I entered and knelt in the presence of Jesus in the Blessed Sacrament, I literally

⁴⁶⁷ Hollenweger, Walter J., *Pentecost between Black and White*, Dublin 1974, 77.

⁴⁶⁸ Suenens, Léon-Joseph, *A New Pentecost?*, 72.

⁴⁶⁹ Ranaghan, Dorothy/Ranaghan, Kevin, *Catholic Pentecostals*, Indiana 1971, 7.

⁴⁷⁰ Wilkerson, David/Sherrill, John/Sherrill, Elizabeth, *The Cross and the Switchblade*, Old Tappan, NJ 1964. Most of the students must have read, and were familiar with this Christian book.

⁴⁷¹ Laurentin, René, *Catholic Pentecostalism*, London 1977, 12.

⁴⁷² Hocken, Peter, "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal", in: Synan, Vinson (ed.), *The Century of the Holy Spirit*, Nashville 2001, 209. He has written widely on the history and theology of the charismatic movement.

trembled with a sense of awe before His majesty [...]. I prayed, 'Father, I give my life to you. Whatever you ask of me, I accept [...]' [...] In the next moment, I found myself prostrate, flat on my face, and flooded with an experience of the merciful love of God, a love that is totally undeserved, yet lavishly given [...]. Within the next hour God sovereignly drew many of the students into the chapel. Some were laughing, others crying.⁴⁷³

To their astonishment, they tangibly encountered the mighty presence of the Spirit. She goes on to say that there was indeed a birthday party arranged for them, but by God, in the Chapel. This experience of the Holy Spirit marked the start of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal.⁴⁷⁴ As this incident took place in a Catholic setting, the ecclesial reactions to it were positive. But the implications for the Catholic Church would have been different if it had happened in a Pentecostal milieu.⁴⁷⁵ With the passage of time, the Charismatic Renewal was recognised in the Catholic Church as an ecclesial movement.

This event, known as the 'Duquesne Weekend,' is generally recognised as the initial Catholic Charismatic prayer meeting.⁴⁷⁶ Almost all historical accounts of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal record the 'Duquesne Event' as the sole event marking its beginning.⁴⁷⁷ Nevertheless, numerous important personages, for example Francis MacNutt (1967) of the United States of America, Javier Gracia Herreros (1972) of Colombia, Mathew Naickomparambil (1970) of India,⁴⁷⁸ have been sharing in the Renewal Experience for 30 to 40 years without having any direct linkage to the 'Duquesne Event.'

⁴⁷³ Mansfield, Patti Gallagher, "A Prayer Lavishly Answered", in: The Pontifical Council for the Laity (ed.), *The Beauty of Being a Christian: Movements in the Church*, Vatican City 2006, 113–114.

⁴⁷⁴ Cf. ibid., 114. She describes how some prayed in tongues; others (like me) felt a burning sensation coursing through their hands. One of the professors walked in and exclaimed 'What is the Bishop going to say when he hears that all these kids have been baptised in the Holy Spirit!' See also Ker, Ian, *The New Movements: A Theological Introduction*, 4.

⁴⁷⁵ Cf. Hocken, Peter, *The Glory and the Shame*, 37.

⁴⁷⁶ Cf. Hocken, Peter, "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal", in: Synan, Vinson (ed.), *The Century of the Holy Spirit*, Nashville 2001, 209; Lehmann, David, "Dissidence and Conformism in Religious Movements: What Difference Separates the Catholic Charismatic Renewal and Pentecostal Churches?", in: *Concilium* (2003) 3, 123.

⁴⁷⁷ Sullivan, Francis A., *Charisms and Charismatic Renewal: A Biblical and Theological Study*, Oregon 2004, 14.

⁴⁷⁸ Burgess, Stanley M., "Pentecostalism in India: An Overview", in: *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies*, No. 1 (2001) 4, 94. The author explains that Mathew received Baptism in the Spirit on his own. A detailed description will be given in 6 in the second chapter.

After becoming a Dominican priest, MacNutt went on to further studies in speech and communication at Northwestern University in order to become a seminary professor. He became involved with a group of Christian seminary professors and became the executive director of a Christian Preaching Conference. At an annual event, MacNutt was introduced to Christian Healing by a Protestant colleague. Subsequently, he received Baptism in the Holy Spirit at a Protestant retreat in Tennessee in August 1967.⁴⁷⁹

MacNutt was thus somewhat apart from the central axis of the Catholic Charismatic movement, an axis that moved from Duquense to Notre Dame, Indiana and to Ann Arbor, Michigan. Nonetheless, he was one of the principal figures in introducing U.S. Catholics to the healing ministry.⁴⁸⁰

Similarly, Javier Garcia Herreros of Colombia is seen as influential in bringing the Catholic Charismatic Renewal to several Latin American countries. He too received Baptism in the Spirit through non-Catholic Christian friends. Garcia Herreros's anointing in the Spirit in Colombia led him to a Catholic Charismatic Renewal community which existed earlier.⁴⁸¹

So it is clear that, on the one hand, the Renewal Experience was initiated in the Catholic Church itself, while on the other, some people experienced renewal in other Christian Groups. But what is remarkable is that they happened in a certain period of time. "What no one could have expected is that what was theory in the documents of the Council has since become for many Catholics a matter of personal experience."⁴⁸² The faithful started to have a new dimension to their spiritual life in this way.

The Catholic Charismatic Renewal as a movement with a background in Protestant revivalism and Pentecostalism entered the Roman Catholic Church and had been finally received and accepted

⁴⁷⁹ Cleary, Edward L., "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Revitalisation Movements and Conversion", in: Steigenga, Timothy J./Cleary Edward L. (eds.), *Conversion of a Continent: Contemporary Religious Change in Latin America*, London 2007, 161.

⁴⁸⁰ Ibid., 161.

⁴⁸¹ Ibid., 161–162.

⁴⁸² Sullivan, Francis A., op. cit., 14.

by Church authority,⁴⁸³ though she perhaps looked askance at the Catholic Charismatic Groups initially.⁴⁸⁴ Also, most of the expressions of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal have been in line with what was experienced in the first Christian community.⁴⁸⁵

It is estimated that one hundred million Roman Catholics have experienced Charismatic Renewal since 1967.⁴⁸⁶ From the first outpouring of the Holy Spirit in the Catholic Church in 1967, now almost twenty million Catholics attend charismatic prayer meetings or events each month. According to International Catholic Charismatic Renewal Services in Rome (ICCRS), this Renewal is gaining ground in 238 countries.⁴⁸⁷ As we have explicated above, it has taken a number of years for the Catholic Charismatic Renewal's ecclesial acknowledgement, from the closure of Vatican II and the 'Duquesne Event,' to its corresponding official introduction into the Catholic Church.

Gradual Recognition by the Church Hierarchy

Cardinal Suenens, former Archbishop of Malines-Brussels and one of the four moderators of Vatican II, was undoubtedly one of the foremost proponents of Charismatic Renewal in the Catholic Church.⁴⁸⁸ He was open to the outpouring of the Spirit in Pentecostal Churches and the Catholic Church (especially in the United States of America), so much so that he desired to experience the same in the Catholic Church worldwide. He personally went to the United States of America to witness this new phenomenon.⁴⁸⁹ He even convinced Pope Paul

⁴⁸³ Cf. Hocken, Peter, "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal", op. cit., 210–211; Quesnel, Michel, "Born Again: Baptism and the Spirit, Discerning who Builds the Church: A Catholic Response", in: Concilium 3 (1996), 116–117; "Editorial: Discernment, Direction and Harmony", in: Renewal, No. 46 (1973), 2.

⁴⁸⁴ Cf. Quesnel, Michel, op. cit., 116.

⁴⁸⁵ Cf. Harper, Michael, "Charismatic Renewal like Early Christianity", in: id. (ed.), *Mysticism and the Gifts*, Rome 1973, 4–5.

⁴⁸⁶ Cf. Cleary, Edward L., "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Revitalisation Movements and Conversion", in: Steigenga, Timothy J./Cleary Edward L. (eds.), *Conversion of a Continent: Contemporary Religious Change in Latin America*, London 2007, 158; Quebedeaux, Richard, *The Origins, Development and Significance of Neo-Pentecostalism*, New York 1976, 70.

⁴⁸⁷ Cf. Boucher, John/Boucher, Therese, *An Introduction to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal*, Ohio 2004, 3. They are religious educators, authors and national leaders of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in New Jersey.

⁴⁸⁸ Hocken, Peter, "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal", op. cit., 216.

⁴⁸⁹ Cf. Fitcher, Joseph H., "How It Looks to a Social Scientist?", in: *New Catholic World* 217

VI to recognise and encourage this gift of the Spirit not in isolation but at the very heart of the Church.⁴⁹⁰ As a result, the First International Congress was held outside Rome in Grottaferrata in 1973, followed by the Second International Leaders' Conference, where Pope Paul VI pronounced that "the Renewal is a blessing for the Church and the world." He asked the question as to how one could "fail to take all means in order that it may remain so."⁴⁹¹

From 1974 to 1982, Cardinal Suenens served as the adviser appointed by the Holy See to oversee the integration of the Renewal into the heart of the Catholic Church.⁴⁹² Cardinal Suenen's endeavour was notable in introducing the Catholic Charismatic Renewal into ordinary Catholic life by promoting its overall reception and expansion. It was a painstaking journey, one that did not attract a lot of allies in the Vatican.⁴⁹³

The International Catholic Charismatic Renewal Services is the main organising body of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal. This organisation was sanctioned as a private association of the faithful by the Pontifical Council for the laity in 1993. The principal objective of this institute is the direction of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, under the close supervision of the Holy See, especially through the Episcopal Advisor of the Pontifical Council for the Laity. This association attempts to maintain the unitary nature of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, as many differences could possibly arise.⁴⁹⁴ More importantly, this association recognises the global character of

(1974), 244; Martin, Ralph, "The International Spread of the Renewal", in: *Pentecost Today* April/Mai/Juni (2010), 6.

⁴⁹⁰ As revealed by Jean-Paul Durand, Pope Paul VI was not convinced about the Renewal Experience; he had his reservations, and he was critical of this tendency. So the assumption is that Cardinal Suenens must have contributed to enlightening Pope Paul VI. See: Durand, Jean-Paul, "Catholic Movements and Communities of the Faithful Which Arose in the Twentieth Century: Some Challenges to Canon Law", in: *Concilium* (2003) 3, 94–95.

⁴⁹¹ Pesare, Oreste (ed.), *Then Peter Stood Up...: Collection of the Popes' Addresses to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal from its Origin to the Year 2000*, Rome 2000, 19. He is the director of International Catholic Charismatic Services, Rome.

⁴⁹² Cf. Hocken, Peter, "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal", op. cit., 216.

⁴⁹³ Cf. McDonnell, Kilian, "Catholic Charismatic Renewal and Classical Pentecostalism: Growth and the Critique of a Systematic Suspicion", in: *One in Christ*, No. 23 (1987) 1/2, 42.

⁴⁹⁴ International Catholic Charismatic Renewal Services, "Articles of the Statutes Establishing International Catholic Charismatic Renewal Services as a Private Association of the Faithful Approved by the Pontifical Council for the Laity 1993", in: *Streams of Living Water: Autobiography of a Charis-matic Leader*, Nunawading 2000, 153–155. Formerly, this organisation was called the International Communication Office.

the manifestations of the Holy Spirit and lends its helping hand to make these charismatic phenomena a reality in specific life situations.⁴⁹⁵

The support and encouragement given to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, along with the recognition and expansion achieved by it during the pontificate of John Paul II, are causes for optimism.⁴⁹⁶ At the Fourth International Leaders' Conference in 1981, Pope John Paul II reiterated the words of Paul VI: the movement for the Renewal in the Spirit is "a chance for the world." He further added,

The Church has seen the fruits of your devotion [...]. We have noted with particular joy the way in which leaders of the renewal have more and more developed a broadened ecclesial vision [...]. We have likewise seen the signs of your generosity in sharing God's gifts with the unfortunate of this world [...].⁴⁹⁷

These words demonstrate the positive outlook of Pope John Paul II towards the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in the life of the Church. Another significant milestone was the gathering of various ecclesial movements and New Communities at St. Peter's Square in Rome on 30th May 1998 for the Pentecost Vigil. Representing more than fifty different movements, there were more than 400,000 members assembled for this service.⁴⁹⁸ In a historic message, Pope John Paul II addressed the participants:

Today, I would like to cry out to all of you gathered here in St. Peter's Square and to all Christians: Open yourselves meekly to the gifts of the Spirit! Accept gratefully and obediently the charisms which the Spirit never ceases to bestow on us! Do not forget that every charism is given for the common good, that is, for the benefit of the whole Church.⁴⁹⁹

Just as Pope John Paul II recognised the charismatic dimension of the Church and extended his support towards its realisation, Pope Benedict XVI showed the same enthusiasm in organising

⁴⁹⁵ Cf. Martin, Ralph, "The International Spread of the Renewal", op. cit., 6.

⁴⁹⁶ McDonnell, Kilian, op. cit., 42.

⁴⁹⁷ Pesare, Oreste (ed.), op. cit., 35.

⁴⁹⁸ Cf. John, Cyril, op. cit., 13.

⁴⁹⁹ Pope John Paul II, "Address of His Holiness Pope John Paul II on the Occasion of the Meeting with the Ecclesial Movements and the New Communities", in: The Pontifical Council for the Laity (ed.), *Movements in the Church*, Vatican City 1998, 221–222.

the Second World Congress of Ecclesial Movements and New Communities in 2006.⁵⁰⁰

In the words of Pope John Paul II, “[t]he Catholic Charismatic Renewal is a grace of renewal in the Holy Spirit with a worldwide character and many expressions in the Catholic Church, but it is neither uniform nor unified.”⁵⁰¹ This Renewal Experience, though international, is not identical everywhere, although some common ends have been delineated. Five central goals have been identified in the Preamble of the revised Statutes of International Catholic Charismatic Renewal Services, which were revised and approved by the Holy See on 9th May 2005.⁵⁰² They are:

1. To promote mature and continuous personal conversion to Christ (Mk 1,4; Mt 4,17).
2. To promote a decisive personal receptivity to the person, presence and power of the Holy Spirit (Ac 1,4-5, 8).
3. To promote the reception and use of spiritual gifts (*charismata*) (I Cor 12,4-11).
4. To promote the work of evangelisation in the power of the Holy Spirit (Ac 1,8; Mt 28, 19-20).
5. To promote ongoing growth in holiness (Lv 11,44-45, 19,2, 20,7; 1 Pe 1,15-16).

This Renewal Experience is a flow of grace that permits individuals and groups to share their experiences in different ways and forms, frequently quite independently of one another, showing various stages and modes of development. Yet they share the same fundamental experience and the same general goals.

⁵⁰⁰ Cf. Pope Benedict XVI, “Message of His Holiness Benedict XVI”, in: The Pontifical Council for the Laity (ed.), *The Beauty of Being a Christian. Movements in the Church*, Vatican City 2006, 7. Encouraging everyone and realising the significance of the movements belonging to the essence of the Church, he went to the extent of saying, “Today, the ecclesial movements and new communities are a luminous sign of the beauty of Christ and of the Church, his bride. You belong to the living structure of the Church.”

⁵⁰¹ Pesare, Oreste (ed.), *A Sign of Hope for All People: The Catholic Charismatic Renewal in the Heart of Pope John Paul II*, Vatican City 2005, 7.

⁵⁰² Ibid., 8.

Conclusion

In general, Pentecostals could not believe and Catholics found it difficult to accept this unexpected outburst of charismatic expression in the Catholic Church. Today, after some years of investigation and scrutiny, the Catholic Church has acknowledged the Catholic Charismatic Renewal to be a movement within its own ecclesial life. The same slow process of approval has been true of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Sri Lanka as well. This perspective becomes evident when we look into the Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Sri Lanka, which also came into being contemporaneous with the International Catholic Charismatic Renewal.

Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Guatemala. Enthusiasm and parish diaconia

Jakob Egeris Thorsen

A prayer group in Guatemala City

Doña Concha is a woman of about sixty-five.⁵⁰³ A retired nurse, she leads one of many Charismatic prayer groups in a Catholic community located on the outskirts of the fast-growing metropolis of Guatemala City. In socio-economic terms it is a neighbourhood inhabited by lower middle-class residents; most regular participants in this prayer group are housewives and some retired older men. The group of about 30 adults and ten accompanying children meets every Wednesday afternoon at a time when most young people are working. Doña Concha has been leading the group since 1985, when it evolved from a basic ecclesial community that no longer received supervision. The group meetings last for two hours and include Charismatic hymns of praise, prayers, personal testimonies of faith and lay sermons. They always end with a healing séance, during which Doña Concha lays her hands on the heads or aching limbs of those who have come forward and knelt down, praying loudly and speaking in tongues as she does so. This healing prayer session attracts many from the surrounding areas who do not belong to the prayer group but suffer from pain, depression and drug or alcohol abuse or believe they are possessed or influenced by demons. Doña Concha prays for the healing of those suffering or commands the demons to leave the possessed. After the laying on of hands most of the kneeling people fall to the ground, sometimes crying or smiling. Helpers are on hand to place them safely in the recovery position. They are what is termed "beaten by the spirit". The liberated are often violently sick during demon exorcisms, and the helpers rapidly remove the vomit with the

⁵⁰³ The meeting of a Charismatic prayer group described here took place in 2009. Doña Concha (pseudonym) is almost ten years older today, but still leads the prayer group described in detail in my book, see: Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, Charismatic Practice and Catholic Parish Life: The Incipient Pentecostalization of the Church in Guatemala and Latin America, Leiden 2015.

aid of newspaper. After the healing séance, during which the children play outside with a helper, everyone recites the Lord's Prayer and a Hail Mary together. They pray for God's blessing and then drink a cup of coffee with *pan dulce* (sweet bread). The meeting takes place in the community hall, a room that is also used by many other groups and for the religious instruction of children and young people. Doña Concha and her group of ten helpers also meet privately at her home once a week in order to prepare the meetings in the community centre, and this group also makes home visits to sick and lonely people once or twice a week. Although Doña Concha's group is almost completely independent, she nonetheless maintains a community affiliation. One third of the modest collection goes to the community fund. Doña Concha sat on the municipal council several times and she and some other helpers serve as lay readers and communion helpers or sing in one of the rhythmic choirs which perform and sing at the services. We will return to Doña Concha a little later, as she and her group illustrate the importance of the Charismatic Renewal for Catholic community life in Guatemala and Latin America.

Today, the Catholic Charismatic Renewal movement (CCR) is the largest movement within the Catholic Church in Guatemala and throughout Latin America. Theological analysis of the CCR concentrates chiefly on an examination of the impassioned spiritual experiences and the sometimes spectacular exploitation of so-called spiritual gifts in the context of religious study. This article therefore seeks to draw attention to the often invisible and frequently underestimated diaconal aspect of Charismatic prayer groups. Diaconia, here generally defined as Christian social practice, has traditionally been understood as one of the central expressions or dimensions of the Church, alongside liturgy (worship), martyria (proclamation or witness) and koinonia (fellowship).⁵⁰⁴ However, diaconia can be expressed and lived in various ways, namely as a specific charitable service to one's neighbour, in the form of prophetic diaconia which criticises unjust social or cultural structures and constructively attempts to reveal an alternative sphere of reference, or as political diaconia which is also actively involved in the field of politics in order to change the world for the better and make it

⁵⁰⁴ Cf. Mette, Norbert, Art. "Diakonia", in: Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche, vol. 5, Freiburg i. Br. 1996, 184.

more just.⁵⁰⁵ Diaconia can be closely linked to the community and emerge from it or be practised in a broader organisational framework, although it may be only partially linked to a church congregation. In Latin America, the base ecclesial communities and liberation theology are known predominantly for their prophetic diaconal commitment.⁵⁰⁶ This article begins by addressing the phenomenon of Charismatic Catholic Renewal in Latin America and Guatemala and goes on to describe the movement's diaconal profile and the ways in which it contrasts with liberation-oriented diaconia.

Charismatic Renewal in Latin America

The Charismatic Renewal Movement within the Catholic Church began in 1967 as part of the so-called "second wave", which saw Pentecostal revivalism spread to the more traditional denominations from the late 1950s onwards. In the case of the Catholic Church such openness to new forms of experience and expressions of piety was facilitated by the Second Vatican Council (1963–1965), and the phenomenon of Charismatic Renewal grew amid the enthusiasm and radical changes which characterised the post-conciliar period. During a retreat in February 1967, several faculty members and students of Duquesne University in Pittsburgh (USA) experienced an "outpouring of the Holy Spirit" and baptism in the Holy Spirit, which was accompanied by glossolalia. The movement grew rapidly and Charismatic prayer groups spread first to Catholic universities and then to many communities in the United States. In the early 1970s, North American priests ensured that Catholic Charismatic Renewal (CCR) spread to various Latin American countries, holding so-called "life in spirit" retreats at the invitation of local priests or bishops. Here Charismatic manifestations were introduced to participants in both theory and practice and many had spiritual experiences of a fervent and Charismatic nature. After their own initiation the participants (priests, nuns and dedicated lay people) brought Charismatic practices

⁵⁰⁵ Cf. Fretheim, Kjetil, "Dimensions of diaconia: the public, political and prophetic", in: *Diakonia*, No. 4 (2013), 67–80.

⁵⁰⁶ Cf. Martínez, Socorro/Mella, Pablo, "A Simple Church, the Seed of the Kingdom": Diakonia in the Re-launch of the Base Ecclesial Communities in Latin America", in: Krämer, Klaus/Vellguth, Klaus (eds.), *Theology and Diakonia – Faith in Action* (One World Theology, No. 3), Freiburg i. Br. 2013, 115–129.

to Catholic educational institutions and congregations, with the result that the movement subsequently developed into what was primarily a lay movement.⁵⁰⁷ In its first decade the CCR experienced a great deal of resistance in Latin America. On the one hand, many conservative bishops had serious misgivings, because, in its fervent expression of faith and its flat, democratic structure, the Renewal resembled the fast-growing Pentecostal churches in Latin America, whose piety differed so radically from its traditional Catholic equivalent. The bishops feared that the CCR could serve as a stepping stone for Catholics before they ultimately converted to the Protestant camp. This fear was not completely unfounded because, in its early days, the CCR did evince strongly anti-hierarchical tendencies and often hostile attitudes towards traditional Catholic (popular) piety, such as the veneration of saints.⁵⁰⁸ Indeed, some CCR prayer groups later established themselves as independent Protestant-Pentecostal communities, a phenomenon which still occurs from time to time. On the other hand, opposition to the CCR movement came from many reformist or liberation-oriented bishops who discerned in the movement's radical charismatic spirituality a shift away from the new-found orientation towards social justice and the "preferential option for the poor".⁵⁰⁹ Despite resistance from many sides the CCR continued to spread, becoming the numerically largest movement within the church in Latin America by the early 1980s. The late 1970s and the following decades witnessed a slow but steadily closer rapprochement between the CCR and the official Church, and the phenomenon of Renewal was gradually integrated into existing structures for lay people.

Today, in its fifth decade, the CCR is still by far the largest lay movement within the Church in Latin America. As the CCR is only a loosely-structured umbrella organisation and forms of Charismatic expression have now spread far beyond this movement, it is impossible to determine the movement's precise status and how high the number of Charismatic Catholics in Latin America actually is.

⁵⁰⁷ Cf. Chesnut, R. Andrew, *Competitive Spirits: Latin America's New Religious Economy*, Oxford 2003, 67–69; Cleary, Edward, *The Rise of Charismatic Catholicism in Latin America*, Tallahassee 2011, 30.

⁵⁰⁸ Cf. Chesnut, R. Andrew, *op. cit.*, 72.

⁵⁰⁹ Cf. Cleary, Edward, "The Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Revitalization Movements and Conversion", in: id./Steigenga, Timothy (eds.), *Conversion of a Continent: Contemporary Religious Change in Latin America*, New Brunswick 2007, 153–173.

In statistical terms there were at least 74 million Catholic Charismatics in Latin America at the turn of the millennium and it can be assumed that this figure has increased considerably since, a fact which emerges clearly from the more recent figures published by the Pew Forum cited earlier. Major national differences can be observed, however. Brazil is at the forefront of all studies, in part because the number of registered CCR followers there is very high and also because Charismatic/Pentecostal forms of expression and the practices pursued by the CCR and the Pentecostal churches have pervaded the general religious sphere, thus also reaching the Catholic community. A similar situation exists in Guatemala, where the proportion of Protestants (predominantly Pentecostal churches or so-called neo-Pentecostal faith communities) is very high, namely approximately 41 per cent, compared with 26 percent in Brazil.⁵¹⁰ Here, too, a "Pentecostalisation" of church life has been observed, with the result that about half of all Catholics can be described as "Charismatic", although perhaps only a tenth of these are (or have been) active in CCR groups. At this juncture, a brief explanation of the historical context is required, prior to an explanation of the significance of the extensive dissemination of Charismatic practice in Guatemala.

Charismatic Renewal in Guatemala

The CCR made its way to Guatemala thanks to North American priests (Harold Cohen SJ and Francis MacNutt OP) who were invited to speak there. Suffragan Bishop Ramiro Pellecer received baptism in the Holy Spirit during one of the first Charismatic meetings chaired by Father Cohen in 1973, an event which led to the CCR becoming closely associated with the institutional Church in the country's capital. In addition, the subsequent Suffragan Bishop Rodolfo Mendoza and Father Hugo Estrada SDB, the priest and author of numerous works on Charismatic spirituality, numbered among the first clergymen to join the movement, thus embedding the Charismatic Movement in the archdiocese dominated by the Guatemalan clergy.⁵¹¹ By contrast, the situation in the provinces, where foreign priests and nuns exerted a

⁵¹⁰ Cf. Pew Forum on Religion & Public Life, Religion in Latin America, Washington D.C. 2014, 14.

⁵¹¹ Cf. Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, op. cit., 31.

strong influence and where the association Acción Católica (Catholic Action) was the dominant form of lay organisation, was quite different. The CCR was frequently unwelcome there and banned by priests and lay leaders in the communities. There were several reasons for the resistance shown to the Charismatics. They were suspected of ignoring the dimension of social justice with their experiential spirituality, rooted heavily as it was in personal piety. In the late 1970s and early 1980s the civil war in Guatemala culminated in numerous military attacks on, and massacres of, the (indigenous) population. The refusal of followers and preachers to embrace the socio-political cause and take a stand against these injustices was perceived as treason by Acción Católica at a time when dozens of catechists and some priests were deliberately being murdered.⁵¹² Moreover, it proved difficult to integrate the enthusiastic followers of the CCR, with their very different interpretation of piety and new forms of expression, into the structures of the rural communities. As a result Catholic followers of the Charismatic Renewal movement usually built their own assembly houses during the 1980s and schisms arose in effect between the majority and the CCR followers in many places.⁵¹³ In just one example of this, the CCR was banned in the Huehuetenango diocese until 2012, while membership of a Charismatic prayer group was punished by exclusion from the receiving of the sacraments in many congregations.⁵¹⁴

A lack of agreement concerning the pastoral stance towards the CCR meant that the Guatemalan Bishops' Conference did not succeed in formulating a collective statement on the movement until 1986. In its pastoral letter *Renovados en el Espíritu* ("Renewed in the Spirit"), the CCR is praised for its ability to involve the laity and commit them to Christian life. On the other hand, the bishops also warn against a number of risks, such as fundamentalism in Bible reading and excessive emotionalism.⁵¹⁵ Over thirty years have passed since

⁵¹² Cf. Melander, Veronica, *The Hour of God? People in Guatemala Confronting Political Evangelicalism and Counterinsurgency (1976-1990)*, Uppsala 1999; Stoll, David, *Between Two Armies in the Ixil Towns of Guatemala*, New York 1993.

⁵¹³ Cf. Hoenes, Eric, "Towards an Ideology of Gesture: Gestures, Body Movement and Language Ide-ology among Q'eqchi'-Maya Catholics", in: *Beyond Logos: Extensions of the Language Ideology Par-adigm in the Study of Global Christianity(-ies)*, Special Section of Anthropological Quarterly, No. 84 (2011) 3, 595–630.

⁵¹⁴ Cf. Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, op. cit., 32.

⁵¹⁵ Cf. Conferencia Episcopal de Guatemala (CEG), *Renovados en el Espíritu: Instrucción*

this official recognition by the Bishops' Conference, and the CCR has since become an integral part of the Catholic Church in Guatemala. The CCR has matured as a revival movement over the years and is no longer as antagonistic as it once was towards the "average Catholics", who are often perceived as being "lukewarm". On the other hand, the institutional Church has integrated the Charismatics more effectively into the existing structures; today, they are often represented on parish councils and the councils of the dicasteries. Thanks to new evangelisation and the "Continental Mission" (2007) proclaimed by the Latin American Bishops' Conference in Aparecida (CELAM V), the church as a whole has drawn closer to both the CCR's priorities and linguistic usage.⁵¹⁶ As pointed out earlier, it is difficult to define the precise boundary between the Charismatic and non-Charismatic parts of the Guatemalan (or Latin American) Church in the wake of almost five decades of Charismatic Renewal. Charismatic practices, songs and forms of expression have spread far beyond the CCR and are now perceived in part as a common religious heritage. As early as the late 1990s anthropologists were lamenting the fact that there was no clear distinction in Brazil between CCR groups and the base ecclesial communities. Practices and songs were adopted reciprocally by the two groups and – despite their very different spirituality – both had the same potential to empower the poor and marginalised. The participants of both groups are encouraged to take responsibility for their own (religious and secular) lives and provided with support in the process.⁵¹⁷ This brings us back to Doña Concha's prayer group and the question of the diaconal side of the CCR.

The diaconal side of the Charismatic Renewal Movement

As the initial description of the prayer group in Guatemala City shows, the fervent Catholic Charismatic groups are not only dedicated to proclamation, praise and prayer, but also have a strong diaconal component both inside and outside the Church. They are communities which invite participants to expose their wounds (in both

Pastoral Colectiva de los Obispos de Guatemala sobre la Renovación Carismática, Guatemala 1986.

⁵¹⁶ Cf. Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, op. cit., 162.

⁵¹⁷ Cf. de Theije, Mario, "CEBs and Catholic Charismatics in Brazil", in: Smith, Christian/Prokopy, Joshua, *Latin American Religion in Motion*, New York 1999, 111–124.

soul and body) in order to seek healing from God through the ecclesial congregation.⁵¹⁸ The testimonies reveal life stories which show how the “pathogens of poverty” (violence, alcohol abuse, machismo, lack of education and health, dysfunctional families) negatively affect the lives of the participants.⁵¹⁹ In the prayer groups, some of which are self-help groups, participants learn how to deal with life’s problems more effectively, fighting addiction and circumventing destructive patterns of action by sharing their stories, listening to (biblical) paradigms and experiencing mutual comfort, mutual intercession, prayers for healing and liberation from demons. More than anything else the joyful surrender of the self to God dominates, which is experienced as a highly specific, divine form of self-communication in the context of Charismatic practice. Besides this internal form of diaconal ministry, the CCR groups in Guatemala almost always have external commitments. Most groups have a visitor service, during which sick or lonely people are visited and sometimes provided with food or medicine. Entertainment, preaching, comforting dialogue and concrete care often go hand in hand during these visits. In addition to their own ministry the Charismatic groups usually also participate in the forms of help organised by the congregation, the so-called *Pastoral Social*. Here food, clothing, school utensils, medicine and other items are collected or purchased and distributed to the needy in the community. Besides this diaconal work in the community, so-called “mega events”, such as the *Eventos Católicos* organised by Charismatic Catholics, also exist in Guatemala, which provides mobile medical treatment vans in which poor people can be examined and treated free of charge or very cheaply by specialist doctors. The *Eventos* have now also established a permanent clinic in Guatemala City.⁵²⁰ It is unfortunately impossible to describe the diaconal work performed by the CCR groups in all its diversity in this article, but it is sufficient to appreciate that this work is primarily a form of traditional, charitable diaconia, which has no prophetic or political dimension at first sight, but is instead very closely linked to religious proclamation. In addition to the ritual elements described above,

⁵¹⁸ Healing is at the heart of almost all Pentecostal and charismatic practice, see Brown, Candy Gunther, Global Pentecostal and Charismatic Healing, Oxford 2011.

⁵¹⁹ The term originates from Chesnut, R. Andrew, op. cit., 55.

⁵²⁰ Cf. <http://eventoscatólicos.org/> and the medical platform <http://www.todoensalud.com.gt/> (23.03.2018).

internal diaconal assistance focuses on the call for, and promotion of, personal conversion and a change in personal family life within the framework of traditional Catholic morality, which has adopted even stricter elements of the Protestant Pentecostal tradition, such as abstinence (from alcohol, tobacco and drugs). As far as external charitable assistance is concerned, Charismatic groups naturally also help people who do not belong to the CCR or the Catholic Church. However, the strong focus on the individual (and his or her family) does not mean that the CCR fails to issue prophetic criticism of social conditions. Although it is frequently not couched in the same sociological and juridical language as liberation-theological or even institutional church appeals and statements, the CCR does directly address corruption, abuse of power, machismo and lack of justice in Guatemala. However, the spectrum of possible solutions differs. As is the case with many Pentecostal and neo-Pentecostal groups, the CCR also seeks to bring about a “conversion of hearts” which, as if through a chain reaction from person to person, is intended to transform a republic marked by corruption and violence.⁵²¹ In addition, social and ethical input from the institutional Church (in circulars penned by bishops, for instance), social problems and their underlying dysfunctional structures in Guatemala are also addressed directly, taken up in lay sermons and exhortations issued by the CCR and passed on. Here, then, language and analysis aligned to liberation theology sometimes coalesces in an unusual manner with the language of the spiritually-focused interpretation of Charismatic Renewal and the conversion of the individual.⁵²² The question is therefore not necessarily whether diaconia rooted in liberation theology and diaconia based on Charismatic prophecy are mutually exclusive. After over 50 years' experience of basic ecclesial communities and 45 years after the emergence of Charismatic Renewal these movements are increasingly intertwined, especially at the community level. However, rapprochements can also increasingly be observed at the ecclesial and theological level. The momentum ignited by the Fifth General Assembly of the Latin American Bishops as well as intimations from Pope Francis demonstrate that, in church communication and in the pastoral

⁵²¹ Cf. O'Neill, Kevin Louis, *City of God: Christian Citizenship in Postwar Guatemala*, Berkeley 2009, 185; Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, op. cit., 146–148.

⁵²² Cf. Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, op. cit., 169.

priorities of the Church, fervently mediated personal conversion (“encounter with Jesus”) can indeed be combined effectively with strong social commitment and a prophetic social voice.⁵²³ When I met Doña Concha in Guatemala City again in 2014, she was deeply impressed by the new pope. She had watched Francis carry out a liberation from demons in St. Peter’s Square on EWTN-TV and she related how several priests in the archdiocese were now undergoing special training in exorcism.⁵²⁴ She said that the new Pope knew the poor people and cared for their needs. In the eyes of Doña Concha and perhaps a hundred million other Latin American Catholics “The Church of the Poor” is a Charismatic church in which diaconia, social justice, fervent spiritual experience and exorcism go hand in hand.

⁵²³ Cf. Arntz, Norbert, “Einführung in Aufbau und Inhalt des Schlussdokuments der 5. Generalversammlung des Episkopats von Lateinamerika und der Karibik”, in: Zeitschrift für Missionswissenschaft und Religionswissenschaft, No. 92 (2008) 1/2, 48–67; Pope Francis, Apostolic Exhortation *Gaudium et Spes* on the proclamation of the Gospel in today’s world, 24 November 2013, No. 5: http://www.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_exhortations/documents/papa-francesco_esortazione-ap_20131124_evangelii-gaudium.html (28.05.2020); Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, op. cit., 216.

⁵²⁴ In all likelihood, Doña Concha was referring to an event which took place on 19 May 2013, <http://www.zeit.de/news/2013-05/21/kirchen-papst-soll-exorzismus-ausgefuehrt-haben-21190402> (27.03.2018).

Charismatic Movements within the Catholic Church

Kwadwo Nimfour and Opoku Onyinah

Of no movement do we have the reflection of the fulfilment of Jesus' prayer in John 17:21, "that all of them may be one, Father, just as you are in me and I am in you (NIV)," as in the charismatic renewals in the churches in the 20th Century. Within the Charismatic Renewals, the mainline churches have their share of the Pentecostal revival that began in the early part of the 20th Century at the Azusa Street. In the 1950s as the baptism of the Holy Spirit began to gain root in some of the established churches, through the Full Gospel Business Men's Fellowship, by members who remained in their denomination, the Charismatic Movement came into existence. What the Pentecostals called the baptism of the Holy Spirit began to take place, in the early 1960s, among members of these churches including the Episcopalians, Lutherans, and Presbyterians. It was therefore no wonder that in 1967, the renewal broke through the Catholic Church.⁵²⁵

The Pentecostal/Charismatic group boasts of an estimated number of over 700 million members globally. Out of this, 160 million are supposed to be Catholics.⁵²⁶ That means the Catholic Charismatic Renewal (CCR) is a very important movement in the Catholic Church and in the Pentecostal revival. This article attempts to give a brief background of the movements, their organisation, 'theology' and practices.

Origin and Expansion

Significantly, the Catholic Charismatic Renewal all started among few North American Catholic well-educated classes and spread from the same intelligentsia to the rest of the world. Professor Ralph Keifer,

⁵²⁵ Cf. Mansfield, Patti Gallagher, "Part 1: Come Holy Spirit!", in: id., As by a New Pentecost: The Dramatic Beginning of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal, Steubenville, OH 1992, 4.

⁵²⁶ Cf. Nucci, Alessandra, "The Charismatic Renewal and the Catholic Church", in: The Catholic World Report, May 18, 2013.

Patrick Bourgeois and few lay faculty members of the Duquesne University, a Catholic University in Pittsburgh, USA, attended the Congress of the Cursillo movement in August 1966.⁵²⁷ They were introduced to two books on Pentecostalism, which were not only to change their destiny but to cause a renewal, leading to the establishment of the CCR within the Catholic Church.⁵²⁸

Following their quest to experience the Pentecostal concept of the baptism of the Holy Spirit, they sought and attended a prayer meeting in their area which was mainly attended by mainline Protestant Charismatics. In their second meeting with this group, they were 'baptised in the Holy Spirit' and spoke in tongues. The following week, they shared their experiences with two close professor friends at the Duquesne University and prayed for them through the laying on of hands, and they also received the 'baptism of the Spirit'. Then on February 18-19, 1967, these professors and some students of the Catholic University at Duquesne, thirty in all, gathered for a weekend retreat. Meanwhile, the professors had asked the students to read the two books and also the first chapters of *The Acts of the Apostles*.⁵²⁹ At this time, the professors had not shared their experience with the students. Yet, it is said that at the end of the prayer meeting, dubbed, "Duquesne weekend", each of the students had experienced the Holy Spirit in a new way, at different times and in diverse ways; some spoke in tongues and others could feel the presence of God in a special way. This prayer meeting may be termed as officially the beginning of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal (CCR).⁵³⁰

While these Catholics experience came as a dramatic occurrence in a Catholic university, it did not come unexpectedly. This can be deduced from the two professors' attendance to Cursillo meeting, their participation at the Protestant charismatic meeting expectantly and the

⁵²⁷ *Cursillo de Cristiandad* an apostolic movement of the Roman Catholic Church. The focus of the movement is on showing Christian lay people how to become effective Christian leaders over the course of a three-day weekend. The method stresses personal spiritual development, as accelerated by weekly group reunion (after the weekend). Cursillo, <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Cursillo> (24.07.2017).

⁵²⁸ Thigpen, T. Paul, "Catholic Charismatic Renewal", in: Burgess, Stanley/Van Der Maas, Eduard M. (eds.), International Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements, Grand Rapids 2002, 460–467, here: 460.

⁵²⁹ Laurentin, Rene, Catholic Pentecostalism, New York 1977, 33.

⁵³⁰ Thigpen, T. Paul, op. cit., 461.

reading of the two books. Similarly the students were prepared through the request to read the book and some chapters from Acts. This confirms what Jesus said in the Gospel of John that the Spirit fills those who are thirsty and desire for him (Jn 7:37-38). From this perspective, it is implicit that while the Catholic Charismatics experience began as a separate entity through the Duquesne Weekend experience, it has a remote link to the Pentecostal experience that began in the early part of the twentieth century.

Similar to many revival movements, the experience did not end at Duquesne. In March 1967 through some of those who had received the baptism, the experience got to the Catholic University in Notre Dame and later to the University of Michigan, Ann Arbor.⁵³¹

Notre Dame soon became a venue for annual conferences for those who had received that experience. The movement spread through social network. It grew not only in the US but also in other countries and continents including Latin America, Europe and Africa.⁵³² The Catholic World Report indicates that as of 2013, there were over 160 million members;⁵³³ and existed in 230 nations, according to Wikipedia.⁵³⁴ The movement grew because, just like the Pentecostals, it offered people special experience with the Holy Spirit as in the Day of Pentecost, which would bring about the demonstration of charisms and healing.⁵³⁵

Organisation

The movement operates in two ways in the churches. The first type is the prayer groups and the second is referred to as “covenant communities”. The prayer groups are narrowly based within the

⁵³¹ Cf. Klimek, Daniel, “The Spirituality of the Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Separating Facts from Fiction”, http://www.academia.edu/12968275/The_Spirituality_of_the_Catholic_Charismatic_Renewal_Separating_Facts_from_Fiction (28.07.2017).

⁵³² Cf. Thigpen, T. Paul, “Catholic Charismatic Renewal”, op. cit., 461

⁵³³ Cf. Nucci, Alessandra, op. cit.

⁵³⁴ Cf. Wikipedia, “Catholic Charismatic Renewal”, <http://www.catholicworldreport.com/2013/05/18/the-charismatic-renewal-and-the-catholic-church> (28.07.2017).

⁵³⁵ Cf. Csordas, Thomas, “A global geography of the spirit: the case of Catholic Charismatic Communities”, in: Coleman, Simon/Hackett, Rosalind I. J. (eds.), *The Anthropology of Global Evangelicalism*, New York 2015, 170.

community where a person lives, but often includes a limited number of adherences from some parishes. It often conducts a weekly prayer meeting, but occasionally organised additional meetings such as such retreats, healing services and outreaches.⁵³⁶ The covenant community has a larger size and has members who have to commit themselves to explicit forms of set of rules, beyond ordinary church membership. According to Thomas Csordas, a North American anthropologist, members are placed on trial period and thereafter commit themselves to a written covenant that binds them together.⁵³⁷ Consequently there are fewer covenant communities than the prayer meetings. It is not difficult to understand this. It is easier forming a simple prayer meeting for people to converse and pray than to make written covenants which bind them to live an expected standard of life.

The first and most prominent among the covenant communities is the Sword of the Spirit. Other important ones which Csordas highlights are Emmanuel, People of Praise, Catholic Fraternity and the European Network.⁵³⁸ Each of the network has branches in various countries, a link with the International Catholic Renewal Centre and the church hierarchy.

The everyday life and running of communities are done at local, national and international levels. The main existence of the community is for the members to share a common spiritual life, support one another spiritually and advance a collective mission of evangelisation with the view of renewing the church.⁵³⁹

What the Catholic Charismatics brings to Pentecostalism is quite important for our discussion. The one experience that the Pentecostal revival, which began in the early part of the twentieth century brings out is the baptism of the Holy Spirit. With Classical Pentecostals,⁵⁴⁰ the evidence of this baptism is speaking in tongues. There was the common expectation that the Catholics who received the Pentecostal experience would lose their faith in the Catholic tradition, leave the

⁵³⁶ Cf. ibid., 176.

⁵³⁷ Cf. ibid., 176.

⁵³⁸ Emmanuel Community also lists itself as a member of Catholic Fraternity. Csordas, cf. ibid., 177.

⁵³⁹ Cf. ibid., 178.

⁵⁴⁰ The Pentecostal denomination which came out of the Azusa Street revival or those which have a direct link to it.

church and convert to Pentecostalism. Generally this has not been the case, rather most of the Catholic Pentecostals remained and have come out with their version of the Pentecostal experience. There have been three views of the Catholic Charismatic of their experience of the Pentecostal concept of the baptism of the Holy Spirit; the two dominant ones are discussed here.⁵⁴¹ The foremost interpretation is that “the baptism in the Spirit is a ‘stirring up’ or ‘release’ or ‘actualization’ of the Spirit given in the sacraments of Christian initiation, primarily of baptism and confirmation”.⁵⁴²

This proposition is based on the Scriptures in Acts 4:23-35 and 2 Timothy 1:6. In both cases the believers had already received the baptism, yet with regard to the persecuted believers, they were filled with the Holy Spirit, and so was Timothy asked to stir up the gift in him. It is assumed from these texts that there is the possibility of the gift being received at the Christian initiation and later lay dormant.

The Christian initiation interpretation accommodates the new wine - Pentecostalism, within the old wine - intuitionism, and by that makes it easy for the church hierarchy to accept the move of the Spirit within the church, with less difficulty. A nuance of this interpretation is that which was proposed by Fr Francis Sullivan - “a new sending of the Spirit, a fresh outpouring of the Spirit” apart from the Christian initiation for a special service or for an important step forward in life for Christ.⁵⁴³ Sullivan does not dispute the validity of the sacraments of Christianity but to propose what appears to him as to be the right interpretation of what is experienced as the baptism of the Spirit. For him, it is an additional sending instead of an activation of what laid dormant. Sullivan sees the outpouring in Acts 4:31, as God sending fresh outpourings of the Spirit in a non-sacramental context.⁵⁴⁴ Commenting on this, Dr John Joy exclaims, “This seems to be precisely the insight of the Charismatic renewal.”⁵⁴⁵

⁵⁴¹ For brief reading on these, see Martin, Ralph, “A New Pentecost? Catholic Theology and Baptism in the Spirit”, in: Logos: A Journal of Catholic Thought & Culture, No. 14 (2011) 3, 17–43.

⁵⁴² Ibid., 26–27.

⁵⁴³ Cf. Sullivan, Francis, *Charisms and Charismatic Renewal: A Biblical and Theological Study*, Ann Arbor, MI 1982, 70.

⁵⁴⁴ Cf. ibid., 62.

⁵⁴⁵ Joy, John, “The Outpouring” of the Holy Spirit in the Catholic Charismatic Renewal: Theological Interpretation of the Experience”, in: *Antiphon*, No. 9 (2005) 2, 161.

The difference between this view of “a new sending” and the “Christian initiation” is that while the Christian initiation is suggesting an activation of gifts that have been dormant, this one is suggesting a separately “new sending of the Holy Spirit” besides the Christian initiation for the purpose of Christian service and life.

What all of these three views bring out is the experiential of something, which hitherto had not been experienced before by a person. It can therefore be inferred from these discussions, the ‘baptism in the Holy Spirit’ may bring about an encounter which brings the presence of God to a person in such a way that he had not experienced before, leading to speaking in tongues, experiencing deeper union with God, or exercising other spiritual gifts. For most of the CCR, the best way to understand their experience was to turn to the Catholic sacramental theology - Christian initiation. It is this way of understanding the baptism of Holy Spirit - the “stirring up” or ‘release’ or ‘actualization’ of the Spirit given in the sacraments of Christian initiation, primarily of baptism and confirmation”, which articulates the Catholic Charismatic Renewal contribution to the Pentecostal movement.

Surprising to many Classical Pentecostals is the claim by the Catholic Charismatics that the baptism in the Holy Spirit rather has rather given meaning to and deepened their experiences of the confessional, Eucharist, rosary and devotion to Mary⁵⁴⁶. Writing two weeks after the Duquesne Weekend, Patti Gallagher Mansfield narrates the words of one professor, “it is not a revolutionary experience because it reaffirmed all the things which I’d been trying to hold on to for years and to affirm for so many years”....The difference is that ... everything is easier ... comes from within.⁵⁴⁷

The devotion to Mary which some of the CCR still hold is a surprise of many Pentecostals. According to T. Paul Thigpen⁵⁴⁸ an Evangelical Pastor and theologian, who became a Catholic, sometimes the Virgin Mary, who is expected to be in their meetings, is invoked in hymns and prayers. More surprising is the comments by Thigpen that “Marian movement, having grown accustomed to

⁵⁴⁶ Cf. Synan, Vinson, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition*, Grand Rapids, 1997, 254.

⁵⁴⁷ Mansfield, Patti Gallagher, op. cit., 13.

⁵⁴⁸ Cf. Thigpen, T. Paul, “His Open Arms Welcomed Me – The Story of a Former Evangelical Pastor”, <http://chnetwork.org/story/dr-paul-thigpen-his-open-arms-welcomed-me/> (01.08.2017).

acting as channels of messages from, may not hesitate to express prophecies they believe have received from Mary or other saints through dreams, visions, or inner locutions".⁵⁴⁹

All this shows the extent to which most of the adherents were seeking meanings to their church traditions, rituals and religiosity. For them, the baptism in the Spirit is the answer; for it offers freshness to archaic practices.

Relation to the Church's Hierarchy

The Charismatic renewal was acknowledged as an answer to the prayer of Pope John XXXIII at the beginning of the Second Vatican Council, in 1961, that the Lord should renew his "wonders in our days as in a new Pentecost".⁵⁵⁰ Even better, Mansfield⁵⁵¹ has shown that Pope John's prayer might have been influenced by a woman religiously named St. Elena Guerra, and nicknamed the Apostle of the Holy Spirit, who lived around the turn of the nineteenth century. Sister Elena is said to have written twelve confidential letters to Pope Leo XIII between 1895 and 1903, calling for preaching on the Holy Spirit. Besides, the Pope responding to her plead, at St Elena's suggestion, Pope Leo XIII invoked the Holy Spirit on January 1, 1901, the first day of the year in the twentieth century, the same day that Agnes Osman of Charles Parham's Bethel Bible School also received the Holy Spirit baptism and spoke in tongues. This woman was the first person Pope John XXXIII beatified and religiously named St Elena Guerra.⁵⁵² By referring to this, Mansfield was trying to link the Pentecostal revival that broke out in the early part of the twentieth century as partially as the results of the Pope's prayer.

Following this line of thought, all the popes following him have considered the experience as a renewed outpouring of the Spirit of Pentecost within the Catholic Church. However, the relation between the renewal movement and the church officials has not

⁵⁴⁹ Cf. Thigpen, T. Paul, "Catholic Charismatic", op. cit., 466.

⁵⁵⁰ Mansfield, Patti Gallagher, op.cit., 1

⁵⁵¹ As already mentioned, Patti Gallagher Mansfield was among the participants at Duquesne Weekend.

⁵⁵² Cf. Mansfield, Patti Gallagher, op. cit., 3–4.

been always cordial, for various reasons.⁵⁵³ The clergy are aware that movements that claim divine relations and sometimes are led by lay leaders have the potential to cause confusion in an established church such as the Catholic. Consequently, Pope Paul VI appointed a cardinal, Bishop Suenens, to take pastoral oversight of the renewal movement. Suenens hosted a conference which led to the provision of a pastoral guideline for the movement.⁵⁵⁴ While Pope John Paul II strongly endorsed the renewal, he also warned them by asking adherents to preserve, “fidelity to the ecclesiastical Magisterium, filial obedience to pastors and the spirit of service with regard to local churches and parishes”.⁵⁵⁵ Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger, who was to become Pope Benedict XVI praised the renewal as “the visible signs of the Holy Spirit” but also expressed some concerns. Among these, he emphasized that for the Charismatic renewal, it was “essential, above all, to maintain a balance, to beware of an exclusive emphasis on the Spirit, who, as Jesus himself reminds us, ‘does not speak for himself’ but lives and works at the heart of the life of the Trinity.”⁵⁵⁶ This is a sound caution good for people of all times, leading various renewals and all who claim to have special revelation by the Lord.

Concluding Remarks

Indeed, from the foregoing discussion, “The wind blows wherever it pleases. You hear its sound, but you cannot tell where it comes from or where it is going...” (Jn 3:8, NIV). If the Catholic Charismatics would claim that the outbreak of the Holy Spirit, as experienced by the Pentecostals, in the early twentieth century was partly an answer to the prayer of Pope Leo XIII and consider the Pentecostal experience, dubbed, Duquesne Weekend leading to the Catholic Charismatic Renewal movements as the answer to the prayer of Pope John XXIII at the Second Vatican, then it affirms the sovereignty of God over his church and world. For it is that ‘one experience’ which the Pentecostals call the baptism in the Holy Spirit.

⁵⁵³ Cf. Martin, Ralph, op. cit., 19–20.

⁵⁵⁴ Cf. Thigpen, T. Paul, “Catholic Charismatic Renewal”, op. cit., 465.

⁵⁵⁵ Quoted in ibid., 465.

⁵⁵⁶ Quoted in Klimek, Daniel, op. cit., 23. Joseph Ratzinger interviewed by Vittorio Messori, The Ratzinger Report: An Exclusive Interview on the State of the Church, San Francisco 1987, 152.

Although a number of Catholic theologians have offered different interpretations to explain what this experience which the Pentecostals call the baptism in the Holy Spirit, it is apparent that often what was lurking at the seekers' psyche was to experience the gift of the 'speaking in tongues'. Apparently, as it has not been possible for all seekers to speak in tongues, there had to be a nuance of accepting 'deeper feeling of the presence of God' and manifestations of other gifts as equally the baptism of the Spirit. The struggle for names to explain what has happened deeply within people has mostly been influenced by church traditions. Yet the one thing all seekers claimed to experience was a deeper union with God whose presence was felt in manifestation from different perspectives. If the Pentecostal experience, which broke through the then established mainline churches was that one thing which also attracted the Catholic seekers which eventually led to the outbreak at the Duquesne Weekend (outcome of Catholic Revival Movements), and this is linked with the prayer of Pope Leo XIII, then the wind blows to wherever it wants and the world is heading towards one theology.

The Response of the Catholic Church to the Pentecostal Movements

Pentecostal Churches – Question Marks and Challenges

Klaus Krämer

The international character of Christianity has changed radically in the recent past. There are some 2.2 billion Christians worldwide, around 400 million of whom are members of Pentecostal churches.⁵⁵⁷ Although Pentecostal churches are extremely varied and diverse, it is still possible despite all the differences to ascertain common features which link the various independent Pentecostal communities and at the same time distinguish them fundamentally from the other Protestant churches. It is, therefore, quite justifiable to talk of a “fourth basic form of Christianity” alongside the Orthodox, Catholic and Reform churches.⁵⁵⁸ The rapid growth of Pentecostal churches, which has been accompanied in many places by a large number of conversions from the traditional churches, has given rise to fears and concerns which find expression first and foremost in the frequent accusation of proselytism. On the other hand, the spiritual stimulus which gives the Pentecostal churches their momentum is not only to be found outside the traditional churches. This is most readily apparent in the Charismatic movements that have arisen in the traditional churches, such as the Charismatic renewal within the Catholic Church.

This complex situation underlines the need for a theological stance and bilateral clarification in the interests of proper ecumenical relations. One instance of such clarification is the dialogue launched in 1972 between Pentecostals and the Roman Catholic Church represented by the Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity. This dialogue has a number of special features which distinguish it from other processes. It is not a dialogue with official representatives of the Pentecostal churches but merely “with leading representatives

⁵⁵⁷ The figures vary between 200 and 600 million depending on the census. See PEW Forum (ed.), *Spirit and Power: A 10-Country Survey of Pentecostals*, Washington 2006.

⁵⁵⁸ See Eckholt, Margit, “Pentekostalismus: Eine neue ‘Grundform’ des Christseins”, in: Keßler, Tobias/Rethmann, Albert-Peter (eds.), *Pentekostalismus: Die Pfingstbewegung als Anfrage an Theo-logie und Kirche*, Regensburg 2012, 202–225.

of a number of Pentecostal churches and prominent figures who participate in Charismatic movements in the Evangelical and Anglican churches"⁵⁵⁹. In contrast to other processes this dialogue is expressly not geared to "organic unity as a goal or a kind of structural unity". On the contrary, it is about "achieving greater closeness through prayer and common witness"⁵⁶⁰. Hence it is a limited dialogue in two respects. This prompts the question of the importance and prospects of the dialogue. I will now sketch out some of the main points of the dialogue and examine their significance.⁵⁶¹

Baptism in the Holy Spirit

"Baptism in the Holy Spirit" is the most salient feature of Pentecostal churches. "In Pentecostalism 'being baptised in the Spirit', 'being filled with the Holy Spirit' and 'receiving the Holy Spirit' are all occurrences signifying a radical experience which is different to that of repentance. In this experience the Holy Spirit manifests itself, fills and transforms the life of the faithful with its power and, through its inspiration, discloses the entire reality of the Christian mystery."⁵⁶² The pivotal significance of baptism in the Spirit distinguishes the Pentecostal churches from the other Free Churches, from which they originate.⁵⁶³ Baptism in the Spirit varies as regards the workings of the Holy Spirit in penance, conversion and reincarnation. It is understood to be the beginning of an "inherent personal presence of the Spirit

⁵⁵⁹ Dialog zwischen Pfingstlern und der Römisch-Katholischen Kirche (P–RK/1), in: Dokumente wach-sender Übereinstimmung: Sämtliche Berichte und Konsensstexte interkonfessioneller Gespräche auf Weltebene (1931–1982), edited by Harding Meyer/Hans J. Urban/Lukas Vischer, Paderborn/Frankfurt a. M. 1983, 476–486, here: 477.

⁵⁶⁰ Ibid., 476.

⁵⁶¹ See Gasper, Hans, "Global Players im Gespräch? Zum Dialog der römisch-katholischen Kirche mit den Pfingstkirchen", in: Ökumenische Rundschau, No. 56 (2007) 3, 317–333, here: 318f.

⁵⁶² P–RK/1, op. cit., 478.

⁵⁶³ Of special significance here is the Methodist holiness movement; see Zimmerling, Peter, op. cit., 44–47; on the history of the movement see Rethmann, Albert-Peter, "Die geschichtliche Entwicklung und ihre Praxis", in: Keßler, Tobias/Rethmann, Albert-Peter (eds.), Pentekostalismus: Die Pfingstbewegung als Anfrage an Theologie und Kirche, Regensburg 2012, 15–33; Hochgeschwender, Michael, Amerikanische Religion, Evangelikalismus, Pfingsttertum und Fundamentalismus, Frankfurt 2007, 232–246.

in the believer".⁵⁶⁴ In the early days of Pentecostalism this led to a "doctrine of levels", according to which those who have undergone baptism in the Spirit reach a "new level of holiness". Very typical of classical Pentecostalism is the doctrine that speaking in tongues should be regarded as an initial sign of baptism in the Spirit.⁵⁶⁵ Baptism in the Holy Spirit – especially in respect of the gifts of the Spirit it bestows – is regarded as an authorisation to provide special services for the congregation.

The understanding of "baptism in the Holy Spirit" was consequently the first issue to be addressed in the dialogue between Pentecostals and the Catholic Church in the 1970s and it was dealt with in depth in the fifth round of dialogue (1998 to 2006) which examined Christian initiation. The focus in the discussions during that period was on the relationship between baptism in the Spirit and the sacramental process of complete incorporation into the church – from baptism through confirmation to the Eucharist.

In the first round of dialogue a fundamental consensus was reached on the understanding of sacramental baptism and baptism in the Holy Spirit. Pentecostals and Catholics share the conviction that sacramental baptism involves receiving the Holy Spirit: "The Holy Spirit dwells in all Christians, not only in those who have been 'baptised in the Holy Spirit'. The difference between a convinced Christian without such a Pentecostal experience and a Christian with such an experience generally consists not just in a different theological orientation, but also in a greater openness and expectation with regard to the Holy Spirit and its gifts."⁵⁶⁶ Another fundamental shared conviction was "that baptism in the Holy Spirit is a powerful work of grace which God communicates to the faithful in the church"⁵⁶⁷. The effusion of the Holy Spirit is of great significance for individual Christian development and the life of the church as a whole⁵⁶⁸ and

⁵⁶⁴ Krust, Christian, "Geistestaufe", in: Hollenweger, Walter J. (ed.), *Die Pfingstkirchen*, Berlin 1987, 174–182, here: 176.

⁵⁶⁵ Initially advocated by Charles Fox Parham, cf. Krust, Christian, op. cit., 176.

⁵⁶⁶ P–RK/1, op. cit., 479.

⁵⁶⁷ P–RK/5, in: *Dokumente wachsender Übereinstimmung: Sämtliche Berichte und Konsenstexte interkonfessioneller Gespräche auf Weltebene (2001–2010)*, edited by Johannes Oeldemann/Friederike Nüssel/Uwe Swarat/Athanasis Vletsis, Paderborn/Leipzig 2012, 869–980, here: 970.

⁵⁶⁸ Ibid., 971.

therefore individual believers should strive to receive it⁵⁶⁹. In the fifth round of dialogue a joint exploration of Holy Scripture and patristic literature was undertaken in order to arrive at a clearer understanding of baptism in the Holy Spirit. Substantial differences remain, however, including within the two communities.

On the Catholic side, for instance, there is no consensus on the question of how the findings in the patristic texts should be assessed. Different theological positions exist, in particular, on the question of whether baptism in the Holy Spirit "should be understood in relation to the celebration of the sacraments or as an 'extra-sacramental' effusion of the Holy Spirit"⁵⁷⁰. Kilian McDonnell has attempted to demonstrate by reference to extensive biblical and patristic studies that there is a Catholic "counterpart" to Pentecostal baptism in the Spirit.⁵⁷¹ In his view the texts confirm that what is described as "baptism in the Holy Spirit" should be seen as an integral element of Christian initiation and Christian development.⁵⁷² However, this thesis has not gone unchallenged. In his two-volume study of the relationship between charism, baptism and baptism in the Spirit the New Testament scholar, Norbert Baumert SJ⁵⁷³, found that McDonnell's thesis could not be substantiated by reference to the texts of the Church fathers. He therefore came to the conclusion that baptism in the Spirit in the Pentecostal tradition is a new development in the history of piety and hence should be seen as "a specific grace of God in our time".⁵⁷⁴ For Baumert no normative character attaches to baptism in the Spirit, however. He sees it rather as one of the gifts of the Holy Spirit. Whereas the charismatic element has something normative and integral for Christian life even from a Catholic point of view, he says, this does not apply in the same way to the individual charisms. He ultimately concludes that it is possible to be "a fully-fledged Christian" without receiving baptism in the Spirit.

⁵⁶⁹ Ibid., 968.

⁵⁷⁰ Ibid., 971.

⁵⁷¹ Cf. McDonnell, Kilian/Montague, George T., *Christian Initiation and Baptism in the Holy Spirit: Evidence from the First Eight Centuries*, Collegeville, Minnesota 1991.

⁵⁷² Cf. Gasper, Hans, op. cit., 328f.

⁵⁷³ Baumert, Norbert, *Charisma – Taufe – Geisttaufe*, 2 vols., Würzburg 2001; the author was a member of the Dialogue Commission from 1990 to 1997.

⁵⁷⁴ Cf. Gasper, Hans, op. cit., 329f.

However, on the Pentecostal side, too, there have from the very beginning been “differences not only with regard to the relationship between baptism in the Holy Spirit and conversion, salvation (Oneness Pentecostals) and holiness [...] but also concerning the necessity for various forms of authentication signifying that somebody has genuinely received baptism, such as speaking in tongues”⁵⁷⁵. “Whereas the experience of baptism in the Holy Spirit is evidently fairly similar amongst those who receive it, the understanding of baptism in the Holy Spirit as well as its place in the series of events by which people become Christians is marked by considerable differences of opinion.”⁵⁷⁶ This is very evident in the different emphases placed on the relationship between baptism in the Spirit and water baptism and reincarnation. Peter Zimmerling points out that most of the traditional Pentecostal churches distinguish between the two levels of conversion / reincarnation and baptism in the Spirit. For them baptism in the Spirit is the defining moment: “Since the Spirit is bestowed through baptism in the Spirit, water baptism is nothing more than an initial act of religious profession which joins reincarnation and baptism in the Spirit.”⁵⁷⁷ In the traditional Pentecostal churches this has resulted in a certain subordination of water baptism to reincarnation and baptism in the Spirit.

Zimmerling sees a different development in the Charismatic movements within the Protestant churches and the Catholic Church. According to the Lutheran doctrine, those who are to be baptised “receive in water baptism the Holy Spirit which urges them to personally strive for salvation”⁵⁷⁸. For Lutheran Charismatics, baptism in the Spirit is not an objective second level, although it is a new subjective utilisation of the believer by the Holy Spirit. Hence the Charismatic experience of the Spirit mostly takes place in the context of a renewed “baptismal spirituality”. Catholic Charismatics, by contrast, regard baptism in the Spirit primarily as a renewal of confirmation. In the Catholic tradition the sacrament of confirmation is the natural starting point for the experience of the Spirit in continuation of the

⁵⁷⁵ P-RK/5, op. cit., 971.

⁵⁷⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷⁷ Zimmerling, Peter, op. cit., 58.

⁵⁷⁸ Ibid., 59.

Pentecostal event.⁵⁷⁹ Heribert Mühlen regards baptism in the Spirit in this context as the “activation” of the sacrament of confirmation⁵⁸⁰ in the sense of a growing awareness of the bestowing of the Spirit, which took place during confirmation, at the level of personal experience.⁵⁸¹ A characteristic feature of the Catholic understanding here is, in particular, that there can essentially be no experience of the Spirit “which obviates the Church”. Therefore “renewal of the Spirit is consistently experienced as a renewal of one’s own baptism, confirmation as a priest or of religious vows”.⁵⁸²

Zimmerling also detects distinct efforts within the Pentecostal churches “to overcome standardisation of the receipt of the Spirit in Charismatic movements and the two-tier concept of being a Christian that is associated with it”.⁵⁸³ A very forward-looking approach is taken here by Siegfried Großmann, who distinguishes four steps in a holistic “basic Christian experience”: repentance, baptism, receiving the Spirit and incorporation into the church.⁵⁸⁴ The different positions of the various churches and denominations can be attributed to the fact that one of these steps is mostly over-emphasised, as a consequence of which the others fade into the background. An exchange between them can therefore help to detect “blind spots” in individual traditions and to find a way towards a more holistic understanding of the practice of the Christian faith in which Charismatic baptism in the Spirit can then take up its natural place.⁵⁸⁵

⁵⁷⁹ Cf. Mühlen, Heribert, *Die Erneuerung des christlichen Glaubens: Charisma, Geist, Befreiung*, Munich 1974, 230ff.

⁵⁸⁰ Ibid., 232.

⁵⁸¹ See also Baumert, Norbert, *Gaben des Geistes Jesu: Das Charismatische in der Kirche*, Graz/Vienna/Cologne 1987, 50ff.

⁵⁸² Zimmerling, Peter, op. cit., 61.

⁵⁸³ Ibid.

⁵⁸⁴ Cf. Großmann, Siegfried, *Der Geist ist Leben: Hoffnung und Wagnis der charismatischen Erneuerung*, Wuppertal/Kassel 1990, 58ff.

⁵⁸⁵ There is a discussion of whether these steps should be understood more in the sense of an *ordo salutis* consisting of several steps or, as in Zimmerling’s view, as different aspects of the faith, although none of these aspects should be seen in isolation from the others and experience of the Spirit should be regarded as the dimension inherent in every aspect (cf. Zimmerling, Peter, op. cit., 62).

Proselytism

The disproportionately large growth of Pentecostal churches around the globe is very detrimental to the traditional churches, especially the Roman Catholic Church. This is made all too clear by the shifts in the number of Church members in Latin America, but also on other continents, especially in the southern hemisphere. This development is the cause of one of the main conflicts between Pentecostal churches and the other traditional churches. Criticism has focused especially on the evangelising practice of many Pentecostal churches, in particular those which have been established more recently. Members of other Christian churches regard the active recruitment of their members as "proselytism", in other words as a practice inappropriate to ecumenical cooperation between fellow Christians. The Pentecostal churches themselves see in this practice a legitimate way of bearing Christian witness to everyone, particularly since evangelisation campaigns are directed first and foremost at people who – irrespective of whether they should be regarded in a formal sense as Christians or not – have yet to establish an active relationship with Jesus Christ or have not personally experienced the Holy Spirit.

An attempt was made above all in the fourth round of dialogue (1990–1997) to address this issue with the requisite sensitivity. It was established that the different understanding Pentecostals and Catholics have of the "essence of a church / parish" was the hermeneutical reason for the conflicts between them. They were, for instance, "of a different opinion about the relationship between church and baptism as an expression of living faith".⁵⁸⁶ Different criteria applied, in particular, to the question of when someone "is not a member of any church" and is thus "unchurched" and when a person can be regarded as an "evangelised Christian".⁵⁸⁷

The complaint about proselytism, it was said, often originated in a "lack of sensitivity towards long-standing Christian congregations".⁵⁸⁸ Tensions arise when a group of Christians comes to evangelise in a

⁵⁸⁶ P-RK/4, in: Dokumente wachsender Übereinstimmung: Sämtliche Berichte und Konsenstexte interkonfessioneller Gespräche auf Weltebene (1990–2001), edited by Harding Meyer/Damaskinos Pa-pandreou/Hans Jörg Urban/Lukas Vischer, Paderborn/Frankfurt a. M. 2003, 602–638, here: 618.

⁵⁸⁷ Ibid., 624.

⁵⁸⁸ Ibid., 618.

region where another church has already made its religious, cultural and social influence felt. A lack of the requisite respect towards the established community can lead to misunderstandings, conflicts and even violent reactions.⁵⁸⁹ "Courteousness calls for communication between the new evangelisers and the leaders of the older church".⁵⁹⁰ The term proselytism is formulated in a working definition as follows: "Proselytism is the disrespectful, insensitive and heartless attempt to transfer the allegiance of a Christian from one church community to another."⁵⁹¹ While it is noted that the term proselyte tends to have a positive ring in biblical witness, it has latterly acquired a negative connotation in the sense of an "unauthorised form of evangelisation".⁵⁹²

Both sides accept in principle the basic right to religious freedom. All violations of religious freedom are condemned, as are all forms of religious intolerance. Equally, unfair treatment by the state of religious groups is irreconcilable with religious freedom. The basic right incorporates the freedom to bear witness to one's faith. Not least it encompasses the freedom to embrace a religion or to change one's religion without duress.⁵⁹³ Therefore, both sides acknowledge that it is in principle not unlawful for a Christian to join a different Christian community of his or her own free will.⁵⁹⁴ The Christian mission infers the right and inner obligation "to bear witness to all people, including other Christians".⁵⁹⁵

⁵⁸⁹ Ibid., 620.

⁵⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁵⁹¹ Ibid., 622.

⁵⁹² Ibid., 624; in his closing presentation at the international conference organised by the German Bishops' Conference on the subject of "Evangelicals, Pentecostal Churches, Charismatics: New Religious Movements as a Challenge for the Catholic Church" (Rome 2013) Cardinal Karl Koch pointed out that the negative connotation of the term predominated in the ecumenical movement. As the first source for this point of view he referred to a statement made at the General Assembly of the World Council of Churches in New Delhi (1961): "Proselytism is not just something completely different from genuine witness; it is the distortion of witness. Witness is distorted whenever – secretly or openly – powers of persuasion, bribery, unauthorised pressure or intimidation are used to achieve an apparent conversion." (Lüpsen, Focko [ed.], Neu Delhi-Dokumente, Witten 1962, 104–106.)

⁵⁹³ P–RK/4, op. cit., 626–628.

⁵⁹⁴ Ibid., 626.

⁵⁹⁵ Ibid., 625.

It is, therefore, indispensable to develop criteria for the appropriate exercise of the obligation to evangelise.⁵⁹⁶ The document begins by naming activities and actions which are irreconcilable with an appropriate performance of the duty to evangelise and would thus entail the reproach of proselytism. This applies to any form of intellectual dishonesty in recruiting members for one's own church – ranging from the contrast between the idealised presentation of one's own church with the weaknesses of the other Christian group as well as any deliberately false presentation of the items of faith and practices of other Christian communities. Equally unacceptable is "any form of violence, duress, coercion, pressure, ridicule or intimidation, irrespective of whether it is of a personal, psychological, physical, moral, social, economic, religious or political nature." Disregard for the freedom and dignity of the person by all manner of manipulation ranging from the exaggeration of biblical promises to the manipulative use of mass media is denounced. Any form of competitive evangelisation directed against other Christian groups is deemed to be inappropriate.⁵⁹⁷

After listing these negative examples the document notes that there is a contrasting need for fair and honest endeavours to preach the Gospel. The practical measures taken by the well-known evangelist, Billy Graham, are cited as constituting evidence of best practice in this respect. Graham only organised evangelisation events after having sought agreement with the churches in the region concerned and invited them to participate in the events. Hence those inspired by the evangelisation event were able to "place greater personal trust in Jesus" and to seek pastoral support from representatives of their own church. This is highlighted as a practical and exemplary way of fulfilling the duty to evangelise all people while respecting their individual church affiliation.⁵⁹⁸

⁵⁹⁶ This matter was discussed in bilateral and multilateral dialogues. To date the Pentecostal churches have not played a part in the drawing up of such documents. However, internal guidelines have been drawn up for an ethical approach in the spiritual service provided for parishes and pastors which deal with aspects of this matter (P-RK/4, op. cit., 622). Mention should also be made here of the document "Christian Witness in a Multi-Religious World" published by the Pontifical Council for Inter-Religious Dialogue, the World Council of Churches and the Worldwide Evangelical Alliance in Geneva in 2011, in which individual Pentecostal churches were involved.

⁵⁹⁷ P-RK/4, op. cit., 625; these thoughts are taken up in the document "Christian Witness in a Multi-Religious World", op. cit.

⁵⁹⁸ P-RK/4, op. cit., 626.

Prospects

So far the dialogue has only been conducted with a few individual partners from within the Pentecostal movement, who thus cannot be regarded as representative of the very wide range of Pentecostal churches as a whole. However, it shows that a rapprochement is possible in many key areas, nevertheless, or at all events that a more appropriate understanding of the respective positions and concerns can be achieved. This makes it clear that there is no meaningful alternative to the path of dialogue. Further steps on the path to dialogue are needed in order to move from a confrontational relationship to one based on good ecumenical cooperation. There is a need, in particular, for a structured dialogue with the neo-Pentecostal churches. This can begin at the local level as a “dialogue of life” which takes up the natural points of contact in the respective life context and, proceeding from there, lays the ground for ongoing theological dialogues by means of enhanced mutual understanding and respect.⁵⁹⁹

The efforts at dialogue to date make it abundantly clear that both sides can not only get closer to each other by means of enhanced mutual understanding, but must also learn from each other about essentials. For instance, Catholics can learn from Pentecostals how to better recognise the working of the Holy Spirit in the life of the Church and in the lives of individual Christians so that they can adopt an attitude of open receptiveness and appreciate the ways in which the Spirit wishes to lead the Church. Pentecostal spirituality points in an impressive manner to the need for a personal relationship with God and an individual experience of God which has a lasting and enlivening effect on the whole existence of Christians. Pentecostal church practice puts a new focus, not least, on the dignity and importance of individual Christians. A deeper understanding of the priesthood of all the faithful is thus achieved and a new way found of pointing to the diversity of the gifts of the Spirit which are bestowed on each and every Christian and which must be taken seriously and made fruitful for the life of the Church.

⁵⁹⁹ Cf. Kasper, Walter, *Der Heilige Geist und der ökumenische Dialog: Theologische und praktische Dimensionen*, in: id., *Einheit in Jesus Christus*, WKGS 15, edited by George Augustin/Klaus Krämer, Freiburg i. Br., 2013, 659–679, here: 671f.

On the other hand, the dialogues have shown that the Pentecostal churches can also benefit from systematic theological reflection on their religious practice, especially if current experiences can be discussed in the light of the traditional religious experiences of previous generations, including biblical witnesses. All the high regard for individual religious experiences notwithstanding, it is apparent that the objective reality of the faith and the sacraments can enhance trust in the reliability of God's promises of salvation, above all when these experiences are lacking or life is marred by existential crises. Last but not least, the relatively new Pentecostal churches can learn from the centuries-old experience of the traditional churches as regards the institutional forms that are needed to secure the existence and sustained continuity of a community of the faithful.

A New “Religious Style” in the Catholic Church in Germany?⁶⁰⁰

Esther Berg-Chan

“The Response of the Catholic Church to the Pentecostal Movements”, which is the title of this chapter, prompts a wide range of questions. Who or what is meant by the Catholic Church and the Pentecostal movements and with regard to which particular geographical, socio-cultural and time context? From what vantage point does the author address these issues? It is essential to begin, therefore, by outlining the perspectives and confines of this article. My remarks constitute an approach from a religious studies perspective to the Roman Catholic Church and the Pentecostal, Charismatic and Evangelical Movements (PCEM) in present-day Germany.⁶⁰¹ The reason for the apparent broadening of the scope is the close intermeshing of Pentecostalism and Evangelicalism. From the outset both religious movements have been very closely connected.⁶⁰² In addition, there has been increased overlapping of the Pentecostal-Charismatic and Evangelical networks since the second half of the

⁶⁰⁰ The term “religious style” comes from Eckholt, Margit, “Pentekostalismus. Eine neue ‘Grundform’ des Christseins”, in: Keßler, Tobias/Rethmann, Albert-Peter (eds.), Pentekostalismus. Die Pfingstbewegung als Anfrage an Theologie und Kirche, Regensburg 2012, 202–225, here: 210. On the concept of style, see also the concluding remarks. My thanks go to Klara Csiszar, Maren Freudenberg and Marita Wagner for stimulating discussions and helpful comments.

⁶⁰¹ The second half of the 20th century witnessed a series of fundamental theoretical realignments in social and cultural sciences – often referred to as a turn in cultural sciences – which also had an impact on religious studies. Since then a distinction has been made in religious research between research into religions as a theological undertaking and religious studies as a discipline operating in a cultural studies context. This article has been written from a cultural studies perspective. Cf. Bach-mann-Medick, Doris, Cultural Turns: Neuorientierungen in den Kulturwissenschaften, Reinbek bei Hamburg 2006; Bergunder, Michael, “Was ist Religion? Kulturwissenschaftliche Überlegungen zum Gegenstand der Religionswissenschaft”, in: Zeitschrift für Religionswissenschaft, No. 19 (2012) 1/2, 3–55. All subsequent references to the Catholic Church relate to the Roman Catholic Church.

⁶⁰² Cf. Bergunder, Michael, “Der ‘Cultural Turn’ und die Erforschung der weltweiten Pfingstbewegung”, in: Evangelische Theologie, No. 69 (2009) 4, 245–269, here in particular 257–263; Haustein, Jörg, “Die Pfingstbewegung als Alternative zur Säkularisierung? Zur Wahrnehmung einer globalen religiösen Bewegung des 20. Jahrhunderts”, in: Archiv für Sozialgeschichte, No. 51 (2011), 533–552, here especially 534–538.

20th century.⁶⁰³ Internationally circulating media issued by Evangelical and neo-Charismatic⁶⁰⁴ producers are increasingly reviewed by both networks; conferences and bible schools are attended by participants in both networks; and the same topics and practices are pursued. Hence with regard to Asia the anthropologist Jean DeBernardi refers to a popular, cross-ecclesiastical and trans-denominational form of Evangelical-Charismatic Christianity that is spreading steadily across the globe.⁶⁰⁵

The global PCEM phenomenon is not a new topic in the Catholic Church. Ever since the so-called “sect debate” of the 1990s representatives of the Catholic Church have addressed the issue of new religious movements, including the PCEM which are still frequently referred to as “sects”.⁶⁰⁶ That may seem surprising bearing in mind that, since the 1960s, the Charismatic Renewal has been a firm part of the Catholic Church which has, moreover, been engaged in an official dialogue with representatives of a number of Pentecostal churches since 1972. In addition to efforts to explain the seemingly general rapid growth of the PCEM around the world, discussion of them has focused on what appears to be a worldwide “Pentecostalisation/Charismaticisation” and/or “Evangelicalisation” of Christianity, from which the traditional churches are not excluded. The theologian, Margit

⁶⁰³ The term network has become established in research work as a metaphor to describe the extremely heterogeneous and dynamic area of PCEM. Cf. Berg, Esther, “Evangelikalismus in Asien”, in: Elwert, Frederik/Radermacher, Martin/Schlamelcher, Jens (eds.), *Handbuch Evangelikalismus*, Bielefeld 2017, 157–171, here: 160f.; Bergunder, Michael, op. cit., 248f.; Coleman, Simon, *The Globalisation of Charismatic Christianity*. Cambridge 2000, 22f.; Robbins, Joel, “The Globalization of Pentecostal and Charismatic Christianity”, in: *Annual Review of Anthropology*, No. 33 (2004), 117–143, here: 122.

⁶⁰⁴ From the 1960s onwards the emergence of Charismatic movements within the traditional churches was paralleled by the setting up of numerous independent congregations which saw themselves as a renewal movement in the Pentecostal-Charismatic context. Despite the theological and organisational differences between them they are now regarded both “in the field” and among researchers as an inter-connected phenomenon and summarised under the heading “neo-Pentecostalism” or “neo-Charismatics”. Cf. Anderson, Allan H., “Varieties, Taxonomies and Definitions”, in: id./Bergunder, Michael/Droogers, André/van der Laan, Cornelius (eds.), *Studying Global Pentecostalism: Theory and Methods*, Berkeley et al. 2010, 13–29, here: 19f.; Haustein, Jörg, op. cit., 538.

⁶⁰⁵ Cf. DeBernardi, Jean, “Global Christian Culture and the Antioch of Asia”, in: Lai, Ah Eng (ed.), *Religious Diversity in Singapore*, Singapore 2008, 116–141, here: 122. Nonetheless, there are still believers who regard themselves as either exclusively Evangelical or Pentecostal or Charismatic and reject any “blurring of distinctions” or ecumenical cooperation.

⁶⁰⁶ Cf. Eckholt, Margit, “Pentekostalisierung des Christentums?”, in: *Stimmen der Zeit*, No. 8 (2013), 507–520, here: 507.

Eckholt, talks in this context of a new "basic way of living a Christian life" as a new, transdenominational "religious style".⁶⁰⁷

It is striking that these debates (which go beyond church circles) mostly relate to Asia, Africa and Latin America. With a few notable exceptions they have largely passed Europe by. The reason is undoubtedly that, in statistical terms and their public presence, the PCEM in Europe remain a peripheral phenomenon. Germany is no exception in this respect. The low profile of the PCEM has meant that so far little notice has been taken of them here.⁶⁰⁸

With that in mind, my contribution deliberately focuses on Germany. Taking as an example the so-called House of Prayer in Augsburg and the *Mission Manifesto* to which it gave rise (published in 1918 by Herder Verlag), I will examine to what extent a new "religious style" can be ascertained in the Catholic Church in this country and how far it constitutes a response to the global PCEM phenomenon.

The Augsburg House of Prayer and the *Mission Manifesto*

In the early 2000s the Catholic theologian, Johannes Hartl (b. 1979), and his wife set up a house of prayer initially in their own living room and then in rented premises in Augsburg. They consider their initiative to be neither the founding of an independent congregation nor a new spiritual community. It was the intention of the couple, who have close ties with the Charismatic Renewal, to create a supradenominational space "in which prayers never cease to be said by day and by night" as a contribution to a general revival of prayer culture in Germany.⁶⁰⁹ They derived their inspiration from very different prayer traditions but, above all, from the Evangelical-Charismatic 24-hour prayer movement.⁶¹⁰ Since 2011, prayers have been said without

⁶⁰⁷ Margit Eckholt, "Pentekostalismus: Eine neue 'Grundform' des Christseins", in: Keßler, Tobias/Rethmann, Albert-Peter (eds.), Pentekostalismus: Die Pfingstbewegung als Anfrage an Theologie und Kirche, Regensburg 2012, 202–225, here: 210.

⁶⁰⁸ If there has been any discussion of them at all then primarily in connection with migration. Cf. Hau-Stein, Jörg, op. cit., 544.

⁶⁰⁹ Cf. Gebetshaus e.V., <https://gebetshaus.org/gebetshaus/#c16> (27.05.2018).

⁶¹⁰ The House of Prayer website mentions, among others, the prayer tradition of the Carmelites, the South Korean Megachurch pastor, Yonggi Cho, and the Charismatic-style Prayer Watch Movement led by Ortwin Schweitzer who, like the 24/7 prayer movement launched by the American, Pete Greig, and the International House of Prayer founded by

interruption in the Augsburg House of Prayer. In 2012 the community moved to a larger building which is to be enlarged to incorporate a further complex, the Mission Campus.⁶¹¹ The House of Prayer is officially recognised by the Catholic Church as a “work of Charismatic Renewal within the Catholic Church”. Since 2017, an Episcopal representative has been responsible for the House of Prayer.⁶¹²

Every year since 2008 the Augsburg House of Prayer has held a large-scale conference. The tenth of these MEHR (More) House of Prayer conferences held from 4 to 7 January 2018 was attended by a record 10,000 participants. One feature of that particular conference was the presentation of the *Mission Manifesto* co-edited by Johannes Hartl. Its professed aim is the “comeback of the Church”, a “missionary revival” within the Catholic Church in the German-speaking countries.⁶¹³ In early February 2018 the book was in 16th place in the non-fiction paperback section of the list of best-selling books published by the weekly news magazine *Der Spiegel*.⁶¹⁴ will now examine three aspects of the Augsburg House of Prayer phenomenon in order to establish whether there are signs here of a religious surge which has so far attracted little attention in Germany and Europe.

A new way of being Catholic?

On 26 November 2017 the Augsburg House of Prayer released a new video in a series entitled “90 Seconds of Hard Facts with Johannes

Mike Bickle in Kansas City in the USA, has its ori-gins in the concept of a never-ending series of prayers elaborated by Nikolas Ludwig Graf von Zin-zendorff (founder of the Unity of Brethren [of Herrnhut]). Cf. <https://gebetshaus.org/gebetshaus/#c16> (27.05.2018); <https://www.waechterruf.de/> (28.05.2018); Schüler, Sebastian, “Sie beten, als ob alles von Gott abhängt, und sie leben, als ob alles von ihnen abhängt: Posttraditional Vergemeinschaf-tung und religiöse Produktivität in einer evangelikalen Gebetsbewegung”, in: Berger, Peter A./Hock, Klaus/Klie, Thomas (eds.), *Religionshybride: Religion in posttraditionalen Kontexten*, Wiesbaden 2013, 243–266, here: 254–256; Metzlaff, Paul, “Anbetung heute – Einblicke in Jugendspiritualität”, in: *Katechetische Blätter*, No. 140 (2015), 222–227.

⁶¹¹ Cf. <http://mission-campus.de/> (27.05.2018); Martin, Kilian, “Beten am Rande der Stadt”, <http://www.katholisch.de/aktuelles/aktuelle-artikel/beten-am-rande-der-stadt> (27.05.2018).

⁶¹² Cf. Announcement of the Diocese of Augsburg issued on 02.01.2017, https://bistum-augsburg.de/Nachrichten/Mehr-Konferenz-in-Augsburg-Erstmals-ueber-10.000-Gaeste-bei-charismatisch-orientiertem-Treffen-erwartet_id_255532 (27.05.2018).

⁶¹³ Cf. Meuser, Bernhard/Hartl, Johannes/Wallner, Karl (eds.), *Mission Manifest: Die Thesen für das Comeback der Kirche*, Freiburg u. a. 2018, blurb.

⁶¹⁴ Cf. [https://www.buchreport.de/bestseller/buch/isbn/9783451381478.htm/](https://www.buchreport.de/bestseller/buch/isbn/9783451381478.htm) (20.04.2018).

Hartl" on the House's YouTube channel. It looks at the question of "Why are you still a Catholic?", to which Hartl responds as follows:

"Again and again you come across well-meaning Christians who say: Johannes, you love Jesus so deeply and you preach Jesus, so how can you still be a Catholic? Well, I've got news for them. That works the other way around too. There are Catholics who say: Hey, that person is so close to Jesus, he or she reads the Bible so much, why haven't they long since become Catholics?"⁶¹⁵

What is interesting about that excerpt for the purposes of this article is not the mutual discomfort felt by some Free Church members and Catholics which the video addresses. Far more intriguing is that, in both the instances Hartl cites, reference is made to the same identity markers – Jesus and the Bible. As central "codes" these two markers (the talk of Jesus who is loved, whom one meets, whom one experiences, to whom ones looks or whom one preaches; and the talk of the Bible, which is read and provides a foundation) shape not only the quotation cited here, but also the *entire* video. The clear attempt it reveals to formulate a minimum ecumenical consensus is undoubtedly attributable to the supra-denominational orientation of the House of Prayer. What is striking, however, is that the identity markers Hartl uses to describe Christian identity in general and Catholic identity in particular are language conventions to be found primarily among Evangelicals and neo-Charismatics: the emphasis on a personal relationship with God and the Holy Bible as the (sole) foundations for a Christian life. Are we talking here about a new style of Evangelically-influenced Catholicity of the kind that others have already detected in America or as a global "trend"?⁶¹⁶

A new Catholic Modus Operandi?

The Augsburg House of Prayer run by Johannes Hartl organised its first MEHR conference in 2008. Its title was programmatic: The

⁶¹⁵ "Warum bist du noch immer katholisch? – 90 Sekunden Hardfacts mit Johannes Hartl", YouTube-Video, released by the House of Prayer on 26 November 2017, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3U9HlcRN8gM>, (27.05.2018), transcript by the author.

⁶¹⁶ Cf. Allen, John L., *Das Neue Gesicht der Kirche: Die Zukunft des Katholizismus*, Gütersloh 2010, 67–112; Egeris Thorsen, Jakob, "Trends in Global Catholicism: The Refractions and Transformations of a World Church", in: Hunt, Stephen (ed.), *Handbook of Global Christianity: Themes and Developments in Culture, Politics, and Society*, Leiden et al. 2015, 29–48, here: 44.

conference aims to be a space in which young people, in particular, can discover and experience “more” as Christians. Like the House of Prayer it revolves around praise and worship.⁶¹⁷ The theologian, Markus-Liborius Hermann, has described the conferences as a “mixture of Taizé meetings and World Youth Days, Catholic assemblies and congresses, a combination of concert, festival and service”.⁶¹⁸ The growing success of the conferences attracted increased public and church attention. Prior to the 2017 conference the Diocese of Augsburg felt obliged “to examine in detail the intention, objective and, above all, the theological foundations [of the House of Prayer]” and found that “nothing is taught and preached there which contradicts the doctrine of the Catholic Church”.⁶¹⁹ Nevertheless, the MEHR conferences remain controversial in both Catholic and Free Church circles.⁶²⁰

Conferences like MEHR, the main purpose of which is to network Christians and provide them with practical and “motivational-emotional know-how”⁶²¹ so that they can become active themselves, are not uncommon in the Christian landscape.⁶²² They are held mostly in an Evangelical/neo-Charismatic context. Along with bible schools they form classical “nodes” in the relevant networks.⁶²³ People come together at conferences and in bible schools for an exchange of views and ideas, make contacts and then leave. The central networking aspect (establishing and maintaining relations, in which loose contacts

⁶¹⁷ Cf. <https://mehrkonferenz.org/> (28.05.2018) and the MEHR conference trailers 2017 and 2018, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lXEoggFehV4>; <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=higxbsYqUJ8> (18.05.2018).

⁶¹⁸ Hermann, Markus-Liborius, “Vom ‘Mehrwert’ des christlichen Glaubens: Anmerkungen zur 10. MEHR-Konferenz des Augsburger Gebetshauses”, in: Evangel. Magazin für missionarische Pastoral, No. 1 (2017), 1–4, here: 2.

⁶¹⁹ Cf. Announcement of the Diocese of Augsburg of 02.01.2017.

⁶²⁰ Compare, for example, the contribution of the Catholic theologian, Magnus Striet, in the late evening public channel news broadcast of 8 January 2017, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WaWKPfhczo0> (06.02.2019); and the criticism voiced by the Evangelical Bibelbund [Bible League], <https://bibelbund.de/tag/johannes-hartl/> (13.06.2018).

⁶²¹ The term “motivational-emotional know-how” was coined by Andreas Reckwitz and means “an implicit sense of ‘what you really want’, ‘what you are really concerned about’ and ‘what would be incon-ceivable’”. Reckwitz, Andreas, *Unscharfe Grenzen: Perspektiven der Kultursoziologie*, Bielefeld 2008, 118.

⁶²² The International House of Prayer in Kansas City regularly organises major events of a similar kind. Cf. <https://www.ihopkc.org/> (27.05.2018).

⁶²³ Cf. Bowler, Catherine, *Blessed: A History of the American Prosperity Gospel*. Dissertation, United States, North Carolina: Duke University 2010, 23–26; Coleman, Simon, op. cit., 278; Robbins, Joel, op. cit., 125.

are preferred to fixed institutionalised structures) can be described as a typical Evangelical/(neo)-Charismatic modus operandi.⁶²⁴ The considerable ecclesiastical and public attention the MEHR conferences have attracted to date also indicates that such conferences are still something new or at least not (yet) everyday occurrences in the German-speaking countries. Are the MEHR conferences a new Evangelical/(neo)-Charismatic-influenced modus operandi within the Catholic Church of the kind that others have already forecast as being a hallmark of the future global Christian landscape?⁶²⁵

A realignment of the Catholic Church?

In 2018 Hartl was joined by Karl Wallner (OCist, National Director of missio Austria and founding director of the Benedict XVI Philosophical-Theological University in Heiligkreuz, Austria) and Bernhard Meuser (journalist, co-initiator and head of the YouCat Foundation) in publishing the *Mission Manifesto. The Theses for the Comeback of the Church*. The purpose of the manifesto is to bring about a renewal of the Catholic Church in the German-speaking countries and it formulates ten theses to this end. In addition to a programmatic summary the manifesto contains an explanatory chapter on each of the theses. Hartl said at the 2018 MEHR conference that the sixth thesis was particularly close to his heart, as was its appeal to the Catholic Church "to learn in humility – especially from the Free Churches".⁶²⁶ It will come as no surprise that Hartl is the author of the relevant chapter.

According to Hartl, the Free Churches as "decision churches"⁶²⁷ are dependent by their very nature, as it were, on winning people

⁶²⁴ Cf. Coleman, Simon, "The Prosperity Gospel: Debating Charisma, Controversy and Capitalism", in: Hunt, Stephen (ed.), *Handbook of Global Contemporary Christianity: Movements, Institutions, and Allegiance*, Leiden et al. 2016, 276–296, here: 281.

⁶²⁵ Cf. Christerson, Brad/Flory, Richard W., *The Rise of Network Christianity: How Independent Leaders are Changing the Religious Landscape*, New York 2017, 11.

⁶²⁶ Meuser, Bernhard/Hartl, Johannes/Wallner, Karl, op. cit., 11. Cf. "Mission Manifest", YouTube-Video, released by the House of Prayer on 6 January 2018, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=A0VD-0vvoWY> (28.05.2018).

⁶²⁷ Hartl, Johannes, "Wir danken allen Christen außerhalb der katholischen Kirche, die heute schon mit Hingabe missionieren, taufen und Menschen zu Jesus führen", in: Meuser, Bernhard/Hartl, Johannes/Wallner, Karl, op. cit., 149–163, here: 154.

over and “maintaining their loyalty”.⁶²⁸ As a result of this necessity, he says, the Free Churches have an “incomparable treasure trove of experience”⁶²⁹ and fundamentally different forms of organisation.⁶³⁰ A closer examination of the examples Hartl quotes in his contribution reveals that what he has in mind are predominantly Evangelical/(neo)-Charismatic churches, such as the International Christian Fellowship (ICF) founded in Zurich, Bill Hybel’s Willow Creek Community Church in Chicago, Tim Keller’s Redeemer Presbyterian Church in Manhattan and Andy Stanley’s North Point Community Church in Atlanta. These churches can serve as an example for the Catholic Church in Germany. Hartl’s contribution in the *Mission Manifesto* thus reinforces the impression, based on the formal similarity between them, that the Augsburg House of Prayer deliberately takes its lead from models within the PCEB spectrum.

On the fringes of a general audience in May 2018 the authors handed over their manifesto to Pope Francis, who allegedly responded favourably and encouraged them to continue their work.⁶³¹ The manifesto and its associated vision of Church renewal seem to have arrived in the upper echelons of the Catholic Church. Does this mark the beginning of a more comprehensive realignment of the Catholic Church in Germany?

Concluding remarks

The House of Prayer in Augsburg is a supra-denominational initiative and Charismatic renewal project which, when viewed from both inside and out, is undoubtedly closely associated with Pentecostal, Charismatic and Evangelical movements around the world. To what extent the dynamic religious developments they embody are of significance for the Church as a whole is a matter of debate. The *Mission Manifesto* as a product of the House of Prayer certainly lays claim to the entire Catholic Church in the German-speaking countries. This is of significance in that, contrary to global trends, the PCEM have

⁶²⁸ Ibid., 157.

⁶²⁹ Ibid., 158.

⁶³⁰ Cf. ibid., 157.

⁶³¹ Cf. “Papst nimmt ‘Mission Manifest’ entgegen”, in: Vatican News (02.05.2018), <https://www.vaticannews.va/de/kirche/news/2018-05/papst-mission-manifest-sylvia-buhl-karl-wallner-evangelisierung.html> (27.05.2018).

so far remained a peripheral phenomenon both inside and outside the traditional churches in Germany (see above). However, the theologian, Gunda Werner, sees in both phenomena (the House of Prayer and the manifesto) a harbinger of "far-reaching changes in the Roman Catholic landscape"⁶³². She talks of a development she describes as "internal charismatisation", which has a "wide variety of theological and ecclesiastical implications".⁶³³ Werner's observations underline the importance of discussions with such new inner-Church initiatives for the Church as a whole. The Augsburg House of Prayer and the manifesto could prove to be a seismograph of future developments within the Catholic Church in Germany and Europe not only with regard to an increasing "internal charismatisation", but also an "internal evangelicalisation", as this contribution will have made clear.

In this respect the present article is programmatical in many respects. Its purpose is to open up a new perspective on the topic of this chapter, the usefulness of which will need to be verified in the course of further research. This will entail, on the one hand, sharpening the theoretical tool, the concept of style.⁶³⁴ On the other hand, there is a need for a qualitative and quantitative expansion of the research conducted. The question arises of the extent to which a new religious style can be detected in the material design of the rooms in the House of Prayer, for instance, and in the performance and sensual-affective lifestyle of the players involved. Finally, there is the question from a quantitative perspective of whether the hypothesis advanced here can claim validity for the whole of the Catholic Church in Germany. Broader-based comparative studies will be required to scrutinise the hypothesis outlined in this article on a new religious style in the Catholic Church in Germany, the German-speaking countries and Europe.

⁶³² Werner, Gunda, "Vorwort", in: id. (ed.), *Gerettet durch Begeisterung: Reform der katholischen Kirche durch pfingstlich-charismatische Religiosität?*, Freiburg et al. 2018, 7–15, here: 8. See also p. 9, note 11.

⁶³³ Ibid., 8.

⁶³⁴ A concept of style has yet to be elaborated for the purposes of research into religions. An exploration of what sociological (life)style research, media studies, communication studies and linguistics have to offer as well as the "material religion" approach in religious studies would appear promising in this respect. Compare, for example, Hradil, Stefan, "Lebensstil", in: Kopp, Johannes/Steinbach, Anja (eds.), *Grundbegriffe der Soziologie*, Wiesbaden 122018 (online edition), 267–270; Meier, Stefan, "Stil als Praxis mediatisierter Sozialisation: Konzeptuelle und methodische Impulse", in: Hoffmann, Dag-mar/Krotz, Friedrich/Reißmann, Wolfgang (eds.), *Mediatisierung und Mediensozialisation: Prozesse – Räume – Praktiken*, Wiesbaden 2017, 267–287; Prohl, Inken, "Materiale Religion", in: Stausberg, Mi-chael (ed.), *Religionswissenschaft*, Berlin et al. 2012, 379–392.

A Converging Paths – the Catholic Church and the Pentecostal Movement in Latin America

Diego Irrazaval

The history of Catholics and Pentecostals in Latin America has been largely marked by converging and diverging paths. This makes it important to reflect on which paths we take, with whom we take them and where we wish to go. My purpose in this article is to outline some theoretical and practical perspectives of the Pentecostal movement.⁶³⁵ I am committed to a life and mindset in the Holy Spirit which has blossomed in many places and on many occasions in Latin America.⁶³⁶ Contributing to a form of ecumenism that remains true to the Gospel is a compelling but far from easy challenge.

Let me begin by outlining a number of steps to meet this challenge, which involve the following:

1. Putting the religious factor back into the broad sphere of human experience.
2. Endeavouring to prudently take ownership of relevant experiences and of a spectrum of interpretation.
3. Ensuring that Pentecostality⁶³⁷ is firmly anchored within the Christian identity, because “the Spirit of truth [...] will lead you to the complete truth [...] and will reveal to you the things to come” (John 16:13).

⁶³⁵ I wish to acknowledge what I have learned about the Pentecostal movement in Latin America through the programmes of ISEAT (La Paz), UBL and DEI (Costa Rica), CEDM (Santiago), CETELA, ASETT and RIBLA.

⁶³⁶ Among the milestones I wish to mention are: Codina, Víctor, *Creo en el Espíritu Santo*, Madrid 1994; Campos, Bernardo, *La experiencia del Espíritu*, Quito 2002; id., *El principio Pentecostalidad*, Kerigma 2016; Sepulveda, Juan, “El ‘principio pentecostal’”, in: *Voces del pentecostalismo latinoamericano*, Concepción 2003, 13–28; Prada, Óscar Elizalde/Hermano, Rosario/Moreno García, Deysi (eds.), *Iglesia que camina con Espíritu y desde los pobres*, Montevideo 2017, which contains articles from the second Congreso Continental de Teología, presenting a Catholic perspective and recent Catholic influences, including those of S. Martínez Maqueo, Víctor Codina, Leonardo Boff, G. Gutierrez, C. Mesters and Virginia Azcuy.

⁶³⁷ The word “Pentecostality”, which is a direct translation of the Spanish “pentecostalidad”, was coined by the Peruvian scholar Bernardo Campos. He defines it as “the universal experience that expresses the occurrence of Pentecost” in the body of Christ. Cf. Synan, Vinson (ed.), *The Truth about Grace: Spirit-Empowered Perspectives*, Chicago 2018, 121.

4. Entering into fullness of life by opposing the tendency towards politicisation and sectarianism and, instead, choosing to move along converging paths.

Where Catholics and Pentecostals enjoy common ground is in the experience and understanding of ordinary Christians (and also sporadically among their leaders and in their official structures). With a few exceptions the institutions fail to dismantle the obstacles they themselves have erected. Although there are some isolated channels of communication, this situation is harmful to the churches.

The historical facts and sensitivities of Christianity are painful for us but, thanks to the presence of the Holy Spirit and the churches' faithfulness to Jesus, it is possible to overcome compartmentalised thinking. In my capacity as a theologian in various places in Latin America I serve on committees that uphold spiritual and ecumenical traditions. For several years now I have been taking a close look at testimonies and studies which present a critical analysis of Catholic communities.

I would like to begin this article with the words of a young Pentecostal from the Andes: “Redemption can be found in God alone!” What does this mean in the context of Latin America and the Caribbean – regions which are marked by human misery, marginalisation, violence, corruption and spiritual and material poverty?” It seems that the Pentecostal faith refuses to imitate such degenerate humanism and disputes the statement that “redemption can be found in God alone”. Juan Jacobo Tancara notes that the empowerment which comes with the Pentecostal movement enables human beings to call upon God.⁶³⁸ As a result, “in God alone” becomes ambiguous because, although faith leads to empowerment in the face of evil, if God takes priority, it is humans who accord this to him.

Moving back into human experience

What are the key factors that encourage a person to think? Throughout Latin America, institutional Catholicism is losing its

⁶³⁸ See Tancara, Juan Jacobo, “Apuntes sobre Dios y el ser humano en la fe pentecostal”, in: Chiquete, Daniel/Orellana, Luis (eds.), Voces del Pentecostalismo Latinoamericano, vol. II, Concepción 2009, 179–180.

hegemony to a variety of faiths. There is a growing exodus from the Catholic Church into Pentecostal movements and there is also an increase in the unchurched and those who avoid churches. What is so unsettling is not the diversity of faiths but rather what we in Latin America are doing in response to the events that caused the crucifixion. Any sacred structure goes hand in hand with pain and injustice.⁶³⁹

The statistics show that Christianity is the strongest religious force in Latin America: 50% of all Catholics live in America and Protestant churches keep attracting new-comers with 75% of all Christians being Pentecostals. Brazil, for example, has 73.8% Catholics, 14.45% Protestants and 7.3% unchurched. These and other figures raise questions which call for answers.⁶⁴⁰ The Pentecostal movement is more than the sum total of those who feel they belong to it. It is one of the most important cultural pillars in America and – surprisingly – displays certain features of Catholicism. This often leads to mixed forms within Christianity.

Both culturally and spiritually, the Catholic faith is undergoing a far-reaching process of renewal, while continuing to be both diverse and unifying. Syncretistic forms of faith, rites and ethics are gaining ground within Catholicism. So-called folk Catholicism encompasses a broad range of symbolic movements, some of which are autonomous and outside organisational church structures. We must therefore ask what sets a Catholic environment apart. We need to ascertain

⁶³⁹ The Third General Conference of the Latin American Episcopal Council (Puebla, 1979) issued the following statement: "Viewing it in the light of faith, we see the growing gap between rich and poor as a scandal and a contradiction to Christian existence [...] [as] a situation of social sinfulness, all the more serious because it exists in countries that call themselves Catholic and have the ability to change this" (No. 28). Cf. the final document of the Fifth General Conference of the Latin American Episcopal Council in Aparecida, 2007, No. 100b: "Efforts to return to a certain type of ecclesiology and spirituality contrary to the Vatican II renewal ... [and] the shortcomings of our living out the preferential option for the poor." This amounts to a certain self-criticism and bold renewal (rather than simply complaining about the decreasing numbers of Catholics in Latin America).

⁶⁴⁰ See Perez Guadalupe, José Luis, *Entre Dios y el Cesar: el impacto político de los evangélicos en el Perú y América Latina*, Lima 2017; Pew Research Center, *Religion in Latin America: Widespread Change in a Historically Catholic Region*, 2014; Galindo, Florencio, *El fenómeno de las sectas fundamentalistas*, Estella 1994; Martin, David, *Tongues of Fire: The Explosion of Protestantism in Latin America*, Oxford 1990; Mariz, Cecilia, "Religion and Poverty in Brazil: A Comparison of Catholic and Pentecostal Communities", in: Swatos, William H. (ed.), *Religion and Democracy in Latin America*, New Jersey 1995, 1–26; Rolim, Francisco Cartaxo, *Pentecostais no Brasil, uma interpretacao socio religiosa*, Petrópolis 1985; Teixeira, Faustino/Menezes, Renata (eds.), *As religiões no Brasil, continuidades e rupturas*, Petrópolis 2006, 37.

ad intra the features it shares with the charismatic renewal and with evangelical faith tenets in informal Catholicism and also acknowledge the various forms of syncretism. But if neo-Pentecostal churches experience an increasing influx from the working and middle classes, what does that imply for images of God and their characteristics and how are weaknesses exposed within mainstream Catholicism?

To gain an understanding of certain phenomena it is useful to take a look at unfamiliar environments. Here are two examples:

1. In Guatemala, says Verónica Perez, Pentecostal women – led by the Holy Spirit – work together in freedom and solidarity as they seek to overcome poverty. They are tangibly moved by a Pentecostal experience of the power of the Holy Spirit as a strong wind that confounds time-honoured traditions and creates new kinds of relationships which generate a stronger sense of community.⁶⁴¹

2. In the working-class neighbourhoods of Chile (where I have my home) people have a concept of hell in which people run towards a fiery abyss and then fall into it. Only very few of them walk through the door to Jesus and end up in heaven. We should therefore pray: “Lord Jesus, thank you for dying for us on the cross to take away my sins. I ask you to come into my heart and I want to accept you as my personal Saviour.”⁶⁴²

Both instances are Pentecostal models. The first is about the sincerity that can be found in every people. The second concept, which concerns hell, sin and obtaining redemption, has nothing in common with the Gospel or with our shared historical faith.

We need to understand how people overcome barriers and interact with various faith experiences (of which some are acceptable while others are not). Critical, interdisciplinary and theological interpretations are required in both the short and long term. As I mentioned earlier, the most important thing is to change your vantage point and think outside the box. This may include, for example, praying

⁶⁴¹ See Perez, Verónica, “Experiencias locales”, in: Chiquete, Daniel/Orellana, Luis, (eds.), Voces del Pentecostalismo Latinoamericano, vol. II, Concepción 2009, 216.

⁶⁴² Message from a Pentecostal church in Peñalolén, in: El camino a Dios, Chile 2018.

in a Pentecostal fellowship and joining them in longing for redemption. To share socio-spiritual structures we need to be far-sighted (e.g. in combating dehumanising dualisms) and accept people in their otherness where that otherness leads to God. Errors should therefore be confronted regardless of whether they occur in a Catholic or an evangelical environment.

The fact that many people today move back and forth between different symbolic sources (and unbelief) is not tantamount to static pluralism. There is a symbiotic relationship between forms of faith and different forms of communicating them. A perspective of this kind requires tolerance towards those other paths, however, which are often experienced as contradictory. In Cuba a Pentecostal church leader points out that her members are prepared to believe in anything, including the Cuban folk religion *Santería* or even witchcraft, regardless of whether they are Catholics or atheists.⁶⁴³ There are certain parallels between currents within Catholicism and the Pentecostal movement, but there is also considerable potential for conflict. The parallels are most noticeable in intercession, for example when praying because of a person's sickness or the impending loss of a job. For Catholics, communication through traditional Catholic imagery has a value similar to the use of a Bible passage or the laying-on of hands for Pentecostals. It creates an environment that fosters multilateral dialogue between different Christian movements within a certain denomination as well as between one denomination and another. In evangelism it manifests itself in families whose members have different faiths and in environments in which everyone is experiencing the same social crisis.

In a variety of regions, particularly in Brazil, the Catholic Charismatic Renewal takes the form of associations which have developed their own liturgical forms, involving performances by gospel bands with a variety of charismatic gifts. The predominant characteristic of these associations is that they pursue what Antonio Pierucci calls a "universal religion with individual salvation".⁶⁴⁴ The

⁶⁴³ Fariñas, Daysi/Díaz, Ana Margarita, "El pentecostalismo en Cuba", in: Arce, Reiner/Quintero, Manuel (eds.), *Carismatismo en Cuba*, Quito 1997, 35.

⁶⁴⁴ Pierucci, Antonio, "A religião como ruptura", in: Teixeira, Faustino L.C./de Castro Menezes, Renata (eds.), *As religiões no Brasil*, Petrópolis 2006, 30. The Charismatic Renewal was studied by Cecilia Mariz, Brenda Carranza and Antonio Mendonça. Cf. Oro, Pedro, *Avanço pentecostal e reação católica*, Petrópolis 1996; cf. National Conference of

individual/universal element is transversal. This creates scenarios among believers (“non-faith” instances) in which the concept of personal salvation among Catholics and evangelicals is similar to that held by believing humanists.

Experiences and Interpretations

Latin America has seen a rapid growth of Pentecostal studies in the religious studies departments of both evangelical and Roman Catholic institutions. As well as dealing with issues of biblical exegesis and dogmatics (sometimes with an interest in apologetics as well) teaching has focused on insights into practical faith (*practical theology and lived religion*⁶⁴⁵) and looks at the religious side of daily life. This complex area needs to be approached prudently but without underestimating the relevant institutions, the secular world impacted by spirituality or, indeed, the various manifestations of modernism and post-modernism.

I would like to see dialogue between Pentecostals and Catholics. I am not going to comment on ideas developed by Protestant institutions in view of the predominance of the Pentecostal movement nor do I wish to examine Catholic expansionism in its endeavour to leverage the successful strategies of the Pentecostal movement.

One possible starting point would be to look at normative elements and their areas of ambivalence and to evaluate the Pentecostal movement in its alignment with the power of the Holy Spirit and the Bible. Here I would like to mention an article by Miguez Bonino⁶⁴⁶, who

Brazilian Bishops, Orientações sobre a Renovação Carismática Católica, Articles at the Conferência Nacional dos Bispos do Brasil (CNBB), No. 53, 1994; Pontifical Council for Promoting Christian Unity, “Do Not Quench the Spirit”: Charisms in the Life and Mission of the Church: Report of the Sixth Phase of the International Catholic-Pentecostal Dialogue (2011-2015), 2016, http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/chrstuni/sub-index/index_pentecostals_it.htm (07.02.2018).

⁶⁴⁵ Instead of examining formal institutions it might be better to try and understand subjective and social developments, e.g. in: McGuire, Meredith, *Lived Religion*, New York 2008; cf. Ammerman, Nancy T. (ed.), *Everyday Religion*, New York 2007.

⁶⁴⁶ Miguez Bonino, José, *Rostros del protestantismo latinoamericano*, Buenos Aires 1995. Please note, in particular, the pioneering analysis (chapter III) carried out by this Protestant colleague who insists that we must try to understand the Pentecostal movement from within itself and that we should do so in freedom and in a spirit of rational and symbolic reference and self-criticism.

points out that the normative elements are salvation by grace, baptism, adherence to the Holy Spirit, healing, fellowship and eschatology. By including Pentecostal ideas, as expressed by Juan Sepulveda and Bernardo Campos, for example, Miguez Bonino acknowledges the criticism of dualism and anthropological pessimism, the widespread recognition of the power of the Holy Spirit, the personal understanding of the Bible and the existence of committed communities in missionary work. He also questions Biblical fundamentalism and the focus on apocalyptic thinking, to which end he draws on the experiences of the younger generations. He concludes that any critical reflection of a Pentecostal experience must always proceed from within.

There are rays of hope in Pentecostal theology, particularly in its sensitivity towards historical developments. Juan Sepulveda sees the “Pentecostal principle” as a kind of a protest (when a given manifestation of the Gospel is turned into an absolute or if an element of the absolute seeps into the Pentecostal experience). He notes that revival in Chile has been clearly marked by elements seeking to liberate the Gospel message from the constraints of Anglo-Saxon culture.⁶⁴⁷ In Peru, Bernardo Campos has conducted a systematic analysis of Christianity in relation to the Pentecostal experience and to Pentecost itself, introducing Pentecostality as a fundamental theological dimension and enquiring into the meaning of Pentecost (Acts 2:12 and 2:37). He also looks at its current Catholic, Orthodox, Protestant and Pentecostal versions based on Luke’s Gospel.⁶⁴⁸ Moreover, Campos is also a member of *Red de Estudios Pentecostales* (RELEP), a network supported by Luis Orellana and like-minded theologians in Latin America and the Caribbean.⁶⁴⁹ Pentecostal theology thus finds expression in a renewed mindset in Latin America, where cultural manifestations demand a keen ability to distinguish, given that a critical attitude towards otherness and one’s own ways is by no means common.

⁶⁴⁷ Sepulveda, Juan, “El ‘principio pentecostal’”, in: Chiquete, Daniel/Orellana, Luis, (eds.), *Voces del Pentecostalismo Latinoamericano*, vol. II, Concepción 2009, 25.

⁶⁴⁸ Cf. Campos, Bernardo, *La experiencia del Espíritu*, op. cit.

⁶⁴⁹ RELEP has published a range of works, including the three volumes of *Voces del pentecostalismo latinoamericano* (2003, 2009). Further productive bodies are mentioned in footnote 1. The following academic work has been published by DEI (the Ecumenical Research Department): *Algo más que opio: Una lectura antropológica del pentecostalismo latinoamericano y caribeño*, San José 1991.

Catholics often talk about the Pentecostal movement in terms of Biblical fundamentalism and the utilisation of faith for the purpose of satisfying needs, while also highlighting emotional worship meetings and describing Pentecostal churches as “service providers”.⁶⁵⁰ Furthermore, the Pentecostal movement is accused of constituting a kind of Protestant folk religiousness that meets the needs of the people, thus embodying a model of church which combines modern structures with the social and cultural yearnings of the impoverished masses.⁶⁵¹ The General Conference of Aparecida, on the other hand, seeks to strengthen some essential elements of the church: a personal encounter with Jesus Christ, living together in community as a church, intensive ongoing biblical-theological education and the missionary involvement of the entire local church.⁶⁵²

Pentecostality: Identity in Collaboration

The paradigm of Pentecostality is of major significance for both theory and practice. Biblical reflection, which is currently characterised by inclusion criteria, puts the emphasis on the work of the Spirit in the entire world as it changes mankind,⁶⁵³ based, in particular, on Acts 2:17: “I shall pour out my Spirit on all humanity.” Any restrictive readings refer to specific conditions in early Christianity when, historically, they were applied in a sectarian manner. The starting point is a collective experience which has existed since the beginnings of Christianity and has manifested itself in joint missionary outreach (Acts 2:4, 4:31, 10:40f., 13:2f.; Mark 16:15; Matthew 18:19; Luke 24:47) and in a heart-felt identity, because “God has sent into our hearts the Spirit of his Son crying, ‘Abba, Father’” (Galatians 4:6 and Romans 8:9). As sons and daughters of God, we must therefore use the gifts of the Spirit in working together for the good of the community and the entire world.

Unfortunately, both Protestant and Catholic circles tend to reduce this issue to specific phenomena and groups, which only leads to

⁶⁵⁰ Cf. França de Miranda, Mario, *Um catolicismo desafiado*, São Paulo 1996, 95.

⁶⁵¹ This is one of many interpretations in dialogue. Cf. Damen, Franz, “Sectas”, in: Ellacuría, Ignacio/Sobrino, Jon, *Mysterium liberationis II*, Madrid 1990, 433, 445.

⁶⁵² Cf. Final Document of the Fifth General Conference of the Latin American Episcopal Council in Aparecida, 2007, No. 226.

⁶⁵³ An in-depth treatment of this topic can be found in Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti, *Pneumatology: The Holy Spirit in Ecumenical, International, and Contextual Perspective*, Grand Rapids 2002, 2.

segregation and disqualification. It is therefore necessary to remind ourselves of the unlimited call of the Gospel to baptism (1 Corinthians 12:13 and Romans 6:4) and of faithfulness to the Holy Spirit, which is the source of life and of charismatic discipleship.⁶⁵⁴ Alongside these principles (which are relevant to the lives of believers and unbelievers alike), other elements that are equally important are life itself and, in particular, a sense of being guided by the Holy Spirit as well as carrying out transcendental practices. (“Knock, and the door will be opened to you”, Luke 11:9. “Everyone who comes to me and listens to my words and acts on them – I will show you what such a person is like”, Luke 6:47). Pentecostality is firmly rooted in everyday life and expresses itself in personal and collective prayer. This presents a challenge to us as Catholics, given that we rarely pray to the Holy Spirit or put it at the centre of our faith.

On the other hand, any experience comes from inside, is relational and tangible and takes place primarily through prayer. This is summed up in a Pentecostal hymn: “There is no one like my God. I talk to him and he answers, we ask and he provides.”⁶⁵⁵ Blanca Cortés from Nicaragua believes in “the ability to love” and says: “You have given it to me and you encourage me to believe in a new world.”⁶⁵⁶ Isabel Choque from Peru writes that, despite all its problems, life is beautiful and wonderful “because, thanks to the Lord and the hearts of some women, we can make our voices heard.”⁶⁵⁷ In Brazil the church elder Benito Beni dos Santos emphasises that any prayer, “even if it is simply a lament”, is an experience of the Spirit.⁶⁵⁸ All this (and many other things) indicate that the specific feature of Pentecostality (in prayer, in reflection and in organisational matters) should be the hallmark of any ecumenical encounter, regardless of whether it is harmonious or abortive.

At the same time evil cannot be overcome, as is evident from manipulation, withdrawal into oneself, falsification of the Gospel and

⁶⁵⁴ The Bible does not present any single doctrine about life in the Spirit. Instead, it offers a perspective in which the essential elements are the outpouring of the Holy Spirit, the source of life and love and the disciples' power through the use of spiritual gifts; cf. Kärkkäinen, Veli-Matti, op. cit., 36.

⁶⁵⁵ Campos, Bernardo, *La experiencia del Espíritu*, op. cit., 38.

⁶⁵⁶ Cf. Cortés, Blanca, in: *En Ti vivimos*, Managua 2003.

⁶⁵⁷ Cf. Choque, Isabel, in: Caram, María Jose (ed.), *El Espíritu en el mundo andino*, Cochabamba 2012.

⁶⁵⁸ Beni dos Santos, Benito, *El Espíritu Santo, nuestra fuerza*, Bogota 2000, 93.

betrayal of human dignity (and other factors), which render spirituality and Christian reflection null and void. In this respect criticism and constructive suggestions have been expressed both in Pentecostal and Latin American theology. In Guatemala, Byron Mazariegos still describes the Pentecostal movement as a “force for change to deal with the evil of mankind [...] with the help of the Holy Spirit working through the church”. In Chile, Cecilia Castillo sees the therapeutic side, the focus on worship and the popular thrust of the Pentecostal movement as a “driving force which has helped the Pentecostal movement gain a foothold in Chilean society”. On the other hand, the neo-Pentecostal movement has blended the Bible with the prosperity gospel⁶⁵⁹ but has not addressed inequality in Latin America. Countless Christians support political programmes that are harmful to the majority.

Moving along Converging Paths

A fruitful exchange between the Catholic Church and the Pentecostal movement and an interdenominational lifestyle are not limited to a comparison of doctrines or ceremonies. It has been suggested – and this is also the way forward in the future – that recognition of the Pentecostal principle and upholding radical Pentecostality characterise all Christian tenets of faith as well as any interaction with people who have a variety of options.

The emphasis is primarily on prioritising life and perceiving it in its many different facets. When it comes to the special issues facing Latin America, the emphasis tends to be on the growing diversity among Christians and on Catholics transitioning into evangelical and Pentecostal groups. While these are clearly important phenomena, they can be interpreted in different ways. In this article the emphasis has been on human interaction with God (throughout creation) for the benefit of life and justice on a suffering continent, and this is also the context in which we must look at dialogue between the Catholic Church and Pentecostal churches.

There are paths which converge with respect to the Bible, church organisation, ethical responsibility, the socio-political context and

⁶⁵⁹ See Ocaña, Martín, *Los banqueros de Dios*, Lima 2002, 194: “[...] to avoid lapsing ‘into the cheap practice of turning secular things into something sacred’ or living in the spirit of the marketplace”.

inter-human relationships. They are based on spirituality and present macro-social issues and problems of politicisation and sectarianism as inescapable challenges.

There is outrage whenever the structures of violence and inequality in Latin America receive support from religious quarters. During the centuries of colonial history (and the post-modern phase) Christian institutions have been and still are integrated into patterns of oppression and discrimination – patterns that have created a “commercialisation of Christian symbols”.⁶⁶⁰ This makes it necessary to put a greater emphasis on cultivating social ethics and to develop human rights strategies in Latin America – a continent which is suffering from birth pangs and longs for true happiness. It is also important to unmask any exploitation or manipulation of Christian customs (which tends to happen in the form of dehumanising rituals at Christmas and during Holy Week).

Over the past few decades, religious factors have had a negative impact on socio-political developments and the media. Christian leaders have been heading campaigns on family and gender issues and have been cleverly undermining the legislative and local and national governments. Not only is there an increase in influence on the part of various Christian churches; there is also a tendency to exploit biblical messages and images of God for petty socio-economic profit. It is striking that the political and economic elite has the support not only of Catholic traditionalists but also of Pentecostal groups – both symbolically and in practical terms during elections. Neoliberal and populist movements (for example, in Central America and Brazil) are also supported.

José Luis Perez presents a sobering analysis in which he concludes that the new socio-political activists in Latin America are “renewed evangelicals”. He says that they have an obvious spirit of neo-Pentecostalism, the affectations of prosperity ideology and frequent “reconstructionist” aspirations, so that they increasingly reach the middle classes, including the upper middle classes.⁶⁶¹ Paradoxically, while proposing “secular progress”, the elites want to see a renewed emphasis on the sacred again.

⁶⁶⁰ Bobsin, Oneide, *Correntes religiosas e globalização*, São Leopoldo 2002, 30; cf. da Silva Moreira, Alberto (ed.), *O capitalismo como religião*, Goiania 2012.

⁶⁶¹ Cf. Perez Guadalupe, José Luis, op. cit., 214.

Recognising such irresolvable internal contradictions does not mean denigrating the feelings and experiences of faithful Pentecostals: a personal encounter with Jesus Christ, acceptance into Christian fellowship with mutual support, and theological skills in understanding the Bible in order to gain an understanding of the world.⁶⁶² Moreover, Catholic circles have a variety of ways in which to counter fundamentalism. Some experts see fundamentalism as a “moralistic warning against modern society”: regardless of whether society is Christian or not, it has failed in its attempt to build happiness entirely on worldly values and reason, and if reason becomes no more than an end in itself, it can easily lead to unreasonableness.⁶⁶³ Other interpretations detect media strategies which serve geopolitical interests on an international scale and influence evangelicals. This is accompanied by the prioritisation of the private sphere and – due to the worldwide lack of social or ethical standards – adaptation to homogeneous groups which more or less tantamount to religious cults. All this applies both to Pentecostal groups and Catholic programmes.

The most recent bishops’ conferences have stimulated ecumenism in matters of “truth, justice and compassion”⁶⁶⁴ and noted “that dialogue and ecumenical collaboration lead to new shared forms of discipleship and mission”.⁶⁶⁵ On the other hand, there is also panic in view of the proliferation of “fundamentalist cults”, while Catholic programmes include a large proportion of evangelical and Pentecostal objectives.⁶⁶⁶ A “new evangelisation” programme is currently being drawn up along the lines first mentioned in Puebla (1979), then ratified in Santo Domingo (1992) and eventually formalised as a pivotal element of the Church in Aparecida (2007). One point that is continually addressed is missionary work, which includes much of what originated

⁶⁶² This describes the experience of Catholic migrants. Cf. Pérez Guadalupe, José Luis, op. cit., 68. Javier Calderón from the Centro Estratégico Latinoamericano de Geopolítica (CELAG) puts the focus on the up-and-coming political activists who “are attractive to all political institutions that match their religious and conservative demands”, www.celag.org/iglesias-evangelicas-poder-conservador-latinoamerica (07.02.2019).

⁶⁶³ Galindo, Florencio, op. cit., 383.

⁶⁶⁴ Final Document of the Fourth General Meeting of the Latin American Bishops in Santo Domingo, 1992, No. 135.

⁶⁶⁵ Final Document of the Fifth General Conference of the Latin American Episcopal Council in Aparecida, 2007, No. 233.

⁶⁶⁶ Cf. Final Document of the Fourth General Conference of the Latin American Bishops in Santo Domingo, 1992, Nos. 142, 144–146 and 151–152.

in the Pentecostal movement.⁶⁶⁷ The Aparecida Document speaks of “a major mission throughout the entire continent”, and says: “We hope for a new Pentecost that will free us from fatigue, disillusionment, and conformity to the environment; a coming of the Spirit who renews our joy and our hope.”⁶⁶⁸ “We need a new Pentecost!”⁶⁶⁹ These official programmes (where they are being implemented) are opening up new paths for dialogue between Catholics and Pentecostals.

Globally, one of the many stimuli for collaboration between different churches has concentrated on the quality of Christian witness in a pluralistic world. The consultation held in Thailand shows this very clearly: “If Christians engage in inappropriate methods of exercising mission [...], they betray the gospel. Christians must therefore “formulate guidelines for conduct regarding Christian witness applicable to their particular contexts. Where possible, this should be done ecumenically, and in consultation with representatives of other religions.”⁶⁷⁰ These are the right principles and they should therefore be implemented.

Ultimately, I believe that moving forward along different but converging paths means making Pentecostality an element that we all share, since – implicitly or explicitly – it is present in all forms of Christianity. This is apparent in aspirations and spiritual convictions as well as in human forms of collaboration between different individuals. Heterogeneous movements within both Catholicism and Pentecostalism can unite if we seek and find signs of daily redemption (in both contrasting and shared Christian symbols). It is a path that should be walked by humans and nations as they suffer under their own weaknesses – and it should be walked right to the end, in the midst of “gusts of hope”.

⁶⁶⁷ Cf. Final Document of the Fifth General Conference of the Latin American Episcopal Council in Aparecida, 2007, Nos. 10–11, 101–239 and 347–379.

⁶⁶⁸ Ibid., No. 362.

⁶⁶⁹ Ibid., No. 548.

⁶⁷⁰ “Christian Witness in a Multi-Religious World” was the title of the document published by the World Council of Churches, the Pontifical Council for Interreligious Dialogue and the World Evangelical Alliance, after a consultation in Bangkok from 25 to 28 January 2011, leading to the formulation of a “Basis for Christian witness” and “Recommendations”: <https://www.oikoumene.org/en/resources/documents/wcc-programmes/interreligious-dialogue-and-cooperation/christian-identity-in-pluralistic-societies/christian-witness-in-a-multi-religious-world> (07.02.19).

Conclusions

Are our paths converging? Both Catholic and Pentecostal churches give nuanced answers to the pressing spiritual and historical necessities which manifest an ethical urgency and range from prayer, through the process of transformation to new life and sanctification. Part of this is mutual assistance, which also involves political events and structures. All this and other factors represent to a greater or lesser extent ways of loving God and one's neighbour and, encouraged by the Holy Spirit, of walking in Jesus' footsteps.

Together with my colleagues in Latin America I believe Pentecostalism to be a sign of God at work and a sign of joy as Christians work together in solidarity. Pentecostality is the basis of unity for the entire church and mankind, and the power of the Holy Spirit is the basic requirement for the church to function in history as the Body of Christ and the people of God.⁶⁷¹ Pentecostality as such does not cause division but creates unity at the deepest level between Protestants, Catholics and all people of good will.

Two poles can be identified: on the one hand, exaltation (the faith that strengthens Isabel Choque in Peru and Verónica Pérez in Guatemala) and, on the other, intimidation (in Chile) with messages of sin and condemnation. The various symbolic languages are characterised by aspirations, unifying elements and conflicts, which means that any ambivalent elements of religion and the church must be seen in context. Therefore, I would not wish to play off Catholics against Pentecostals. On the contrary, I would wish to join those in Catholic circles who value human dignity and social welfare (both of which are important to Pentecostal Christians). All of us face the same challenges: as a result of authoritarianism and indoctrination, the spiritual sphere has both been declared a private matter and subjected to commercialisation so that it is no longer perceived as credible.

Coercion and manipulation by leaders can be observed in all Christian environments (including Pentecostal churches) and the same is true of fatalist attitudes, the falsification of the sacred and discrimination of marginal groups. As I see it, the most harmful thing

⁶⁷¹ Cf. Campos, Bernardo, *De la reforma protestante a la pentecostalidad de la Iglesia*, Quito 1997, 90.

that can be done is to denigrate humanity with arguments such as: “it is God’s will”, “our sins are crucifying the Lord” and the like. This attitude encourages a view that everything that happens is the result of God’s power (thus encouraging an uncritical view of some situations).

On the other hand, the achievements of Pentecostal theology also foster the renewal of Catholicism. This desire for renewal was a fundamental aspiration at the Episcopal Conferences in Latin America in 1979, 2002 and 2017, each of which called for evangelisation marked by signs of love. Shared experiences give us an intuitive understanding that the God of Life never discriminates against anyone. Traces of rapprochement can also be found in the criticism of social sin, the highlighting of ethical and socio-political alternatives and other forms of Christian witness and worship.

The various communities of believers sense that the living God is putting an end to all petty endeavours to distance themselves from others. Constructive dialogue between Catholics and Pentecostals illustrates the freedom we have along our human paths, in all their ambivalence. With spiritual and theological help the people of God are addressing the transformation of the world in tandem with the lamentations of the Holy Spirit.

The Response of the Catholic Church to the Pentecostal Movements

Ignatius Ayan Kaigama

The theological content of Christ's message and mission has and will always remain one and the same notwithstanding the diversity in understanding and variations of interpretations. Interpretations are of necessity as varied as the people who attempt them. Most of these interpretations are not holistic, but lopsided; biblical chapters and verses that apparently placate strained nerves and troubled souls are overstretched while those that demand the cost of true discipleship receive little or no attention or emphasis. Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger sees these interpretations as reconstructions: "In these reconstructions, they identify Scripture with the prevailing exegetical opinions, thus confusing faith with opinion."⁶⁷²

The irreconcilability of these discrepancies in understanding and interpretations has, over the centuries, stimulated theological controversies and tensions that have occasioned avoidable and needless schisms in Christendom resulting in doctrinal conflicts and unwholesome competitions over followership. Scholars have predicted that the Pentecostal and charismatic movements, the third force after Catholicism and Protestantism will take over the Christian denominations in the not too distant future as they seem to be growing fast.⁶⁷³ In fact, its startling growth "is amazing and/or frightening the rest of the Christian world."⁶⁷⁴ Catholics need to take a hard and honest look at what is going on, and why, so that they can faithfully discern how to respond to the challenge it poses to the Church.

⁶⁷² Cf. Joseph Kardinal Ratzinger, *Der Geist der Liturgie. Eine Einführung*, Freiburg i.Br. 2000.

⁶⁷³ Cf. Young, Amos, *The Spirit Poured out on All Flesh. Pentecostalism and the Possibility of Global Theology*, Grand Rapids, 2005.

⁶⁷⁴ Roebuck, David/Rodgers, Darrin, "Preserving and Sharing Our Heritage: The Biblical and Institutional Mandate", in: Synan, Vinson (ed.), *Spirit Empowered Christianity in the 21st Century*, Lake Mary 2011, 231.

Pentecostal Movements

Pentecostal Movements are a conglomeration of different and diverse non-Catholic and non-Protestant Churches. They are a creation and product of twentieth century Christians that sprang up in America and introduced to Africa through South Africa, in 1909/1910. They have always repackaged and represented the Gospel message and value in such a manner that they meet and satisfy the immediate wants and not needs of the underprivileged and their born again adherents with a robust emphasis on the Holy Spirit, glossolalia and healing.

Prior to the advent of Pentecostal Movements in Africa, there were a few African Independent Churches, which either ruptured from the mainstream churches or were autonomously founded by Africans, for Africans and in Africa. The poor in Africa pour out into the independent churches, healing homes, sects and charismatic groups and delight in highly emotional or culturalist liturgies in order to drown their pains in the irrational and emotional instead of questioning the very structures which produce such a pain and oppression.

Because Africans are extensively acknowledged for their elaborate cultural celebrations and dances to the rhythm of symbolic and thrilling traditional melody, Pentecostalism rides and soars higher on this patrimony. In line with this, emotionally charged music plays an integral part in the Pentecostal services designed to give followers a spiritual experience taking them to a higher plane of worship. This strikingly captures and lucidly describes the extraordinary blow-out of Pentecostalism in some African countries. Materialistic values are embraced, christened and expressed as religious views by the Pentecostals since their preoccupation is with the life here and now; not with the life hereafter. Their preaching is bereft of eschatology and is “one- sided,” directed toward the creation of a better world rather than “the other, truly better world.” They have, regrettably, replaced eschatology with utopia.

Catholic Charismatic Renewal

Unlike the Pentecostal Movement, which is an autonomous movement, the Catholic Charismatic Renewal is in and for the church.

The Movement began among Catholics in 1966 with Ralph Keifer and Patrick Bourgeois, laymen and lecturers in Theology at Duquesne Catholic University in Pittsburgh. After their initiation, they in turn initiated other Catholics into the Pentecostal rite, and the movement grew rapidly. Soon there were also groups at the University of Notre Dame and other Catholic centres.⁶⁷⁵

There is a system of checks and balances for its activities which harness the charisms of its members in conformity with the doctrines of the church for the overall good of the Mystical Body of Christ. This system is usually anchored by a priest-chaplain duly appointed by the Local Ordinary. The term “renewal” appended to Catholic Charismatics should not be regarded as an attempt to reform the church as a body. It is meant to renew the individual’s commitment to the church and to the Holy Spirit who guides and advocates for the church.

The Catholic Church, has never had misgivings about authentic gifts of the Holy Spirit. As a result, she has always insisted on the necessity of discreet discernment because not all inspirations and/or charisms are from God. She teaches that these bestowals, are not as a result of personal merits and should neither be sought nor auto-appropriated.

From the birth of the church, pride of place and prominence have always been accorded to the Holy Spirit, which is evidently seen in the administration of the sacraments and a ten day novena that traditionally precedes the annual Feast of Pentecost. However, no claim is laid on the manipulation of the third Person of the Blessed Trinity, whose enlightenment is invoked in our daily lives and on the path of Christ’s disciples.

Why Catholics drift to Pentecostal Churches

While there are many reasons why Pentecostal-charismatic Christianity is growing, the most persuasive reason for the dramatic growth - the one in which all of the other reasons make sense - is the spirituality common to this form of Christianity.⁶⁷⁶ This is the reason

⁶⁷⁵ Cf. Ogunu, Michael, The Phenomenon of Pentecostalism in Nigeria today and its Effects on The Catholic Faithful, in: Nigeria Catholic Reporter, 15.11.2016.

⁶⁷⁶ Cf. Allen, John, The Future Church: How Ten Trends Are Revolutionizing the Catholic

most commonly given, and the one that is most taken seriously by those who come to the faith in these traditions. If one were to ask any Pentecostal or Charismatic why they are growing so fast he would simply respond: it is because of the power of the Holy Spirit. In effect, they believe that their churches represent the most awesome work of the Spirit in the modern age, and that accounts for the growth. John Allen⁶⁷⁷ summarizes the beliefs of their spirituality as follows:

- Belief in the gifts of the Holy Spirit, such as speaking in tongues, prophecy, or prayer for miraculous healing;
- A literal reading of the Bible;
- Strong belief in divine healing of illness or injury;
- Belief in the possibility of direct divine revelation;
- An emphasis on evil spirits;
- Belief that Jesus will return to earth during their lifetimes;
- Belief that miracles still occur as they did in biblical times;
- Commitment to evangelization, meaning sharing the faith with non-believers;
- Emphasis on Christ as the lone path to salvation;
- Higher-than-average rates of attendance at church services;⁶⁷⁸

These beliefs are practically universal among the Pentecostal Christians.

Implications for the Catholic Church

From a positive point of view, the Church must admit that the Pentecostal members are effectively reaching the multitudes with the gospel of Jesus Christ, and entire nations are being transformed. Looked at in negative terms, however, the sheer growth of these churches represents an existential threat to thousands of Catholics, and may result in people leaving the Catholic Church, and living without the fullness of the truth and the sacraments found only in the

Church, New York 2009, 381.

⁶⁷⁷ Ibid., 389.

⁶⁷⁸ Ibid., 389–397.

Church. Therefore, in turning from the truth, and the power available through the Church, such Christians put their eternal salvation at risk.

Pentecostalism has also negatively influenced the Catholic rich and symbolic liturgical hymns which are swiftly giving way to sensational religious songs and choruses. Even some priests have become prosperity preachers of a crossless Christianity, promising the congregation liberation from poverty, illness and misfortune of all sorts. We are embracing the more music-motivated, concert-flair approach in the so-called claim to resuscitate and reinforce the waning enthusiasm of our congregations. Solemn Eucharistic celebrations with unbroken fidelity to the General Instruction of the Roman Missal and liturgical rubrics are considered by some priests and lay faithful as outmoded requiring rebranding and revitalization to measure up with the Pentecostal genre of worship.

The Youths, who were active are no longer comfortable with the solemn mode of worship. They allege that the liturgy, in comparison to Pentecostal service, is drab, monotonous, immobile, uninteresting and dull. They would prefer to go to churches where they are entertained and hypnotized; they turn the church into a discotheque with little or no regard for the presence of God. There is, then, an alarming abuse of Eucharistic celebrations through the importation of alien ideas and practices to them thereby transforming the Mass from the glorification of God and the sanctification of His people to an entertainment.

One of the most tragic effects of Pentecostalism on the Catholic faithful is its silent conversion of Catholics to become Protestants. Some Catholic Charismatic Communities are indeed Protestants who under the guise of "Catholic Charismatics" are working hard within the Church to turn Catholics away from their Catholic faith. They will never make the sign of the cross; they are anti-clerical; they will prefer their prayer meeting to the Holy Mass. The way they pray is absolutely un-Catholic. At many Catholic Charismatic prayer meetings you see many so-called Catholics praying like Protestants. They command God; they shout and babble.

Response to Pentecostalism

Three approaches are possible in any attempt to give the response of the Church to the Pentecostal explosion. There are firstly, those who

out rightly reject anything Pentecostal and put on antagonism towards it for reasons, which may include seeing the movement as heretical or threatening our tradition. MacArthur's criticism of the movement is a good representation of this approach:

The sad truth is, the legacy of the charismatic movement has been mostly one of chaos and doctrinal confusion. The charismatic approach to spirituality is unsound and fraught with potential disillusionment...The only appropriate response is and always has been a return to the word of God. For it is there that God has revealed to us all the truth we need to serve him and live for his glory."

Though MacArthur is dogmatic and may be considered harsh in his approach he should be commended for his call for a return to the Scripture as the basis for faith and practice. Such a negative opposition has however proved unsuccessful can only lead to the formation of schisms since they can only be suppressed but rarely rooted out by force.⁶⁷⁹

Some others neither reject nor consciously accept Pentecostal practices and just care less about them. These are the lackadaisical ones who are "not showing enough care or enthusiasm." They display a careless none-critical tolerance and accommodation of the Pentecostal phenomena – they "copy and paste" without questioning. This category of individuals could be called "blind builders" who build without measurement or real knowledge of what they are doing. Confusion of identity in doctrine and practice is the inevitable end product of the lackadaisical approach. This careless approach is both dangerous and detrimental to biblical Christianity which says what our attitude should be in all things: "Test all things; hold fast to what is good" (I Thess. 5:2).

Then there are those who carefully accept and adopt biblically based Pentecostal practices and traditions. This category "Test all things" and "hold fast to what is good" (1 Thess. 5:21). They critically analyze Pentecostalism and identify and discard unbiblical practices and properly accept and "hold fast" to the best of the two worlds. They combine the best of the two traditions into a "new whole" to be better both in doctrine and practice.

⁶⁷⁹ MacArthur, John, Charismatic Chaos, Grand Rapids 1992, 295.

Hans Kung as quoted by Omenyo⁶⁸⁰ supports the benefit of a positive attitude towards the Pentecostal movement". He asserts that. "The working of the Spirit may often, as once in Corinth, produce unattractive side-effects; but have we the right to quench the spirit when we can only set the letter of the law against it? The only answer is to accept the challenge...and make what is good better". This is the approach of the Catholic Church.

Despite our difference, we have many things in common - what unites us is more than what divides us. "Master, we saw someone who drives out demons by calling upon your name and we tried to forbid him, because he does not follow you with us. But Jesus said, "Do not forbid him. He who is not against you is for you." Belief in Christ is our confluence. Hence, we will always extend our hand of friendship and partnership to people of all faiths and denominations in our unrelenting determination to continue to preach Christ crucified and to ensure the practice of Christian principles.

The Holy Spirit is of unity and not schism. Individual gifts are not to be used for personal aggrandisement but for the common good of the church. It is imperative for Christ's faithful to understand that there is nothing intrinsically wrong with Catholicism and the liturgy. Therefore, our doctrines should neither be relaxed nor liturgical decorum compromised to be in tune with a new brand of Christianity. "It is totally absurd to try to make the liturgy attractive by introducing dancing pantomimes which frequently end with applause. "The liturgy is a tradition; the past living in the present and the present living in the past."⁶⁸¹

Catholic doctrinal clarification is paramount in combating and curbing the influence of Pentecostalism on Catholics. Hence, it is incumbent on priests to catechize the lay faithful on the import of the Holy Eucharist, which is the source and summit of our worship. There is no miracle that surpasses and takes precedence over Transubstantiation and there is no prophecy greater than the Paschal Mystery.

The multi-religious composition of many nations is an undisputable fact. This is not without some key and knotty bottlenecks. The Catholic Church in Nigeria has, in this regard, for example, distinguished herself

⁶⁸⁰ Omenwo, Cephas N., *Pentecos Outside Pentecostalism: A Study of the Development of Charismatic Renewal in the Mainline Churches in Ghana*, Zoetermeer 2002, 295.

⁶⁸¹ Joseph Kardinal Ratzinger, op. cit.

as a vanguard of the promotion and provision of a viable platform for a meaningful intra/inter-religious dialogue of life and peaceful co-existence. The platform has immensely contributed in clearing the cloud of misunderstanding between Christians and Muslims and has created an expedient atmosphere of mutual enrichment.

There is need for Christians to dialogue among themselves and with other religions. This desire has been strengthened for example in Nigeria, with the establishment of a department for dialogue and mission within the Catholic Secretariat of Nigeria (CSN)." Correspondingly, our educational and health institutions are open to people of other faiths and religions deprived of prejudice. The same as our humanitarian interventions in crisis ridden areas channelled either through Justice, Development and Peace Commission or Catholic Relief Service.

The Church is aware of the tragedy of Christian disunity and the quest for ecumenism. Spurred by Vatican II's decree Unitatis Redintegratio, it remains one of our primary day-to-day preoccupations and priority, to champion and encourage initiatives for unity among Christians. The Church in Nigeria again has been instrumental to the formation of the Christian Association of Nigeria (CAN) for continuous dialogue. It has encouraged mixed marriage, faithful observance of the Annual Week of Prayer for Christian Unity and participation in inter-denominational services without compromising the basic doctrines of our faith.

We have also tried to extend the olive branch even to the indigenous religions through the demonstration that Christianity, most especially Catholicism has not come to destroy, but accomplish through transcending them. It is our belief that enlightened by divine truth and ennobled by grace they can be lifted up to true virtue and the supernatural life since there are certain practices in these religious movements that could be used to enrich Christianity even as the latter transforms them.

Recommendations

It seems obvious from the foregoing that the Pentecostal and charismatic movements pose real danger to the Catholic faithful who

are exposed to the various devices aimed at winning them over. The following measures are recommended to stop the drift:

1. There should be greater involvement of priests in the lives of the faithful. Efforts should be made to reach out to Church members and help fill the void in the various areas of their lives. To this end, counseling centers should be set up in parishes and a sound counseling programme installed to enable priests attend to the spiritual and other needs of parishioners.
2. The Church should show more concern for the needs of its members. To this end, time should be created for counseling and prayers. There are many Catholics who flock to prayer houses and prophets for counseling and prayers. Some of the conditions they are given is to change their faith. As part of the concern, there should be visitation teams and the basic Christian Communities should be made more active.
3. The Church should make it mandatory for all parishes to have bible classes for children and adults outside the Scripture reading periods at Mass. Only Catholics of unquestionable orthodoxy should be in charge of such classes. The bible classes should be used as avenues of explaining the Mass and Catholic faith and doctrine. There should be a continuous study of the Catholic doctrines especially during the Mass and other Church celebrations.
4. Emphasis should be placed on those controversial aspects of the doctrine. Also, seminars and workshops on the Catholic faith should be encouraged in Churches. Priests and Church leaders should spend more time in talking about the Word of God, than on other things like money, tithes and seed-sowing. The Sunday-Sunday Word of God which Catholics hear when they attend Mass is grossly inadequate. Bible reading/study should be a mandatory part of all zonal meetings and Church Societies.

Index of authors

Bernardo Campos, Prof. Dr. theol., b. 1955, Pentecostal theologian, coordinator of *Pentecostal para América Latina y El Caribe* and director of the series *Teología Sistemática en Perspectiva Hispana*.

Brenda Carranza, Professor at the Centre for Applied Human and Social Sciences of the Pontifical Catholic University of Campinas (CCHSA-Puc-Campinas).

Esther Berg-Chan, Dr. phil., is a religious scholar and expert adviser for education management / androgogy in Main Department XI Church and Society of the Diocese of Rottenburg-Stuttgart and for the Society for Catholic Adult Education in the Diocese of Rottenburg-Stuttgart.

Patrick C. Chibuko, b. 1956, was ordained as a priest in the Diocese of Enugu in Nigeria in 1983. He took a doctorate in liturgical science at the Pontifical Athenaeum Sant'Anselmo in Rome in 1990. He has been Professor of Liturgy at the Catholic Institute of West Africa in Port Harcourt (Nigeria) since 1991.

Asogwa Augustine Chikezie is a Catholic priest in the diocese of Nsukka in Nigeria. He obtained a doctorate in systematic theology (main focus on ecclesiology) at the Pontifical Lateran University in Rome. His research interests include Pentecostalism, ecumenism and the Second Vatican Council.

Meehyun Chung, Prof. Dr. theol., b. 1963 in Seoul, is an ordained minister of the Presbyterian Church of South Korea (PROK). She earned her doctorate in Basel in 1993 with a dissertation on Karl Barth, Josef Lukl Hromadka and Korea. In 2006 she became the first woman to be awarded the Karl Barth Prize of the Union of Evangelical Churches in the Protestant Church in Germany (EKD) for having expressly pursued a dialogue in her dissertation between Karl Barth's theology, the Theological Declaration of Barmen and Korean culture and society. From January 2005 to February 2013 she was head of the Women and Gender Desk

of mission21, evangelisches missionswerk Basel. Since March 2013 she has been Professor of Systematic Theology and the first female chaplain at the University of Yonsei in Seoul, Korea.

Margit Eckholt, Prof. Dr. theol. is Professor of Dogmatics and Fundamental Theology at the University of Osnabrück.

Paul Gifford, b. 1944 in New Zealand, studied in Wellington, Rome, Oxford and Upp-sala. As a lecturer at the universities of Zimbabwe and Leeds and during his more than 20 years as a teacher in the Department of Religions and Philosophies of the School of Oriental and African Studies (SOAS) at the University of London he has published widely on matters of religion; his book on Christianity, Development and Modernity in Africa was published in 2015.

Ignatius Ayau Kaigama, b. 1958, is Archbishop of Jos in Nigeria. Having trained as a priest at St. Augustine's Seminar in Jos, he studied theology in Rome. He was or-dained a priest on 6 June 1981 and awarded a doctorate in theology at the Pontifical Gregorian University in 1991.

Diego Irarrázaval, teaches at the Universidad Católica Silva Henríquez in Santiago de Chile and is involved in parish work. Consultant for various social and church pro-grammes (1975-2004 in Peru and elsewhere as well as 2005-2018 in Chile). Head of the Instituto de Estudios Aymaras (1981-2004) and EATWOT (Ecumenical Association of Third World Theologians) (1995-2006). Member of the editorial board of the journal CONCILIOUM (2005-2017).

Klaus Krämer, Dr. theol. habil., b. 1964, is President of the Pontifical Mission Society missio and President of the Missionary Childhood Association in Aachen.

Claude Nonis, Fr. Dr. (Leuven), Dr. theol. (Rome), is director of the archdiocese and national coordinator of the family apostolate in Sri Lanka.

Kwadwo Nimfour Opoku Onyinah, b. 1964, holds a Doctor of Philosophy in Theological Studies and a Master of Theology in Applied Theology. He has been Chairman of the Church of Pentecost in Ghana and around the world since 2008.

Tony Richie, D. Min., Ph. D., is Lecturer in Theology at the Pentecostal Theological Seminary in Cleveland, Tennessee and Lead Pastor at the New Harvest Church of God in Knoxville, Tennessee.

Joachim Schmiedl, Dr. theol. habil., b. 1958, holds the Chair of Mediaeval and Modern Church History at the Vallendar College of Philosophy and Theology and was General Secretary of the Schönstatt Apostolic Movement from 1998 to 2001. He is editor-in-chief of the theological journal *Regnum*.

Alberto da Silva Moreira is Professor of Religious Studies and Theology at the Pontifical Catholic University of Goiás in Goiânia, Brazil.

Jakob Egeris Thorsen, b. 1978, is a professor at the School of Culture and Society of Aarhus University, where he is active in the field of ecclesiastical history and practical theology. His main research interest is in the theology of Latin America.

Klaus Vellguth, Dr. theol. habil. Dr. phil. Dr. rer. pol., b. 1965, is head of the Theological Research Department at missio in Aachen, Professor of Missiology and Director of the Institute of Missiology (IMW) at the Vallendar College of Philosophy and Theology.

Christina Vital da Cunha, lecturer in sociology in the post-graduate programme of the Universidade Federal Fluminense (state university in Rio de Janeiro).

Hildegard Wustmans, Dr. theol. habil., has been head of the Department of Pastoral Services in the Episcopal Ordinariate of the Diocese of Limburg since 2017. Prior to that she was Professor of Pastoral Theology at the University of Linz in Austria.

Franz Geng Zhanhe, Dr. theol., is co-founder and vice-director of the Li Madou research centre in Macerata, Italy, and Professor of Systematic Theology at Holy Spirit Seminary College in Hongkong.

Index of Translators

The articles in this volume were written in English, German and Spanish.

Pentecostalism in Europe

Translated by Hugh Beyer

Pentecostalism in Latin America Today.

Dissemination and Trends

Translated by Harriet Rössger

Healing and Holy Spirit. Pentecostal Churches and

New Ecumenical Challenges in a Universal Church

Translated by Robert Bryce

Fundamental Aspects of Pentecostal Theology as

seen from Latin America

Translated by Robert Bryce

Something is not coming our way; it is already here.

The fascination of Pentecostal and Charismatic movements
for Christians in German-speaking countries

Translated by Harriet Rössger

Pentecostalism in Brazil and its Appeal to Catholics

Translated by Hugh Beyer

Argument over the “*Mission Manifesto*”. On Evangelical and
Pentecostal Tendencies in the Catholic Church in Germany

Translated by Robert Bryce

Catholic Charismatic Renewal in Guatemala.

Enthusiasm and parish diaconia

Translated by Harriet Rössger

Pentecostal Churches – Question Marks and Challenges

Translated by Robert Bryce

A New “Religious Style” in the Catholic Church in Germany?

Translated by Robert Bryce

Converging Paths – the Catholic Church and

the Pentecostal Movement in Latin America

Translated by Hugh Beyer

**List of recently published titles in the
“One World Theology” series
edited by Klaus Krämer and Klaus Vellguth:**

Mission and Dialogue. Approaches to a Communicative Understanding of Mission
(OWT Volume 1), Quezon City 2012.

Small Christian Communities. Fresh Stimulus for a Forward-looking Church
(OWT Volume 2), Quezon City 2012.

Theology and Diakonia. Faith and Action
(OWT Volume 3), Quezon City 2013.

Spirituality of the Universal Church. Rediscovering Faith
(OWT Volume 4), Quezon City 2014.

Religious Freedom. Foundations – Reflections – Models
(OWT Volume 5), Quezon City 2014.

The Universal Church in Germany. Living the faith together
(OWT Volume 6), Quezon City 2015.

Evangelii Gaudium. Voices of the Universal Church
(OWT Volume 7), Quezon City 2016.

Human Dignity. Discourses on Universality and Inalienability
(OWT Volume 8), Quezon City 2017.

Evangelization. Sharing the Joy of the Gospel
(OWT Volume 9), Quezon City 2017.

Family. Living Life Together in the Church and the World
(OWT Volume 10), Quezon City 2017.

Creation. Living Together in Our Common House
(OWT Volume 11), Quezon City 2018.

Inculturation. God’s Presence in Cultures
(OWT Volume 12), Quezon City 2019.

Flight and Migration. Between Homeless and Hospitality
(OWT Volume 13), Quezon City 2020.

Religion and Violence. The Potential for Conflict and Peace
(OWT Volume 14), Quezon City 2020.

ALSO AVAILABLE:

Africa

API – Eldoret
Fr. Pius Male
P.O. Box 908
30100 Eldoret
Kenya

Asia

Claretian Communications Foundation, Inc. – Philippines
Robert U. Laurio
8 Mayumi Street, U.P. Village
Diliman, 1101 Quezon City, Philippines
www.claretianpublications.ph

Europe

missio
Goethstr.43
52064 Aachen
Germany
www.missio-hilft.de/de/angebote/onlineshop/
bestellungen@missio.de